



CBMS Pilot Study in Pakistan*

Durr-e-Nayab, Ph.D**

Poverty, especially in countries like Pakistan, is a multidimensional phenomenon. It encompasses, among others, the inability to satisfy basic food and non-food needs, lack of education and skills, poor health, lack of shelter, poor access to water and sanitation, and lack of political freedom. Each factor accentuates the other with the cycle of poverty being perpetuated when the most vulnerable are excluded from the decision-making process affecting it. To gauge the current state and changes in poverty, to analyse the impact of poverty reduction policies, and to design/refine strategies for poverty alleviation, updated and relevant data are of prime importance.

In Pakistan, data on the different facets of poverty are traditionally acquired from national surveys, mainly the Household Income and Expenditure Survey (HIES) and the Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS). While data available from these sources are useful, they may, however, be too aggregated at the national, provincial or district level to be of sufficient use for local governments.

There is a need for more disaggregated information at the local level to be able to diagnose poverty, identify problems and ways to reduce them, monitor the impact of any developmental project being carried out in the community, and assist the policymaking process at all administrative levels. Community-based monitoring system (CBMS) could fill in this void by generating information at the lowest level. As such, it is being piloted in Pakistan.

CBMS and Devolution

The CBMS is able to fully complement Pakistan's devolution plan as envisaged in the Local Government Ordinance that was promulgated in August 2002. The ordinance calls for a devolvement of administrative powers from the national level to the local administrative levels where budget allocations become the responsibility of district, *tehsil*¹ and union council administrations.

This new set-up requires the formation of village/ neighbourhood councils in both urban and rural areas with the village/neighbourhood councils

assisting the union council administration in carrying out these functions, along with taking steps to improve the security of the population and organising sports, cultural and recreational activities. The tasks will likewise require the collection of socio-economic data and selection of sites for the provision of municipal services.

To help in compiling and consolidating the data, the National Reconstruction Bureau (NRB) has developed the National Reconstruction Information Management System (NARIMS), whose primary focus is to store, transform and display spatial data for financial management, planning and development purposes, evaluation of existing schemes, and performance incentives.

The CBMS, by decentralising the information-collecting procedure, complements this set-up. The CBMS and the indicators found relevant in it after the piloting phase could be incorporated in the information that

* Excerpt from a report prepared by the CBMS-Pakistan Project Team of the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), Islamabad, Pakistan.

** Research Anthropologist and CBMS-Pakistan Project Leader, PIDE.

¹ Tehsil is the 4th lowest level of government after provinces, districts and city districts. Following tehsil is city town and union council (village council).

Inside	
News Updates-International	6
News Updates-Philippines	7
News Updates-International	8

Research Results

are to be collected by the union councils and village/neighbourhood councils. Thus, the whole exercise will be more beneficial for needs assessment, planning, monitoring and evaluation of poverty reduction projects.

The succeeding sections give an account of the process and findings of the CBMS pilot study in Pakistan.

Objectives

The main objectives of the CBMS pilot study in Pakistan include:

- Conduct of a baseline survey to examine the existing socio-economic conditions in the selected sites, especially those related to poverty.
- Examination of gender differences in indicators related to poverty.
- Provision of suggestions to the NRB for the inclusion of certain indicators, found to be significant in the CBMS pilot study, in the NRB's data collection format at the lowest administrative level.

Methodology

In consultation with the NRB, two rural union councils of Punjab province were selected in the CBMS pilot study. Because sustainability of the CBMS after the pilot phase was a major concern, the union council administration was thus tasked to be involved in the carrying out of the pilot study. It is premised that the experience gained by the union council personnel during the piloting of the CBMS would not only help them deliver their job more efficiently but also help sustain the CBMS once the pilot phase is over.

The districts of Rawalpindi and Toba Tek Singh of the Punjab province were selected as CBMS survey pilot sites. These two districts rank on the opposite ends of the Human Development Index (HDI): Rawalpindi District features among the well-off districts while Toba Tek Singh is in the

list of deprived districts. From these districts, one union council for each was nominated by the district *nazim* to carry out the CBMS pilot study. From the Rawalpindi District, Dhamyal Union Council (UC) was selected while from Toba Tek Singh District, the GB42 was identified. From these two union councils, villages were then selected, where a census was to be conducted for the pilot study.

Three questionnaires were developed: two separate questionnaires for male and female and one for the community. To avoid leaving out any important indicator, all information that can impact on the poverty status were included in the questionnaires.

To generate specific information regarding the gender dimension in different life conditions, certain sections like household health were included in both questionnaires for males and females. In addition, men and women were asked different questions.

The enumerators and monitoring personnel included members of the union council monitoring committee and local educated youth and teachers. Site supervisors were also designated to conduct the community questionnaires.

Results of the CBMS Survey

The following are the results of the survey by indicator.

Demography

Except for two villages, namely, Mohra Chapper and Mohra Bariyan, both in Dhamyal, males outnumber the females. The higher male proportion is especially pronounced in the two villages of GB42.

The mean household size in GB42 is 7 members per household while in Dhamyal, it is 6 members. As expected, the mean number of males per household is greater than that of



Dr. Durr-e-Nayab, CBMS-Pakistan Team Leader.

females per household in all villages, with Mohra Chapper and Mohra Bariyan being the two exceptions. These exceptions are explained by the rather high male out-migration rates in Rawalpindi district, where Dhamyal is located, resulting in a slightly better sex ratio. GB42, located in Toba Tek Singh district, meanwhile, is mainly agriculture and therefore does not offer as many push factors for migration as the land-deficient Rawalpindi district.

Education

Inter-village differences are present within and between the two union councils. Some villages like Jorain and Mohra Faqeeran fare much better in male education than other villages of Dhamyal. They have lower "never attended school rate" and higher "current attendance in school" than other villages in the union council. Likewise, villages in GB42 are generally better placed in school attendance than most villages in Dhamyal in terms of male education.

Similar differences are found in the rate of school attendance among females. The proportion of the "never attended school" ranges from a comparatively low 27 percent (Mohra Chapper in Dhamyal) to a much higher 47 percent (Banda Nagial also in Dhamyal). Slightly less variation is found among the current school attendance rates for females in the

nine villages, with the rate varying from 24 percent (Banda Nagial) to 37 percent (Dhamyal village). Banda Nagial thus not only shows low past school attendance rate but also the lowest current attendance rate for females among all villages.

Employment

Work status of all males and females aged 5 years and over was also probed in the study. Working age is generally considered to start at 15 years but the study included the 5-9 year olds as well to see if children were working instead of going to school.

For population five years old and above, labor force participation rate among males in both union councils was around 50 percent. The remainder were neither working nor wanting to work, with a small proportion being unemployed in both union councils. For females, the rate was very low in both union councils, with only 6 percent each working in Dhamyal and GB42. Despite such a low participation rate, very few were looking for work, more so in GB42 where only 0.4 percent were unemployed.

Apart from the huge sex differences, not much difference was found within the union councils as most villages follow the trend at the aggregated level.

It is mainly males who are working for money, as females comprise a very small proportion of working members within a household. In Dhamyal, on average, 6 members of a household depend on 2 working members, while in GB42, 7 members of a household rely on 2 working members.

Agriculture is among the main occupations common to both gender. Other occupations include construction work, transport, wholesale and retail trade, and public services for males, and

teaching, domestic and social services for females.

Almost an equal proportion of males and females are working as self-employed and employed workers. In contrast, in GB42, majority work as employed workers. A small proportion in both union councils work as unpaid family workers, with females in GB42 having the highest proportion (5.1%).

In terms of wanting more hours of work, majority were already working as fulltime workers or even more. Thus, most do not want more hours of work anymore. Interestingly, majority of the working females, mainly part-time workers, were not interested in having more hours of work either.

Income

The survey results show that working females have a mean annual income approximately four times less than working males in the two union councils under study. Using the median value, the comparison worsens even more, with working females earning 6-10 times less than their male counterparts in the GB42 and Dhamyal districts, respectively.

Not much difference is found within villages in GB42 regarding female earnings. Males, however, in 286GB were better off than the males in 285GB. On the other hand, the villages in Dhamyal show much difference with each other. Females working in Dhamyal could earn an annual median income of Rs. 2100 (Hayal) to Rs. 8400 (Mohra Faqeeran). Likewise, annual median income of working males in Dhamyal ranges from Rs. 42,000 to Rs. 60,000.

In terms of monthly household income that includes income from all sources by all members, Dhamyal fares better than GB42, having a much higher mean and median monthly household

income. Much difference is found in the income levels of households in villages of Dhamyal. For instance, Mohra Faqeeran had a median household income of Rs.8000 compared to Rs. 6000 in Jorain, Hayal and Banda Nagial. In the two villages of GB42, difference is also found in the income level, with 285GB being better off than 286GB.

It would also be of interest to see the per capita monthly income in the survey villages. Dhamyal, with its higher income level and smaller household size, has a higher per capita monthly mean and median income, Rs. 1066 per head compared to Rs.750 per head in GB42. Intra-union council differences are also again prevalent, especially in Dhamyal.

Expenditure

In all villages, more than half of the total household expenditure is on food. In some, the proportion increases even more (as in Jorain and Hayal in Dhamyal, and in both villages of GB42).

Budget Deficit

Approximately 40 percent of the households in both villages have a deficit household budget, more so in Dhamyal (43.2%) than GB42 (38.5%). A little over half of the households in both union councils have surplus amounts per month. The remaining 6 percent in Dhamyal and 9.1 per cent in GB42 have a levelled income-expenditure balance.

Village Banda Nagial (52.2%) and Mohra Chapper (52.2%) in Dhamyal, and 285 GB (42.2%) in GB42 have more households with a budget deficit than other villages in their union council.

Health

In terms of health, the CBMS pilot study looked into the following:

Research Results

Incidence of Morbidity

Incidence of morbidity was found to be higher in GB42 than in Dharmyal for both males and females with the trends not showing a stark difference between gender. Higher morbidity rates among women aged 15-49 years old in Dharmyal council are, however, registered.

Child Immunization

The results of the survey show that only one village, Jorain in Dharmyal, has a 100 per cent immunisation rate. The rate is lowest among children in village Banda Nagial, Dharmyal where only 79 per cent of the children were vaccinated. Overall, children in GB42 (91.4%) were more likely to be vaccinated than their counterpart in Dharmyal (87.3%). Sex differences in vaccination do not show any stark trends with both male and female children almost equally likely to get vaccinated. Getting vaccinated does not necessarily mean, though, that it was done for all the diseases and at the right time.

Nutritional Status

A vast majority reported taking three meals in both union councils (91 percent or above) but interestingly, the rate is slightly higher for females than for males.

Food shortage/lack of finances to buy food was the predominant reason for both males and females for not taking three meals per day in GB42 union council. At the same time, part of the survey in Dharmyal was conducted

during the Muslim fasting month of Ramadan. As such, the responses reflected that, as it was the main reason given by males. Interestingly, a much bigger proportion of females in Dharmyal gave "lack of finances" as the reason than their male counterparts.

Infant and Child Deaths

A big proportion of infant deaths take place in the neonatal stage, i.e., 0-30 days. Congenital reasons and those associated with conditions at the time of delivery are usually the reasons associated with such deaths. Death of infants aged 31 days to one year constitutes the second highest proportion for both union councils, taking the rate of death for infants (that is children aged under one year) to over or around 80 percent in both union councils.

Typhoid, diarrhea and pneumonia were among the major causes of death of children reported by the respondents in both the union councils, with measles and chicken pox also contributing to the deaths. Malaria, diphtheria and tetanus in GB42 and stomach problems in Dharmyal union council were also among other major causes.

Housing

House ownership is among the most cherished dreams of a person regarding security per se. Additionally, the nature of the house structure and the

facilities available in it are considered just as significant.

Majority of villagers lived in houses that they owned. Ninety-three percent of houses in Dharmyal and 89.8 percent in GB42 were occupied by their owners.

Water

In terms of access to drinking water, villages in GB42 have an almost universal availability of water source inside their houses. In contrast, less than three quarters of the houses in Dharmyal have water source inside their houses. Large differences are found within Dharmyal ranging from only 45.6 percent (Dharmyal village) to 84.3 percent (Mohra Chapper).

If the water is fetched from outside the house, 28.9 percent of the households in GB42 are shown to rely on motor pumps to get the water while open wells are the main source of water for houses in Dharmyal (63.1%). Intra-union council differences are again found in both union councils. In Dharmyal, villages like Mohra Faqeeran (25%) and Dharmyal (41.1%) have a substantial proportion relying on community tanks for water while for most of the other villages, the proportion is negligible. Likewise, in GB42, 286 GB have motor pumps as the main source outside the house (41.2%) but for 285 GB, the proportion (19.2%) relying on motor pumps is much less.

All of the households in GB42 that are getting water from outside their houses have to travel a kilometer or less while in Dharmyal, the situation is much worse, with 35 percent having to travel over one kilometer. The situation is worst in Mohra Bariyan where 13.1 percent of the households need to travel 2-5 kilometers to get drinking water.

In Dharmyal village, one of the CBMS sites, females, young and old, have to walk long distances every day carrying water.



Garbage Collection

It is disturbing to see that no formal system of garbage collection is present in 95.1 percent of the households in Dharmyal and 99 per cent in GB42. A few of the households in both union councils (3.2 percent in Dharmyal and 1 per cent in GB42) have a private garbage collection system but it is not a substantial proportion. Only a few in Mohra Fageeran (1.3%) report the availability of a garbage collection system managed by the *tehsil* administration.

Toilet Facility

Having a flush connected to a septic tank is the most common type of toilet in both union councils, with 61.6 percent of the households in Dharmyal and 44.9 per cent in GB42 having such facility. The matter of concern here, however, are the households without toilet in the house and those having toilets connected to open drains, which can be a source of disease and pollution. In GB42, 26.8 percent of the houses have toilets connected to open drains while in Dharmyal, the proportion is 13.7 percent. Almost similar proportions in both union councils have houses with no toilet facility (17.3% and 16.8%). As in other cases, there are more intra-union council differences within Dharmyal, with Banda Nagial having 48.3 percent of houses without toilet facility while Mohra Chapper has only 3.7 percent.

Political Participation

The results show a high turnout of respondents in the last local government elections, with males (81.1%) having a higher rate of voting than females (69%).

Dharmyal again shows a variation in the voting rate, with female voting rate ranging from 50.4 percent to 69.9 per cent, and male voting rate varying from 75.2 percent to 89.9 percent. Not much variation is found in the villages of GB42.

It is worth mentioning that in most cases, female responses to this question relate more to the ease of any male member in their household in accessing the local government representative and not her personal access to the representative. Females hardly meet the representatives on their own.

At the union council level, not much difference is found between sexes and also between union councils. Differences, however, could be found among villages in Dharmyal. It is interesting that in some cases, as in Mohra Chapper and Mohra Bariyan in Dharmyal, male and female perceptions vary by more than ten percentage points.

Formation of village councils is one of the requirements of the devolution plan needed to define the budgetary needs of the village. Ground reality, however, shows otherwise. Respondents either reported that there was no village council (VC) in the two union councils or that they were not aware of the presence of one.

Victims of Crime

In terms of the crime situation, the survey shows that the reported crime rate by both males and females is higher in GB42 than in Dharmyal. Not much difference is found between the reports for the two GB42 villages by the male and female respondents but some variation could be found among the Dharmyal villages. Differences are also found in the male and female respondents' report of crime rate in Dharmyal. According to female respondents, Mohra Chapper has the highest crime rate (6.2%) while for male respondents, Dharmyal and Banda Nagial have a rate higher than other villages (3.4 percent each).

The crimes reported by the male and female respondents in the two union

councils refer to those encountered by their household members. Theft, physical attack and pick pocketing are the most common crimes reported. Some sex differences could be found in the reporting but the rates are also being affected by the difference in number of males and females who report experiencing the crime in the first place.

Conclusions

As noted in the results, the pilot study of the CBMS in Pakistan shows that differences are not only found between the two union councils but among intra-union councils. As such, making villages—rather than union councils—as the unit of analysis would perhaps be more meaningful. Likewise, villages are generally resource- and facility-poor even when they are located in an area otherwise considered affluent, as it was found in the case of the Dharmyal union council in this study.

For gender comparisons, sex differences are generally found most likely in education, employment and health.

Finally and in conclusion, additional questions at the household level on health, water and sanitation, and crime situation are being suggested to be included in the NARIMS format to help design a better health delivery system for children and women, especially vis-à-vis immunization for preventable childhood diseases and reproductive health issues, respectively. A better water and sanitation system could also go a long way in making the lives of the people better, as would a more just society where crimes, if committed, are reported and punished. *

CBMS-Philippines Hosts International Workshop on Local Level Gender Responsive Budget

The CBMS Philippines Team hosted the Methodology Workshop on the Integration of Local Level Gender Responsive Budget (LLGRB) and Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) in Manila last March 8-10. The workshop was organized by the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies (AKI) in cooperation with the International Development Research Centre of Canada (IDRC-Canada).

The workshop's general objective was to explore possible ways of combining the CBMS and LLGRB that would help come up with budgets that can address gender disparities. In particular, the workshop attempted to:


- a. determine data requirements and information gaps commonly experienced in LLGRB.

- b. examine the extent by which CBMS can address LLGRB data requirements and information gaps.
- c. explore how LLGRB and CBMS processes can be combined.

Based on the workshop discussions, a potential good fit for CBMS and LLGRB exists. For one, the CBMS can complement the objectives of the gender responsive budget (GRB) by providing a regular source of necessary gender disaggregated data that can indicate issues needing to be addressed and prioritized in the budgeting process. CBMS can also facilitate the targeting of resources to corresponding beneficiaries since it covers information of the entire community population. It can likewise facilitate the monitoring of outputs and outcomes of government programs and their associated budgets.

Meanwhile, the LLGRB can provide an avenue for extending the application of the CBMS at the local level specifically in terms of influencing resource allocation to address gender sensitive concerns. It can also strengthen the use of CBMS data to deepen civic engagement and participation.

The workshop was attended by invited CBMS and GRB practitioners from Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, Philippines, and South Africa. IDRC Senior Program Officer, Ms. Martha Melesse, and AKI Executive Director, Dr. Ponciano Intal, Jr., also participated in the workshop.

Full copies of the workshop program, papers, presentations and directory of participants are available online at the CBMS section of the PEP website at www.pep-net.org 



CBMS and GRB practitioners from Bangladesh, India, Pakistan, the Philippines and South Africa discussed possible ways of integrating the two systems that would help come up with budgets that can address gender disparities.

CBMS Team-DILG Collaboration

The CBMS Network Coordinating Team has recently signed a memorandum of agreement with the Bureau of Local Government Development (BLGD) of the Department of the Interior and Local Government (DILG) in line with a technical collaboration for BLGD's adoption of the CBMS as a tool for monitoring the local progress on the Millennium Development Goals and for poverty diagnosis and planning.

As part of its commitment, the CBMS Team will provide free technical assistance to the BLGD through the conduct of training workshops on CBMS data collection and processing, and digitized mapping for key technical staff of BLGD-DILG. In addition, the instruments on CBMS data collection, data encoding, processing and mapping software developed by the CBMS Team shall be provided to the BLGD at no cost.

Meanwhile, the BLGD-DILG has allocated an amount—which is part of the project fund under the World Bank-Asia-Europe Meeting (ASEM) Project “Capacity-Building for LGUs on Poverty Diagnosis and Planning”—for the conduct of CBMS training workshops for pilot CBMS sites in Marinduque, Camiguin and Masbate. BLGD-DILG has also incorporated the CBMS in its advocacy campaigns for MDG localization in local government units. *

Series of Training Workshops for CBMS Local Partners

The CBMS Team conducted a series of training workshops on data collection and data processing for three provinces, namely, Palawan, Agusan del Sur and Marinduque. Said workshops were in line with the technical collaboration between the CBMS Network Coordinating Team and these local government units.

The training workshops conducted by the team were as follows:

- February 28-March 3 – Data collection and manual data processing for CBMS trainors in Palawan.
- March 14-17 – Data collection for CBMS trainors in Agusan del Sur
- March 17-18 – Data encoding and digitizing for Marinduque and the Bureau of Local Government Development of the Department of Interior and Local Government. *

Joel Bancolita, Database Management Specialist of the CBMS Team, facilitates the training on data encoding for the technical staff of the provincial government of Marinduque and BLGD-DILG.



Presentation at Asian Institute of Management

The CBMS Network Coordinating Team was recently invited by the Asian Institute of Management to present various experiences in the utilization of the community-based monitoring system as a tool for community-building. Representing the team were Ms. Anne Bernadette E. Mandap and Ms. Jasmina P. Asirof.

The invitation to present the CBMS was in line with the Institute's commitment to provide institution-building and community-organizing lessons for the Fellows of the Ford Foundation International Fellowships Program (IFP). The Fellows are recognized leaders from marginalized communities in their respective countries, which include the Philippines (from the local government units of Ifugao, Zamboanga Sibugay, Masbate, Nueva Viscaya, and Dumaguete), China and India. *

PEP 2005 General Meeting in Sri Lanka

On June 13-17, 2005, the Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP) Research Network will hold its annual conference at the Hotel Galadari in Colombo, Sri Lanka.

More than 150 development researchers and stakeholders from all over the world will attend to discuss recent issues, methodologies, and findings on poverty analysis and policy impact assessment. Presentations are to be given by researchers and resource persons from the following three PEP sub-networks: (1) Modeling and Policy Impact Assessment (MPIA); (2) Poverty Monitoring and Measurement Analysis (PMMA); and (3) Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS).

One of the major highlights of the conference this year is a forum on the

impact of the recent tsunami in Asia. The conference will be hosted by the Institute of Policy Studies (IPS)-Sri Lanka and organized by the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies, De La Salle University in cooperation with the Centre Interuniversitaire sur le Risque, les Politiques Économiques et l'Emploi (CIRPÉE, Université Laval) and International Development Research Centre (IDRC, Canada).

Full details on the upcoming conference may be viewed online at www.pep-net.org. Inquiries about the conference may also be sent through the conference secretariat at reyesc@dls-csb.edu.ph or mandapa@dls-csb.edu.ph. *

CBMS Network Updates is the quarterly newsletter of the CBMS Network Project. This work was carried out by the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada.

The **Updates** may be downloaded in Adobe Acrobat format for free from the Project's website. The site can be accessed through <http://www.pep-net.org>.

For inquiries, please write or call:

PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
Rm. I-1016, 10th Floor
Angelo King International Center
Estrada corner Arellano Streets,
Malate, Manila 1004, Philippines
Tel No: (632) 524-5333
Telefax No: (632) 526-2067
E-mail: mimap@dls-csb.edu.ph

Editorial Staff

Celia M. Reyes
Editor-in-Chief

Jennifer P.T. Liguton
Managing Editor

Jasminda P. Asiot,
Joel E. Bancolita,
Marmath Baris, Jr.
Juan Paulo M. Fajardo,
Kenneth C. Ilarde,
Anne Bernadette E. Mandap,
and Lani V. Garnace
Researchers/Writers

CBMS NETWORK UPDATES

PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
Rm. I-1016, 10th Flr. Angelo King International Center
Estrada cor. Arellano Streets, Malate, Manila 1004, Philippines

BUSINESS MAIL

Bulk Pre-sorted **Third Class Mail**
Postage Paid at **Makati Central Post Office**
Under Permit No. **BPSPM-04-05 NCR**
Valid Until **December 31, 2004**
Subject for Postal Inspection