Gender and Social Policy

Methodologies and Research Tools for Integrating Gender into Development Research

Compiled by
Julie Kon Kam King

for the Assessment of Social Policy Reforms (ASPR) Program Initiative of IDRC

November, 1999
If you have comments on this paper, or require additional copies, please contact

Assessment of Social Policy Reforms
Programs Branch
IDRC
250 Albert Street. PO Box 8500
Ottawa, ON
Canada K1G 3H9

Fax: (613) 567-7748
"No set of methods are in themselves sensitive to differences and inequalities between men and women; each method is only as good as its practitioners."


Acknowledgements

The development of this document has evolved from earlier IDRC gender toolkits prepared by Alice Havorka for the Cities Feeding People Program Initiative, Abra Adamo for the Sustainable Use of Biodiversity Program Initiative, and Sam Landon for the Community-Based Natural Resource Management Program Initiative. Special thanks go Steve Langill, Martha Melesse and the ASPR team for their guidance in writing this document.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the Toolkit ...........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION TO THE TOOLKIT ........................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1. Introduction ..................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SECTION 2: KEY TERMS AND CONCEPTS ................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Sex and Gender ..................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.1. Sex ............................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.2. Gender ..........................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.3. Gender Relations .............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1.4. Gender Roles ..................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Gender Equity and Gender Equality ............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1. Gender Equity ................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.2. Gender Equality .............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.3. Gender Equality and Organizational Transformation ....</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3. Gender in Policy, Programmes and Projects ..................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1. Gender Mainstreaming ......................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2. Gender Analysis .............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3. Gender Analysis Frameworks ................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.4. Gender Disaggregation .....................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.5. Gender Division of Labour ..................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.6. Practical Gender Interests/Needs ............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.7. Strategic Gender Interest/Needs .............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.8. Gender-Blind Research ......................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.9. Gender-Sensitive Research ..................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.10. Gender-Neutral Research ...................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.11. Gender-Specific Research ..................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.12. Gender-Transformative Research ............................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.13. Gender Impact ...............................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.14. Gender Indicator ...........................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.15. Evolving Development Strategies ...........................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4. Policy Approaches to Women’s Involvement in Development (Chart) .................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5. History of Approaches to Development and Gender (Chart) ................................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6. Gender and Development (Chart) ................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7. Women in Development vs Gender and Development (Chart) .................................................................</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8. Practical Needs and Strategic Interests (Chart) ............</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SECTION 3: GENDER AND SOCIAL POLICY GUIDELINES

3.1. General Guidelines
   3.1.1. Assessing the Team’s Resources
   3.1.2. Reviewing the Objectives
   3.1.3. Defining the Research Project
   3.1.4. Assessing the Methodology
   3.1.5. Evaluating the Research
   3.1.6. Disseminating and Applying the Research Results
   3.1.7. Assessing Gender Impacts of Policy Reform

3.2. Targeted Guidelines
   3.2.1. Poverty and Access to Resources
   3.2.2. Health
   3.2.3. Education
   3.2.4. Socio-Economic Analysis
   3.2.5. Gendered Knowledge, Expertise and Technology

SECTION 4: READING MATERIALS
Overview of the Reading Materials
Selected Readings

SECTION 5: REFERENCES
5.1. Annotated Bibliography and Further Readings
5.2. Institutional and Web Resources
5.3. Regional Network Contacts
PURPOSE OF THE TOOLKIT

About the toolkit

• This kit is constructed as a reference tool to stimulate adaptation and innovation in research. It is designed to aid IDRC staff and research partners in the South to re-think conceptions of gender and to provide a starting point for integrating gender into each level of the research and project cycle. It aims to provide a working base from which researchers can build their own methodologies and tools, and begin reflecting upon and sharing lessons learned. Although it is specifically built for social policy researchers and existing and prospective IDRC partners, development practitioners, government officials, independent consultants and other individuals involved in the field of social policy will find this toolkit useful.

What is the format of the toolkit?

• The format has been designed to allow researchers to familiarize themselves with key concepts and ideas about gender, while at the same time providing access to practical research tools. The toolkit is divided into five main sections. Section One is a general introduction to the field of gender and social policy. Section Two is an index of the key terms and concepts which appear in most gender and social policy literature. Section Three features gender mainstreaming guidelines developed specifically for social policy research. It is divided into two parts: generic guidelines for incorporating gender concerns into project cycles; and targeted guidelines in the areas of poverty, health, education, socio-economic analysis, and technology. Section Four consists of relevant reading materials on gender and social policy. Section Five is a reference tool which included an annotated bibliography and a list of suggested readings; a web-resource guide; and a list of contacts for professionals working in the field. To facilitate use of the toolkit, the beginning of each main section is marked by a corresponding tab, and the different parts are divided by coloured inserts.

Why were the readings selected?

• The reading materials selected for inclusion in the toolkit cover a range of academic and practical perspectives. They are intended to provoke the user to examine the arguments presented and decide which ideas or practices outlined may be most appropriate or relevant to the environment she/he is working in. The readings were selected from an in depth literature search in consultation with academics, other professionals in the field, and the Gender and Sustainable Development Unit and the Research Information Specialists at the IDRC. The accessibility of the language of the article, its publication date, and its relevance in broadening the parameters of social policy were prime considerations in making article selections. Readers should note that the views expressed in the readings included are those of the original author(s) and do not necessarily represent those of the IDRC.
How should the Toolkit be used?

- The toolkit should be a starting point for locating gender within social policy research projects. Users are not required to read every article or apply every guideline, but should work with those which may shed insight on their particular area of interest and provide a framework for further innovation. It may be helpful to have different members of a research team survey diverse articles to stimulate debate or discussion on each topic. In addition, organizing training sessions, or disseminating articles to other researchers are effective strategies for encouraging gender mainstreaming into projects and promoting the formation of new gender-sensitive networks.

Where can you receive more information about the Toolkit and the resources included?

- Copies of the toolkit and information about IDRC’s activities in the field of social development can be obtained by contacting the Assessment of Social Policy Reforms (ASPR) Program Initiative at the following address: IDRC, 250 Albert St., P.O. Box 8500, Ottawa, ON, Canada. K1G 3H9. Tel: (613) 236-6163; Fax: (613) 567-7748. (http://www.idrc.ca/socdev). ASPR welcomes your feedback regarding the accessibility and practicality of this toolkit and any changes it has made in facilitating the mainstreaming of gender in particular research initiatives.
Section 1: Introduction to the Toolkit

1.1. Introduction

Since the declaration of the UN Decade for Women in 1975, and following the UN and NGO Beijing Conference on Women almost two decades later, the world has turned its eyes to the enormous gaps in addressing women's diverse needs and development objectives. While a large body of literature has emerged detailing the systematic exclusion of women in economic, social, and political life, the transition from critiques of existing systems to actual shifts in policies and programs has been both fragmented and disjointed. Thus, despite progress in redressing the structural imbalances, women still remain on the periphery of many mainstream development planning and policy initiatives.

At the turn of the millennium, governments in the South are compelled to juggle the ongoing challenges of structural adjustment policies, shifting demographics, limited state capacities, persistent poverty, civil wars, and turmoiled transitions to democracy. In this context, privatization, decentralization, fees for services, and targeting are examples of measures implemented as states re-examine the costs of social safety nets and discuss options to reform existing welfare systems. The values and assumptions guiding such social policy changes do not necessarily allow for equal entitlements to social welfare, nor do they redistribute evenly the burden of compensating for lost services particularly among women. Yet, these changes have significant impacts on how community groups, families, and individuals, must redefine obligations and responsibilities in coping with reduced state spending and less affordable access to resources.

Statistics from the 1995 World Summit for Social Development indicate that women: still receive 50% less wages and job opportunities than their male counterparts; continue to make up 70% of the world’s poor; have lower caloric intake in proportion to body weight than most men; and an estimated 100,000,000 have gone missing as a result of recurrent femicides and female dowry deaths.

Women’s worsening situation in many developing countries signals a need for re-orientation in social policy research and practice. There is a need to address changing development dynamics and to allow development researchers and planners to acquire the knowledge and tools to consider what roles government and civil society organizations can play in facilitating sustainable gender-sensitive change. There is also a need for research to re-examine the implications of social policy reforms and the consequences they have on women’s division of labour, positions in the household and community, and access to fundamental services. Ultimately, this requires an ongoing commitment to gender mainstreaming in all areas of the policy process.

Over the last three years, the International Development Research Centre of Canada (IDRC) has supported the Assessment of Social Policy Reform (ASPR) program initiative. ASPR draws on the IDRC’s former experiences in applied social policy research to assess various approaches to social policy reform; develop and test low cost methods, instruments and indicators for measuring the impact of social policy reform; and foster South-South and North-South collaboration to produce knowledge bases and information resources. It recognizes that neither the processes nor the impact
of social policies are gender neutral. In following with the IDRC’s stance towards gender mainstreaming, ASPR aims to incorporate gender sensitive methodology, disaggregate research data, and outline gender components in its policy recommendations. In the past three years, it has worked at gender mainstreaming by: giving attention to gender issues at the level of project development and design; targeting research on gender-related issues arising from ASPR’s core areas; and identifying and collaborating with Southern and Canadian partners with relevant expertise and interest in gender-oriented social policy research.

As part of ASPR’s sustained commitment to integrating gender into its activities, this toolkit has been developed to assist current and prospective research partners in incorporating gender into their research methodologies. As a research tool, it marks an important step in providing IDRC partners with the resources to plan and implement their own gender-sensitive frameworks and projects and confront the challenges of long-term sustainable development.
Section 2: Key Terms and Concepts

The purpose of this section is to provide information on the ideas and terminology which are often used in gender and development literature. This is followed by five graphs which outline from a historical perspective, some of the major frameworks used in discussing women’s development issues.

2.1. SEX AND GENDER

2.1.1. Sex

"Sex is the biological difference between men and women. Sex differences are concerned with men’s and women’s bodies."


2.1.2. Gender

"The term gender refers to the economic, social, political and cultural attributes and opportunities associated with being male and female. In most societies, men and women differ in the activities they undertake, in access and control of resources, and in participation in decision-making."

*Source: Woroniuk, Beth, Helen Thomas and Johanna Schalkwyk, Gender: The Concept, its Meaning and Uses - A Think Piece, Department for Policy and Legal Services, SIDA, May 1997, pg. 2*

"The difference between men and women that are socially constructed, changeable over time and that have wide variations within and between cultures. Gender is a socio-economic and political variable with which to analyse roles, responsibilities, constraints and opportunities of people; it considers both men and women. Neither are gender and sex, nor gender and women synonyms. Gender refers to roles; sex refers to the biological state of being male or female; and women refers to adult females"

*Source: Taborga Carolina and Beryl Leach, IPS Gender and Development Glossary, Rome, December 1996, pg 26*

"Gender is a way of distinguishing between biological difference and the social construction of maleness and femaleness. It refers to the distinctive qualities of men and women that are culturally created. The concept of gender helps to explain that women’s inferior status in society is not determined by their biological sex but is constructed socially. Furthermore, gender is not a homogenous category; it is internally differentiated and elaborated by class, race/ethnicity, age, culture and other hierarchical social relations which organize a society’s institutions and practices.

"Gender is also a relational concept and implies a relationship between men and women. The assumption thus that “women’s issues” are only women’s concern, and that these issues may be marginalised from “larger” considerations about political and economic considerations, are thus misplaced. Gender is not about women: it refers to a structural relationship between men and women which is linked to the state, the economy, and to other macro- and micro-processes and institutions."

2.1.3. Gender Relations

"Gender relations seek to shift attention away from looking at women and men as isolated categories to looking at the social relationships through which they are mutually constituted as unequal social categories. Gender is constructed through a society's assignment of some activities to women and others to men. Gender relations are constructed out of the activities of actors and institutions and as such they are subject to change. In other words, gender relations vary historically.

Gender relations are, more often than not, unequal. They often signify a relation of subordination and domination between women and men. The condition of their existence and transformation depends upon existing and changing power relations, upon the material conditions which give rise to existing and new forms of social action.

In sum, gender is a socially constructed relationship between men and women which is often unequal, historically variable and subject to change. Gender relations are constituted, like all other social relations, through the rules, norms and practices by which resources are allocated, tasks and responsibilities are assigned, value is given and power is mobilized. Gender relations, in other words, do not operate in a social vacuum but are products of the ways in which institutions are organized and reconstituted over time. To overcome inequality it is important to recognize that unequal relations are made in history through social construction and not in nature and hence can be unmade through organized human intervention.”


2.1.4. Gender Roles

“Gender roles are due to social factors that influence or allocate activities, responsibilities, and decision-making authority to groups of people. Gender roles change, often spontaneously and sometimes quickly, as the underlying social, economic, and technological conditions change. Social factors which underlie and sometimes reinforce gender differences include religious practices, ethnic or cultural attitudes, class or caste, the formal legal system, and institutional arrangements. Adapted from: One Hundred Words for Equality: A glossary of terms on equality between women and men. European Commission: Employment and Social Affairs. January 1998.

2.2. GENDER EQUITY AND GENDER EQUALITY

2.2.1. Gender Equity

“Gender equity is the process of being fair to women and men. To ensure fairness measures must often be available to compensate for historical and social disadvantages that prevent women and men from otherwise operating on a level playing field. Equity leads to equality.”


“Systemic discrimination means that some people are better placed to exploit opportunities than others. Therefore, in initiatives to decrease disadvantage, whether for women or disadvantaged groups, we need
to consider carefully the underlying barriers to equal participation, aiming at measuring for equity of impact, not just equality of opportunity”.
Source: Canadian Council for International Co-operation, MATCH International Centre, Association Québécoise des organismes de coopération Internationale, Two Halves Make a Whole, Balancing Gender Relations in Development, 1991

2.2.2. Gender Equality

“Gender equality requires equal enjoyment by women and men of socially-valued goods, opportunities, resources and rewards. Gender equality does not mean that men and women become the same, but that their opportunities and life chances are equal. The emphasis on gender equality and women’s empowerment does not presume a particular model of gender equality for all societies and cultures, but reflects a concern that women and men have equal opportunities to make choices about what gender equality means and work in partnership to achieve it. Because of current disparities, equal treatment of women and men is insufficient as a strategy for gender equality. Equal treatment in the context of inequalities can mean the perpetuation of disparities. Achieving gender equality will require changes in institutional practices and social relations through which disparities are reinforced and sustained. It also requires a strong voice for women in shaping their societies.”

2.2.3. Gender Equality and Organizational Transformation

“...work organizations, having been created largely by and for men, tend to reflect masculine values, experiences and life situations in their systems, practices, structures and norms. As a result everything we come to regard as normal and commonplace at work often privileges traits that are socially or culturally ascribed to men while devaluing or ignoring those ascribed to women ... our approach (to achieve gender equality) focusses on systems, practices and norms - things that on the surface appear to be merely routine, gender neutral, artifacts of organizational life and seeks to change them in ways that will be beneficial not only to women, but also for men, and very importantly, for the organization. We call this approach the dual agenda. It is dual because it has an agenda for change that encompasses not only, gender equality, but also organizational effectiveness and performance. Thus, the focus is on identifying as leverage points for change those systemic issues in the organization that both reproduce gender inequality and also have a negative effect on organizational performance, inhibiting the organization’s ability to envision alternative work practices or adapt to new demands”
Source, Merrill-Sands, Deborah, 1999, Report to the International Development research Centre (IDRC) - Gender and Sustainable Development Unit - gender and organizational change - observations for IDRC's programming and its work place, Internal Report

2.3. GENDER IN POLICY, PROGRAMMES AND PROJECTS

2.3.1. Gender Mainstreaming

“Gender mainstreaming is a two fold process: agenda setting to transform the thrust of development policy in order to bring gender concerns into the mainstream; and, the integration of gender concerns into the mainstream of existing practices within the Centre’s institutional policy, programme initiatives,
“Mainstreaming is a process rather than a goal. It is not concerned with simply increasing women’s participation; rather it is concerned with the terms of their participation. A commitment to mainstreaming does not preclude a focus on women and is a collaborative effort.”

Source: Experiences In Mainstreaming For Gender Equality, Presented to the UNICEF Meeting of Gender Focal Points, 5-9 May 1997, By Joanne Sandler UNIFEM, http://www.unifem.undp.org/pap_main.htm as at 30/03/1999

“It is the systematic integration of the respective situations, priorities, and needs of women and men in all policies, programs, and projects and with a view to promoting equality between women and men and mobilizing all general policies and measures specifically for the purpose of achieving equality by actively and openly taking into account, at the planning stage, their effects on the respective situations of women and men in implementation, monitoring and evaluation.”


2.3.2. Gender Analysis

“Gender analysis, in terms of research for development, is:

(i) a process that assesses the differential impact of proposed and/or existing research on men and women; and
(ii) a tool that makes it possible for research to be undertaken with an appreciation of gender differences, of the nature of relationships between women and men and of their different social realities, life expectations and economic circumstances; and
(iii) a tool for understanding social processes and for responding with informed and equitable options.”


“It is the systematic examination of roles, relationships, and processes between women and men in all societies, focussing on imbalances in power, wealth and workload. Gender analysis can also include the examination of the multiple ways in which women and men, as social actors, engage in strategies to transform existing roles, relationships, and processes in their own interest and in the interest of others.”


2.3.3. Gender Analysis Frameworks

“Gender analysis frameworks are practical instruments designed to help users integrate a gender analysis into social research and planning. Gender analysis frameworks concentrate on certain factors in women’s and men’s lives. The chosen focus reflects a set of values and assumptions on the part of the frameworks designers. When you use a framework, these values and assumptions will ultimately influence the type of development interventions you select. It is important, therefore, to be aware, as far as possible, of the thinking behind the gender frameworks. Some gender analysis frameworks take an efficiency approach whereas others have the objective of empowerment. Some of the main gender analysis frameworks
available are:

- Harvard Analytical Framework
- People-Oriented Planning Framework
- Moser Framework
- Gender Analysis Matrix
- Capacities and Vulnerabilities Analysis Framework
- Women's Empowerment (Longwe) Framework
- Social Relations Approach

(For more information on these gender analysis frameworks consult Chapter 2 of the following source.)


2.3.4. Gender-disaggregation

Gender-disaggregation entails the collection and separation of data and statistical information by gender to enable comparative analysis/gender analysis (should include sampling of both women and men)

2.3.5. Gender Division of Labour

Gender division of labour is the allocation of paid and unpaid work between women and men in private and public life.


2.3.6. Practical Gender Interests / Needs

Practical needs can be defined as necessities which improve the condition of women and men in the short term. They generally include responses to inadequate living conditions regarding clean water, shelter, income, health care, etc.

“If these were met the lives of women (or men) would be improved without changing the existing gender division of labour or challenging women’s sub-ordinate position in society. Meeting practical interests/needs is a response to an immediate perceived necessity; interventions which do are typically concerned with inadequacies in living conditions such as water provision, health care and employment”.


2.3.7. Strategic Gender Interests / Needs

“Strategic Interests are long term and related to improving women’s position. Access to participatory democratic processes is in the strategic interest of the poor in general. Access to gender equality is in the strategic interest of women in particular. Empowering women to have more opportunities, greater access to resources, and more equal participation with men in decision making is in the long term strategic interest if the majority of the world’s men and women alike.”

“If these were met the existing relations between men and women would be transformed. These interests relate to the gender divisions of labour power and control. Those identifies by women may be issuers such as legal rights, domestic violence, equal wages and women’s control over their bodies”.

These interests refer to the relative status or position of women to men in society. They vary in each context and in relation to gender divisions in labour, resources, and power. Strategic interests tend to imply/require structural change over the long-term to address systemic discrimination. Strategic interests may include legal rights, increased decision-making, access to the means of production, and women’s control over their own bodies. Adapted from: One Hundred Words for Equality: A glossary of terms on equality between women and men, European Commission: Employment and Social Affairs. January 1998.

2.3.8. Gender-blind Research

Gender-blind research is implicitly premised on the notion of a male development agent and which, while often couched in apparently gender-neutral language, is implicitly male-biased in that it privileges male interests and priorities in the distribution of opportunities and resources.

“Gender-blind research does not acknowledge the unequal division of resources and responsibilities between men and women. It is important to note that a gender-blind framework dismisses and not simply misses the unequal relations between men and women. In some literature this phenomenon is termed “gender-neutrality” and such research as “gender-neutral”. However, neutrality implies equal distance and/or equal representation of the existing gender roles and responsibilities. Gender-blindness involves a denial of such differences and by implication gender-blind framework privileges male interests as human interests and as a social norm. In this sense, gender-blindness contributes to sustaining unequal gender relations.”

2.3.9. Gender-sensitive Research

Gender-sensitive research, in contrast to gender-blind processes, recognizes that both women as well as men have social agency, that they are constrained in different, and often unequal ways, as potential participants and beneficiaries in the development process and that they may consequently have different, and sometimes conflicting needs, interests and priorities

“It is the recognition of gender differentiated reality and the realization that men and women may have different interests, goals and preferences. Gender-sensitive research could have many levels and it ranges from a researcher’s sensitivity to recognizing existing gender division of resources and responsibilities in order to realize certain predetermined goals and objectives, to focusing on a specific sex in order to meet certain gender-specific needs more effectively to proposing a new agenda which (potentially) transforms the existing gender relations.
Gender sensitivity in research, in a nutshell, is a reconstructive project which ranges from including marginalized actors to critically examining the reality from the perspective of these actors. It is a process
Gender sensitivity in research, in a nutshell, is a reconstructive project which ranges from including marginalized actors to critically examining the reality from the perspective of these actors. It is a process of evolution and change and is marked by several levels of critical engagement with gendered reality. The following categories of gender-sensitive research may help to identify certain levels in these processes. These categories are not discrete and can be overlapping but at the same time they represent the many layers of the continuous process of change. It is important to note that the process from inclusion to interpreting the gendered reality and finally transforming it, requires researcher’s constant interrogation of her/his own assumptions about social relations and reality.”


2.3.10. Gender-neutral Research

“In this category of projects there is a recognition of the existing gender division of resources and responsibilities in order to realize certain predetermined project goals and objectives. But while there is a recognition of the (often unequal) division of existing resources and responsibilities, the research does not make an attempt to address this division. It assumes the existing productive and reproductive division as natural and avoids any analysis of current power relations.

Thus, a gender-neutral research is not dismissive of gender differential divisions of resources and responsibilities but it misses the power dynamic in defining the existing gender relations and hence is unlikely to impact the existing divisions. Unlike the gender-blind approach which is dismissive of gender differential impact of project interventions, a gender-neutral version of intervention recognizes the divisions and distributions within the households and communities but does not act as a catalyst of change.”


2.3.11. Gender-specific Research

“This research involves focusing on a specific group/sex in order to achieve certain policy goals or meet certain gender-specific needs more effectively. Like the WID approaches, this favors marginalized gender groups and has the potential to challenge existing "natural" division of labour as it addresses intra-household relationships and the current power situations. However, gender-specific research intends to meet targeted needs of a particular group within existing distribution of resources and responsibilities.

Such a research activity is often the result of an approach of counteracting the bias, both conscious and unconscious, against a particular sex/gender group. Since the focus is on a specific group, this intervention increases visibility of research needs of such a marginalized gender group.

On the other hand, gender-specific research also has the danger of slipping into "fixing the women" administrative approach. It may also reify and naturalize the existing gender roles if in attempting to counteract the bias, it fails to bring about a change in the existing roles and fails to envision new roles.”

2.3.12. Gender-transformative Research

Such an intervention may target women, men or both and recognize the existence of gender-specific needs and constraints but it additionally seeks to transform the existing gender relations in a more egalitarian direction through the redistribution of resources and responsibilities.

*Adapted from: Kabeer, Naila and Ramya Subrahmanian, Institutions, Relations and Outcomes: Framework and Tools for Gender Aware Planning, IDS Discussion Paper 357, September 1996*

"The crucial element in transformational thinking is redistribution in such a way that the advance is sustained. Equally important is that women should themselves feel that they have been the agents of the transformation that they have won this new space for action themselves." (Young 1993).

"Gender-transformative research is the result of a vision of transformation which will potentially create new space for marginalized groups to articulate their rights. It articulates the demands of a gender-just order."


2.3.13. Gender Impact

Gender impact refers to a change in gender relations, or gender roles that results in the process of development. Gender impact may be measured through gender indicators.

*Source: A Guide to Gender Sensitive Indicators, CIDA, (1996, 61) *

2.3.14. Gender Indicator

"A gender indicator provides direct evidence of the status of women, relative to some agrees normative standard of explicit reference group (Johnston, 1985). In other words a statistic becomes an indicator when it has a reference point against which value judgements can be made. A gender indicator can be defined as using quantitative and qualitative measures to capture gender-related changes in society over time."

*Source: A Guide to Gender Sensitive Indicators, CIDA, (1996, 61) *

"Gender sensitive indicators have the special function of pointing out how far and in what ways development programs and projects have met their gender objectives and achieved results related to gender equity. Gender sensitive indicators measure gender-related changes in society in time."

*Source: A Project Level Handbook - The Why and How of Gender Sensitive Indicators, CIDA, (1996,1) *

2.3.15. Evolving Development Strategies

"Women in Development (WID) is the earliest approach in the woman and development literature. It originated as a feminist critique of dominant development modes, which often ignored women and deprived them of their traditional status and economic opportunities. Influenced by liberalism the WID approach seeks to improve the situation of women by integrating them into development policy and practice"
“Women, Environment and Development (WED) is an approach within the women and development literature which emphasizes the intersections between gender, development and the environment. There are two strands of the WED approach. The first advocates a women-centred approach to sustainable development based on the special relationship between women and nature. The second criticizes the modernist, growth oriented (dominant) development model and its implications for women and the environment.”

“Gender and Development (GAD) is an approach within the woman and development literature. It focuses in particular on the social construction of gender roles and relations. Since GAD assumes that the gendered divisions of labour and power are constructed and not a natural given, it sets out to transform gender roles and relations.”

Source: Eds Marchand, Marianne and Jane L Parpart, Glossary, Feminism / Postmodernism / Development, Routledge

Adapted with permission from the GSD Unit, IDRC: Ottawa, August, 1999.
## 2.4 POLICY APPROACHES TO WOMEN'S INVOLVEMENT IN DEVELOPMENT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause of the Problems</th>
<th>Welfare</th>
<th>Anti-poverty</th>
<th>Efficiency</th>
<th>Equity</th>
<th>Empowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Circumstances that are beyond control.</td>
<td>Lack of resources, causing low standard of living.</td>
<td>Failure by development planners to recognise women's role in production, and necessity to involve women.</td>
<td>Patriarchy, exploitation, subordination, and oppression of women by men.</td>
<td>Women's subordination not only by men, but as an aspect of colonial and neo-colonial oppression.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Goals or purpose | To support motherhood as the most important role for women in society. To relieve suffering. | To raise production to ensure poor women increase their productivity. To integrate women into development. | To ensure that development is more efficient and more effective. “Feed the Nation.” | To gain equity for women in development by grafting gender into the development process. | To empower women through greater self-reliance. Building new political, economic, and social structures. To challenge/overcome exploitative structures. |

| Service Programs | Fanine relief programs, Family Planning, Nutrition (improving family health, especially of children through maternal care). Activities to meet Practical Gender Needs. | Training women in technical skills. Small-scale income-generating activities to meet basic needs (practical gender needs). | Programs that meet PGN in the context of declining social services. Rely on all three roles of women and the elasticity of time. | Organize to reform structures. To meet SGN in terms of Triple roles. | Programs that address themselves to SGN in terms of Triple Role - through bottom-up mobilisation around PGNs to confront oppression. |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Change</th>
<th>Functional change (non-challenging)</th>
<th>Functional change (non-challenging)</th>
<th>Functional change (non-challenging)</th>
<th>Structural change (challenging) Equal Rights/ opportunities.</th>
<th>Structural change (challenging)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

| Type of Leadership | Strong reliance on authority (patriarchal in nature)-residual model of social welfare with modernisation in ideology, and roots in colonialism. | Consultative-ideological reproduction of values that reinforce patriarchy and women's subordination. | Authoritarian/consultative. Women seen as a resource. | Participatory to reform structures. Top-down state intervention to reduce inequality. | Enabling, participatory, build solidarity, overcome fear (alternative n/f balanced structures). "Bottom-up." |

| Type of Service | Welfare - assuming women are passive beneficiaries of development. | Anti-poverty - development (integrating women into development). Poor women isolated as a category. Recognition of the productive roles of women. | Efficiency - Policies of economic stabilisation and adjustment rely on women's involvement. | Equity - reforming, liberating. Women seen as active participants in development. | Empowerment, transformation, liberation. Largely unsupported by Government or agencies. Slow steady growth of under-financed voluntary organizations. |


2.5. HISTORY OF APPROACHES TO DEVELOPMENT AND TO GENDER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PERIOD</th>
<th>MAINSTREAM</th>
<th>NGO</th>
<th>WOMEN’S MOVEMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1950's</td>
<td>-build infrastructure so the economy can grow. -allow productivity to “take off.” -benefits will trickle down. -include (primarily male) labour force skills and health as an element of good infrastructure. -women targeted for &quot;reproductive&quot; roles (family health and nutrition) and welfare.</td>
<td>-NGOs involved mainly in welfare and disaster relief work.</td>
<td>-In North, women (except the poorest) returned to the home after the war, to traditional &quot;reproductive roles.&quot; -In the South, women active in liberation struggles, subsistence production.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960's</td>
<td>-political control and redistribution seen as important by newly independent nation. -terms of trade of Third World commodities and capital goods challenged by Southern development thinkers. -major development thinking continues as in the 50's.</td>
<td>-NGOs begin development work, with an approach based on organizing at the community level. -NGOs organize communities, especially for infrastructure construction and productive work. -community considered to be homogeneous -much NGO work directed towards creating informal or formal cooperatives. -work with women mainly health, nutrition, home management.</td>
<td>-Northern women begin to fight for legal right and against workforce discrimination and educational barriers. -end of the decade sees launching of current wave of women's movement. -Boserup's book on impact of development on women published in 1970.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970's</td>
<td>-since inequality is increasing and productivity is lower than expected, &quot;basic needs&quot; theory is adopted. -all men(and, to some extent, women need food, shelter, security to become productive.) -projects focus on provision of income, housing, especially for the poor. -infrastructural development continues.</td>
<td>-beginning of development education, changing opinions at home toward fairer trade. -New International Economic Order, campaign for better Southern commodity prices, to establish producer cartels. -attempts to reform unfair national and international structures through pressure and negotiation by base groups (Korten's 3rd Generation).</td>
<td>-increased documentation of problems development is creating for Southern women. -1973 Percy amendment to USAID legislation. -1975 declared International Women's Year. UN Decade (1976-85).Major conferences held in Mexico, Copenhagen, Nairobi. -improving women's productivity becomes a goal of mainstream development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980's</td>
<td>-Third World debt is increasing. -productivity is not increasing. -terms of North-South trade continue to exploit Southern primary commodities. -structural adjustment theory developed to make Southern governments less costly, more efficient.</td>
<td>-attempts to influence development (Korten's 4th generation). -NGOs identify woman's exclusion as an issue; respond mainly with projects oriented to women. -growth of indigenous Southern NGOs as planners and implementers of NGO development, partnership-based programs.</td>
<td>-conceptual frameworks (Harvard, Gender Planning Framework) developed. -DAWN critiques WID and begins to create a transformational gender and development theory. -Southern grass roots women increasingly ask for resources, benefits -as women continue to struggle for greater equity, male and institutional backlash increases.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.6. INTRODUCING GAD: A SUMMARY

1. The Community Situation:
   - Communities are complex.
   - Two major contributors: women and men.
   - Women's position is subordinate.
   - Sexual/gender division of labour: women's work is less valued.
   - Three categories of work: productive, reproductive, community.
   - Women and men: differential access to/control of resources and benefits.
   - Women are more often excluded from decision-making.
   - Gender relations vary/change over time and place.

2. Development Strategies
   - Empowerment/enable women and men collectively to determine their own development.
   - Increase the access of women and men to resources, options and political power.
   - Involve women and men as development decision-makers.
   - Transform gender relations.
   - Achieve equality of impact/benefit.

3. Development Actions
   - Carry out gender analysis and analysis of gender power relationships of "community situation.
   - Establish means of consultation with women and men.
   - Identify/address condition and practical needs of women and men.
   - Identify/address condition and practical needs of women and men.
   - Identify/address position and strategic interests of women.
   - Address strategic interest of community for greater economic and political strength.

4. Goal
   - Equitable, sustainable participatory development.

Reprinted with permission from Two Halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, 1991, CCIC, Match and AQOCI: Ottawa, 178.
2.7. FROM WID TO GAD

“WID” and “GAD” are sometimes used interchangeably. This chart outlines some basic differences between the WID and GAD approach. This is a simplified variation, it is not exhaustive but can be used effectively as a presentation outline or handout for beginners in gender theory.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN WID AND GAD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women in Development (WID)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Approach</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-An approach which views women as the problem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Focus</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Problem</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-The exclusion of women(half of productive resources) from the development process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Goal</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-More efficient, effective development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Solution</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Integrate women into the existing development process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The Strategies</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Women’s projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Women’s components.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Integrated projects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Increase women’s productivity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Increase women’s income.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Increase women’s ability to look after household.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reprinted with permission from Two halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, 1991, CCIC, Match and AQOCI: Ottawa, 178.
### 2.8. PRACTICAL NEEDS AND STRATEGIC INTERESTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practical Needs</th>
<th>Strategic Interests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Tend to be immediate, short term.</td>
<td>- Tend to be long-term.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Unique to particular women.</td>
<td>- Common to almost all women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Relate to daily needs: Food, housing, income, healthy children etc.</td>
<td>- Relate to disadvantaged position: subordination, lack of resources and education, vulnerability to poverty and violence etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Easily identifiable by women.</td>
<td>- Basis of disadvantage and potential for change not always identifiable by women.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Can be addressed by provision of specific inputs: food, hand pumps, clinic, etc.</td>
<td>- Can be addressed by: consciousness-raising, increasing self-confidence, education, strengthening women’s organizations, political mobilization, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Addressing Practical Needs</th>
<th>Addressing Strategic Interests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Tends to involve women as beneficiaries, but not always as participants</td>
<td>- Involves women as agents or enables women to become agents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Can improve the condition of women’s lives</td>
<td>- Can improve the position of women in society.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Generally does not alter traditional roles and relationships.</td>
<td>- Can empower women and transform relationships.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*N.B. It should be noted that this is just one framework for looking at women’s needs. It is important to realize that the divide between practical and strategic needs is not static and both types of needs influence each other in the politicized attempt to gain access to and control over resources.

Reprinted with permission from Two halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, 1991, CCIC, Match and AQOCI-Ottawa, 178.
Section 3: Gender and Social Policy Guidelines

This part of the tool kit features sets of questions designed to offer gender guidelines for researchers and planners at each stage of the project cycle. They are not exhaustive lists, but rather touch on key areas that should be reflected upon in carrying out development projects.

3.1. General Guidelines

Consider the research area and research project design systematically in light of the questions raised below. Wherever possible, provide concrete answers to the questions and identify possible 'entry points' for including gender in the design of the research.

Consider the ability of the principal researchers(s) and / or research team(s) to recognize and address relevant knowledge about the topic and its relevance to men and women. Identify available literature, documents and bibliographies in the subject area, and their relevance for men and women.

Dis-aggregate data and research finding wherever possible.

Challenge key concepts or terminologies which might obscure differences between men and women (e.g. broad references to "communities;" "groups;" "households;" "participants;" "constituencies;" etc.) Wherever possible, specify the participants and the beneficiaries of the research.

Identify specific resources (e.g. human, financial) required to integrate gender into the design, implementation and evaluation of the research (e.g. methodological expertise, training requirements, budgetary resources, etc.)

Develop a strategy for disseminating the research and maximizing its potential impact on policy.

3.1.1. Assessing the Team’s Resources

• Does the researcher or research team possess adequate knowledge about gender issues to incorporate these into the research? How is this knowledge being informed or constructed? Was a gender resource person consulted? If so, what form should this consultation and collaboration take?
• Will there be a need for gender-specific expertise or training? At what stages in the research would such training be most important? What resources are required - budgetary or otherwise - to ensure access to such expertise or training?
• Are there any women on the project team? What are their roles and responsibilities compared to male team members?
• What is the female/male breakdown of researchers, participants, disseminators?
• What role (if any) will men’s and women’s organizations play in the research process?
• Will all stakeholders be involved in gender analysis? How?

3.1.2. Reviewing the Objectives

• Who are the intended beneficiaries?
• Do the objectives specify between women and men or other socio-economic groups? Are gender dynamics included in the general or specific project objectives?
• Are project objectives explicitly related to women's needs? Have women participated in setting those objectives? Has the proposal built on earlier efforts? Is so, how?
• Is gender equity a specified objective?
• Has any other research been previously conducted on the topic? Was it gender inclusive? If not, how did it overlook gender dimensions?
• Do any of the objectives challenge the existing or customary gender division of labour, tasks, opportunities, responsibilities and obligations? How?
• How specifically will the project contribute to men's and women's increased empowerment?

3.1.3. Defining the Research Project

• Does the research topic appear to be "gender neutral" or "gender blind"? Are different experiences, status, and resources of men and women considered relevant factors? What has been assumed or overlooked?
• Does the research differentiate within categories of "men" and "women" (e.g. by class, ethnicity, race, head of household, religion, age)? Does the proposal use broad references to "women," "families," "the community," or "the poor"? Or does it instead detail the different constraints and needs of women and men in and across diverse demographic groups?
• How does the problem (topic of research) involve and affect women and men differently? What are the gender dynamics behind the problem?
• Who is the beneficiary of the research project? Why are they beneficiaries?
• Who was consulted in identifying and describing the problem? How are their opinions solicited and evaluated? What is their relationship to the project? (Target group, local organization, project team?) What criteria are used to define the issues, which question take precedence and why?
• What are the shared responsibilities between men and women as they relate to this subject of research? Who looks after the diverse family resources and how are they renumerated for this? How do different family structures affect the division of responsibilities, and what value is prescribed to different tasks? Does this affect decision-making power? How do these evaluations of the value of different responsibilities relate to the cultural and traditional norms and beliefs about gender roles within the country?
• Could the project reduce women's access to, or control of other resources and benefits?
• Could it adversely affect their situation in some other way? In the short and longer run?

3.1.4. Assessing Methodology

• Are gender differences reflected in the conceptual frameworks, objectives, methodology, expected outputs and anticipated impact of research? How can attention to the different situations of men and women be incorporated into these aspects of research design?
• Does the methodology include gender analysis? Does it address the obstacles often faced by women in participating in research such time constraint? How does it attempt to minimize these obstacles?
• Have gender roles been conceived as static and unchanging? Has the sanctity of the culture or the family been used as a shield against women's participation? Have public/private distinctions been made in a way that de-politicize women's needs? How participatory will the research process be?
• Does the methodology avoid compartmentalizing gender concerns?
• How will gender-disaggregated data be collected during the course of the project? Will a variety of methods be used (qualitative and quantitative) to explain gender differences? Who will inform the data collection, interpretation and analysis (e.g. local women/men, researchers)?
• Who will participate in the research? Is the research process designed to create equal opportunities for
the participation of men and women? What steps can be taken to ensure that this is so?

- How will research methodologies address gender differences? Will relevant documents about the gender dimensions of the research area be identified and reviewed? Why have the particular research tools been chosen?
- What criteria or indicators will be required in order to evaluate the success of the research in meeting its objectives and impact in relation to men and women?
- Are there appropriate methods and tools for measuring unintended outcomes of social policy reforms? How can these methods and tools be developed to capture gender-differentiated social outcomes (e.g. Changes in the divisions of labour, access to services, time, etc.)? Does the measurement of unintended outcomes entail the development of methods and tools which inherently challenge gender-biased, conventional assumptions (e.g. about “productive” vs. “Unproductive” labour, “costly/public” and “free/private” services etc)?

3.1.5. *Evaluating the Research*

- What specific issues have been explored through gender analysis? Has gender been approached as a discipline in its own right or has it been used as an analytical tool that cuts across all disciplines?
- What systems/networks are in place to encourage the research team to monitor and evaluate the gender impacts throughout the project cycle and following project completion?
- Has gender analysis been an iterative process? How has gender analysis informed the conclusions and recommendations stemming from the research?
- Will gender issues be incorporated into the evaluation criteria (evaluation of methodologies, participatory strategies, impact etc.)? What indicators will be used to measure the significance or impact of the research on men and women?
- How will the affected groups participate in the final evaluation? Which results will be deemed relevant?
- Will the information about the outcomes be presented in such a way as to report separately on the impact for the women and men in the affected groups?
- Are there provisions made for women and men in disadvantaged target groups, affected groups, and institutional systems, to participate systematically in the project monitoring?
- Will there be information about the differential participation in the project of men and women in the target groups, the affected groups, and the institutional systems? Will there be analysis into why there was differential participation?
- Is there a provision for identifying unexpected outcomes?
- Has the research team been able to adequately address relevant gender issues? Has it increased its knowledge of and skills regarding gender?
- Was there consultation or collaboration with a gender resource persons? In what capacity? Was this useful?
- Has the institution improved its ability to adequately address gender issues? What specific factors or initiatives have allowed for these improvements? What obstacles/constraints exist? How can constraints be managed? Has the project facilitated linkages with local women’s/men’s organizations? In what capacity?

3.1.6. *Disseminating and Applying Research Results*

- What information will be generated by the research? Will gender-specific findings and policy recommendations be identified?
- How will conclusions and recommendations impact or change existing gender dynamics? Are these impacts and changes expected to be largely positive or negative? For whom?
• How will the research results be disseminated? Will the results be equally accessible to men and women, and the relevant groups or institutions concerned about the issue?
• How will research results be used to generate policy alternatives which will enhance local access to resources and community benefit sharing? Where will gender considerations be crucial?
• Will research results work to enable local inputs to be made into policy processes (including policy formulations and local feedback)?
• Can research results be used to strengthen the position of women and men within informal contractual arrangements?
• What steps will be taken to ensure that gender specific findings are included in the policy discussions? How will results be made available to relevant government agencies, NGOs and other networks?

3.1.7. Assessing Gender Impacts of Policy Reforms

• How does the state re-define the boundary between the "public" and the "private" in specific social sectors? What responsibilities for the cost and delivery of social services are transferred or "informally decentralized" to the "private sphere"? With what implications for gender divisions of labour and equitable social development?
• Where state institutions retain responsibility for national policies in particular sectors, how do public sector bureaucracies conceptualize and address (or not address) women's interests in the design, implementation and delivery of social policy reform? For example, are state policies informed by specific assumptions about gender roles in ways which distort policy formulation, implementation and delivery, and contribute to inequitable outcomes?
• What implications does the management of private sector and market institutions (i.e. cost-sharing, fees for service) in social service provision and delivery have for the gender differentiated impacts of social policy reform? What assumptions about the individual are embedded in market-driven social development strategies, and how might these assumptions work against those with limited access to resources, autonomy, social power and legal status etc.
• In the case of formal decentralization, where financing, management and delivery of social service are decentralized to local governments, what are the implications for gender equity of: a) new modes of consultations of delivery; b) changes in the quality, range, and costs of services; c) new structures for community consultation, needs identification, and interest representation; d) inadequate local administrative and technical capacities and (gender) expertise; e) re-allocation of resources within and across services and sectors.
• Where responsibility for social policy is transferred to new social actors at local levels -- for example, municipalities, NGOs, and traditional social organizations -- how do the new structures, procedures, capacities, histories, and power relations which characterize these institutions influence the social policy reform process from a gender perspective?
• As NGOs assume an increasingly prominent place in social policy design, implementation, and delivery, what implications does this have for gender equitable social development? For example, in the context of their specific new responsibilities, how well-equipped and inclined are particular NGOs to conceptualize, represent and address gender specific social needs? What are the capacities of these NGOs, whom do they represent, and to whom are they accountable?
• What impact do social policy reforms have on gender-based NGOs (e.g. women's based NGOs devoted to welfare, training or advocacy functions)? As gender-based NGOs assume the role previously performed by the state, what impact does this have on women's practical and strategic interests? For example, does it contribute to state forfeit of social commitments critical to gender equitable development?
• Do gender-based NGOs have the capacity to analyse social policy reforms, formulate alternatives and influence policy-processes? What are ten capacity-building needs of gender-based NGOs? What are the
3.2. Targeted Guidelines

3.2.1. Poverty and Access to Resources

- What productive resources do women/men have access to and control over?
- Do women and men have different customary or legal rights to different resources? (i.e. do men have rights of ownership while women have rights of use)? Are there cultural norms/legal frameworks in place which limit women’s/men’s access to resources and opportunities?
- What kinds of shared rights do women/men possess for each resource?
- Is there evidence of conflict over, or resistance to, current rights to resources (or lack thereof) between men and women and the levels of household, community or state?
- Are women’s/men’s rights of access, control, and use of resources consistent with their labour contribution in productive and conservation activities?
- What political resources do women/men have access to and control over? (e.g. local organizations, NGOs, local and regional government, leadership, education, information)?
- What kinds of social and political relationships do men/women call upon as a means to access resources (are such channels of access further disaggregated by class, ethnicity and age)?
- Have women and men engaged in strategies to expand their channels of access to resources (e.g. forming a local women’s group, investing in local and market relationships, etc.)
- How much time do men and women spend on sustenance activities?
- How are different activities prioritized regarding allocation of time spent?
- What activities are given priorities over others?
- How do the priorities of men and women, poor and wealthy, young and old differ?
- As social and economic responsibilities of women in the household and community expand, how do different women (dis-aggregated by class and age) re-organise their daily activities to accommodate new responsibilities? Which activities get less attention? What is the impact of this on their workday, their health and their position in the family?
- How do government cut backs on health care or education affect women’s workload or lessen access to resources?
- Are there mechanisms in place for identifying and supporting the multiple roles of local men and women in the maintenance of social security systems?
- Is there a commitment to cooperation between government departments working in the areas of economics, poverty alleviation, social security, education and health?
- How can programs specifically address the links between large scale farming and women’s poverty?
- How can programs explore the relationship between informal markets and women’s sustenance?
3.2.2. **Health**

- How is the notion of health constructed in the community? Is disease conceptualized from a male or female experience of illness or wellbeing?
- How does the state address women's health in allocating resources and funds?
- What health services currently exist? What is the level of access of women to these services? What percent of the population do these services reach? What is the male to female ratio of patients?
- Are the primary health care clinics within close proximity to the majority of women in the region?
- What health services currently exist? What is the level of access of women to these services? What percent of the population do these services reach? What is the male to female ratio of patients?
- Are there female health workers available at the clinics in sufficient numbers?
- What aspects of family health care are women responsible for? What is the resulting balance of rights, obligations, power and privilege, between men and women of the various social groups involved?
- How do socio-cultural community and family structures of power and decision-making distributions affect fertility and reproductive health and responsibility for birth control methods?
- How is access to medical services influenced by geographical location, age and gender? What are the prevailing cultural or social attitudes concerning unwed mothers? Are they forced to leave the community? Do they have access to health services? Are there child care facilities for parents wanting to attend or continuing their education? Will men also receive information and/or training in family planning methods and benefits, nutrition and community care giving?
- If health/ family planning services are to be provided, will information/training be offered as a separate service or will it be channelled through existing institutions such as schools, clinics, women's groups, cooperatives and programs or community services?
- Will health workers be instructed to recognize the symptoms of and treat health problems to which women are particularly prone (back problems from carrying heavy loads, anaemia, gynecological and obstetric complications, eye and lung diseases from cooking smoke)?
- Will nutrition, health and family planning information given to women be followed up with reminders and reinforcement -- ongoing information sessions, radio advertisements, bulletins, home visits? Will contraceptives programs be followed up with programs addressing the potential side-effects?
3.2.3. Education

- Do girls and women have full access to education / training?
- What specific cultural, social, legal, geographical, financial, and time constraints do girls and women face in gaining full access to education and/or training?
- What is their current participation rate? How are obstacles to participation measured?
- What are the educational/training needs of girls in the proposed project area?
- Does the education / training received by girls and women differ from that received by boys and men? Is there an emphasis on traditional roles of women, reinforced by teaching personnel and school textbooks?
- What visual and textual stereotypes persist? Are women considered traditional or unmodern by the literature? What emphasis is placed on certain skills? What values are being communicated by literacy initiatives?
- Will women be consulted in the design of new or revised educational / training programs? Who determines education/training curricula?
- Will the location, time, cost, and ways of communicating, affect women's participation in the project?
- Will there be sufficient numbers of female instructors and female role models to encourage the participation of women and allow for social and cultural restrictions concerning women being taught by male instructors?

3.2.4. Socio-Economic Analysis

- How are resources distributed within the community?
- What cultural or political norms influence who has access to resources and through which channels programs of social security are implemented?
- Has interdependence between the "productive economy" and the "reproductive economy" been taken into account?
- What employment activities are male/female members involved in? (e.g. farming, trading, collection and sale of wild plants, small-enterprise, formal sector employment)
- Do women and men engage in income-generating activities?
- Is women's domestic labour recognized or renumerated?
- Who controls the money derived from income-generating activities? How is income used and/or invested? Who makes decisions regarding household budgets?
- Who receives and makes decisions about funds distributed by the government to families for poverty alleviation? How is this normally distributed?
- What does the distribution of government funds in the family show about community spending that may not be visible in macro-economic appraisals?
- What benefits and what costs are different groups of women and men expected to experience from programs concerned with restructuring social safety nets and changing the national economic environment? How do women compensate for these costs?
- How do families or female-heads of households function economically and respond to cuts in government funding? What resources do they use? How do they alter their spending habits?
- Do women get any social security benefits from the workplace?
- Whose responsibility is it to look after the sick or elderly? Do women receive any benefits if they have to leave work to perform these tasks?
- Do laws exist to safeguard the jobs of women who become pregnant?
- Are there any laws that enforce and equal minimum wage for men and women?
### 3.2.5. Gendered Knowledge, Expertise and Technology

- Do women possess specialized knowledge of family health or medicinal treatments?
- Who are opinion leaders in the community regarding women's formal and informal education? How do they adapt informal education processes to meet changing needs?
- How is indigenous information preserved in the community and passed on between generations?
- Do local cooperatives and other formal and informal networks or groups exist? Who are the members? What are the barriers to membership or to obtaining resources to keep the networks in place in the long term?
- Do women and men rely on different kinds of formal and informal groups, networks and relationships to access information, technology and productive resources?
- Are new technologies made accessible to women? If so, how and to whom?
- How is new information distributed among women in the community? What social networks are relied on in this process?
- What NGOs assist local women in accessing technology and information and in which ways? What is the gender composition of their staff? What do the women on their staff do?
- Who are their services targeted towards (i.e. women, men, heads of households, children) How are their diverse learning needs solicited in this process?
- What government initiatives exist for encouraging equality in access to information and technology?
- Are there any specialized initiatives directed at encouraging female participation in the creation of new technologies?

The above guidelines have been adapted with permission from the following documents prepared by the Assessment of Social Policy Reform Program Initiative, IDRC: Ottawa:


**Gender Mainstreaming and Institutional Arrangements, Decentralization and Social Policy Reform.**

**Gender Mainstreaming and Methods and Tools for Policy Reform Assessment.**

**Gender Mainstreaming and the Nature and Role of Ethical Determinants for Social Policy Reform.**
Section 4: Reading Materials

This part of the toolkit includes copies of selected reading materials on various aspects of gender and social policy. A brief introduction is provided below, complete with citation.

Wherever possible, the annotations featured in the following pages are imported directly from available abstracts provided by the original authors or publishers. The “adaptations from introductions” are notes modified from opening paragraphs and thesis statements in the original texts where no such abstracts exist. Full credit is given to the original authors and publishers for any phrases or descriptive paraphrased in this section.

Overview of the Reading Materials

The first two readings situate the reader within the field and act as a starting point for analysis of the shortfalls of past approaches to gender mainstreaming in development projects. They are significant as they canvass a range of approaches and propose analytical frameworks for overcoming barriers and integrating gender needs into each step of the project cycle.


Adaptation from Introduction: The rationale for integrating gender awareness into the policy and planning processes derives from well-documented evidence that the absence of such awareness in the past has given rise to a variety of efficiency, welfare and equity costs. The paper aims to develop an analytical framework and set of tools which can help planners ensure that gender is systematically integrated into all aspects of their work. It begins with a brief overview of the policy approaches and strategies by which gender advocates have sought to raise gender-related questions in the policy domain and then goes on to develop a framework for analysing the gendered outcomes generated by the key institution through which the development process occurs. The paper stresses that in as much as attempts to rethink development efforts from a gender perspective are likely to come up against some deep-seated inequalities in power and privilege from men and women, it is essential that gender politics are factored into the policy planning process.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article focuses on the “technical” domain of planning, and the extent to which constraints may relate to inappropriate planning procedures, or wider political constraints which impede successful implementation. It reviews the range of new planning procedures to operationalize gender concerns introduced during the past decade by organisations at international, national and NGO levels. This analysis highlights constraints in such procedures, with a detailed examination of the introduction of gender into the project planning cycle.
Articles three and four target challenges related directly to women and poverty. They focus on the stereotypes associated with female poverty and the role of different institutions in facilitating poverty reduction strategies that can lead to empowerment, as opposed to further subordination.


Abstract: While inequalities between men and women have long been recognized in formal development policies, poverty-alleviation schemes generally display a discrepancy between declared commitment to equity for women and their actual achievements in incorporating the insights of gender analysis. This article explores the experience of NGOs which have successfully incorporated gender-awareness into the formulation of anti-poverty interventions. It shows that increasing poor women’s organizational experience is critical to ensuring that their needs and views inform the planning process. The article concludes that, unless women are empowered to move beyond the “project trap”, and to take part in formulating policy and allocating resources, they will continue to be a marginalized category in development.


Abstract: The New Poverty Index is seen as incorporating gender within a new broader concept of poverty capable of measuring, evaluating and redressing gender bias along with poverty-reduction policies based on labor-intensive growth, targeting social services and safety nets. Multi-lateral position on gender and development (GAD) for their part also stress the poverty of women as a primary justification for development interventions designed to improve the position of women. It is argued here however, that the concept of poverty cannot serve as a proxy for the sub-ordination of women, that anti-poverty policies cannot, be expected to improve necessarily the position of women and there is no substitute for a gender analysis which transcends class divisions and material conditions of deprivation. The instrumental interest in women as the means to achieve development objectives such as poverty reduction may ultimately undermine GAD. Gender appears to have collapsed into a poverty trap; this essay raises a call for help, or at least discussion about the relative benefits of captivity vs. escape.

Articles five, six and seven put forth some interesting arguments about gender and health policy. They challenge the reader to re-think how health as a concept is constructed and measured, and in which ways these constructions may consequently pose logistical of political barriers to women’s access and control over health services.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article raises the point that health and development cannot be approached solely from a medical perspective, nor can it be fully dealt with in society by the health sector alone. Beginning with this premise, the article analyzes how the formal sector has a tendency to operate within a “medicalized” concept of health, dealing with circumscribed diseases rather than with the human being in its socio-cultural or natural environment. The article looks at the conceptualization of disease as it intersects with gender; poverty; food security; water and sanitation; workload and industrial injuries; and education. It tackles the more
specific topics of son preference and daughter neglect; differential feeding; differential health care; high fertility and infertility; maternal mortality; maternal morbidity; and family planning. It concludes by offering recommendations for integrating gender into health and development analysis.


Adaptation from Introduction: The article pinpoints that services and information can only contribute to improving health to the extent that people are aware of them, able to make use of them, and choose to do so. Its central thesis is that many service-related factors, as well as social, economic and cultural aspects of people's lives, can interfere with the use of health services or the implementation of health practices. The specific issues with which this article is concerned is the possible negative effect of time constraints on women's capacity to use health services or engage in other health related activities. It attempts to disaggregate health services and practices along a number of dimensions, with the goal of identifying those health related activities that may be particularly vulnerable to non-utilization because of conflicting demands on women's time.


Abstract: Female health workers often make up 75 percent or more of the health sector workforce in developing countries, and yet they remain underpaid and relatively powerless. This article looks at the role of women in the production of health care services at different levels within the health sector, discussing primary health care and the effect of economic crises. The article discusses how professions, which insulate the power and status of doctors, also insulate and rigidify the status and power of nurses. It looks at how this contributes to the limitation of the crucial role of nurses in primary health care. It further discusses informal sector workers and auxiliaries, the bulk of female health workers, who have inadequate resources and vulnerable in their work. This article proposes a research agenda for the subject.

Article eight provides a new approach to education for empowerment with instructions on how to run a workshop featuring this interactive approach.

Cottingham Sara, Kate Metcalf, and Bimal Phnuval. The REFLECT Approach to Literacy and Social Change. Gender and Development 6 (2), 27-35. Reprinted with permission from Oxfam, UK.

Adaptation from Introduction: This article focuses on the REFLECT approach to participatory education. It discusses ways in which participatory approaches to poverty alleviation and community-based learning have been enriched by feminist perspectives. The approach taken by REFLECT is to teach skills alongside community development initiatives which stress the importance of solving problems associated with poverty and marginalization. Without these practical improvements in the quality of life, attaining literacy can only be of very limited use; women may simply become 'better managers of poverty.' This article argues that practical issues must be linked to the strategic aim of challenging gender stereotypes; as literacy programs which "do not expressly include gender issues result all to often in women learners studying 'home economics, sewing and didactic materials with a sexist orientation."
Articles nine and ten offer some insight which also relate to issues of poverty and income generation. These works discuss how structural adjustment policies and economic indicators which ignore women's economic contributions may lead to program initiatives which overlook women's realities and specific needs.


Adaptation from Introduction: It is now recognized that structural adjustment strategies weigh most heavily on the poor; this article argues that it is particularly women who are adversely affected in low income households, as employees of the public sector, and as farmers. Women are affected both as producers and as reproducers; and as carers of children, the sick and the elderly. The article further emphasizes the acute shortage of dis-aggregated data showing the differential impact adjustment has on men and women, although research is now underway which shows that different classes and economic groups are affected very differently. It highlights that the lack of gender specific data is a major obstacle to understanding fully and in detail how women are affected by structural adjustment in different countries. This lack of statistical data also limits our knowledge of their situation in relation to many other areas such as agriculture, pastoralism, health needs, and as such, demands further research.


Adaptation from Introduction: Economists traditionally divide economics into a supply side and a demand side, and look at the functioning of economies at the micro-level of supply and demand interactions between individual economic agents, and at the Macro-level of aggregate supply and demand. This article discusses economic policy which features a third or "meso" level of analysis. Meso analysis concerns itself with the structures that mediate between individuals and the economy considered as a whole, by providing economic signals of costs and benefits and focussing on markets and private-sector firms and public sector services. More specifically, this article examines how concepts of the micro, macro and mesa are used by orthodox and critical economists in discussions of economic policy reform, and the extent to which these concepts recognize gender. It also considers some strategies for enabling economic analysis in policies to contribute towards the empowerment of women.

The final two inclusions of the toolkit are a composition of targeted research tools for enhancing gendered access to and control over resources. Researchers and planners should not attempt to use every tool in this section, but should select those most appropriate to their work and to each level of the project cycle.


Abstract: A variety of frameworks are offered to analyze gender relations in development work. They can be helpful tools in planning gender-sensitive research projects, or in designing development interventions which
address gender inequalities. Drawing on the experience of trainers and practitioners, these inclusions contain step-by-step instructions for using different gender analysis frameworks, and summaries of their advantages and disadvantages in particular situations.

---


Adaptation from Introduction: This is the product of a joint projects between Clark University and Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, established for the purpose of examining the role of gender across different communities, these inclusions provide explanations and examples of practical research tools for: gathering information and raising awareness; defining roles and responsibilities including divisions of labor and access and to and control over resources; assessing needs and identifying projects; planning and formulating projects by assigning tasks and creating time frames; and for strategizing for change by building alliances, assessing risks, using technological tools and the media, and writing proposals that can help communities represent themselves at policy levels.
Institutions, Relations and Outcomes: Framework and Tools for Gender-Aware Planning

Naila Kabeer and Ramya Subrahmanian

September 1996
Acknowledgements:

This paper has been written on the basis of the authors' joint experience working on the ODA/Government of India funded Gender Planning Training Project in India, which was aimed at adapting a gender relations approach in the planning process to the Indian context. An application of the institutional framework developed in this paper to the analysis of the credit needs of the poor and government and non-government attempts to address these needs is to be found in a companion discussion paper to this one: ‘Compensating for institutional exclusion? Lessons from Indian government and non-government credit interventions for the poor’ by Naila Kabeer and Ranjani K. Murthy, IDS Discussion Paper No 356. The empirical analysis from that paper is also used to illustrate the planning tools developed here. The authors owe a debt to all the people they have worked within in connection with the project and with other training courses at IDS, but would particularly like to thank Shireen Huq, Naripokkho, Bangladesh and Shanthi Dairiam, IWRAW, Malaysia who have contributed in various ways to the methodology presented in this paper. We would also like to thank Susanna Davies and Katherine Henry for their comments on an earlier draft of the paper. Responsibility for errors of omission, fact and judgement obviously lie with us.
INSTITUTIONS, RELATIONS AND OUTCOMES: FRAMEWORK AND TOOLS FOR GENDER-AWARE PLANNING

INTRODUCTION

The major impetus behind the design of analytical frameworks for integrating a gender perspective into the planning process came from two different kinds of experiences. On the one hand, it came from the recognition by planners that past 'gender-blind' policy interventions had carried avoidable costs and that new concepts and tools were needed to ensure a greater sensitivity to gender issues in different aspects of their work. On the other, it stemmed from the acceptance by many gender advocates and activists that, unless the insights of feminist scholarship and activism were collated and systematized so that their relevance to the planning process at every stage was easily apparent to those who had little background in this area, such insights would play a minimal role in shaping policy design and outcomes. In this paper we will be laying out one attempt at systematizing some of the insights from this body of work. Earlier attempts at sketching out the analytical framework contained in this paper are to be found in Kabeer (1994a and 1994b, Chapter 3 and 10. The framework itself was developed in the course of various training efforts in gender analysis, run both at the IDS and elsewhere. This paper pulls together different strands of the earlier work and grounds it in more practical concerns and empirical examples.

The structure of the paper is as follows:

- Section 1 focuses on policy issues. We distinguish between gender-blind and gender-aware approaches to the design and analysis of policy, and summarize some of the common preconceptions and prejudices which have characterized the former. We then review some key approaches through which gender issues have been raised in the policy domain, making a distinction between attempts to integrate gender into pre-existing policy concerns and attempts to transform mainstream policy agendas from a gender perspective.

- Section 2 lays out the key elements of an institutional framework for the analysis of gender inequalities in different cultural contexts. We suggest that the framework is useful both for analytical purposes - raising awareness about gender issues - as well as a tool for gender-aware planning.

- Finally, Section 3 demonstrates the application of the framework to key stages of the planning process: problem analysis, the design of a response and the implementation and evaluation of interventions.

The underlying aim of the paper is to rethink existing planning frameworks and tools from a gender perspective, identifying their gaps and limitations and attempting to reformulate them in a more gender-sensitive way. Since training efforts remain a primary route for dissemination of such methodologies, the paper highlights some of the main learning points which need to be emphasized in the training context, while the gender audit contained in Appendix 1 summarises some of the questions that would need to be asked to ensure gender-awareness in the planning process.
I THE RATIONALE FOR GENDER-AWARENESS IN THE POLICY PROCESS

1.1 SAME REALITY, DIFFERENT WINDOWS: THE DEVELOPMENT COSTS OF GENDER-BLIND POLICY

Efficiency costs

A useful way of exploring how apparently gender-neutral interventions often contain a hidden gender bias is through a comparison of a 'gender-blind' and 'gender-aware' analysis of the same intervention. An exercise of this kind is instructive in demonstrating how the failure to incorporate a gender perspective into policy analysis provides at best an incomplete, and at worst a misleading, picture of the achievements and limitations of policy interventions. Our first example compares two studies of the role of agricultural extension services in increasing rural inequality in Western Province, Kenya, one by Leonard (1977) and one by Staudt (1978). According to Leonard, the role of agricultural extension practices in accentuating the gap between a wealthy minority and the poor majority of farmers in the area reflected a number of reasons. First of all, it reflected the biases embedded in the design of the services.

The basic premise informing agricultural extension services in the country was drawn from the 'diffusion-of-innovations' literature; the strategy was to concentrate extension visits on innovative farmers whose adoption of progressive farming practices would provide a demonstration effect for the rest of the farming community. Innovative farmers were defined as those who had adopted the new hybrid maize and who included a cash-producing enterprise among their farming activities.

Leonard pointed out that in as much as innovative farmers often tended to be wealthier, there was an in-built bias within the extension services favouring wealthier farmers. However, Leonard found that the bias went beyond any emphasis that could be justified by economic growth arguments alone because for junior staff, the fact that their supervisors endorsed this strategy acted as a powerful incentive to work with such farmers beyond its logical limits. Wealthy farmers were also better able to make effective demands on the extension services and in any case, the rural poor were often invisible to extension staff. Leonard also pointed to the larger context of class politics which helped to sustain the operation of these different factors in producing inequalities within the extension services. Kenyan policymakers used the economic growth rationale for their programmes because it provided a legitimating framework for ensuring that benefits flowed to that class of farmers whose interests they shared at the national level.

In an independent analysis of rural inequality of the same region, Staudt (1978) pointed to a further dimension which had escaped Leonard's notice. She noted that one group of farming households which were systematically excluded from agricultural extension services were those managed by female farmers, despite the fact that 40 per cent of farms in this area fell into this category. Nor could this exclusion be explained in terms of the 'innovative farmer' strategy. Female farmers received significantly fewer visits regardless of whether or not they were cash-oriented and whether or not they were adopters of hybrid corn technology. Despite this neglect, female-managed farms showed considerable innovative abilities. A third of the women who were early adopters of hybrid corn had done so without any
administrative support: only 3 per cent of male-managed farms who were early adopters had done so without any such support. Innovating women farmers had obtained their information from their own community-based work groups. Staudt pointed out that the progressive farmer strategy had certain advantages where extension staff worked under financial constraints since it allowed them to concentrate their efforts on the innovators as agents of change. However the effectiveness of the strategy were thwarted by the biases which characterized its translation into practice. Part of the reason why extension agents tended to overlook female-managed farms, despite their proven capacity for innovation, was that 98 per cent of extension staff were men in a context which was characterized by communication between men on governmental matters and by symbolic male authority over households, despite extensive male absence in rural areas.

Welfare costs

Staudt's analysis highlighted the efficiency costs of gender-blindness in agricultural extension services where norms which supported male preferences led to the denial of access to capable groups, thwarting the realization of the government's stated goal of increasing agricultural productivity. Other studies have testified to the welfare costs of gender blindness in the policy domain. Here again it is instructive to compare different analyses of the same intervention, in this case, the Mahaweli Development Programme (MDP) in Sri Lanka. This was begun in 1975 and was intended to bring the dry zone of the country under year-long cultivation through one of the largest irrigation projects undertaken in the country. Discussing inequalities in the distribution of benefits from the project, including access to irrigated water, Jayawardene, a senior government official involved with the programme, noted that large-scale irrigation projects had been characterized by inequalities in access to water by those who were located at the top end of the irrigation canals compared to those at the tail-end (1983a; 1983b). To avoid this discrepancy between top-enders and tail-enders, the solution adopted by the planners was the formation of farmers' groups to manage the distribution of the water on the basis of the irrigation turn-out area along with the provision of intensive training in water management organization and community development skills.

What is interesting in Jayawardene's discussion, given his key role in programme implementation, is its 'gender sub-text': the assumption of men as key economic actors and hence the main focus of planners' attention and of women as primarily domestic in their concerns and secondary to project goals. This is evident for instance in his assessment of 'farmer' priorities: 'It has been my experience that farmers are initially interested only in productivity: i.e. agriculture, land and water. Only after consolidation of these project benefits and successful cultivation do they become fully interested in social, cultural and religious activities. Only then do they participate together as a community in project activities or programmes with respect to environmental sanitation, community health, nutrition, clean drinking water, day-care centres, and so forth' (p. 125). Such an assessment is likely to be accurate only if it is assumed, as Jayawardene clearly does, that the 'farmer' in question is a male, whose priorities are unquestioningly shared by the rest of his household. Women - who are more likely to prioritize sanitation, community health, nutrition, clean drinking water and day care centres since these impinge directly on their sphere of responsibility - can therefore be assigned a secondary place within the scheme. In fact women enter Jayawardene's discussion explicitly in only two roles: as farmers' wives' and as mothers to be targeted by 'women and children's programmes' (p.
They also enter indirectly in Jayardene's observation that the farmers needed a child care centre 'so that their wives could also work'. They are invisible in the rest of the analysis.

A very different analysis of the MDP is provided by Schrijvers (1988), one that highlights the operation of class and gender relations in producing inequalities in access to project benefits. The starting point for her analysis is a survey finding that the rate of under nourishment among pre-school children in the Mahaweli area was very much higher at 39 per cent than the national average of 7 per cent. In a project area where the expansion of food production was a primary aim, this was an unexpected and unwelcome outcome. Schrijvers lays out some of the reasons why this might have happened. First of all, she draws attention to the drought-prone context in which the dam was built, the consequent importance given to food security by households and the gender division of labour through which they sought to assure it. Men in this area were traditionally responsible for growing paddy, the more socially significant but also less reliable crop since it required adequate and timely rainfall while women were involved in slash-and-burn or chenna cultivation and contributed a range of more drought-resistant food crops, such as finger millet, soya, green gram which tided the family over in times of food shortage. Women had also enjoyed equal rights to land according to local customary laws.

The Mahaweli project introduced a set of rules and practices which reshaped the distribution of resources and responsibilities between women and men in favour of the latter. These norms specified that irrigated allotments of two and a half acres were to be assigned to each settler family by the project along with half an acre for the homestead. To prevent land fragmentation, the project specified that there could only be one heir. Since the main crop promoted by the project was paddy, which was identified as a male crop, this inevitably implied that a son would be designated as the heir. The project thus dispossessed women in an area where they had traditionally enjoyed equal rights to land; some still had access to chenna land, but its distance from the project area meant this additional source of food could not be utilized. Most women were consequently reduced to growing a few fruit trees on the homestead plot where there was little land left once the house and latrine had been constructed.

The gendered outcomes of the project were constituted in the context of unequal class relations in the area. Pre-existing class inequalities meant that physical location in relation to irrigation canals - the top-end versus the tail-end - were not the only factors determining access to irrigation water and other project benefits. Only 20 per cent of loans from the project could be repaid because the rest of the loans were diverted by poorer farmers into consumption. Many ended up (unofficially) mortgaging some of their lands to the more successful farmers and became wage labourers, with women earning two-thirds of the wage that men earned. These families were forced to purchase their food requirements at a time when rapid inflation was eroding the value of the wages they earned.

Along with having to share the burden of earning the family livelihood, women experienced additional gender-specific demands on their time, because of the distance of the new settlement from schools and medical facilities. While day-care centres had been set up by the government, the requirement that children bring a meal from home and be dressed properly tended to exclude poorer mothers who, while they needed such support most, were least able to provide their children with adequate clothes, a homemade lunch or to spare the time to deliver and fetch them from the centre every day. The gender redistribution of household resources in favour of men by the project was further exacerbated by the national policy shift
from food subsidies to food stamps; whereas free rice and commodities tended to be collected by the mother and were used for the entire household, the new food stamps tended to be collected by the father and could - and were - converted into cash to finance more individual forms of consumption: alcohol and tobacco. Research by Siriwardena (cited in Schrivers 1988) showed that only 35 per cent of the income of male farmer which remained after loan repayments were used for the collective consumption of the household.

**Equity costs**

Both these sets of case studies raise some important questions about development: what are its goals, who is it for and who decides? The first case study emphasizes some of the efficiency costs which stem from gender blind planning while the second highlights the generation of welfare costs. In addition, however, both point to some of the intangible equity costs of gender-blind planning which either escape the notice of policy makers or are discounted by them. In both the case studies, the gender blind design and implementation of development interventions led to the erosion of the independent production capacity and economic autonomy previously enjoyed by women. In the Kenyan case study, women's autonomy as economic actors was eroded by the male preference embedded in government extension services leading to a likely increase in their dependence on men. In the case of the Mahaweli irrigation project, project norms and practices deprived women of their role as independent producers with long-standing, community-sanctioned rights to land, and redefined them as dependent housewives, the normative ideal of the urban middle class bureaucrat.

### 1.2 ASSUMPTIONS AND PRACTICES UNDERLYING GENDER-BLIND POLICY

We have discussed these two sets of case studies in some detail because they illustrate the differing, sometimes conflicting, diagnoses to development problems which arise from a gender-blind, as opposed to a gender-aware, framework of analysis. Indeed the case studies work at two levels; they demonstrate how a gender perspective can illuminate aspects of policy design, and they demonstrate how a gender perspective can illuminate aspects of policy assessment, aspects which would otherwise remain in the dark. It is unlikely that either Leonard or Jayawardene consciously intended to exclude women, in one case, and marginalize them in the other, in their analysis. Both were reproducing - as the planners of the interventions they sought to analyse had also reproduced - the unexamined assumptions and preconceptions which form the 'common-sense' of so much of traditional top-down development planning.

This analysis lead us to distinguish between two approaches to policy design:

- **Gender-blind policy design and analyses** are those which are implicitly premised on the notion of a male development actor and which, while often couched in apparently gender-neutral language, are implicitly male-biased in that they privilege male needs, interests and priorities in the distribution of opportunities and resources.
• Gender-aware policy design and analyses, by contrast, recognize that development actors are women as well as men, that they are constrained in different, and often unequal ways, as potential participants and beneficiaries in the development process and that they may consequently have differing, and sometimes conflicting needs, interests and priorities.

Gender-blind policies are the consequence of inappropriate assumptions and practices which inform policy and which in turn stem from the norms, beliefs and prejudices of policy makers. Some of the assumptions and practices which have led to gender-blind policies belong to the broader category of 'people-blindness' with harsher effects on women; others are more specifically related to gender blindness. We can categorize them broadly as errors of:

- compartmentalizing
- aggregating
- eternalizing
- depoliticizing

Compartmentalizing

Compartmentalizing refers to the practice of treating social reality - and women's lives within it - as if it can be broken down into a series of different compartments, each of which can be analysed and acted upon in isolation from the others. Compartmentalizing assumptions can take different forms. They can take the form of an artificial distinction between the technical and social aspects of planning so that, for instance, dams and roads are seen as purely a matter for engineers with no social implications while a sociologist may be brought in afterwards to find out what went wrong with the project. They can also take the form of a concern with the physical and tangible (how many tubewells sunk) rather than with the social and intangible (what difference did it make?) As Jayawardene (op. cit.) pointed out in his analysis, the general practice in the design of large scale irrigation schemes had been to leave it to the technical expertise of Irrigation Departments. While such technicist interventions tend to be ostensibly indifferent to class and gender considerations in the distribution of their costs and benefits, in situations of inequality their benefits tend almost inevitably to be commandeered by the more powerful sections of the community. Belated recognition of the gender dimensions lead to the 'add women on' mentality. Maguire (1984) cites a creative example of this from a report of a field mission for US Agency for International Development which included a road construction project as a Women in Development activity on the grounds that 'women walk on roads too'.

Another form of compartmentalization is the tendency to consign women's issues to the micro-level while macroeconomic planning is seen as gender-neutral. Yet decisions taken at the macro-level set the parameters for what people - women as well as men - can and cannot do at the micro-level. Elson points to some of the contradictions contained in many structural adjustment programmes because of this gender-blindness in macroeconomic thinking. Cutbacks in public expenditure on health and education in order to balance internal budgets is often combined with an increase in the prices of agricultural crops to increase production; where women provide the main labour on the farm as well as into family health and well-being. Such policies result in a less elastic response in agricultural production; reduced
inputs into family health; and/or an intensification of women's workloads. She cites the case of the Zambian woman interviewed by Evans and Young (1988) who reported missing the entire planting season because of the time involved in accessing health care services for the family 'a perfect example of the interdependence between the labour that macroeconomic models do include and that which they ignore' (Elson 1991: 178).

Aggregating

The fallacy of gender-blind aggregation refers to the use of abstract, generic categories (the poor; the labour force; the community) which disguise the extent of differentiation and inequality within categories. In fact, a major criticism of development policy made by feminist scholars has related to the treatment of 'the household' as one such unified category of analysis. This treatment generally drew on the 'ideal-typical' household of social science text books which posited a nuclear family with a male breadwinner making decisions on behalf of a dependent housewife who was primarily concerned with childcare and housework. It is precisely such a depiction of the household which led to the bypassing of female-managed farming households in rural Kenya as well as to the targeting of male household heads for the distribution of productive resources in the Mahaweli scheme in Sri Lanka.

The concept of 'the community' as internally cohesive with a common set of clearly definable interests is another frequently utilized example of the fallacy of aggregation. Sarin (1995) provides an interesting analysis of how the move towards community-based 'Joint Forest Management' (JFM) by the Indian government represented an attempt to reduce the inequities embodied in past forest management policies. However, given women's cultural exclusion from the 'community' in many parts of India, and given that forestry departments are almost entirely staffed by men, it is not surprising that Sarin documents the results of joint forestry management policies as 'men interacting with men to take decisions on behalf of the community' (p. 86). Women's customary entitlement to collect cooking fuel from the forests was defined as a major cause of forest degradation under JFM and ruled out by community forest closure. In some areas, women have been transformed into 'forest offenders' because of their attempts to bypass these rules and enter the forests in search of fuel; elsewhere, they have had to walk to still unprotected forests ten kilometres from their own villages.

If men have represented the community when it comes to the allocation of resources, women appear to come to the forefront when responsibilities are entailed. Analyses of community health programmes, for instance, suggest that the concept of community participation has been used largely as a euphemism for the unpaid or underpaid labour of women within the community. They point out that while such programmes regard the concept of community participation as central to their success, 'the participation they rely on is predominantly, although not exclusively that of women' (Leslie et al. 1988: 308). The construction of women as 'maternal altruists' in these highly gender-specific policy interventions has the advantage of dispensing with the need to offer them material incentives. Instead they are assumed to be 'naturally' willing to undertake additional responsibilities in the interests of the family and community 'with more knowledge but little more time or money' (Bruce and Dwyer 1988: 18).
Finally there is a tendency to see women themselves as a homogenous category with identical needs and interests. The absurdity of the assumption that programmes can be devised for some category called women becomes clear when it is considered how few planners would attempt to devise a project for some undifferentiated category called men. Questions would immediately be asked about 'which men?' Schrivers' case study pointed out some of the differing terms on which women from different classes are able to access the benefits offered by a development project; even the government child care centres were provided on terms which benefited some categories of women and excluded others. Another example of the problems associated with treating women as a homogeneous category comes from India (cited in Kabeer and Murthy 1996) where government officials, noting that papad making was a 'female' activity in their locality, sanctioned a batch of loans to support papad making schemes for local women's groups organized to receive government credit assistance. When the papad failed to sell, it was discovered that the women's groups belonged to scheduled caste households; members of other castes were not prepared to eat food made by them.

**Eternalizing**

A third class of assumptions and practices which result in gender-blind policy and planning relates to the tendency to depict gender relations as unchanging and unchangeable. Biological determinism - particularly the remarkably wide tendency to attribute certain roles and tasks to women and men on the basis of some notion of 'natural' suitability - is one form taken by this attempt to **eternalize** gender inequality. The naturation of gender difference is a frequently deployed tactic to justify the reinforcement of pre-existing forms of gender inequality or, in some cases, the introduction of new ones. Yates (1994) notes the resort to biological determinism in a Ghanaian national education policy document in order to justify the delivery of gender segregated vocational education:

> By their very make up biologically, nature has made women comparatively more delicate than men physically. There are therefore some trades which do not suit women. If our women by their vocational skills will develop muscles and look masculine, sooner or later they will look physically like their husbands. Skills which require physical strength do not often suit women. Vocational skills which require deft hand, aesthetics and accuracy of taste by tongue and many such are those which suit women. Examples are hairdressing, dressing, cookery, ordinary or advanced processing of various commodities.

(cited in Yates 1994: 104)

Ghana, it should be noted, is a country where women are known to work extremely long hours in agricultural production, have some of the highest rates of participation in trading and exercise considerable economic autonomy. Harrison (1995) provides another example of biological determinism in the justification offered by a project officer in Zambia for excluding women from a fish farming project: Traditionally women are known to be weak to men. This therefore puts them off most of the activities, for instance fish farming. In short, inferiority complex is a hindrance for women' (p. 44). Once again, such a declaration ignored the fact that most of the physical work in the area was done by women, including the maintenance of the fish farms distributed by the project. If declarations of biological difference are used on some occasions to exclude women from project benefits, they can also be used on
others to bring them into a project on exploitative terms. A documentary film of an irrigated rice project in the Gambia records how project rules redistributed land from women to men for rice cultivation with the expectation that women would work as unpaid family labour on their husband's rice lands whereas previously they had cultivated rice on their own independent holdings. Stressing the need for female labour to the rice irrigation project, the project manager explained: 'women are better than men as far as transplanting is concerned and they are also better than men as far as working in the water .... so quite frankly we expect a lot of labour from women' (cited in Carney 1988: 63).

Along with biological determinism, the 'sanctity of culture' is often invoked as an alibi for resisting any attempt to rethink and challenge gender inequalities (Mukhopadhyay 1995). Although development processes everywhere have been about the massive transformation of political economy and personal life, so that no society can claim to have been untouched by it, the sanctity of culture tends to be brought up most frequently when some form of redistribution in favour of women is being considered. National as well as international development agencies who have no qualms about seeking to intervene in the most personal arenas of people's lives through family planning programmes or the promotion of safer sexual practices in response to the AIDS threat frequently tend to invoke the sanctity of culture when the question of women's empowerment is brought up. Yet when development programmes violate local cultural norms in favour of men, it passes with little official comment. Thus Jayawardene's account of the Mahaweli programme makes no reference to its overturning of traditional bilateral inheritance patterns and its denial of women's economic roles; instead he appears to be promoting what Schrivers terms the 'housewifisation' of women based on a model of gender roles which had very little grounding in local cultural realities. It is worth noting that when rural women are given 'voice', they may not subscribe to the sanctity of culture in quite the same way as men; Kapadia's anthropological study from Tamil Nadu (1994) points out how the perception of kinship and family relations as frequently inimical to women's interests was expressed in a local saying which only women voiced: Sondam sudum (kinship burns!).

Depoliticizing

Another significant feature of gender-blind policy is its depoliticized understanding of gender relations. A common manifestation of this is the persistent conflation of women with the private sphere of the family - Staudt (1985) for instance cites one USAID official that she interviewed in her case study of USAID as saying: 'I'm not interested in WID; I'm interested in families' - and the reluctance to countenance any form of state intervention which might have redistributive ramifications within that sphere. The presumed neutrality of the process of needs interpretation, a presumption which has often permitted the top-down definition of women's needs, frequently serves to disguise the fact that what is being identified as 'women's needs' are either those which are generated by women's greater family and child-care responsibilities (i.e. those associated women's roles as wives and mothers) or else are needs which are attributed to women as vehicles of state policy.

As an example of the former, Sarin (1995) points out how officials in forestry departments in India that she studies frequently refer to 'women's need' for fuelwood ignoring the fact that men, and the rest of the family, all ate the cooked food which underpinned this need. As an example of the latter is the extent to which women's presumed 'unmet need' for contraceptives has been used to satisfy official population control programmes rather than women's need to control their own
bodies and space childbearing. Thus sterilization is often the only option offered to poorer women (Caldwell et al. 1982) or else financial incentives are offered to women who adopt sterilization or IUDs, both methods which transfer control of fertility behaviour out of women's hands (Hartmann and Standing 1989; Kabeer 1996).

Finally, of course, the reluctance to intervene in the 'private' sphere of the family explains the long-standing refusal of the state and policy makers in most societies to take action against violence and sexual abuse within the family. The gradual emergence of violence against women within the home as a matter for policy intervention has entailed the politicization of the problem, the struggle to shift it from its previous status as a 'private' issue, to be settled by the individuals concerned, to the status of a 'public' issue, a question of basic human rights and hence a matter for state intervention. It is worth noting that while violence against women has increasingly been recognized by international bodies as an infringement of their human rights, its political nature cannot be easily accepted in all development agencies. Thus, in the World Bank's report on the issue, it is brought in as a 'hidden health burden' (Heise et al. 1994). The significance of the labelling of a problem is the response it evokes: clearly the policy response to violence as a health issue is likely to differ considerably from the response when it is raised as a human rights issue.

1.3 CLASSIFICATIONS OF GENDER-AWARE POLICY

These are some examples of the assumptions and practices through which gender has been marginalized or ignored in past policy efforts. We have discussed them in order to demonstrate that the move from gender-blind to gender-aware development interventions requires policy makers, planners and analysts to constantly check their assumptions and practices against the reality on the ground in order to avoid the consequences of their own preconceptions and prejudices or of planning on the basis of some outmoded version of that reality. However, rethinking assumptions and practices from a gender perspective need not automatically result in the adoption of policy interventions which directly address the unequal relations between women and men. The extent to which interventions which result from gender-sensitive analysis will also have transformative outcomes will reflect the combined effects of the predisposition of individual planners and implementers, the institutional constraints within which they must function, the socioeconomic contexts in which they are planning and the possibilities which it offers. Consequently, under the broad rubric of gender-aware policies, we can distinguish three kinds of interventions (see Figure 1.1).

- gender-neutral policies: these are the minimum we would expect from a gender-aware policy analysis. Such policies stem from an accurate assessment of the existing gender division of resources and responsibilities and ensure that policy objectives are met as effectively as possible within a given context. Gender neutral policies seek to target the appropriate development actors in order to realize certain pre-determined goals and objectives, but they leave the existing divisions of resources, responsibilities and capabilities intact. Thus a gender neutral version of agricultural policy in Western Province, Kenya would have retained the overall goal of improving agricultural productivity, but agricultural extension services would have been designed to take account of the fact that a significant proportion of innovative farmers were female household heads. In the very different cultural context of Bangladesh, where men dominate field-based agricultural work while women engaged in homestead farming (although
Figure 1.1: Categories of gender-aware policy

Gender-blind policies
(often implicitly male-biased)

rethinking assumption
rethinking practice

Gender-sensitive policies

Gender-neutral
(interventions intended to leave distribution of resources and responsibilities intact)

Gender-specific
(interventions intended to meet targeted needs of one or other gender within existing distribution of resources and responsibilities)

Gender-redistributive policies
(interventions intended to transform existing distributions in a more egalitarian direction)
there is evidence that this may be changing) a gender-neutral agricultural extension service which aimed at improving agricultural productivity would entail services which encompassed information and inputs pertaining to both cereal crops grown in the field as well as horticultural crops grown on homestead farms.

- **gender-specific policies**: These are policies which are intended to target and benefit a specific gender in order to achieve certain policy goals or to meet certain gender-specific needs more effectively. This category of policies differs radically from the older gender-stereotyped development equation which targeted men for production-related interventions and women for welfare-related interventions in that it is based on an accurate analysis of the prevailing division of labour, responsibilities and needs rather than on planners' biases and preconceptions. The gender division of labour in most societies entails the assignment of differing tasks and responsibilities to women and men in the pursuit of household survival and security and consequently generates gender-specific practical needs and constraints. Gender-specific policies may result from a recognition of these needs and constraints. Home-based income generating projects for women in societies where strict norms of female seclusion are observed, with related restrictions on women's mobility, can be gender-specific without being gender blind. However, in societies where women do not suffer from such constraints, such an intervention is likely to be a reflection of the gender biases of planners. Welfare provisions which focus on reproductive health issues are likely to be women-specific interventions; the extent to which they are also transformative interventions will rest entirely on the extent to which they treat women as passive objects of welfare or as critical actors in the development process whose needs and well-being are essential for achieving a more human-centred development. Thus, the difference between a women-specific intervention being regarded as gender-aware rather than gender-blind rests on the difference between a project design which is based on the analysis of gender-specific constraints and one that is based on prior assumptions about 'proper' roles for women.

- **gender-transformative policies**: finally, a third category of interventions can be envisaged which may target women, men or both and which recognize the existence of gender-specific needs and constraints but which additionally seek to transform the existing gender relations in a more egalitarian direction through the redistribution of resources and responsibilities. Gender redistribution is the most politically challenging of the different categories of policy interventions which we have identified because it does not simply seek to channel resources to women within the existing social framework but almost inevitably requires men to give up certain privileges or take on certain responsibilities in order to achieve greater equity in the development process.

A simple and easily understood example of the difference between a gender-neutral and a gender transformative approach was offered by a member of the Education Department of Karnataka and related to a discussion of proposed attempts to redesign school text books in a more gender aware way. For a long time, Indian school books tended to be saturated with examples and illustrations which focused on boys engaging in typical masculine activities. A gender-neutral revision of text books would entail a fairer representation of girls and boys in the illustrations and text engaged in the kinds of activities that they typically engage with in the given context. A gender transformative revision might seek to show boys more often taking part in domestic activities and girls aspiring to non-traditional roles in order to seek to question, rather than merely reproduce, the gender division of roles and responsibilities. The transformative potential of symbolic representations should not
be underestimated. An anti-liquor agitation mobilized by rural women in Andhra Pradesh was sparked off by the reading materials distributed in a literacy campaign which showed the plight of a poor village woman whose husband drank away his wages at the local liquor shop. As Batliwala, (1994) points out, the example encouraged women to raise questions in the literacy classes about their own status and their potential to act.

This attempt to categorize different policy interventions according to their underlying objective is intended as an analytical, rather than a prescriptive, tool. The different approaches need not cancel each other out and one may be used as a precursor to another. In situations where extreme gender bias in planning has been the norm, merely shifting to a more neutral approach may constitute a major step forward. In other situations, transformative strategies can take a gender-specific form, sometimes focusing primarily on men: interventions which seek to strengthen male responsibility in family planning, given the predominant (and indeed sole) focus on women in most family planning programmes, or attempts to conscientize men in gender issues such as wife-beating and dowry. In yet other situations, redistributive policies may end up being counter-productive if deeply-entrenched constraints militate against such attempts in the short term. In such contexts, women-specific projects which reflect local culture may not only be more immediately feasible but may also constitute a necessary first step to making redistribution more feasible in the long run. Planning for transformation entails strategic thinking and a grounded sense of what is possible. One corollary of this is that debates about the generic virtues of 'integrated' versus 'women-specific' programmes often miss the point. Instead, an intervention has to be designed on the basis of the needs or opportunities which have been prioritized on the basis of gender-aware analysis, the kinds of social relations which should be promoted and their political feasibility in a given context.

1.4 ENGENDERING THE MAINSTREAM POLICY AGENDA

The importance of political considerations in attempting to bring about gender-aware development is well illustrated by looking at some of the various ways in which feminist advocates have sought to influence the policy process, from both within mainstream international agencies as well as from outside them (Buvnic 1983; Moser 1993). Figure 1.2 summarizes the mainstream policy concerns in the last few decades and the policy rationales though which women's concerns have been addressed. In particular, efforts to make development policy more gender-aware have been fuelled by two different, although not necessarily incompatible, types of considerations which are spelt out in Elson (1992) and Jahan (1995).

- **Integrationist tactics** have sought to emphasize how a concern with the advancement of women can contribute to the achievement of agendas set by those who may have no particular concern with women's needs and interests. Its advantage is the short-term payoff, but its achievements are likely to be circumscribed within predetermined parameters (Elson 1992).

- **Transformative or agenda-setting strategies** are more politically ambitious. They seek to change the development agenda, to broaden its objectives and to introduce different values. More crucially, they seek to give women a much greater role in setting the agenda in the first place. Because of the more radical goals, transformative strategies require a more nuanced and complex set of
creative proposals for alternative ways of doing; and political mobilization to ensure more participatory and responsive decision-making structures (Elson 1992).

| Figure 1.2: Tactics and strategies to raise gender issues in development policy |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Mainstream                      | Segregated      | Integrative     | Transformative  |
| State-led economic growth       | Welfare         | Women in poverty| Equality        |
| Poverty alleviation             |                 | Efficiency      | Equity          |
| Market-led economic growth      |                 | Mainstreaming   | Mainstreaming   |
| Human development               |                 |                 | Empowerment     |

Integrationist advocacy

Integrationist tactics by gender advocates began as a response to the segregated and marginalized status assigned to women's concerns in mainstream policy agendas prior to the emergence of Women in Development (WID) advocacy. At that time, development efforts were dominated by the drive for economic growth, generally backed by state intervention. Within this agenda, men were identified as the key economic agents and hence the focus of mainstream development policies while women were brought in primarily under welfare efforts as mothers, wives and dependants. This gender segregation within the policy domain was the main target of early WID advocacy and explained their emphasis on integration. As the stress on economic growth gave way in the seventies to a concern with poverty and basic needs, integrationist efforts sought to demonstrate that women were predominantly represented in the ranks of the 'poorest of the poor' and were largely responsible for meeting the family's basic needs. By the eighties, the ascendance of neo-liberal ideologies in the international arena led to a renewed emphasis on economic growth, this time with the stress on market forces, and integrationist gender advocacy accordingly shifted to 'efficiency'-based arguments, stressing the critical significance of women's economic contributions in any effort to maximize returns to development investments.

More recently, as the limits to the market as prime allocator of resources have become more evident, there has been a growing emphasis on the human factor in development. For the World Bank, this has taken the form of a re-focus on poverty and the promotion of labour-intensive strategies backed by investment in human resources as the key to poverty-alleviating growth. The UN agencies have sought to
promote a human-centred development but with less of an emphasis on the market as the key institutional mechanism for ensuring growth and more space for public action. Although 'women' as a category is now more routinely included within such discussions, it is often on a tokenistic basis; gender advocates within these agencies therefore have to continue to explicitly draw out the gender implications of these broader policies. Consequently, an integrationist version of mainstreaming is concerned with highlighting the gender dimensions within the current policy preoccupation’s of official development agencies.

**Advocacy for transformation**

Alongside these integrationist efforts, there have been parallel efforts by gender advocates, scholars and activists, often outside the official agencies, to move beyond the task of integrating gender issues into mainstream development to the more challenging task of transforming the meaning of development from a gender perspective. As Elson (1991b) points out, one reason why male bias continues to persist in development thought and planning is because a gender approach has frequently been reduced to 'adding women on' without seeking to question mainstream ways of thinking and operating. As long as these ways of thinking and doing remain intact, the potential for a more gender-aware development remains severely curtailed.

Early attempts at a transformative approach took the form of the demand for equality. The 'welfare' approach had been heavily criticized by early WID advocates because it equated women primarily with reproduction and ignored their critical role in production. Pointing to the adverse effects of development for women, early advocates argued for equality of opportunity for women within the development process. However, the redistributive connotations of the demand for equality - and in particular its pertinence to the institutional practices which led to the reproduction of male dominance within most development agencies - meant it never went beyond the level of rhetoric in most of these agencies (Buvinic 1983). In any case, it has also been increasingly realized that formal equality of opportunity within institutions which have evolved around the assumption of the male institutional actor would always work against women: as the case of Pauline Neville-Jones, a high-ranking woman who recently resigned from the British Foreign Office after being passed over for promotion, appeared to demonstrate; there is no need for active discrimination against women when the culture of an organization can be relied on to reproduce the gender status quo (The Observer, February 11th 1996).

More recent advocacy to transform development practice has therefore focused on the nature of institutional rules and practices and the way in which they embody male agency, needs and interests. Some feminists have stressed the significance of women's labour and responsibilities in the production of human resources and the extent to which existing policies and institutions have taken them for granted (Elson 1991b; Folbre 1994). Others have pointed to the gender-blindness of laws which have been constructed on the basis of formal equality, or equality premised on the notion of the 'sameness' of women and men, where the male actor is held to be the norm. Kapur and Cossman (1993) suggest that a substantive, as opposed to a formal, concern with equality, would require taking legislative account of the ways in which women are different from men, both in terms of biological capacities, as well as the socially constructed disadvantages women face relative to men. Kabeer (1994) also notes the implications of the social construction of biological differences, and the associated division of resources and responsibilities, for the needs, interests and constraints experienced by women and men. She suggests that gender equity has to
be premised on the notion of social justice rather than on a search for formal equality; gender equity requires recognition of the unequal constraints and opportunities which underpin gender differences in the ability of women and men to define their own goals and exercise agency in pursuit of these goals. Within a framework of substantive equality and gender equity, welfare investments to assist women in the reproduction and care of human resources and efficiency investments to ensure the optimal use of their productive potential have to be seen as complementary, rather than competing approaches, to a human-centred development.

Following on from, and subsuming, the demands of equality, equity and justice are strategies which stress the empowerment of women. Empowerment is about questioning the notion of selfhood that women and men bring with them to their everyday development activities. Empowerment processes seek to bring about changes in the distribution of material and symbolic resources and opportunities between women and men within the development process but also - and crucially - to bring about changes in the beliefs and values which are internalized by them in the process of acquiring a gendered sense of selfhood, since these help to shape the contours of the 'beings and doings' which constitute the capacity for agency (see Batliwala 1994 and Kabeer 1994b for more detailed discussion on strategies for empowerment).

Finally, we can also identify a transformative version of the mainstreaming approach. When the attempt to shift gender perspectives and women's concerns from their marginal location, in both institutional and ideological terms, to the centre of the development agenda succeeds in promoting the rethinking of institutional rules, priorities and goals and substantial redistribution of resources (as any attempt to engender the development agenda has to), then mainstreaming strategies have the potential for transforming the nature of development practice. It is significant that many of the same international agencies which were so resistant to the demands for equality in the seventies are now taking steps to achieve a greater gender balance in their recruitment and promotion practices. Ultimately, as Jahan (1995) points out, while the integrationist logic requires that women take their place within the mainstream, the success of such a strategy is likely to result in women also reorienting the nature of the mainstream.

These different arguments and rationales for the promotion of gender issues in the policy arena clearly offer different bases for claiming resources with differing degrees of transformatory potential. However, it is also important not to reify the different categories. Gender relations are far too differentiated across cultures, and far too fluid within the different cultures, to permit for easy or universal policy prescriptions. The primary contribution that scholarship, advocacy and activism in this field can make is to analyse the main barriers to gender equity and social justice in different contexts and to develop appropriate strategies for dealing with them. If planning for transformation requires strategic analysis and a grounded sense of what is possible, as we suggested earlier, then the how of a policy approach is as important as the what. A welfare or a poverty approach may often prove to be the politically most feasible entry point for raising gender awareness within the policy arena because of their apparently non-threatening concerns; however the means used to implement the approach will determine whether it remains a purely welfarist measure, leaving intact the underlying causes of gender inequality, or whether it contributes to longer-term strategic change.
2 INSTITUTIONS, RELATIONS AND OUTCOMES: A FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS

2.1 THE INSTITUTIONAL CONSTRUCTION OF GENDER INEQUALITY

Having reviewed the various assumptions and strategies through which gender concerns have been included or excluded from development policy in the past, we move on to considering an analytical framework to assist planners to ensure more gender-aware policy interventions in the future. Returning to the case studies we cited at the start of the paper, an important general point to draw from them - and one that is supported by the broader literature - is that the processes by which gender inequalities are socially constructed are not confined purely to household and family relationships, but are reproduced across a range of institutions, including many of the policy making agencies whose avowed objectives are to address the different forms of exclusion and inequality within their societies. For this reason, the framework that we have developed for the analysis of gender inequality is one which focuses on the institutional construction of gender relations and hence the institutional construction of gender inequality. Frameworks are useful tools in the face of complex and dynamic social realities if they can help to draw attention to the key issues which have to be explored in order to achieve certain analytical objectives. In relation to the objectives of this paper, our framework is intended to direct attention to the existence of gender inequalities in the prevailing distribution of resources, responsibilities and power and to analyse how they are thrown up by the operations of the institutions which govern social life.

The concept of gender emerged as a way of distinguishing between biological difference and socially constructed inequality while the concept of gender relations sought to shift attention away from looking at women and men as isolated categories to looking at the social relationships through which they were mutually constituted as unequal social categories (Whitehead 1979; Elson 1991). Gender relations are an aspect of broader social relations and, like all social relations, are constituted through the rules, norms and practices by which resources are allocated, tasks and responsibilities are assigned, value is given and power is mobilized. In other words, gender relations do not operate in a social vacuum but are products of the ways in which institutions are organized and reconstituted over time.

What are these institutions and how do they construct gender relations as a relation of difference and inequality? A simple definition of institutions is as a framework of rules for achieving certain social or economic goals; organizations refer to the specific structural forms that institutions take (North 1990). For analytical purposes, it is useful to think of four key institutional sites - the state, the market, the community and the domain of family/kinship. Thus the state is the larger institutional framework for a range of legal, military and administrative organizations; the market is the framework for organizations like firms, financial corporations, farming enterprises and multinationals; the community is made up of various supra-family groupings, including village tribunals, political factions, neighbourhood networks and non-governmental organizations, which exert considerable influence over its members in particular domains of life; while households, extended families and lineage groupings are some of the ways in which kinship relations are organized. Few institutions profess explicitly to ideologies of inequality; where inequalities are observed, they tend to be explained in terms of natural difference, divine will or culture and tradition. Many of the official ideologies through which institutions describe themselves tend to get uncritically reproduced in social science text books, in public policy and in popular discourse, while the compartmentalized nature of the
social sciences has led to the treatment of the key institutions as somehow separate and distinct from each other, the subject matter of different disciplines.

In Figure 2.1 we offer examples of some characterizations of institutional goals drawn from the social sciences and suggest that in order to move beyond 'text-book' to 'actual' reality, it is necessary to put to one side the professed ideologies of different institutions and to scrutinize empirically the actual rules and practices through which their various organizational forms are constituted. What such an analysis would make clear is that, although different institutions may operate with their own distinct 'ways of doing things', there are certain common norms and assumptions which cut across the different institutional sites, leading to the systemic and widespread construction and reinforcement of certain social inequalities. While the literature on institutions and their organizational forms suggests that they vary considerably from each other and across cultures, it also suggests that they can be usefully analysed in terms of a number of generic constitutive components: rules, activities, resources, people and power. These are elaborated in Figure 2.2.

The narrow application of these concepts to the analysis of an organization will help to highlight the way in which these inter-related elements operate to produce unequal gendered outcomes; a broader focus will illuminate how gender and other social inequalities are mutually constituted within and across institutional sites. By way of example, the application of the framework to household organizations in the Indian context will show how the intersection of caste (community) and kinship 'rules' determine who will marry whom, at what age, which direction resources will flow at marriage and whether the newly married couple will live with the husband's family, the bride's family or set up their own separate household.

However, these rules and practices vary even within the Indian context. Thus in South India cross-cousin marriage is more frequent and couples are as likely to reside with the bride's family as with the grooms while in northern kinship patterns, kin and village exogamy tends to be practised so that women marry outside their kin and village and take up residence with the groom's family as stranger-brides (Dyson and Moore 1983). These differing practices are believed to have considerable influence in shaping or patterning the forms of power and inequality experienced; for instance, the greater gender egalitarianism observed in South India kinship systems in which women are not separated from the support of their natal kin, as compared with the greater gender subordination of women in the Northern Indian system where women are ideologically and physically separated from their natal kin. Furthermore, the intertwining practices of female seclusion, strict controls over women's mobility and dowry which constrain the economic contributions of women in northern kinship systems further tend to undermine their personal autonomy vis-à-vis men within the family and community.

Where men are culturally defined as the main or sole breadwinners (as in northern India) they are also likely to be favoured in the intra-household distribution of resources (property and inheritance) and claims on the household product (consumption and investment). The profound gender inequalities in basic physical well-being and survival, associated with excess levels of overall female mortality, reflect this broader structural devaluation of women. However, the norms and values which characterize the domain of family and kinship are not confined to it but are rearticulated in the operations of the apparently gender-neutral institutions of the market and state so that the material resources, employment opportunities and key decision-making positions tend to be implicitly reserved for men or offered to them on privileged terms. Examples of this can be found, for instance, in Kapadia's work on agricultural labour markets in Tamil Nadu (1992). She notes, for instance, that
Figure 2.1: Unpacking Institutions

I. INSTITUTIONS: THE OFFICIAL PICTURE

**Household**
- Altruism
- Cooperation

**Market**
- Profit goal maximization

**State**
- National Welfare

**Community**
- Service
- 'moral economy'

II. INSTITUTIONS: THE UNOFFICIAL PICTURE

RULES
PEOPLE
RESOURCES
ACTIVITIES
POWER
Figure 2.2: Unpacking Organizations

Rules: (or how things get done): What is distinctive about institutional behaviour is that it is rule-governed rather than idiosyncratic and random. Distinct institutional patterns of behaviour inherent in the official and unofficial, the explicit and implicit, norms, values, traditions, laws and customs which constrain or enable what is done, how it is done, by whom and who will benefit. The institutionalization of rules has the advantage that it allows recurring decisions in the pursuit of institutional goals to be made with an economy of effort; their disadvantage is that they entrench the way things get done to the extent of giving them the appearance of being natural or immutable.

Activities: what is done: The other side of the coin to institutional rules is the generation of distinct patterns of activities. Indeed institutions can be defined as 'rule-governed' sets of activities organized around the meeting of specific needs or the pursuit of specific goals. These activities can be productive, distributive or regulative but their rule governed nature means that institutions generate routinized practices and are reconstituted through such practices. Institutional practice is therefore a key factor in the reconstitution over time of social inequality and in the final analysis, it is institutional practice which will have to be changed if unequal relations are to be transformed.

Resources: what is used, what is produced: All institutions have the capacity to mobilize resources and institutional rules govern the patterns of mobilization and allocation. Such resources may be human (labour, education and skills) material (food, assets, land, money) or intangible (information, political clout, goodwill, contacts) and they may used as 'inputs' in institutional activity or represent institutional 'outputs'.

People: who is in, who is out, who does what: Institutions are constituted by specific categories of people. Few are fully inclusive, despite their professed ideologies. Rather institutional rules and practices determine which categories of people are included (and which excluded) and how they are assigned different tasks, activities and responsibilities within the production process and different resources in the allocative processes of the institution. Institutional patterns of inclusion, exclusion, positioning and progress express class, gender and other social inequalities.

Power: who determines priorities and makes the rules: Power is rarely diffused throughout an organization, however egalitarian its formal ideology. The unequal distribution of resources and responsibilities within an organization, together with the official and unofficial rules which legitimize this distribution tend to ensure that some institutional actors have the authority to interpret institutional goals and needs as well as ability to mobilize the loyalty, labour or compliance of others. Thus power is constituted as an integral feature of institutional life through its norms, rules and conventions, its allocation of resources and responsibilities and its customs and practice. The outcomes of institutional practice, including its reconstitution over time, will reflect the interests of those with the power to make the rules as well as to change them.

Men were paid double the female wage for the same period of field labour and that both women and men agreed that men should be paid more because they did more demanding work. However, as Kapadia points out, given that men were digging earth sporadically and women were carrying soil ceaselessly, this owed more to ideological perceptions than to objective reality. An additional consideration behind the unequal wages was that it would have been considered deeply humiliating for a man to be paid the same as a woman, even for the same work. A differential had to
be observed to signal the superior status of men. There was thus a 'gender premium' to wages. In fact, on the rare occasions where some women had out of need taken up a vacant 'male' job, they were still paid the 'female' wage (Kapadia 1992).

Any organization can be scrutinized through the framework outlined above and an analysis of its official rules and unofficial norms, together with the allocation of resources and responsibilities which these generate between different categories of people, used to understand the pattern of hierarchies embodied by the organization, where power lies within it and who exercises it. Thus the gendered 'outcomes' of organizational practice - who gets what, who does what, who decides, who gains and who loses - can be understood through a 'snap-shot' analysis of its rules, resources and practices (Figure 2.3A). In the narrow organizational sense, power will be concentrated more densely in those members of an organization who are favoured by the rules as far as command over people and command over things are concerned (what Giddens 1979 describes as command over allocative and authoritative resources). In the broader social sense, power is most likely to be exercised by those who are able to mobilize these resources over a range of organizational domains. It is precisely because men from any given social class are more able in general than women from the same social class to mobilize resources from a broader range of organizational domains - the intimate and personalized organizations of family and kinship to the increasing more distant and apparently impersonal organizations - that gender relations are constituted as relations of power.

Understanding gender inequality through such an institutional perspective helps to emphasize the complex ways in which organizational rules, cultural norms and routinized practices from different institutional sites intersect to produce and sustain such inequality across society. It also helps to make a number of other points which need to be borne in mind in any attempt to address such inequality through policy interventions:

- On the one hand, it reminds us that gender inequalities are deeply institutionalized in largely unquestioned aspects of organizational practice. Because of the taken-for-granted nature of these practices which constitute gender inequality; because these practices cut across almost all institutional sites; because of the powerful and often 'naturalist' ideologies which justify them and keep them in place, gender relations often appear immutable and given.

- On the other hand, if organizations are brought into existence through the adoption of specific combinations of rules and practices, then the unequal or unjust outcomes which may result from these combinations can be transformed through a transformation of rules and practices.

However, it is not just that the 'rules' are unjust and hence give rise to unjust practices. The power relations of different organizations mean that different organizational actors not only have differential capacity to define and interpret the rules - to 'set the agenda', to use our earlier terminology - but they also have a differential stake in defending them. Conflict of interests between different stakeholders will make any attempt to alter organizational behaviour problematic. Those whose interests are best served by the prevailing configuration of rules and resources are not only most likely to resist, but also have the greatest capacity to resist, any attempt at redistribution or transformation. Hence the point we made earlier: the struggle to achieve gender equity in development policy is in the ultimate analysis a political project and it is essential to think tactically as well as strategically about how it is to be achieved.
2.2 A GENDER ANALYSIS OF NEEDS, INTERESTS AND INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE

An appreciation of the routinized roles and responsibilities generated by the gendered rules and norms of organizations, and asymmetries of allocative and authoritative resources which underpin them, points to the usefulness of Molyneux's distinction between practical and strategic gender concerns in planning for greater gender equity in the context of complex social relations (Molyneux 1985). Because women and men are embedded within specific configurations of rules and practices, they are likely to have certain routine practical gender-specific needs which reflect their socially ascribed obligations and responsibilities. For instance, in societies where men are expected to be the primary breadwinners, they will have a practical gender need for employment while in societies where women are expected to contribute to household food needs, they will also have a practical gender need for the resources which would allow them to meet their obligations. However, despite their roots in routinized gender practices, gender needs are by no means static. Where male breadwinning ceases to be reliable or adequate, and where women continue to bear responsibility for dependants, women may also have need of employment, even if this goes against the grain of tradition (see Kabeer 1995 for a discussion of this in the Bangladesh context).

As long as the existing institutional arrangement meets these practical needs - and no better arrangement appears feasible - there will be little incentive to seek to renegotiate the rules, an inertia that is likely to be strengthened by the strong stake that those in power have in defending existing institutional practice. However, in as much as these configurations also underpin an asymmetrical division of resources and responsibilities, women and men are also likely have very different and often conflicting strategic gender interests in defending, resisting or transforming prevailing rules and practices. As long as men as a category benefit from the rules and practices of any given institution, they are likely to defend the status quo and resist any attempt to challenge it. Thus if Figure 2.3A provides a 'snapshot' of gender relations within specific organizations and explains the gendered outcomes of organizational practice at a particular point in time, Figure 2.3B points to process: the reconstitution of gender inequalities over time as the combined result of presence of powerful male gender interests in promoting unchanged practices and the absence of any countervailing interest group strong enough to challenge them.

However, entrenched male privilege within an institution does not imply that change is impossible. Institutions have to be constantly reconstituted through the practices of different actors, all of whom bring a range of identities and interests to bear upon their practice. It is precisely the potential for conflict and contradictions arising out of diverging strategic interests within an organization that may give those with a stake in transformation the impetus and strength to challenge the 'rules of the game'. In terms of the policy approaches we spoke of earlier, gender-neutral or gender-specific interventions are those which seek to address the existing practical gender needs of women and men with the prevailing distribution of rules, resources and practices; it is when interventions seek to challenge the rules, resources and practices through which gender inequalities are institutionally constituted, that they touch on strategic gender interests.
Figure 2.3A: Gender relations (as outcome)

RULES
NORMS, CUSTOMS,
RIGHTS, RESPONSIBILITIES
CLAIMS OBLIGATIONS

RESOURCES AS INPUTS,
RESOURCES AS OUTPUTS

ACTIVITIES ROLES, TASKS
LABOUR

COMMAND & CONTROL
(HIERARCHIES OF POWER AND DECISION-MAKING)

Figure 2.3B: Gender relations (as process)

RULES RESOURCES ACTIVITIES POWER

PRACTICAL GENDER NEEDS + STRATEGIC GENDER INTERESTS

ROUTINE PRACTICES
However, rather than posing a dichotomy between practical gender needs and strategic gender interests, they can be usefully seen as different aspects of the same question: what the priorities for gender-aware policy should be and how should they be operationalized (Kabeer 1994b). Women's practical gender needs and the ways in which they are met then become inter-related dimensions of strategic interests: 'needs point in the direction of satisfying choices, while interests refer to expanding control over the conditions of choice' (Kabeer op. cit.: 300; see Jonasdottir 1988 for an excellent discussion of interest theory). Many of the examples that Molyneux gives of women’s strategic gender interests - the abolition of a coercive gender division of labour, of unequal control over resources, measures against male violence, reproductive rights; establishment of political equality, ending the sexual exploitation of women - go to the very heart of the power relations of gender and are likely to meet with profound resistance. The capacity of those who have a stake in challenging the status quo to deal with this resistance cannot be taken for granted; it has to be built up through processes of empowerment. The idea of strategic gender interests can therefore be given a processual definition: ‘meeting daily practical needs in ways that transform the conditions in which women make choices is a crucial element of the process by which women are empowered to take on the more deeply entrenched aspects of their subordination’ (Kabeer op. cit.: 301). This relates once again to the point we made earlier: that the transformative potential of an intervention lies as much in the means through which needs are satisfied and opportunities created as it does in the precise ends which inform a policy intervention.

3 GENDER-AWARE PLANNING THROUGH THE INSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

3.1 POLICY FORMULATION AS THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MEANS AND ENDS

An institutional analysis is relevant to policy and planning efforts since all such efforts occur in institutional contexts: they are intended as responses to problems which are outcomes of specific institutional operations and they are designed, implemented and have consequences within specific institutional settings. If such efforts are to be gender-aware, then the use of the institutional framework we have outlined above as an analytical tool for understanding the institutional construction of gendered development outcomes is only the start of the process. The understanding it yields must then be applied to subsequent stages of the planning process: the analysis of problems, the design of interventions and the evaluation of results. In this section, we explore the process by which such an application can occur, starting with the meaning of policy.

Stripped to its essential elements, a policy statement can be conceptualized as a relationship between a desired end(s) and the range of means selected to achieve it (Figure 3.1). The first problem that arises is that for every chosen end, there are a number of possible means, while the finite means available to policy makers lend themselves to a variety of different ends. Thus, the basic dilemma for policy makers is how to go about selecting specific sets of means and ends over others. The second problem is that the selection procedure has been dominated by the most powerful interests within a community, who tend not only to be the most visible and audible to policy-makers, but often tend to be dominant within the policy making process itself.
Whose priorities should count?

The persistent conflation between development and economic growth is one product of the asymmetrical representation of interests in the policy making domain. The voices of the poor, particularly poor women, who are most likely to remind policymakers that economic growth is only a means to the desired goals of development are also least likely to be heard or listened to within the policy domain. The idea that the priorities of poor women should be the starting point for thinking about development policy should not be taken to imply that they are more knowledgeable than others but rather that they offer the viewpoint from below, a viewpoint of those who stand at the crossroads of various forms of inequality - class, gender and often race and caste as well. For the purposes of our planning exercise therefore we will begin with the priorities of the poor, and of poor women in particular.

If, as is generally accepted, human well-being is the desired 'end' of all development efforts, the first question must be what constitutes human well-being for those who have been largely excluded from the policy-making process? There is a considerable body of research that suggests that as far as the poor are concerned, well-being is made up by the goals of survival, security and self-esteem (Chambers 1988, Jodha 1985). For most poor people - women as well as men - survival is an over-riding preoccupation because of the precariousness of their livelihoods and security is likely to be significant for the same reasons. Policy formulation for a human centred development therefore requires that priority be given to interventions which meet the basic survival needs of the poor and that the means adopted also serve to strengthen security of livelihoods and reduce dependency relationships. In as much as gender equity is integral to a human-centred development project, it is necessary to ensure that these broad goals of survival, security and agency are met for women as well as men and we may then need to ask how the survival and security needs of poor women, as well as their ability to exercise agency and choice over their own lives, might differ from those of poor men.

We noted earlier the need for policy-makers and planners to constantly carry out 'reality-checks' to ensure that their preconceptions and prejudices do not bias the design of their interventions. In the light of the power relations which permeate almost all institutional contexts, we would stress here the critical importance of participatory methodologies as a means of carrying out such reality checks. One important rationale for the adoption of such methodologies is the acknowledgement that the notion of well-being does not have a uniform meaning for all sections of society and that policies which aim to bring about the enhancement of human well-being must be informed by the definitions of those whose well-being is being planned for rather than by the definitions of those who are doing the planning. Figure 3.2 reformulates 'ends' side of the policy equation as human well-being and suggests the key dimensions that have to be taken into account to achieve the well-being of the poor.
Figure 3.1: Designing interventions: the technical relationship

INDIRECT MEANS → DIRECT MEANS → ENDS

Figure 3.2: Designing interventions: the social content of 'ends'

RESOURCES AS INPUTS → RESOURCES AS OUTPUTS → BROADER GOALS
- Human well-being
- (Survival, security, autonomy)
The significance of means

If human well-being is the overall goal of development, what are the 'means'? The focus in much of mainstream planning in the past has been on material resources as the 'means' of development: (land, assets, finance, equipment, infrastructure etc.). However, there are two additional categories of resources which are critical to an equitable development and which have sometimes been overlooked. The first category encompasses human resources. Human beings enter the policy process in two capacities: human well being is the final goal of development and human labour, energy, skills, creativity and imagination are the most important means.

In addition, along with material and human resources, an essential component in development activities are the intangible social resources which people create through their association with each other. In as much as poor people in general, and poor women in particular are so often excluded from mainstream institutional allocations, these social resources are a critical element in their survival strategies. However, the disempowerment of the poor and marginalized often lies in the fact that the relationships they are able to mobilize to underwrite their survival and security tend to be based on patronage and dependency rather than on solidarity and reciprocity. Consequently, security has to be traded for autonomy in the interests of survival. For women who are generally most cut off from independent access to socially-valued resources, this tradeoff takes a particularly intensified form in that their ability to define and act on their own priorities can often only be achieved by sacrificing the protection of hierarchical familial relationships.

Unless the intangible aspects of human well-being (which powerful groups take for granted as their right and privilege) and the intangible resources which they frequently entail are integrated into the conceptualization and design of policy, the poor will remain the objects of policy and the passive recipients of charity. Consequently, different 'means' for achieving policy goals have to be assessed not only in terms of their technical efficiency but also in terms of how well they contribute to the broader goals of survival, security and human dignity. Here we would put forward a second rationale for the importance of participatory methodologies in gender-aware planning: enabling the participation of the excluded in the process of policy design is not only critical to ensure policy goals which respond to their priorities but is also a strategic means for overcoming social exclusion. We will return to this point later. Figure 3.3 presents an expanded version of the means-ends relationships, stressing the multiplicity of resources which make up the means of development and the need to relate them to the broader goal of human well-being.

Finally, Figure 3.4 draws attention to the fact that all means-ends relationships exist within institutional contexts, that these institutions are sites of rules and resources, production and allocation distribution and that the power relations within them determine the ability of different categories of people to achieve the goals of survival, security and autonomy. Consequently, in order to understand why shortfalls in the achievement of well-being occur, we have to locate the observed shortfalls in the institutional sites in which they are produced and explore the structure of rules, norms and practices which characterize the relevant organizations, the constraints and possibilities which they generate and the causes and effects of the resulting shortfalls. This is done in the next section where we will be demonstrating the application of the institutional framework to the analysis of the causes and effects of problematic development outcomes in order to establish the means and ends through which the problem can be addressed. Our discussion is
Figure 3.3: Designing interventions: the social content of means and ends

Human Well-being
(Security, Survival, and Autonomy)

Resources as: Human, Material and Social direct means

Resources as: Human, Material and Social indirect means
Figure 3.4: Designing interventions: the institutional content of means and ends

'Ends'
Whose?

Distributional Practices
(Institutional Locations)
Rules, Organization, Allocation

Direct 'means'
Who owns what, who gets what, on what basis, who benefits, who decides?

Production Practices
(Institutional Locations)
Rules, Organization + Allocation

Indirect 'means'
Who owns what, who does what (and how), who gets what, on what basis, who benefits, who decides?

Human Well-being
(Security, Survival, Autonomy)

Human, Material, Social Resources
loosely organized around the planning sequence embedded in goal-oriented project planning (NORAD nd; GTZ nd) in order to illustrate how a gender analysis can be integrated into a widely utilized set of planning tools. It will also assist our exposition if the discussion is illustrated by a practical example of a development problem and for this purpose we will be drawing on the overview of the Indian literature on the credit needs of the poor provided in Kabeer and Murthy (1996).

3.2 AN INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS OF THE PROBLEMS OF CREDIT FOR THE POOR: CAUSES AND EFFECTS

The relevance of credit to the poor will depend on how their poverty is conceptualized. Kabeer and Murthy (1996) suggest that one way of conceptualizing poverty is as the product of multiple and frequently interlocking forms of exclusion with regard to the mainstream institutions through which people meet their basic needs in any given society. In the Indian context, there is considerable evidence to suggest the exclusion from reliable and non-exploitative sources of credit is one of the basic causes of poverty and hence building access to such sources is one of the basic means for overcoming poverty. Accepting this analysis for the purposes of exposition, a first step in our planning process will be to establish the various organizations through which credit is distributed in rural areas in India in order to identify the barriers to access by the poor and hence the reasons for the observed shortfalls in access to credit. However, the poor are not a homogenous group. The significance of gender and caste as further axes of inclusion and exclusion in the Indian context suggest that the rules and practices of the credit delivery system 'entitle' women and men from different castes differently and unequally and must be factored into the account. We focus for the sake of simplicity of exposition on the gender dimensions of exclusion.

The exclusion of the poor from formal credit: a gender blind analysis

Formal financial organizations together with government-administered credit programmes, often in collaboration with the banking sector, constitute the mainstream of the credit system in India. At the community level, there are moneylenders and neighbourhood networks as well as a range of non-governmental efforts to meet the credit need of the poor. An institutional mapping of credit organizations and their lending practices will immediately make clear that the poor are largely excluded from the mainstream banking system and even from much of the government' poverty-oriented lending and must rely largely on informal sources. However, the limitations associated with informal sources (e.g. usurious rates of interest charged by moneylenders; clientilist relations involved in borrowing from landlords; the insufficiency of funds from neighbourhood networks) mean that they are unlikely to constitute a long-term and sustainable solution to the problem of poverty. After reviewing the performance of both government and non-government attempts to deliver credit to the poor, Kabeer and Murthy (op. cit.) concluded that the desired 'end' of a sustainable and non-exploitative credit intervention for the poor would be best served by building regularized access by the poor to mainstream credit institutions rather than through the creation of separate credit mechanisms. Access by the poor to formal credit systems does not imply displacing informal credit sources in the lives of the poor but does expand their options and strengthen their bargaining power in the market for credit.
In order to build such regularized access, it is essential to understand the causes of institutional exclusion. This then becomes our 'core' problem. Applying the institutional framework to the analysis of this problem, Kabeer and Murthy (op. cit.) document some of the specific ways in which the rules, practices, norms and culture of banking organizations have combined to produce these exclusionary outcomes. In India, as elsewhere, the overarching goal of commercial banks is profit maximization and corporate efficiency, leading to an institutionalized preference for dealing with local entrepreneurial elites who are perceived as 'people they can do business with'. From the point of view of bankers, lending to the poor is rife with problems: transaction costs are high (owing to the small amount of loan required by the poor and high cost of monitoring loans), recovery of loans is a problem (dispersed borrowers and their microenterprises, physical distance, wilful default and non-wilful crisis-led default), and there is low security for loans (collateral provided is often not easily disposable). While banks are clearly constrained institutionally from lending to the poor, the perspectives from the borrowers' end is equally bleak. Not only are bank procedures fairly inflexible, they are also structured to reflect the kind of clientele that banks consider themselves best suited to serve: literate, knowledgeable, self-confident, urban and generally male entrepreneurs. From the point of view of the illiterate and largely rural poor, loan application procedures are lengthy, wordy and dense; bank staff have a limited and unsympathetic understanding of how their enterprises work and of the kinds of constraints poor borrowers are likely to face.

The various rules, norms and practices which lead to the exclusion of poor people from the formal banking sector can be organized as a hierarchy of causes and effects, distinguishing between different levels of causation - immediate, underlying and structural - and a corresponding hierarchy of effects. Figure 4.1 presents the more conventional version of this analysis to be found in the general literature which tends to be couched in generic and gender-neutral terms. Such formulations suggest that poor women face the same problems as poor men in accessing credit and suffer similar effects so that there is no need for a gender-disaggregated analysis. However, as we noted earlier, the routine use of non-gendered generic categories, such as 'the poor' and 'the landless', in the analysis of development problems has long helped to obscure the degree of internal differentiation and inequality within these groups. Ostensibly gender-neutral analysis is frequently extremely gender-biased in its assumptions and its implications and there is sufficient evidence now available to suggest that poor men and women in India do not have the same credit needs or face the same credit constraints.

The exclusion of the poor from formal credit: a gender aware analysis

The question then is what lies behind the disproportionate exclusion of poor women from both the formal banking sector as well as from the government lending programmes administered through these banks? The gender-disaggregated analysis of access to credit carried out in Kabeer and Murthy (1996) suggests three distinct, but obviously inter-related, categories of gender disadvantage:

- Gender-intensified disadvantage refers to those disadvantages which women and men share, but which women suffer in a more intensified form. Thus illiteracy, lack of collateral, low self-confidence, social distance from banking staff are all problems which men experience in gaining access to bank credit but which women suffer in a more intensified form.
Figure 4.1: Analysing poor people’s access to credit: causes and effects (gender-blind)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-term effects</th>
<th>Indebtedness; Vulnerability; Impoverishment; Disempowerment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate effects</td>
<td>Shortfalls in consumption; reduced capacity to recover from crisis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate effects</td>
<td>Fluctuations in household income flows; resort to unreliable/exploitative forms of credit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The core problem</td>
<td>Lack of access to institutional credit</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Immediate causes

Household-based: Lack of collateral; Lack of self-confidence; uncertain repayment capacity
Bank-based: Collateral requirements; complex and inflexible procedures; perception of poor as high-risk borrowers

Intermediate causes

Household-based: Low productivity enterprises; uncertainty of returns; illiteracy; ignorance about banking procedures; class distance from bank; personnel imperatives
Bank-based: Risk-averse culture; perceived costs of lending to the poor; class distance from the poor

Structural causes: Entrenched banking practices; unequal distribution of assets; imperfect financial markets; inadequate educational provision

- Gender-specific disadvantage refers to those constraints which women suffer by virtue of being women: the ideology of the male breadwinner, the constraints imposed by norms of female seclusion; the difficulties of combining domestic labour with entrepreneurial activity.

- Bureaucratically-imposed gender disadvantage These were forms of disadvantage which had little to do with the actual reality of women’s lives but were the product of the biases, prejudices and sometimes straightforward ignorance of bankers as well as of the officials who were responsible for delivering development resources to the poor.

Figure 4.2 presents a more disaggregated level of analysis which allows some of the additional, more hidden, constraints specific to poorer women in accessing credit to become visible. It is precisely these more invisible and submerged constraints which tend to be the basis of women’s greater exclusion from mainstream allocational mechanisms and which explain why planning credit interventions on the basis of some generic category of ‘the poor’ are likely to fail to meet the needs of poorer women. Figure 4.2 makes a number of points. It points to the priorities and practices which institutionalized bank rules generate and the kinds of people which they are best able to serve through their lending practices. It thus explains why poor people are unlikely to be within this category. However, it also reminds us that poor women suffer from constraints based on their gender which help to exacerbated the disadvantages of economic class. They suffer greater constraints on their mobility and time, they are less likely to own collateral and possess literacy or marketing skills than poor men.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Figure 4.2: Causes and effects of credit-based institutional failure: a gender-aware analysis</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long-term effects</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intermediate effects</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immediate effects</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The core problem:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immediate causes:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hh-based</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bank based</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intermediate causes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hh-based</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bank based</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Structural causes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Furthermore, discriminatory attitudes serve to close off any chances they might have. Bankers are as likely to subscribe to the ideology of the 'male breadwinner' as the rest of the population and not see any reason for lending to women. They point to the 'awkwardness' of dealing with women entrepreneurs and of engaging in follow-up activity for this more dispersed and less mobile section of borrowers. Women's enterprises are generally perceived to be more risky than those of men. They often tend to be located in enterprises that are home-based, seasonal, with low capital-intensity and hence low returns. This is partly linked to the gender division of labour and responsibilities within the household, such that women are burdened by domestic and child care responsibilities and their women's enterprises are more often geared to meet immediate survival and consumption needs. In addition, gender norms also constrain women to appropriate sectors, even if they themselves are willing to engage in a wider and more profitable array of enterprises. Unless a more disaggregated level of analysis is conducted, the specific constraints which women as a gender experience in accessing institutional credit, in addition to the more general ones of class, are likely to remain submerged.

The hierarchical organization of causes and effects in Figure 4.2 helps to distinguish between the more immediate manifestations and causes of a problem - which may be possible to act upon in the short-term - and the more entrenched structural causes which entail a more longer-term perspective. On the effects side, we note some of the immediate effects of exclusion from reliable and non-exploitative sources of credit on the basic consumption needs and security of the poor, and of poor women, as well as the longer terms implications for continued vulnerability and exploitation. Our analysis suggests that depriving women and men from access to institutional sources of credit will lead to fluctuations in their basic consumption levels, to reliance on exploitative sources of credit and distress sale of household assets; to reduced capacity to recover from crisis and to long-term vulnerability and impoverishment. Figure 4.2 thus helps to demonstrate what is entailed in a gender-aware analysis:

- a disaggregation of the problem into its immediate, underlying and longer-term causes and effects
- analysis of the extent to which these causes and effects are the same for men and women and the extent to which there are gender-specific causes and effects
- the effects of a problem often provide the rationale for addressing it. The existence of gender-specific effects of a problem can help to provide the rationale for a gender-sensitive response

### 3.3 FROM CAUSES AND EFFECTS TO MEANS AND ENDS

Just as causes and effects can be organized on a hierarchical basis into immediate, underlying and longer term, so too can the means and ends which they suggest. The causes of the problem point in the direction of possible responses to it. In mapping out causal relationships for our credit example, we distinguish between immediate disadvantages causing the exclusion of the poor from formal credit sources, the underlying disadvantages of class and gender which give rise to these disadvantages and then finally the roots of these inequalities in more deeply-entrenched, structural arrangements. The various levels of causes that we identified help to clarify the kinds of needs and interests that have to be addressed by the policy response. Credit interventions which are designed around immediate causes may be responsive to immediate and practical needs but they are unlikely to contribute a great deal to
changing the underlying causes of disadvantage which threw up these needs in the first place. Furthermore, even where interventions seek to go beyond the immediate to underlying causes may still confine themselves to addressing structural class disadvantage while ignoring conflicting strategic gender interests. In terms of our gender analysis, they may address practical gender needs but leave unchallenged the strategic gender interests which gave rise to the gendered manifestation of the problem.

For instance, land reform may be one way of addressing the unequal distribution of wealth which underlies the exclusion of the poor from credit and commodity markets but unless women and men are jointly entitled to redistributed land, such measures will leave a significant aspect of gender inequality intact. Our methodology suggests therefore that a gender-blind approach to the question of poverty and credit is likely to lead to one set of policy responses, based primarily on class-based disadvantage, while a gender aware analysis is likely to lead to other or additional interventions which acknowledges the existence of gender inequalities among the poor. While some of the means we have identified - particularly those at the structural level - require changes in macro-level policy and are outside the remit of the lower-level interventions that will be the focus of our discussion, spelling them out in the analysis in this way helps to make the argument that many of the class and gender constraints experienced by the poor derive from the broader environment. Unless attempts are made to tackle these broader sources of disadvantage, lower level, project based interventions will remain limited in their achievements.

Moving from problem analysis to objectives analysis - or from the analysis of causes and effects to the analysis of means and ends - entails a reformulation of the 'negatives' of the situation into positive desirable conditions so that what were the causes of the problem now become the potential means for addressing it while the effects of the problem are now reformulated as desired goals. This is done in the next set of figures which present a comprehensive array of options for the design of interventions: a gender-blind array of options in Figure 4.3 and a gender-aware one in Figure 4.4. They help to illustrate what is entailed in the gender-aware analysis of possible responses to a problem:

- the immediate, underlying and structural causes of the problem point in the direction of the immediate practical needs and the longer term strategic interests which have to be addressed and a range of means through which this can be done.

- The existence of gender-specific causes points in the direction of the practical gender needs and strategic gender interests which have to be addressed and suggests a range of possible gender-neutral as well as gender-specific means through which this can be done.

3.4 BUILDING ON THE 'LOGIC' OF LOGICAL FRAMEWORK: PRIORITIZING MEANS AND ENDS

So far we have identified a problem, analysed its causes and effects from a gender perspective and identified the range of means and ends which were thrown up by our analysis. The gendered effects of the problem give us the rationale for gender-sensitive policy response to the problem, lay out the immediate needs and longer term interests which are implicated in it and also sketch out the desired ends which will constitute the overall goals and objectives of the policy response. The next stage
of the planning exercise is to select from the comprehensive array of means outlined in Figures 4.4, those elements which would constitute a feasible strategy to address the overall goal of building regularized access by poor women and men to mainstream credit institutions. We will be using these different elements to demonstrate the gender-aware application of Logical Framework Analysis (LFA) now widely used in many development agencies. Like any tool, LFA will reflect the skills and commitment of its users. Used inflexibly or apolitically, it can become a blueprint planning tool, wielded as a mechanism for enforcing conformity and control. However, used iteratively and interactively as a tool for participatory planning, in conjunction with a socially-attuned understanding of the institutional context in which planning is to be implemented, LFA can serve to promote transparency, accountability and participation among the various stakeholders in the planning process.

Bearing these caveats in mind, the next stage of the planning process is to spell out the overall goals of the credit intervention we are seeking to design, the immediate objectives that have to be realized in order to achieve these goals and the basic input-output relations through which these objectives can be met. As we have emphasized throughout our discussion, the specification of goals and objectives in terms of a generic category called 'the poor' is unlikely to signal the need to ensure that poor women are included along with poor men in the project design. It is essential that, until gender-awareness becomes an institutionalized and routine aspect of the planning process of an organization, the goals and objectives of an intervention be stated in gender-specific terms from the outset, signalling the need to take account of gender-specific opportunities and constraints throughout the design of the intervention so that past exclusions and marginalizations experienced by women are not repeated and reinforced.

<p>| Figure 4.3: Analysing poor people's access to credit: means and ends (gender-blind) |
|---------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <strong>Long-term ends</strong>             | Self reliance: Security; Accumulation; Empowerment                           |
| <strong>Intermediate ends</strong>          | Smooth consumption streams; Emergency funds; Resilience in crisis             |
| <strong>Immediate ends</strong>             | Reliable flow of household income; reduced reliance on exploitative credit    |
| <strong>The core response</strong>          | Assured access to non-exploitative credit                                     |
| <strong>Immediate means</strong>            |                                                                             |
| Household-based:               | Strengthening collateral position; Improvement in self-confidence; Improved information; Strengthened repayment capacity |
| Bank-based                     | Altered collateral requirements; simple and flexible procedures; perception of poor as credit-worthy |
| <strong>Intermediate means</strong>         | Improved productivity of enterprise; Certainty in returns; Literacy; Knowledge of banking procedures; Affinity with bank personnel; Accumulation-oriented enterprises |
| Household-based:               | Risk-taking culture; Realistic assessment of costs of lending to the poor; Affinity with the poor |
| Bank-based                     | Transformed banking practices; Redistribution of assets; Improved financial markets; Educational provision for all |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Long-term ends</th>
<th>Intermediate ends</th>
<th>Immediate ends</th>
<th>The core response</th>
<th>Immediate means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self reliance Security Accumulation Empowerment</td>
<td>Smooth consumption streams Emergency funds Resilience in crisis</td>
<td>Reliable flow of hh income; reduced reliance on exploitative credit</td>
<td>Assured access to non-exploitative credit</td>
<td>Hh-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Egalitarian intra-household relations; valued bodies; empowerment</td>
<td>Equitable distribution of consumption; increased control over own income</td>
<td>Reduced reliance on exploitative credit</td>
<td>Gender equality in accessing non-exploitative credit</td>
<td>Strengthening collateral position Improvement self-confidence Improved information Strengthened repayment capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Removal of gender disadvantage vis a vis collateral, self-confidence, repayment capacity and information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Removal of women-specific disadvantages: greater social and physical mobility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Altered collateral requirements Simple and flexible procedures; Perceptions of poor as credit-worthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Equal credit facilities for women borrowers; information on women’s enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hh-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improved productivity of enterprise. Certainty in returns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Literacy Knowledge of banking procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Affinity with bank personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Accumulation-oriented enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Removal of gender inequalities in productivity and certainty of return from enterprise; literacy; knowledge of banking procedures; affinity with bank staff; equality of responsibility for survival needs within household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Removal of women-specific disadvantage: social networks; affinity with bank personnel; control over loans/proceeds from loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bank based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Risk-taking culture Realistic assessment of costs of lending to the poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Affinity with the poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Removal of gender-specific stereotypes; realistic assessment of costs of lending to poor women; affinity with women borrowers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Structural means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Transformed banking practices Redistribution of assets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improved financial markets Educational provision for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Egalitarian gender ideologies; gender neutral labour markets;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>gender-neutral banking practice; intra-household equity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|                      |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |                                                                                  |
The 'vertical' logic of logical framework spells out the relationship between inputs and activities, the outputs which result, the objective which these outputs contribute to and the overall goal of the intervention. Its 'horizontal' logic spells out the indicators that have to be in place to ensure each relationship feeds into the next as planned, the assumptions that have to be valid for these relationships to materialize and the information that is necessary to construct the indicators. Figure 5 adapts some aspects of this logic to illustrate the design of a gender-aware response to the problem of institutionalized exclusion of the poor from mainstream credit organizations. The overall goal adopted for the intervention is to build regularized access by women and men from low-income households poor to mainstream credit institutions. However, such access cannot be made to materialize overnight, given the existence of the major barriers identified to such access, which explained the exclusion of the poor from mainstream banking in the first place. Consequently, it has to be seen as the long term objective of our hypothetical intervention, which will need a sequenced set of sub-objectives and activities which will help to build up this access over time.

Figure 5 therefore presents the 'means-ends' relationships through which this access will be built, phased into immediate, intermediate and longer term goals and objectives, the 'means' necessary to achieve each set of goals and objectives and the kind of information necessary to ensure that they are achieved. Drawing once again on the analysis in Kabeer and Murthy (1996), we have identified the formation of self-help thrift-and-credit groups of the poor as an immediate objective of the intervention together with the provision of basic accountancy skills to group members. The savings accumulated by such groups serve to meet some of the more urgent survival and security needs until the longer term goal of the intervention can be realized.

The intermediate objective of the intervention would be to transform these thrift-oriented groups into credit management groups with the skills and resources to invest self-generated capital funds productively; means used include building group responsibility for repayment of loans and compliance with group-determined rules governing the rights and obligations of members. Such a process is intended also to give group members the self-confidence to negotiate with bank staff and to seek terms and conditions which suit the capacity of the membership. Thus the activities in the intermediary phase not only address certain aspects of poor people's productive needs but they also serve as the strategic means for establishing a secure route to more mainstream sources of credit, which is the long term goal of the intervention.

An important point to draw out of our presentation of goal-oriented planning is that merely specifying women along with men in the goals and objectives of the intervention does not constitute gender-aware planning. It demonstrates that a gender-aware analysis of causes and effects of a problem will lead to a gender-aware specification of means and ends and this will have to be carried thought into the design of the intervention. Our analysis has shown that women face gender-intensified disadvantages as well as gender-specific ones and appropriate rules, practices and actors will have to be identified to ensure that the gender-specific opportunities and constraints of the poor are addressed along with more generic, class-based ones. The need to think innovatively around rules and practices in the design of the intervention suggests that NGOs may be more suitable institutional actors, at least for this stage of the intervention, since they tend to be less rule-bound than government agencies and more closely attuned to local realities, although the longer term role of bank officials remains critical once the groups have developed their capacity to handle institutional credit.
## Figure 5: Means, ends and indicators: a sequential analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>ACTIVITIES</th>
<th>EVALUATIVE INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long-term objective: Ensuring regularized access to institutional credit for women and men from low-income households</td>
<td>Meetings with bank officials by group representatives</td>
<td>Number of meetings; composition of group representation at meetings; group preparation and outcome of meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Agreement of bank procedures for lending to group-guaranteed members</td>
<td>Extent, nature and composition of participation in the process of designing bank procedures; gender-awareness of new bank procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phasing out of agency support for groups</td>
<td>Institutional capacity of groups (e.g. management skills, democratic leadership structures; equity in participation at all levels; financial viability and sustainability)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expansion into wider range of enterprises by both men and women</td>
<td>Gender-disaggregated data on nature, viability and success of enterprises; women's participation in non-traditional activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

...contd/
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>ACTIVITIES</th>
<th>EVALUATIVE INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intermediate objective</strong>&lt;br&gt;Promotion of credit management groups of women and men to invest their self-generated capital funds productively</td>
<td>Training&lt;br&gt;- members of older groups in leadership skills and more advanced forms of financial management&lt;br&gt;- in enterprise development and management&lt;br&gt;- women-specific groups in non-traditional skills and enterprises</td>
<td>Gender-disaggregated data on participation in training; impact of training on financial skills, awareness, confidence and management skills of women and men; impact on productivity; creation of new and non-traditional skills in women; expansion in range of enterprises undertaken by women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge dissemination about bank procedures</td>
<td>Outreach of information; gender-aware literature on banking procedures; use of different media and access of illiterate and neo-literate women and men to information</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building group based approaches to overcome mobility constraints</td>
<td>Increased participation in distant markets; increased access and use of means of transport; direct interactions between group representatives and financial institutions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building access to other technical departments of government</td>
<td>Meetings between technical departments and groups; successful resolution of group demands</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>ACTIVITIES</td>
<td>EVALUATIVE INFORMATION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate objectives</td>
<td>Recruitment of male and female organization staff and fieldworkers</td>
<td>Numbers of men and women at all levels of the organization; egalitarian/transformatory gender division of labour within organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formation of separate self-help groups of poor women and men in order to promote savings and lending for self-identified needs</td>
<td>Training of staff and fieldworkers in group formation skills, gender-awareness and financial management</td>
<td>Numbers of training programmes conducted, extent of follow-up; participation of male and female staff in training; attention to gender content in training programmes; changes in practice as a result of training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Construction of centres close to target groups</td>
<td>Numbers of centres; satisfaction of group members with location of centres; increase in women members' participation in group activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Adoption of sensitive and flexible rules of group saving and lending</td>
<td>Consultation with poorer members in developing rules; satisfaction of group members with rules; increase in participation by poorer members particularly women in group saving and lending; reduced dependence on or better terms from money lenders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

...contd/
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>ACTIVITIES</th>
<th>EVALUATIVE INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immediate objectives (contd)</strong></td>
<td>Training of group members in basic accounting skills</td>
<td>Numbers of women and men trained; application of accounting skills by members to relevant activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formation of separate self-help groups of poor women and men in order to promote savings and lending for self-identified needs</td>
<td>Use of literacy and numeracy for 'conscientization' around class and gender issues for male and female groups</td>
<td>Use of examples with transformatory potential in training materials; full participation by women and men in the training; changed perceptions and practices attributable to the training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Building group responsibility for loan recovery</td>
<td>adoption of processes / rules within group to manage default; improvements in repayment rates;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The rationale for separate group formation comes from the views of poorer women who welcomed improved access to credit for both women and men but sought to form women-only groups to ensure that men did not dominate the proceedings and the resources. Group-based savings also address another gender-specific need expressed by women to safeguard their savings and the proceeds from their enterprises from appropriation by male members of the household. Women customarily save clandestinely in order to have some fall-back resource which cannot be appropriated by their men. Group-based savings not only ensure group protection but also allows such saving to take place more openly. The location of organizational activity within close distance of the homestead both reflects the need to take account of constraints on women's time and mobility but simultaneously provides them with spaces outside their homes where they would be temporarily freed from the demands of their household chores as well as from the surveillance of senior members - their husbands or in-laws. Indeed, one of the attractions for women of joining such groups has been not necessarily the resources that they might acquire but the possibility of having a 'space of one's own' where they can be temporarily freed from their domestic obligations. And given women's cultural exclusion from the community, such groups may be a first step to having a voice within that community.

Training is a key element in the process of group formation both as a means of imparting the practical skills necessary to achieve the economic goals of the intervention as well as a way of developing the broader skills to analyse the nature of the constraints that they are subject to in order that solutions to these problems can be initiated on the basis of their self analysis. Fieldworkers also need to be trained in the gender-sensitive implementation of the intervention so that they are more aware of their own class and gender preconceptions and prejudices and do not unconsciously reproduce the biases and exclusions of the broader community. While issues of self-confidence, assertiveness and articulation should continue as part of the training begun in the first phase, these need to be backed up with training in enterprises that enable women to visibilize their economic productivity and enhance their own savings and contributions to household survival. Training along with market research is necessary if women who are willing to do so are to be assisted to break out of the traditionally 'feminine' confines of the market place; exposure to non-traditional occupations and enterprises will offer women a wider range of activities from which to choose, will enable them to engage in higher-return oriented activities, help them to build up productive assets in the long-term, enhance their savings capacity, while also enabling greater investment in the household standard of living. It also follows that continued training in leadership can help women ensure that they benefit equally along with other family members from the improved access to credit facilities and more strategically, it will help women break out of imposed social norms and expectations of what they can or cannot do, or who they can or cannot be.

Finally, attention will have to be paid to the means for achieving the longer term objective of the intervention. The positive experiences of organized groups which mediate bank lending for their members illustrates the importance of group linkages that are horizontal and not just vertical. Such groups represent their members' interests with bank officials, provide support for each other, help to defray some of the transaction costs of lending to the poor, particularly to poorer women, and help to overcome some of the class and gender biases of bank officials.
3.5 RISKS, ASSUMPTIONS AND THE POLITICS OF IMPLEMENTATION

Most interventions are premised on a hypothesized relationship between outputs and intended goals and, in an uncertain and imperfectly known world, most will entail both unanticipated risks and invalid assumptions which can lead to unintended outcomes, including the collapse of the project. However, the analysis of implementational failures when some form of gender-redistributive policy is entailed also reveals a particular source of failure because of how such policies are often perceived, both in the communities in which they are implemented as well as by those responsible for designing and implementing them. Within the community, gender redistributive policies run into the same problems of resistance that any policy aimed at altering pre-existing power relations is likely to encounter. The resistance may reflect hostility to the idea of going against taken-for-granted cultural norms and practices governing local gender relations or it may reflect a more material concern with the possible loss of prior resources or denial of access to new ones. In the case of the Tamil Nadu Women's Development Programme, which sought to lend money to women's groups, considerable male resistance was experienced at the beginning of the group formation process, with drunken husbands seeking to disrupt meetings. However, it was also found that resistance from family members tends to occur in the early stages of an intervention; in the Tamil Nadu context, most of the men reduced their antagonism over time, recognizing the possible benefits to the family and there was a shift from discomfort about their wives attending meetings to positive encouragement of attendance. In Bangladesh, attacks on Grameen Bank workers, as well as workers for the BRAC education programme which primarily benefits girls, can be seen as attack on organizations which threaten both the power of local moneylenders, landlords and religious figures by seeking to change what such groups regard as acceptable gender norms and practices.

The other, and major source of 'misbehaviour' in gender-related policy interventions - and one which has taken longer to recognize - is linked to the gender dynamics within the implementing agency itself. Development organizations, whether government or non-government, tend to be organized along hierarchical lines, with decision-making power most densely concentrated within a central core, what Staudt (1985) calls the 'technical core' and Lotherington et al. (1991) call the 'deep policy core'. The source of policy failure may be located at this central decision making level or it may located further down the hierarchy; and it may be manifested through a variety of different decisions or, just as damagingly, through a variety of 'non-decisions'. The experience of the past decades suggests that while considerable progress has been made in winning policy commitment to gender issues by those in the central decision-making core, this has not necessarily resulted in gender-equitable outcomes lower down the policy process.

To the extent that this failure often lies within the implementing agency, force field analysis, which promotes reflection on the 'enabling' and 'disabling' features of the institutional environment in which the implementation takes place can be a useful tool in the planning process for anticipating the risks and resistances likely to be encountered within the implementing agency as well as to potential areas of weakness. Figure 6, which links the idea of force field analysis to our overall institutional framework, draws attention to the significance of the prevailing structure of rules, resources, practices, people and power within an agency as the basic elements which determine the translation of an intended policy goal into a practical outcome. It reminds us that a major reason why gender-aware policy goals do not always translate into gender-aware policy outcomes lies in the organizational failure to rethink the pre-existing rules, resources, people and practices of the organization in order to meet the requirements of these new goals. Figure 7
Figure 6: Forcefield analysis through the institutional framework

ACTUAL OUTCOMES

ENABLING FACTORS

PEOPLE

ALLIES

RESOURCES

SOCIAL, HUMAN, MATERIAL

RULES & NORMS

POWER & DECISION-MAKING

POWER & DECISION-MAKING

RULES & NORMS

HUMAN, MATERIAL, SOCIAL

RESOURCES

PEOPLE

ADVERSARIES

DISABLING FACTORS

POLICY GOALS
**Figure 7: The composite forcefield analysis of WID programmes in six Commonwealth Caribbean countries**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Disabling Factors</th>
<th>Enabling Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No budget or inadequate funds</td>
<td>Support from National Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of staff in bureaux</td>
<td>Commitment of women attached to agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequately trained staff</td>
<td>Supportive international bodies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureaux unable to meet demands</td>
<td>Availability of international aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No cooperation/understanding from Ministries</td>
<td>Cadre of trained/committed women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No national advisory body</td>
<td>Pool of volunteers available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear policy</td>
<td>Realistic role &amp; programme emerging projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bureaucratization of the bureaux</td>
<td>Achievement of income generating projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unclear status of bureaux</td>
<td>Emphasis on socioeconomic development of women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competitive forces</td>
<td>Regular contact with PS and cooperating ministries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political pressure</td>
<td>Link with official regional policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependence on international finance</td>
<td>Specialized sub-committees valuable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding agency pressure</td>
<td>Government commitment to WID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No/few support staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inadequate transportation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Ladies in Limbo: The Fate of Women's Bureau, Women and Development Programme, Commonwealth Secretariat, London 1984.
synthesizes the results of a forcefield analysis undertaken by Gordon (1984) on women's bureaux in six Caribbean countries and provides empirical evidence for some of the point we are making here. Gordon concludes:

Evidence suggests that the major impediments confronting the operation of the Caribbean women's bureaux lies in the administrative arrangements in which they are embedded. Presumably, such arrangements emanate from existing policy directives, but the current level and style of operations suggest that if real policy lies in bureaucratic practice then policy in this area of women's affairs can be said to be non-existent. It is true that policy statements exist, but they contain no clear definitions of goals and priorities and the associated arrangements for the provision of proper levels of resources and imaginative management support structures which can transform those statements into creative and dynamic action programmes. Rather the bureaux have emerged as weakly structured, ill-defined units whose ability to function as the sole implementing agency for the governments policy on Women in Development is seriously compromised by the absence of appropriate support and resource provisions

(p.115, our emphasis)

There are examples of similar kinds of implementational failure from the experience of international agencies as well. In their study of the ILO and the FAO, Lotherington et al. (1991) point out that failure to carry out the realignment between goals, on the one hand, and rules and practices, on the other, considerably slowed down the ability of these organizations to implement their commitment to integrating gender concerns into their activities. The pre-existing rules, values and norms within these organizations reflected a sector-oriented, technical expertise and were adapted to serving sector-oriented technical policy; by contrast, the adoption of a gender-mainstreaming agenda required a new, human-oriented approach and socio-economic expertise. Rather than seeking to mainstream this new approach and the expertise it required, the organizations relied instead on a strategy of ad hoc 'adding on' of gender considerations. In an earlier study, Maguire (1984) had pointed to an example of this ad hoc approach in a UNDP report on a $120 million joint multilateral agency project on river blindness in West Africa for which the FAO had included 'a woman consultant sociologist' to review the programme in order to ensure that 'the concerns of the rural family and women would be included in the programme'. As Maguire suggests, the implication was that but for this lone female sociologist, the concerns of women in Benin, Ghana, Ivory Coast, Mali, Niger, Togo and Upper Volta would be overlooked.

The case study of an FAO fish farming project in Zambia by Harrison (1995) referred to earlier suggests that the ad hoc and piecemeal attention to gender issues remains an aspect of FAO practice. The fisheries department in the FAO office in Rome was made up of expert staff with a technical background in biology or fisheries management; gender policy has remained little more than the collection of information and calls for more information and the implementation of unsystematic and ad hoc measures which frequently lead to the marginalization of gender issues. In fact, Harrison suggests, the lack of clarity on what constituted a 'gender-aware' perspective in the planning process led to the translation of gender concerns at implementation level in ways which reflected the priorities and preferences of local project workers and interest groups. The result was, for all the concerns expressed at policy level about 'gender', the promotion of a fish farming technology which was

These examples from the agency context illustrate the point we made earlier: that the language of 'mainstreaming' can often conceal very limited integrationist goals. A genuine concern with mainstreaming gender issues would have required the incorporation of socio-economic knowledge into the existing body of technical expertise and entailed rethinking of old rules and procedures. It would also have required the allocation of adequate and appropriate material, human and financial resources within the organization in order to ensure the policy goals can be translated into practical outcomes. As Staudt's case study of USAID in the seventies showed graphically, organizations that adopt gender-related policy goals very frequently sabotage their own chances of success by allocating completely inadequate resources for implementing the policy. Assessing the poor performance of the USAID WID office in the seventies to carry out its mandate, she notes that its annual budget was limited to $1 million (out of $4 billion) and staff of four (in an agency of around six thousand) precluding the WID office from achieving little beyond an exhortatory role. The UN agencies allocated around 0.2 per cent of their overall budget to projects which benefited women while less than 1 per cent of FAO projects specify strategies to reach women farmers (Staudt 1990).

However, even where appropriate rules and adequate resources are in place, this will not necessarily guarantee the success of gender-related policy. What is critical is also the beliefs and values of the people responsible for implementation. Power may be officially concentrated within the central policy-making core of an organization but staff located at mid and lower levels can ignore, dilute or alter the spirit of its policies and systematically make or break implementation. Clearly all policies with redistributive intentions are likely to come up against resistance at some stage in the policy making process. What is specific to the resistance faced to gender-redistributive policies is that the fact that both policy-makers and implements in these organizations tend to be predominantly men who live intimately with the group who stands to benefit from such policies and individual aspects of these relationships carry over into the work place in potentially distorting ways (Staudt 1985: 7). Gender-redistributive policies thus impinge directly on the personal beliefs and values, relationships and identities of those who formulate and implement policies to a degree that no other transformative strategy does. Such organizational actors do not generally live in intimate and highly personal relationships with the poor, with members of minority groups or those whose environments are threatened. The fact that they often live with women leads them to believe that they can generalize from their own experiences; it also gives them a very personal stake in defending the existing ideas and practices through which they have acquired their gender identities and therefore in the outcomes of policies which threaten these ideas and practices. Indeed persistent references to some idealized set of family relations and the sexual stereotypes this entails appears to be a feature of a great deal of the articulated resistance to gender redistributive policies.

When policies which seek to redress culturally sanctioned inequalities have to be implemented by individuals who themselves have been beneficiaries of these inequalities, then implementers are critical stakeholders in the policy process along with members of the community that will be affected. An important aspect of gender-aware planning therefore must be an analysis of the various institutional actors responsible for various aspects of implementation and the kind of the stake that they are likely to have in the success or failure of gender-related policy goals.
In this context, a useful classification provided in Lotherington et al. 1991. can be used to further disaggregate the category of 'people' in the institutional forcefield analysis outlined in Figure 8 into:

- **Innovators**: those who have been active in getting gender-aware policy onto the organizational agenda and would seek to assure its implementation. For successful implementation, a minimum critical mass of an organization's staff need to be innovators in this sense.

- **Loyal Bureaucrats**: this is a category of staff within an organization who may not be personally convinced of the need for integrating gender concerns into their agency's policies and plans but will not allow this to affect their professional commitment to ensure such integration if that is what is indicated by organizational goals. They can prove effective allies for gender advocates, even if they are not privately enthusiastic about the promotion of gender equity goals, provided they are given the analysis, concepts and tools to guide them in carrying out their duties.

- **Hesitators**: those who may subscribe to gender-oriented goals in principle but find it difficult to support its practical implementation. There are a number of reasons why this may be so: the experience of resistance from the community in which implementation will take place; a felt loss of prestige in working on gender issues; or the inability to grasp how policy reformulated from a gender perspective might differ from a more traditional welfarist approach to women. In addition, as development agencies add gender on to their existing priority goals, the complexities, contradictions and trade-offs between these various goals can have a paralysing effect on those responsible for implementation. Here again, analytical tools and technical expertise can help to convert ineffective hesitators into effective allies for the implementation of gender-oriented policies.

- **Hardliners**: those who are fundamentally opposed to the adoption of gender oriented goals within their organization. They are likely to deploy various tactics to ignore or block the implementation of these goals, silently and tacitly if such goals are espoused by those at the top, vociferously and actively if support at the top is perceived to be purely rhetorical or a response to donor pressure. They resist because they are either actively opposed to such policy or because they see it as a lesser priority to other development issues. In addition, they resist because they feel threatened; professionally threatened by the redistributive connotations of such policies and personally threatened because of the perceived challenge to long-internalized notions of what constitutes proper gender roles.

An analysis of the beliefs and practices of hardliners within an organization at the evaluation stage has often helped in the past to cast light on why organizations apparently committed to gender equity fail to deliver on their policy goals. Various researchers have sought to compile what we might call an inventory of resistance tactics deployed at the implementation stage (Longwe 1995; Buvinic 1983; Staudt 1985). Unlike the inventory of biases and errors documented as underlying gender-blind policy, which were frequently the product of deeply internalized and often unconscious biases which prevented gender from emerging as a factor in the planning process, resistance to the implementation of gender-related policy goals are less easy to explain in terms of ignorance and thoughtlessness and are more often consciously adopted by men, as well as women, who feel uneasy or threatened by
the redistributive connotations or ideological changes represented by the goals they are being asked to implement. Among the various resistance tactics utilized by implementing officials, the most frequently documented appear to be:

- **trivialization**: attempting to reduce the significance of the gender-related policy goal by personalized attacks on gender advocates within the organization or trivializing jokes about gender issues. Almost all those who are engaged in such work have experienced this treatment and it has been widely reported in the literature. Staudt points out that the level of personalization and trivialization of gender-related issues within an organization provides a good barometer of the depth of resistance and notes its incidence within USAID in the early seventies in the form of tedious jokes about 'developing a woman' and 'what about men in development' and the persistent tendency to discuss gender issues with reference to their own wives. According to Moser (1993), when a Gender and Development Unit was first set up in OXFAM, it was met with some amount of hilarity and a tendency to refer to its members as lesbians and dykes.

- **dilution**: i.e. the process by which an innovative policy is watered down into a weak and routine set of actions. Kaber and Murthy (1996) trace how DWCRA (Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas) in India was initially conceptualized as an innovative credit programme for women, based on a long-term group formation process and a recognition of women's productive potential as well as their domestic roles and responsibilities. By the time it was implemented, it had been transformed into yet another 'spoon-feeding programme' for poor women. The main reason for this dilution lay in the lack of effort to communicate the rationale and philosophy which underpinned the innovative aspects of the programme so that by the time it reached the field level, the entrenched rules, norms and practices of the implementing apparatus together with the gender biases and preconceptions of field level officers were powerful enough to submerge the programme's innovative aspects.

- **subversion**: when the transformatory goals of a policy are reinterpreted as welfarist ones. Buvinic (1986) pointed out early on how even when projects for poor women were initially designed with explicitly production-related goals, they were frequently transformed into welfare-oriented programmes in the course of implementation because welfare programmes were seen both as promoting 'appropriate' roles for women and, more importantly, as not taking away resources from men. She quotes a high-level official in a planning ministry who expressed willingness to support income-generating projects for women as long as they did not lead to women earning more than men since he perceived this as having undesirable effects for family stability.

- **outright resistance**: Agarwal (1994) cites several examples of the reluctance and often downright refusal of state officials to carry out government policy on land rights in India which allows women to use common property resources and inherit land on the grounds that the transformatory potential of such policies could jeopardize the stability of the family through its challenge to male authority. Such attitudes often start at the top and Agarwal notes the response of the Indian Minister of Agriculture to her advocacy of land rights for women at the seminar for the Indian Planning Commission in 1989: 'Are you suggesting that women should be given rights in land? What do women want? To break up the family?' cited in Agarwal 1994: 12.
3.6 MONITORING, EVALUATION AND GENDER AWARE INDICATORS

This discussion helps to highlight both the conventional reasons for having indicators of achievement in place at the outset of the implementation process as well as certain additional ones related specifically to interventions with gender redistributive goals. Conventionally, indicators are necessary for most interventions to ensure that there is baseline data from which the impact of the intervention can be evaluated at a later stage. Furthermore, when collected on a periodic basis, they can provide a mechanism for feeding back information on the conversion of inputs into outputs and the contribution of outputs to the immediate objectives and longer term goals of an intervention. It thus ensures that the planning framework is treated as a dynamic rather than static tool and the implementing organization has the capacity to be able to respond to unanticipated opportunities and constraints thrown up in the course of its life in the field.

Less conventionally, from a more specifically gender perspective, indicators of achievement serve to signal to all actors involved in planning and implementing an intervention the need to ensure that gender concerns are integrated at every stage of the process and to measure how successfully this integration has occurred. The long history of gender blindness in the planning process, combined with the present tendency to 'add women on' as a form of symbolic politics, makes the attention to gender-aware indicators which relate to inputs, outputs, objectives and goals of critical importance as statement of intent, as signal to all actors involved in the intervention, as constant reminder during the life of the intervention, as measure of performance in the achievement of gender-aware goals and objectives and as a tool for analysing shortfalls. There is a salutary example of a consultant hired by DANIDA in Bangladesh to design an aquaculture project for landless and poor farmers. Given DANIDA's commitment to gender equity, his initial report was returned because no mention had been made of its possible relevance to landless and poor women. The consultant responded by adding the term 'and women' wherever reference had been made to intended beneficiaries in the Logical Framework. It is highly unlikely that an intervention designed in this way is likely to promote a great deal of attention to the needs and interests of women and to their social relationships with men since it confines women purely to the goals and objectives stages of the project design and totally ignores the kinds of constraints that women specifically might suffer and that might require different or additional features in the inputs, outputs, activities and indicators of the project.

It is precisely in order to avoid such tokenistic efforts to incorporate gender perspectives into the planning process that indicators for monitoring achievements of the stated gender-related goals and objectives of the intervention have to be in place at the outset of a project. They provide an important precautionary measure to ensure that a gender-transformatory intervention does not get diluted, subverted or derailed by unofficial norms and actual behaviour in the implementation stages. For indicators of achievement to be operationalized, the requisite information has to be available, either in the form of existing surveys, reports and studies or else by commissioning the necessary research. Here it becomes important to decide from the outset 'whose reality', and hence whose indicators, should inform how achievements are to be assessed since, as we pointed out earlier, certain interests are better represented or heard within the policy domain than others. Information can be acquired through conventional, top-down and generally quantitative methodologies or else through alternative, participatory and more qualitative methodologies. As Schaffer (1996) points out, each set of approaches posits a particular relationship between those who ask questions and those to whom the questions are addressed.
and will have particular implications for the transformatory potential of the intervention in question.

An attempt to take account of the different, and possibly divergent, 'realities' is to be found in Greeley et al. (1992) where three different categories of indicators were suggested, each offering a different window into the reality in which an intervention was located and representing the perspectives of different sets of actors relevant to the intervention:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Taking account of intersecting realities in evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>The 'outsider's' indicators:</strong> these are indicators which have gained wide acceptance in a particular field of development, arising from a substantial body of research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>The agency's indicators:</strong> these tell us how an agency perceives and measures its own objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beneficiaries' indicators:</strong> These express how those who are expected to benefit from a particular intervention would themselves assess their own well being and experiences as a result of the intervention</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition, and to some extent echoing the distinction we made earlier between different levels of causality underlying a problematic outcome, Greeley et al. (1992) suggest a number of dimensions of information to be collected on this 'beneficiary-identified' set of indicators:

- what the change has been.
- the immediate causes to which the change is attributed.
- the underlying causes to which the change is attributed.

This sequence of information allows changes in the well-being of the intended beneficiaries to be traced through to the institution or actors responsible since a reported change does not by itself constitute evidence of an organization's performance if there is no way of interpreting and attributing the change. Some examples from the literature will illustrate the point. An evaluation carried out of Nari Nidhi's credit programme for poor rural women in Bihar found that the majority of women loanees interviewed reported increases in their incomes while a significant majority also reported an increase in the share they contributed to household income (see Kabeer and Murthy 1996). However, such an increase did not necessarily constitute evidence of Nari Nidhi's success in improving the economic situation of women since it could have reflected some other factor unrelated to Nari Nidhi's efforts. A further level of information was clearly needed for the change to be attributed to Nari Nidhi. Further information from the loanees revealed that they attributed the immediate cause of their improvement earnings to their expansion into a new economic activity or expansion of the scale of existing economic activities and that the underlying cause of this ability to expand was in turn attributed to the fact that they had been able to switch their source of loans from local moneylenders who charged interest rates of 10 per cent monthly to Nari Nidhi who charged 12 per cent interest annually. Consequently, the economic improvements reported by these women were in fact attributed to Nari Nidhi's
efforts. On the negative side, women from one particular district reported a fall in returns from their main activity which was fish vending. The immediate cause of this was found to be a shortfall in the supply of fish to meet the needs of women traders which in turn reflected the fact that Nari Nidhi had provided a large batch of loans for investment in fish vending activities simultaneously - in one village alone, 60 women received such loans - which led to a sudden upsurge in the demand for fish and an increase in its price.

Changes in income may be considered to have a relatively straightforward interpretation in terms of well-being but there are kinds of changes where there is a danger that 'our' assumptions may translate into misleading interpretations of 'their' priorities. For instance, a number of poverty-related credit interventions in the Indian context, where indebtedness to moneylenders has long been analysed as a key cause of poverty, have identified the reduction or elimination of reliance on moneylenders as a long-term goal. Consequently, the finding that women borrowers with the Madras-based Working Women's Forum (WWF) continued to rely on moneylenders, despite receiving yearly loans at increasing amounts, might be taken to signal that the intervention had failed to achieve its stated objectives. However, a study by Noponen (1990) also found that women who routinely combined loans from moneylenders and subsidized credit had statistically higher overall earning levels than women who did not. She suggested that women resorted to moneylenders in times of consumption crisis, for which WWF loans were not forthcoming. As a result of this strategy, their working capital was not eroded by family needs. Reliance on moneylenders need not therefore in itself represent a problem as long as it did not lead to debilitating debt.

Finally, if mainstream, gender-blind interventions have often erred in attributing altruistic and harmonious interpretations to intra-household distributional outcomes, feminist assumptions may lead to a different kind of interpretative bias, the tendency to attribute passivity and victimhood where there may be agency and negotiation. Thus Goetz and Sen Gupta (1994) attribute their findings from rural Bangladesh that around 60 per cent of the loans given to women as a part of poverty-oriented interventions were invested in male enterprises to 'male predation' and 'male appropriation'. However, this conclusion appears to be based on their own interpretation of this finding rather than on an interpretation provided by the women themselves. An alternative interpretation - and equally valid on the basis of the information they provide - might stress productivity rather than power: in the context of rural Bangladesh, where women are either secluded or confined to narrow, unproductive segments of the market and men are better positioned to make profitable investments, male use of loans to women could reflect a straightforward case of rational economic choice.

Conflicting interpretations of empirical phenomenon are also evident in two separate assessments of the Tamil Nadu Women's Development Programme cited earlier. the programme offers credit to members of poor women's groups on the condition that they accumulated minimum amount of savings in order to ensure that they had learnt to manage their funds effectively. One evaluation was carried out in a workshop with the project organizers while the other was specifically commissioned by the project funders. Both evaluations noted that it was often men's savings that were being used in order to meet the qualification. However, the first suggested that men were using the women in order to get access to the credit while the second suggested it was the women who were using men's savings in order to expedite their access to programme credit. However, neither interpretation appeared to be based on the accounts provided by the women in question.
Allowing women to speak on their own behalf about their own priorities and lives will not only help to rescue them from the position of eternal and muted victims, but also has very practical implications. The specific meaning of the indicators which emerge out of various evaluations - and it is the women affected who are the best judge of what these meanings might be - is important in the practical sense because it determines how a programme should evolve in future. If Goetz and Sen Gupta are correct in their surmise that the male use of women's loans was a matter of male appropriation of these loans, then a future course of action might be to take steps to strengthen women's control over their loans. If on the other hand it was a case of rational choice, then more attention may have to be given to dismantling barriers to women's participation in the market. In the Tamil Nadu example also, programme responses are likely to be very different if 'men were using women' (measures to ensure that women also benefited?) and if 'women were using men' (alternative effort to ensure that women learnt how to manage the money?).

CONCLUSION: POWER, PARTICIPATION AND THE POLITICAL SUB-TEXT OF GENDER-AWARE PLANNING

The policy process is seldom a neutral one. It is imbued at all stages by the power relations which govern the contexts in which policy is formulated and implemented and it is characterized by struggles over meanings as well as over resources. For women, particularly poorer women, who have tended to be marginalized in these struggles, their needs and priorities have always been defined on their behalf and often in terms which help to contain them within pre-existing roles and relationships. A planning process in which causes, effects, means and ends are analysed and evaluated in collaboration with those whose voices have been traditionally excluded has the advantage not only of allowing hitherto submerged needs and constraints to emerge but also of acknowledging the incompleteness of a development process in which such groups have not been given the space to participate. Participatory techniques are a means of ensuring that local interpretations, particularly by those whose lives are affected by an intervention, are given priority in the design and assessment of the intervention. This is not an entirely unproblematic process.

For women in particular, in societies where deeply-entrenched and internalized cultural rules, norms and values not only tend to devalue their worth and well-being but also to militate against recognition by women themselves of what Sen describes as this 'spectacular lack of equity in the ruling arrangements' (1990: 149). The power of social conditioning in shaping the 'choices' that women make to the extent that they may be resigned to, and indeed actively promote, the distribution of resources which discriminate against themselves and their daughters cannot be underestimated. It is this concern which underlies Jackson's critique (1995) of the populist claims made for PRA as 'giving voice' to the perceptions of local people. Noting the 'mutedness' that goes with political and economic disenfranchisement within a community, she challenges the implicit assumption of many PRA practitioners that the perceptions and priorities that women articulate are necessarily complete truths.

What is important to realize is that gender-awareness relates more to the theoretical perspectives and political stance of the analyst than it does to the superiority of one set of methodological tools over another. Participatory methodologies can only be as gender-blind or as gender-aware as their practitioners. At present, the gender biases of many PRA practitioners are disguised by the populist rhetoric of PRA discourse, a disguise not easily available to researchers using more conventional quantitative techniques. Nevertheless, to deny a role to participatory methodologies
in the processes by which needs and opportunities are identified, prioritized and responded to carries the danger of reinforcing the exclusion of women from policy process and denying them a voice a second time around. Participatory approaches which require 'us' to listen to 'them', and are informed by sensitivity to the different forms that gender power and inequality takes in different contexts, are critical in challenging the assumptions, preconceptions and biases which are part of all our cultural and disciplinary baggage, whether the 'we' in question is the feminist researcher or the neoclassical economist. They allow us to analyse the 'choices' that women make, the meaning of these choices and the extent to which they are a product of agency or the denial of agency to women within their households and communities. And when the denial of agency is entailed in the choices women make, they allow us to explore the extent to which such denial is the product of internalized ideologies or external constraints and hence what the priorities of policy intervention should be. 'Listening for change' is an essential part of the process by which poor women can be given 'voice' in shaping the interventions that are intended to address their poverty and by which they can take their place as central actors in deciding both the ends and means of development.

NOTES

1 The phrase comes from Fraser (1989).

2 Thus Jayawardene suggests that farmers' wives need to be educated to ensure that they do not encourage the farmer to waste his new prosperity: 'increased production and increased income do not necessarily mean that his money is spent in the best possible way. He may have confused priorities. This is where not only the farmer but his wife as well needs suitable education and guidance' (p.129).

3 A fairly classic welfarist programme for women was set up by the project authorities in the shape of a 'Home Development Centre' in which training was provided for women in health, nutrition, sanitation, poultry, home-gardening and needlework' (with a special emphasis on macramé) p.47.

4 See Waring (1990) for an ironic list of ways in which women can be kept out of development projects. An early attempt to categorize planners' errors with regard to women is to be found in Tinker (1976).

5 Gayathri Devi Dutt, personal communication.

6 The sheepish response of some of the development officials we have trained suggests that this is not an isolated response.

7 We also suggested collecting the beneficiary-identified indicators on a control group in order to improve the ability to separate out project-specific impact from alternative sources of impact.

8 Although of course Jodha's classic study reminds us that changes in income do not fully capture changes in wellbeing (Jodha 1989).
APPENDIX I: A GENDER AUDIT FOR DEVELOPMENT INTERVENTIONS

1. What are the goals of this intervention? Who decided upon them and who was consulted? Are they shared equally by both women and men? Equally by all women and men? If not, what are the grounds for supporting this intervention?

2. Is the intervention specified in generic, gender-specific or gender inclusive terms? Who is it actually directed at? Women? Men? Both? How are these men and/or women conceptualised: producers, consumers, experts, agents, victims; participants, beneficiaries? What is the rationale for this conceptualisation?

3. Whose constraints and potentials are being addressed through the intervention? Who identified them and who was consulted?

4. What assumptions are being made about the gender division of resources and responsibilities? What evidence is there that these assumptions are well-informed?

5. What new resources and responsibilities are being made available by this intervention? How does the gender distribution of these additional resources and responsibilities fit in with the existing distribution? Who is likely to have access to these new resources and responsibilities, to manage them and to benefit from them?

6. What gains or benefits flow as a result of this intervention? Who is likely to have access to them? Manage them? Who is likely to lose from this intervention? Which men? Which women? What is the justification for this distribution of gains and losses?

7. Does this intervention take account of the a) immediate b) underlying and c) structural causes of the problem being addressed? Is the analysis gender-blind or gender aware? Do the means and modalities adopted to address the problem focus only on immediate causes or do they also address the deeper causes? Are any strategic gender interests addressed by the intervention? Whose? Does addressing these gender interest entail a transformation or a reinforcement of existing relations of dependence and inequality? If it is the latter, can a transformatory potential be built into the intervention? What kinds of resistance would this encounter and how can these be dealt with?
REFERENCES


— 1992, 'Gender issues in development strategies', Women 2000, No 1, New York: UN Division for Advancement of Women


Goetz, A.M. and Sen Gupta, R., 1994, 'Who takes the credit? Gender, power and control over loan use in rural credit programmes in Bangladesh', IDS Working Paper No 8, Brighton, IDS


GTZ, nd, ZOPP. An Introduction to the Method, Frankfurt


Jackson, C., 1995, 'Rescuing gender from the poverty trap', Gender Analysis in Development Series, East Anglia: University of East Anglia


Kabeer, N., 1994a, 'Gender aware policy and planning: a social relations perspective' in M. Macdonald (ed.) Gender Planning in Development Agencies: Meeting the Challenges, U.K.: Oxfam


Kabeer, N. 1995, 'Necessary, sufficient or irrelevant: women, wages and intrahousehold power relations in urban Bangladesh', IDS Working Paper, No 25, Brighton, IDS


Kapur, R. and Cossman, B., 1993, 'On women, equality and the constitution: through the looking glass of feminism', National Law School Journal (Special Issue on Feminism and Law), Bangalore: National Law School of India University


Maguire, P., 1984, Women in Development: An Alternative Analysis Amherst, Massachusetts: Centre for International Education


Mukhopadhayay, M., 1995, 'Gender relations, development and culture', Gender and Development, Vol 3 No 1


Pyle, D, 1985, 'Indonesia: East Java family planning, nutrition and income generation project' in C. Overholt, M.B. Anderson, K. Cloud and J.E. Austin, Gender Roles in Development Projects, West Hartford: Kumarian Press

Sarin, M, 1995, 'Regenerating India's forests: reconciling gender equity with joint forest management', IDS Bulletin, Vol 26 No 1, Brighton, IDS


1985, Women, Foreign Assistance, and Advocacy Administration, New York: Praeger


7 Operational procedures for implementing gender policies, programmes and projects

Operational procedures designed to translate planning into practice are a simultaneous concern, along with the creation of institutional structures for a new planning agenda. Can gender simply be 'added on' to existing planning procedures such that ongoing policies, programmes and projects are made gender-aware? Or are separate planning procedures required, along with specific gender policies, programmes and projects? Or is a third alternative the transformation of existing planning processes, through 'mainstreaming'?

Successful gender planning depends not only on an appropriate problem analysis and policy formulation but also on an adequate methodology to implement the policy. Over the past decade professionals working on WID issues have clearly articulated the constraints and opportunities in institutionalizing gender planning within existing organizational structures. They have fought for increased resources and new institutional structures, as described in Chapter 6. In marked contrast, far less attention has focused on the operationalization of gender into current planning practices. Traditionally, operational procedures in the planning process have been identified as the 'technical' domain of planning, in which the major problem identified has been a lack of adequate procedures. The response by those involved in WID issues over the past five years has been to ensure that WID policies, programmes and projects have been developed, along with associated planning tools such as guidelines, manuals and checklists.

It is only recently that gender planners have realized that the problem no longer relates principally to a lack of gender policy, or to partially formulated gender policy. The rigour of current gender diagnosis and analysis has helped to ensure that 'technically' such policy is becoming increasingly sophisticated. The most important problem now is the inability to translate gender policy into practice. Why does this so frequently fail to occur? Why does the content of WID/GAD programmes and projects so often change during the implementation process? These are the questions that need to be addressed.

Chapter 5 outlined the evolution of different planning traditions and their
associated planning methodologies. This highlighted the difference between two planning traditions: first, rational comprehensive planning, with problem-solving technologies based on rational procedures and methods for decision-making; and second, 'transformative' traditions, that integrate conflict and negotiation into the planning process. In reviewing current practice it is necessary to identify the extent to which constraints in operational procedures are technical in nature, relating to inappropriate planning procedures. Is the problem that inappropriate rational comprehensive methodologies are being used to operationalize gender concerns, or are there wider political constraints which impede successful implementation? Or are both technical and political constraints and opportunities themselves linked in an iterative process?

During the past decade a range of organizations and agencies, at international, national and NGO level, have introduced new procedures into their planning processes, to operationalize gender concerns. From the wealth of experience of the past decade this chapter discusses different levels of intervention. Analysis of two very different planning interventions follows, with examples from both UN planning procedures, as well as from OECD bilateral agencies concerned with Third World development issues. The analysis concentrates primarily on constraints in operational procedures, with a detailed examination of the introduction of gender into the project planning cycle. Given the importance of project planning in the donor community, many see this as one of the most important areas of intervention. The examples come from personal experience and data accessibility. However, they also reflect the fact that several donors, both in Europe and in North America, have allocated considerable resources to the development of sophisticated tools and techniques. Assessment of their progress is intended to help other agencies concerned with gender planning within their own organizations.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND: THE DEVELOPMENT OF WID POLICY

Since colonial and post-colonial governments first identified the problems of Third World, low-income women as a policy concern, many types of interventions have been designed to help them. However, until recently there has been very little systematic classification of these various policy initiatives. Chapter 4 examined the conceptual rationale underlying different policy approaches from a gender planning perspective. It categorized five WID policy approaches — on a continuum from welfare, through equity, anti-poverty, and efficiency to empowerment — and evaluated each in terms of the roles recognized and gender needs met.
The operational procedures and levels of intervention associated with each policy approach are not necessarily similar. For example, the early welfare approach did not articulate itself as WID policy as such. Ministries of welfare or charitable groups made interventions at programme or project level. They targeted 'vulnerable' groups that included women, rather than specifically targeting interventions to women. The first defined WID policy, at donor level, was the 1973 Percy Amendment to the US Foreign Assistance Act. The history behind this equity-approach initiative and the widespread antagonism it encountered was described in Chapter 4. So was its particular focus on top-down statutory intervention at policy level to improve the position of women through legislation.

Despite the apparent limitation of equity as a policy approach, its importance lies in the fact that it was the first approach to highlight the need for the identification of policy direction through a formulated WID policy. As described in Chapter 5, this is the first stage in any gender planning process. It is now broadly recognized that a clear, precise and unambiguous policy-level statement of the importance of WID provides the starting point for operationalizing WID concerns. At the same time it is important to realize that the particular policy approach to WID adopted, and consequently the content of such policy, may differ widely.

From plans of action to forward looking strategies: the experience of the UN system

Following on the formulation of WID policy has been the development of plans of actions and sets of guiding principles. The purpose of these has been to define more specific goals, priorities and strategies for the integration of WID issues into particular policies, programmes and projects. Several planning initiatives by the United Nations, linked to both the 1975 International Women's Year, and then the 1976–85 UN Decade for Women, illustrate these changes. They reflect not only increasing levels of professionalism, but also changes in planning methodology.

The UN World Plan of Action for the Implementation of the Objectives of the International Women's Year (UN 1976a) was an early initiative intended to provide guidelines to national governments for action over the ten-year period up to 1985. It was the General Assembly that proclaimed this the Decade for Women, with its objectives equality, development and peace.1 Produced at a time of widespread legitimacy of national plans, it is a classic example of the blueprint 'survey–analysis–planning' plan to introduce women's issues into the political agenda. The methodology comprised three clear stages: of survey collection of data on women, its analysis, and the provision of recommended solutions. The Plan of Action outlined proposals
for general national policy, as well as identifying nine key areas for action, with recommendations addressed primarily to government. For example, in the education sector the survey revealed that 'in many countries women and girls are at a marked disadvantage'. The analysis showed that 'this constitutes a serious initial handicap for them as individuals and for their future position in society'. The action proposal included the provision of 'equal opportunities for both sexes at all levels of education and training according to national needs and international standards' (UN 1976a: 15–16).

In each sector the Action Proposals provided an eclectic checklist of measures without setting gender objectives or indicating the entry strategy for their implementation. Some measures advocated were for such practical gender needs as adequate training or child-care facilities. Others, intended to reach controversial strategic gender needs such as equality of opportunities in education and equal pay rights, were unlikely to be implemented in practice.

The UN Plan of Action provided a model for many governments to develop their own national policy statements and plans of action. Jamaica, for example, was one of a number of Caribbean countries that extended its national policy statements to include not only general principles but also immediate goals and proposed measures. In each case it identified the responsible agency. Thus, in the Jamaican Bureau of Women's Affairs National Plan of Action, goal number 5 states:

recognising that the evidence of physical and sexual abuse within families and societies is increasing – the government will pursue means of providing adequate protection and means of redress to women and children who are victims of family violence, incest, rape and sexual harassment.

(Government of Jamaica 1987: 17)

It then identified several important constraints to achieving this goal, including the fact that social attitudes condone physical abuse within the family. The proposed measures included the implementation of an act for the prevention of abuse to women and children to be administered in the family court. The Ministry of Labour was identified as the agency responsible for this measure (Government of Jamaica 1987). However, further stages in the implementation process were not outlined, which raises the question whether these measures were seen simply as procedural in nature.

Important though such policy initiatives have been, in practice it has proved very difficult to implement many recommendations. One negative outcome has been that this has often served simply to reinforce the prevailing cynicism as to the relevance of gender issues to mainstream national planning. This manifests itself in hostility of the opposition, and the despair of women's organizations, who have lobbied long and hard to get such issues
onto the agenda. To what extent is the planning methodology responsible for this problem?

In their evaluation of the Women's Decade, Tinker and Jaquette commented that it not only 'promoted and legitimised the international women's movement'; it also 'required attendance by governments at the three world conferences [and thereby] elevated women's issues to the level of international diplomacy' (1987:419). A third very important effect was its influence at the international level on planning procedures to operationalize gender concerns. The 1985 Nairobi conference recognized the limited impact of the Plan of Action during the decade in terms of its goals of equality, development and peace. Consequently the Forward Looking Strategies (FLS), adopted by 157 nations at the conclusion of the Nairobi conference, provided a far more specific set of guidelines and recommended strategies for adoption by UN member states. It was produced as a result of comprehensive surveys and questionnaires completed by all member states on progress and obstacles to women's development. It outlines concrete proposals and actions to be followed between 1985 and 2000 and makes impressive reading, containing as it does a substantial agenda relating not only to practical, but also to strategic gender needs.

The FLS alludes to the essentially political nature of the planning process. However, as a UN document it is limited in its ability to set specific goals and targets, or to define entry strategies. It therefore, confines itself to putting into place a few international structures to monitor progress, and thereby indirectly exerting pressure on national governments. This it does through the Commission on the Status of Women. The focus for WID in the UN system is based at the Division for the Advancement of Women in Vienna. It monitors the implementation of the FLS to the year 2000 by preparing annual reports on WID progress for the Economic and Social Council of the UN (UNCSDHA 1989).

Finally, at the UN level it is necessary to mention the 'Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women'. This is the most comprehensive international legal instrument dealing with the rights of women, now ratified by some ninety member states. Unlike other items agreed by consensus at the UN assembly, ratifying this document means that a country has a legally binding commitment to work for the elimination of discrimination against women (Commonwealth Secretariat 1988b). The Convention requires that governments set up national legislation banning discrimination. Some thirty articles outline the international principles to implement equality in areas relating to political rights, public life, education, employment and pay, maternity rights, social services and child-care provision. The Committee for the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) supervises the implementation of the Convention. This is under-
taken through monitoring and reporting procedures, requiring ratifying
nations to provide reports at stated intervals.

The reporting procedures of both the FLS and the Convention have
resulted in sophisticated gender diagnosis on a wide range of issues relating
to the status of women. This may be their greatest achievement. Diagnosis
is undertaken on a four-year cycle and, consequently, has the potential for
integration into national planning cycles. Since national women's bureaux
have responsibility for the data collection, this provides the opportunity for
closer liaison and collaboration with other ministries.

Despite such measures, however, few countries have integrated gender
into national development policy or planning procedures. In both the FLS
and the Convention, government's participation in monitoring procedures is
voluntary. The evidence to date shows that many fail to respond promptly,
if at all, while many countries have yet to ratify the Convention. As
INSTRAW (1988) has commented, it is only when women's organizations
and others begin to monitor the work of CEDAW that the Convention will
become a powerful tool for eliminating discrimination. Even in countries
working to achieve absolute equality in the law, there is a wide gap between
de jure equality and the actual state of affairs (UNCSDHA 1989).

From WID mandates to project-cycle handbooks: the experience of
the OECD community

The UN experience illustrates changes in planning procedures at the policy
level, particularly during the 1975–85 period. This is applicable to an
international institution with a mandate to monitor progress globally. Com-
plementary to this is the experience of the donor community, discussed here
in relation to the OECD countries. Particularly during the 1980–90 period,
these countries had an impressive record in the development of complex
planning procedures, and detailed tools to ensure that different stages in the
planning process operationalize gender concerns. In describing these de-
velopments in Table 7.1, the purpose is also to clarify terminology and
categories used.

The first critical stage in the formulation of WID policy is when organi-
izations recognize the limitations of their gender-blind procedures and
establish a WID Mandate or Policy. All nineteen members of the OECD's
Development Assistance Committee (DAC) comply with the requirement
that WID policies should be explicitly based on specific mandates. All
therefore have such a document. This is a legally binding policy document,
adopted at a high level, to show political commitment. Within its general
guidelines, different options follow. These range from parliamentary law
(Italy and the United States), to ministerial directives, to internal guidelines
Table 7.1 Planning procedures to operationalize WID

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General procedures</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Type of country-specific procedure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WID mandate or policy</td>
<td>to define and legitimate WID policy</td>
<td>- parliament legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- ministerial directive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- internal guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- operational objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan of action</td>
<td>to provide WID operational strategies and procedures</td>
<td>- detailed plan of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- general action programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WID strategy paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WID specific sector guidelines</td>
<td>to provide sector-specific WID guidelines</td>
<td>- sector-level WID checklists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WID sector papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WID manuals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated WID criteria in sector guidelines</td>
<td>to integrate WID criteria into general sector guidelines</td>
<td>- sector guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WID in office procedure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country-level WID guidelines</td>
<td>to integrate WID concerns into country-level operations</td>
<td>- country-specific WID plans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- country plan of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- country development strategy statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- country programme/reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- country assessment WID papers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WID project guidelines</td>
<td>to integrate WID into the project cycle</td>
<td>- WID project cycle manual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- WID project checklist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- project identification document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- project paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- checklist for participation of WID projects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring procedures</td>
<td>to monitor implementation of WID plan of action</td>
<td>- progress reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- built-in monitoring procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- reporting to congress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
emanating from the ministry or agency responsible for development cooperation (adopted by all other OECD countries). The scope of mandates varies considerably. Canada, for example, has one of the more complex mandates. An extensive policy framework defines the scope of the WID mission assigned to CIDA, as well as the orientation, operational objectives and strategy.

Within such mandates different approaches to WID reflect complex internal political processes undertaken to ensure that such a mandate is adopted. It also reflects the fact that policies themselves often are redefined over time. Within the OECD countries the full spectrum of WID approaches exists. While most countries now have adopted a combined welfare/efficiency approach, others have what is termed a 'gendered efficiency' approach. Occasionally, when women are identified as a central target of development assistance, empowerment is more explicitly articulated. For example, USAID, in a 1982 policy paper, clearly reflected an efficiency approach when stating that ‘the key issue underlying the women in development concept is ultimately an economic one: misunderstanding of gender difference, leading to inadequate planning and designing of projects, results in diminished returns on investment’ (1982: 1).

In contrast, a recent policy definition of the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs combines an emancipatory/efficiency approach:

The advancement of women is a necessary component of development cooperation. It is required both by a fair approach to the female half of the target group, which has long been overlooked, and by an expedient approach to their substantial contribution, which has too long been underestimated. Thus while the improvement of the position and status of women is fully valid as an emancipatory end in itself, the utilization of women’s potential is at the same time an efficient means to improve the quality of development as a whole.

(1989: 2)

Recognizing that a WID mandate is not enough, OECD countries have sought to operationalize it through several different types of interventions (see Table 7.1). While mandates provide general guidelines, the next important procedure is a Plan of Action. Its purpose is to provide operational strategies to implement the WID policies outlined in the mandate. The plan identifies objectives and responsibilities over the full range of the agency’s area of operations, and provides specific guidelines for the implementation of different departments and divisions. By 1990 all but two of the DAC members had adopted such Action Plans.

A further procedure is that of WID specific sector guidelines. These provide more stringent measures to ensure that WID is operationalized at the
Operational procedures for implementation

To date, most specific guidelines have been elaborated in areas where women's roles are identified as critical. These include agriculture, health, water and the environment. The guidelines highlight substantive issues at the sectoral level, also providing summarized checklists to help staff in drawing up terms of reference. Sometimes general action programmes or WID manuals include sector-specific details. An alternative procedure has been to integrate WID criteria into general sector guidelines. This procedure obviously involves greater collaboration and negotiation between WID and other sector experts. Again it is more likely to be undertaken in sectors where women are visible, and not in those sectors, such as urban, energy or industry, where the role of women is less obvious.

Some donors give less priority to sectoral interventions, and emphasize more the importance of procedures for country-level WID guidelines. Here WID or gender issues are integrated into the country programme/frame documentation included in negotiation procedures between the donor and the recipient countries. These are the major decision-making processes for selecting sector, programme and project priorities. The procedures can include either country-specific WID profiles and plans, or the integration of WID into national plans of action. Finally, there are WID project guidelines that provide detailed instructions as checklists to ensure that the project planning cycle integrates gender.

Ultimately, commitment to the integration of WID into the planning process has to be measured. The purpose of monitoring procedures is, therefore, to gauge the extent to which each of these six procedures has been implemented. To date, monitoring procedures have focused on the implementation of Plans of Action through such measures as progress reports and 'built-in' monitoring procedures. But progress has been very slow, with the most important problem being the lack of adequate or appropriate indicators. Here it is also important not to conflate the need for two different sets of indicators: first, indicators that assess the implementation of procedures; and secondly, indicators that assess or measure the impact of interventions on the situation of women in developing countries. In the latter case a well-known problem is the lack of disaggregated baseline data against which to measure impact.

One problem in monitoring changes in operational procedures is the difficulty of developing adequate quantitative measurements of process. The DAC evaluation, for instance, comments that although all OECD members have adopted action plans, very few have integrated monitoring procedures to review the process of WID integration in their agencies. Measures, both quantitative and qualitative, are needed to decide benchmarks for WID integration activities. These do not necessarily have to be onerous to develop or cumbersome to use. Measurements such as the numbers of times aid
148 Gender planning process and implementation

officials raise WID issues in donor exchanges, or the inclusion of WID in the terms of reference, provide simple but innovative indicators.

USAID is one of the few agencies to undertake a rigorous evaluation of the implementation of its WID policy. Undertaken in 1987, its conclusions were both depressing and salutary. This is particularly the case, given the political mandate and impressive budget invested both in increasing institutional capacity and in the development of detailed planning procedures. The evaluation concluded that WID was operating against a range of constraints. These included the attitude of USAID staff, which was one of tolerant indifference. Although lip-service was given to the importance of WID, this was seen as a reaction to special-interest politics rather than a serious concern for development. A lack of regularized systems and procedures revealed that it was the initiative and enthusiasm of individuals that had been the most significant variable influencing the degree to which USAID programmes and projects incorporated WID concerns. Overall, the findings were summarized as follows:

AID’s Women in Development Policy is not being implemented fully or vigorously, and there is little enthusiasm and few incentives for doing so. Without meaningful Agency-wide acceptance of responsibility for implementation of this policy, the efforts of WID and its agents in support of the policy will be marginally useful at best.

(Development Alternatives 1987: 76)

WHAT HAS GONE WRONG? CONSTRAINTS IN OPERATIONAL PROCEDURES

Evaluations such as this raise the question as to what has gone wrong with operational procedures designed to translate policy into practice. USAID’s response to this indictment was to develop a new, more complex set of guidelines for incorporating gender into its activities. This was called the Gender Information Framework (GIF), in which both the language and the concern have changed from women in development to gender and development. While it is still too early to see if this set of new tools has changed USAID’s practice, the importance of this initiative lies in what it reveals about the agency’s perception as to the constraints in the implementation of policy. Above all, these were identified as being of a technical nature emanating from inappropriate or inadequate planning procedure. The solution was to develop ‘better’ or more appropriate procedures. But is this apparent ‘failure’ due to technical constraints, or are there also fundamental political constraints operating? The fact that donor agencies have developed
Operational procedures for implementation

so many different procedures makes it important to identify the opportunities and constraints in the implementation of policy.

Is ‘symbolic’ policy the problem?

It is useful to start by asking whether the problem is that, from its formulation, the policy concerned is essentially ‘symbolic’? One reason why policy so often is not carried out relates to the fact that it can easily be formulated without the intention to carry it out at all. It has been argued that effective implementation requires ‘unambiguous policy directives’ (Sabatier and Mazmanian 1979). ‘Perfect’ implementation then requires ‘complete understanding of and agreement upon, the objectives to be achieved’ (Gunn 1978: 173). In introducing the concept of ‘policy message’, to embrace both the substance of policy and the way it is communicated, Hambleton (1986) argues that there are limits to the degree of clarity that can be expected in the policy message. He identifies a number of sound reasons for policy ambiguity.

First, although it may be easy to specify policy standards and objectives, usually it is extremely difficult to show clear performance indicators or targets. This is particularly true when policy is complex or extensive in its goals. Policies to improve the status of women present a classic example of this case, with globally relevant indicators of status so difficult to identify. Secondly, ambiguities may result from uncertainty, which occurs when understanding is imperfect, or when policy-makers have little control over those carrying it out. In such cases the temptation is to leave policy vague. Again policy objectives to ‘bring women into development’ provide a widely experienced example of this phenomenon. Thirdly, and of greatest relevance to gender policy, ambiguity may be fostered deliberately by policy-makers. Their intention is to conceal conflicts of objectives between the different actors involved, thus leaving room for manoeuvres, negotiation and renegotiation.

Finally, some policy messages are intended to be heard but not acted on. These policies are not intended to achieve real change but simply to provide ‘symbolic reassurance’ that something is being done. Symbolic policy is one of the biggest problems faced by those working with a WID agenda. This can be the consequence of policy formulated under outside pressure placed on countries by donor agencies to integrate WID into their development programme. It can also be the consequence of policy formulated without realistic objectives by those unwilling or unable to recognize that policy implementation always involves some kind of compromise. For instance, it could be argued that in many countries the UN Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies are perceived as symbolic policy.
Are separate WID policies, programmes and projects the problem?
Changing programming approaches from ‘targeting’ through ‘integrating’ to ‘mainstreaming’

Procedures to operationalize WID concerns can focus on WID-specific interventions at policy, programme or project level. Or they can emphasize ‘integration’ or ‘mainstreaming’ of gender into existing policies, programmes and projects. This raises the question as to which are the more appropriate planning procedures. Anderson and Chen (1988) argue that ‘programming approaches’ to WID can be classified in the same way as institutional structures, described in Chapter 6. Targeted interventions are obviously those specifically directed at women. This means that their express objectives are to meet practical or strategic gender needs, with their budgets allocated entirely for this purpose. This approach has been justified as necessary to overcome the gender-blindness that has excluded women from the benefits of development.

In contrast to this is the ‘integration’ or mainstream approach in which women as much as men are taken into account in all stages of the planning cycle. The rationale for this approach, according to Anderson and Chen (1988), is that every project activity affects all segments of economy and society. Consequently, development efforts should take account of those effects on women. From their review of the relationship between different programming and institutional arrangements, they conclude that there is no internal logic that dictates the connection between one structural arrangement and its programmatic thrust. Both institutional and programmatic approaches have been successful sometimes and have failed completely at other times. Each has strengths, but each has also encountered pitfalls.

Despite this conclusion, there is nevertheless an interesting relationship between different policy approaches to WID and different emphases in programming (see Table 7.2). Changing positions in this debate have coincided with developments in policy approaches to WID, which appear to have determined not only the type but also the level of intervention. While the welfare approach targeted ‘vulnerable’ groups that happened to include women with interventions at programme and project level, the equity approach focused on integrating women into development with interventions primarily at policy level. The anti-poverty approach that quickly replaced it represented not only a toned-down version of equity but also an important shift to a different level of intervention. These were the women’s projects, so aptly described by Buvinic (1986) as small-scale, situation specific, and using limited financial and technical resources. Women, many of them volunteers with little technical expertise, carried out such projects intended to benefit only women. The golden era of women’s projects was the
1970s and early 1980s, associated with the global networking of the WID concept. However, the anti-poverty approach and women's projects have not disappeared.

For many agencies, the shift to mainstreaming has been a direct reaction to the manner in which separate women's projects appear to have further marginalized women. A common problem identified in government planning procedures has been for important ministries, such as agriculture, to cease allocating resources to women-specific projects. This was done on the basis that the Women's Bureau had their own budget. Equally, as Buvinic (1986) has argued, resources for poor women are often accessible only if there is not a cut-back in investment for poor men. This has resulted in a marked preference for cheaper, non-threatening welfare projects that do not have the potential to redistribute resources from men to women.

For some agencies, mainstreaming has also marked an apparent epistemological, if not ideological, shift from women and development to gender and development. Again this has also been accompanied by a semantic shift in emphasis from 'integrating' to 'mainstreaming'. Thus, in 1982 USAID WID policy stressed that 'gender roles constitute a key variable in the socioeconomic conditions of a country' (USAID n.d.: 1).

Above all, the shift from targeting to mainstreaming must be associated with the increased popularity of the efficiency approach. This identifies women as the most important under-utilized resource which programmes and projects must incorporate for more effective and efficient development. Reflecting the World Bank's position on the efficiency approach to WID is its Operational Issues Paper on the Forestry Sector, in which Molner and Schreiber explicitly state:

Women are key actors in the forestry sector throughout the developing world. Ensuring their direct involvement in forestry projects, both as beneficiaries and participants, can: a) ensure that projects achieve their
immediate purposes and broad socio-economic goals, and b) maximize returns on investment in this sector.

(1989: i)

The relationship between policy and programming approaches to WID and GAD differs. Separate projects are associated with a welfare or anti-poverty approach, and integrated projects with an efficiency approach. In reality, however, successful implementation relates more to recognition, with adequate budget and staffing, than to whether it adopts a separate or integrated approach. A women’s project can be identified as a mainstream project if decision-makers give it priority and an adequate budget (Levy 1989).

Simultaneously, the fact that it is a mainstream policy or project does not a priori mean that there cannot be special components for women within it. For instance, a project targeted at both men and women may require specific women’s ‘components’ to ensure that women participate equally with men. Often agencies do not clearly distinguish between a women’s project and a component for women in a mainstream project.

The World Food Programme (1987), in their General Guidelines state that a ‘women-only’ project or a ‘women’s component’ can be normally justified only as a bridging strategy to bring women to a threshold level from which they can enter mainstream activities equally with men. One problem here is the failure to recognize women’s need to balance their triple role. This means that unless men also take on reproductive activities, no amount of ‘bridging’ can bring them up to men’s threshold. The most obvious women’s components in mainstream projects is child care. In reality, this is a family need but is identified as a practical gender need of women because of their reproductive responsibilities (Levy 1989).

Since the mid-1980s most donor agencies have adopted the policy of integrating women into mainstream programmes and projects, as shown in Table 7.1. They use both WID-specific procedures (such as WID-specific sector guidelines) and mainstream procedures (such as integrating WID criteria in sector guidelines). SIDA, for example, has what it terms a ‘gendered efficiency’ approach. This emphasizes the integration of women into existing development co-operation programmes, rather than establishing separate women’s projects. The reason for this approach is twofold. First, women already participate in most sectors, and efforts are needed to facilitate a more effective role for them. Secondly, neglect of women in development co-operation programmes results in a negative impact on women themselves, and on development in general. Efforts to involve women more equitably invariably result therefore in better development co-operation (SIDA 1989: 2).

The empowerment approach to WID seeks to intervene at all three levels
Operational procedures for implementation

153

of policy, programmes and projects, and combines both mainstreaming and targeted approaches. It recognizes that both types of programming are important. Women-focused projects remain critical, especially at the level of small-scale NGOs, because so many poor women can never be reached in mainstream projects. In addition, mainstreaming, unless meticulously monitored, can in effect mean men. There is a very real danger that widespread proliferation of gender, rather than women and development may ironically result in women losing out again. It allows policy-makers and programmers to pay lip-service to women through the term 'gender'. Again, monitoring is the crucial issue. As Christian Aid state in their Gender Guidelines:

We think there is sometimes a special case for projects run entirely by women for women ... [these] can enable women to increase their level of self-confidence and organizational skill. This is usually more difficult to achieve in mixed [male/female] groups, where there is a tendency for men to dominate – even within groups which are predominantly female. Support for women only projects is justified and should be encouraged, although the dangers of marginalization must be recognised.

(1989: 2)

Is the problem the analytical tools?

The fact that the introduction of gender into existing planning procedures has not fundamentally changed the situation suggests that on its own this cannot confront the real problem. However meticulous the procedures developed to integrate gender into the project planning cycle, it is necessary to assess whether they fall into the trap of being what Thomas (1979) identifies as 'contentless' and contextless'. One important criticism of rational comprehensive planning is that in assuming 'consensus' it fails to recognize conflict, or to provide the operational procedures to confront it. In 'grafting' gender onto an existing planning methodology, the procedures in the planning cycle have not changed. They do not incorporate new stages that include the negotiation of conflict, or participatory debate. Because it assumes that the problem is a technical one, the introduction of additional interventions within the existing framework of procedures is identified as solving the problem. Therefore, another constraint may be the analytical tools themselves.

One tool that has received particular attention is gender diagnosis and analysis, and the extent to which it recognizes subordination. It is helpful to distinguish between the gender analysis of the 'Harvard approach' and the gender diagnosis approach of the gender planning methodology described in Chapter 5. The Harvard approach was designed to create awareness. Its tools are intended to ensure the meticulous documentation of differences between
men and women in divisions of labour, as well as in the ownership and control over resources. It assumes that feeding this information into the project cycle, based on rational comprehensive procedures, is sufficient to change practices. Its careful avoidance of identifying the causes of the inequality between men and women means that it does not seek to provide tools to confront conflict in the implementation process. This is not surprising, since it is based on a consensus, rather than conflict, planning model. Anderson (1990), one of those responsible for developing the Harvard approach, recently identified a gap between gender analysis and ‘incorporating this analysis in some effective way into actual programme design and implementation’. However, the Harvard approach does not provide any guidelines as to how this might be achieved.

The Harvard approach is closely linked to the efficiency approach to WID with its economically deterministic underlying assumption that there is a direct relationship between increased access to resources and employment and increased status for Third World women: ‘[The] Gender analysis approach ... avoided the ideological tone that worried critics ... the approach demonstrated that the issue of women was an issue of economic efficiency, rather than an issue “only” of equality’ (Anderson 1990: 31). Gender analysis, therefore, provides tools for policy interventions to help women to participate more efficiently in the labour market, through ameliorating measures such as child-care provision, or transport. It does not provide the tools for policy intervention to help women to ‘empower’ themselves to organize and challenge existing relations. Policy which equates increased efficiency with equity focuses almost entirely on practical gender needs on the assumption that increased access to employment will make women equal, or more equal, with men.

The cause of this problem is most frequently identified as ‘culture’, as illustrated in the following statement from the World Bank WID Division:

For women, as for men, the ability to realize their economic potential depends both on their human capital – i.e. their health and learning – and on their access to information, resources, and markets. However, women face additional and more intractable barriers to access than do men, because of their mothering role (multiple pregnancies and childcare) and because of cultural traditions, sometimes reflected in law or policy, that tend to keep women more home-bound than men and more restricted in their work choices and social interactions. These barriers are worse in conditions of poverty, but they persist even in industrialized countries. They restrict women’s access to the information and resources required to respond to economic opportunities.

(1990: 2; my emphasis)
Is the current reticence of agencies in recognizing subordination a widespread collusion with the idea that better education, health and employment opportunities will make women equal with men? Or is it a sensitivity towards addressing an issue that in reality is so threatening? Gender needs assessment, as a contextually specific planning tool, provides agencies with the capacity to confront this issue more directly. The distinction then between different gender objectives is clear: meeting practical gender needs through development projects assists women either to perform more effectively and efficiently the activities they are already undertaking, or to take on new activities in their existing roles; meeting strategic gender needs through development projects assists women to achieve greater equality, and therefore changes existing roles, which, as ODA has argued, may be considered appropriate in those contexts where ‘the status and opportunities of women are inferior to those of men’ (ODA 1989: 5).

Most governments are committed to policies of equity and equal opportunities, as endorsed in the UN Forward Looking Strategies. However, along with many donor agencies and NGOs, they remain unable or unwilling to articulate the problem of women’s position as one of subordination. As Peggy Antrobus has written so explicitly:

the problem with the array of guidelines, checklists, and methodological tools that have been formulated has less to do with their technical qualities and shortcomings than with the conceptual frameworks, and paradigms, within which they are situated and by which they are constrained.

(1989: 5)

EXPERIENCES WITH PROJECT PLANNING: IS THE PLANNING METHODOLOGY THE PROBLEM?

Given the impressive number of planning procedures developed to operationalize gender concerns, it is important to identify how far meticulous gender planning tools can ensure the implementation of gender into the planning process. Table 7.1 provided a checklist of the seven most widespread procedures, identifying in each case their purpose and country-specific titles. Of these, one important opportunity for gendering planning procedures is project planning. Many donors still consider this the most important planning procedure for developing countries. Consequently, some of the most innovative initiatives to integrate gender have been developed in relation to project planning. The remainder of this chapter will focus, therefore, on the factors influencing the integration of gender concerns into the project planning cycle.

Donors have both adapted and adopted the generalized project cycle,
described in Chapter 5, to suit their own particular agenda. Governments, NGOs and donors alike now use the logical framework approach, with different modifications. The extent to which the different phases, or stages, of the cycle are clearly identified, however, varies depending not only on the level of professional planning expertise and financial accountability, but also on the ideological position of the procedures, often relying on 'common good sense'. Even where procedures are specified, such as in the Oxfam Field Directors Handbook, often they are guidelines rather than checklists for practice. In contrast to this, larger donors such as USAID and the World Bank have highly systematized procedures identified for all stages of the project cycle.

In addition, several new planning tools have been introduced to integrate gender into the project cycle. Although variations exist, it is useful to divide them into three broad categories:

a) **Checklists and guidelines** are intended to be integrated into all stages of the cycle, although their relevance at different stages of the cycle is unspecified. Guidelines, checklists and impact statements are often used interchangeably to both measure and monitor the extent of women’s integration in development programmes. Antrobus provides a useful distinction between guidelines as ‘indicators for translating policy mandates on women and development into action at the programme and project level’; checklists, which ‘are more specific and aim to provide a more detailed memory aid, giving conceptual clarification and practical suggestions’; and impact statements, which are intended to ‘get people thinking about the consequences of their interventions’ (Antrobus 1989: 13–16).

b) **General project-cycle tools** comprise detailed procedures identified for each stage of the cycle, sometimes in manual form, and are intended for projects despite sectoral concerns.

c) **Sector-specific project guidelines** are detailed procedures laid out for each stage of the project cycle, and for a designated sector.

Chapter 5 described the gender planning process, identifying the interrelationship between gender planning tools, procedures and components in the planning process. This methodology for gendering the project cycle assumes that at each stage of the project cycle an iterative process occurs which includes gender diagnosis, gender consultation and participation, the identification of gender objectives and an entry strategy, followed by monitoring and the inclusion of appropriate institutional structures and training procedures. In theory this is fine; in practice it is more complex. Therefore the following description of the gendering of the project cycles identifies the problems encountered in attempts to incorporate gender, as well as empha-
### Table 7.3 Checklist of current interventions to ‘gender’ the project cycle

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Important Interventions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Identification</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- policy direction  
- identification of WID policy approach (WID/GAD policy matrix)  
- targeted or mainstream intervention  |
| 2 Preparation (a) definition of target group (b) identification of gender objectives |  
- gender diagnosis  
- gender roles identification  
- gender needs assessment  |
| 3 Design (a) personnel (b) socio-economic feasibility studies |  
- staff gender training  
- gendered terms of reference for staff and consultants  
- mechanisms to ensure women and gender-aware organizations are included in planning process  
- gender needs assessment  
- gender disaggregated data over allocation and control of resources  |
| 4 Appraisal (a) mission personnel (b) appraisal studies |  
- gendered terms of reference for consultants  
- inclusion of gender expert  
- gender staff training  
- gendered cost-benefit analysis to include women's 'invisible work'  
- inclusion of women in staff gender training  |
| 5 Ratification |  
- entry point for dialogue?  
- staff training on gender-awareness of issues  |
| 6 Implementation (a) agency and staff (b) target population |  
- staff gender planning training  
- gendered terms of reference for staff  
- gendered composition of agency  
- clarification of women’s role in participatory projects  |
| 7 Monitoring/evaluation |  
- gendered terms of reference of consultants  
- staff gender training  
- team composition  |
sizing the particularly important interventions at different stages of the cycle. It draws on the comparative experience of a number of institutions that have tackled this planning problem (see Table 7.3). Although stages are discussed separately, they are of course highly interrelated.

Project identification – policy direction

The introduction of the issue of gender into project identification, the first stage in the cycle, determines from the outset the project's orientation. This stage is concerned with relating development goals and resulting sectoral priorities to appropriate projects. These not only have to fit into, and support, a coherent development strategy, and meet sectoral objectives, but they also have to be considered suitable by both the implementing agency and the donor.

The issue of gender is important in two ways in project identification. First, at a general level, gender, along with class, can be identified as an important determinant of development goals in terms of broad sectoral resource priorities. For example, donors often give priority to large-scale infrastructure projects such as dams, hydro-power or electricity, on the basis that their impact will 'trickle down to reach the poor'. Yet the low-income population may not be able to pay for the water or electricity. So such projects, although generally assisting the country's 'development', more specifically meet the needs of factory-owners or upper-income households. Since it is women in the low-income households who take primary responsibility for water and fuel collection, such projects are unlikely to meet their needs. The fact that project identification can predetermine women's participation in projects has been widely recognized. CIDA, for instance, in their 1986 Project Identification Memorandum (PIM) state:

The project identification stage involves the selection of projects that are compatible with CIDA's aid framework (including the WID Policy Framework) and contribute to sectoral and country strategy. Certain projects have greater potential to influence the lives of women. Provided they are compatible with other CIDA objectives and those of the recipient, such projects should receive preference.

(1986a: 6)

At a specific level, gender is important in terms of the type of project selected. An important distinction exists between women's projects and mainstream or integrated projects, as discussed in the previous section. In reality, the debate between mainstreaming or targeting is critical throughout the project cycle. It affects choices on issues such as staff selection, training procedures and institutional structures. Therefore, a priori, gender must be recognized
as a policy priority. As a generalization, projects targeted at those sectors – basic needs provision, small-scale production and farming and traditional food production – have greater potential to reach low-income households.

**Project preparation or formulation**

The recognition of gender in project identification does not ensure that the project is gendered. It is in the project preparation stage, when target groups are defined, project objectives identified and the project designed, that most has been achieved in integrating gender.

*Definition of target groups: gender diagnosis, gender roles identification and gender needs assessment*

In principle, it is now acknowledged that gender must be integrated into target group definitions. SIDA (1989), for instance, has argued that the use of collective terms within development co-operation, such as ‘families’, ‘the poor’, ‘farmers’, ‘slum dwellers’, ‘target groups’, ‘rural population’ and ‘small-scale entrepreneurs’, has negative impact for the integration of women. It is therefore necessary to break down these terms by gender. In practice, however, gender is still not usually included at the design stage – above all, because most planners still lack a gender planning methodology.

Particular problems often occur when planners, overnight, as it were, are informed that ‘women must be included’. If, because of ‘political’ pressure for endorsement purposes at the appraisal stage, the project is required to ‘include’ women, the document is often simply amended with the phrase ‘and women’ added to each appropriate stage in the cycle. This happens when an agency funds a project designed by another, or when gender-blind projects are sent for appraisal to WID or social advisers. The fact that there is no logical rationale behind such changes means that usually the project does not in practice become ‘gendered’. The most blatant example of this practice occurs when existing project documents add the phrase ‘and women’ in a different type-face.

Yet an even more common confusion is the illogical identification of gendered and non-gendered categories in the same target group. For instance, ‘farmers, landless labourers and women’; ‘women and resource poor-farmers’; ‘farmers, including farm women and agricultural labourers’. Are all such unspecified project target groups in reality men? When monitoring procedures require agencies to ‘count’ how many projects include or ‘reach’ women, lack of accurate gender disaggregated data can result in the under-recording of resource allocations to women. FAO, in a recent analysis of three departments’ regular programme activities concluded that ‘68 percent
of projects were not explicitly directed at women to any degree' (FAO 1987: 1). Because this figure only included projects in which the word 'woman' appeared, it presumably missed projects in which 'resource-poor farmers' or 'landless' happened to include women.

Despite constraints such as these, gendered target group identification now has elaborate procedures. Gender diagnosis was described in Chapter 5. However, other methodology has been variously termed 'gender analysis' (USAID), 'gender investigation' (World Bank) or a 'gender perspective' (SIDA). One detailed procedure is that of USAID. It comprises four different techniques: the disaggregation of data by gender; gender distinctions in terminology; the inclusion of explicit strategies to involve women; and the use of gender-disaggregated benchmarks in monitoring and evaluation. To ensure its adoption, USAID has developed the Gender Information Framework (GIF). This itself consists of two components, a gender analysis guide, and a document review guide.

Based on the Harvard case-study methodology, the gender analysis guide outlines a two-step gender analysis process. First, it identifies where gender might intervene in social and economic production systems (in terms of allocation of labour, sources of income, financial responsibilities, and access and control of resources). Secondly, it analyses the implications of gender differences for project design. These are identified in terms of key differences between men and women's constraints and opportunities in development activities (relating to labour, time, access to credit, education and training, skills and knowledge).

SIDA's (1989) gender perspective identifies two analytical tools. First, gender-specific target group analysis. As factors for consideration, this identifies household composition, the division of labour in terms of the different roles of men and women at household and community level, and the responsibility, access and final control over resources at household and community level. Second is gender-specific impact analysis. In projects where women may not be considered the 'target group', such as a hydro-power project, there can still be both negative and positive impacts for women, which a gender-specific impact analysis can identify. USAID's GIF and SIDA's target group/impact analysis both provide examples of specific tools intended to ensure the provision of gender-disaggregated data in all stages in the project cycle. The USAID Document Review Guide explains the importance in project/programme design and evaluation, to disaggregate data by gender whenever possible, to incorporate gender considerations and to include decision points in project implementation to allow project adaptation as new data become available.

It is important that gender diagnosis is what it says it is; the diagnosis of both men and women, and the relationship between them. Projects can fail
equally if they ignore men in target group identification. SIDA cites the example of health projects, where inputs in child care, nutrition, family planning and care of pregnant women had limited impact if directed solely at women. Men often have ultimate authority with the family. Consequently, even if the women are well informed, they often cannot make changes to family eating habits unless their spouses have sufficient information to agree. For instance, to grow different crops requires that male farmers have the necessary information to make the recommended changes.

Identification of project objectives; gender needs assessment and gender objectives

The integration of gender into project objectives requires detailed specification of the changes which the project needs to achieve for both men and women. The basic issue here relates to the assessment of gender needs, and the extent to which the methodology distinguishes between practical and strategic needs. CIDA, for instance, in their PIM document provide a guide of eleven issues to ensure that their objectives address key aspects of WID. They state that projects should be examined in terms of whether they

- lead to jobs, skills, training, improved markets, more public services, housing, food production or other gains that directly benefit lowest income groups, in which women frequently are found in the largest percentages;
- facilitate access to and control over resources by poor women, including women heads of household (1986b: 100).

One constraint of a checklist such as this is that it does not prioritize needs into a ‘cause and effect’ hierarchy, or state the likelihood of their being achieved. Thus it identifies practical gender needs relating to jobs and skill training alongside strategic gender needs related to controlling resources. As ODA (n.d.) points out, project objectives need to identify whether they recognize the distinction between different types of needs. Christian Aid recognizes that objectives to reach practical gender needs automatically do not reach strategic gender needs. These often require specific, often highly sensitive, interventions in their own right. In its Gender Guidelines, it shows its priorities in terms of gender needs:

Our task is not simply to support the involvement of more women or to fund more women’s projects, but to equip women with the means to challenge and overcome their constraints. We should address ourselves to both the practical and strategic needs of women. We should support projects that enable women and men to understand the structural inequal-
Project design and gender consultation and participation

Project design includes questions relating not only to what is designed, but also who designs, and how it is designed, all of which involve issues relating to gender. The procedures discussed under project design, which relate to personnel and feasibility studies, also relate to later stages in the project cycle. These include project personnel, gender training and gendered terms of reference.

One difficulty in planning relates to the division of labour at different stages in the project cycle. Staff identifying project objectives may not design the project. Unless both are gender-aware, project objectives may not be taken into account in the design phase. Agencies commonly separate out the design of ‘technical’, ‘economic’ and ‘social’ components of projects to different experts. This encourages ‘technical’ experts to leave the social development issues to the socio-economists, or anthropologists. In order to solve the problem of gender-blind personnel, most donor agencies have integrated training. The extent to which this helps technical staff depends not only on the relevance and content of training, but also on the policy approach to training itself – issues to be examined in detail in Chapter 8.

The fact that training provides no guarantees that staff will be sensitive to issues in practice has resulted in the operationalization of a further critical planning tool. This is the development of clearly gendered terms of reference of all project staff. This identifies the gendered information and analysis required to ensure gendered interventions at each relevant stage of the project cycle.

The socio-economic feasibility study

The timing of feasibility studies is often critical to project success, with severe difficulties experienced in making changes later in the project cycle. The socio-economic feasibility study can provide the first critical entry point for gender issues in the project cycle. To ensure they include gender, many agencies have redefined their project formulation stage to include social studies.

At the project design stage it is the gender-specific potential inputs and outputs that the feasibility study needs to identify. Molner and Schreiber (1989) identify four specific issues: pre-project benefits likely to be forgone by women and their households (with special attention to households headed...
by women); work-load implications for women; probable gains for women; and differences and potential conflicts between probable gains and losses for women and those anticipated for men, households in general or for the community as a whole. CIDA (1986a) identifies the project feasibility study as a synthesis of separate studies that deal with four essential aspects of the project, which they identify as technical, managerial, socio-economic and financial. CIDA states that the feasibility study should identify the institutional and other changes needed to facilitate, increase, accelerate and retain the access and control over resources of the sector by women. Information on the degree to which women have control over resources can be used to assess the extent to which they are likely to retain control over benefits of the project. It also assists in identifying potential conflicts that may occur if project design challenges existing roles, benefiting women and disadvantaging men.

Like USAID, with its socio-economic studies, CIDA uses the Harvard case-study approach. However, it also stipulates that information should be obtained from local people (men and women) and local academics, leaders, women’s organizations and NGOs. Equal consultation with and participation of local women and men is essential, although often difficult to achieve in practice. Gender diagnosis also has important implications for project design. For instance, information on women’s reproductive role can be used to assess whether the project will have implications for their need to balance their triple role. Buvinic identifies a critical design fault in income-generating projects as the underestimation of the difficulty of stereotypical female tasks, and the overestimation of their transferability.

The typical project involves group activities through which women attempt to apply the skills they have learned for income generation... common wisdom judges that stereotypical Western female tasks are both simple and familiar to poor women in the Third World and are, therefore easily transferable. . . . In reality however, female appropriate tasks are not simple, nor are they as familiar to low-income women as they are assumed to be.

(Buvinic 1986: 656)

Since many issues relating to the feasibility studies are equally important at the appraisal stage, they are discussed below.

**Appraisal**

Project appraisal is intended to provide a comprehensive review of all aspects of the project and lays the foundation for implementing the project and evaluating it when completed (Baum 1982). Traditionally, appraisal covered
technical, institutional, economic and financial aspects of the project, with social and environmental appraisal being a more recent 'add-on'. From a gender perspective, this is a critical stage in the project cycle. For donors it is often the first stage when they formally participate in the project. Therefore, it may be the only opportunity to make any fundamental changes in the framework already developed.

Appraisal mission personnel: gender experts or gendered terms of reference

Donors have increasingly realized the need not only to ensure that all terms of reference for appraisal missions are gender-aware, but also to get gender specialists on the appraisal team. Does the team need a gender specialist if all members are gender-aware? This debate is similar to the mainstream—target debate outlined above. In addition, one specific problem that occurs is the assumption that women professionals will automatically monitor the gender aspects of a project. The greatest resistance to mainstreaming often comes from women professionals. They argue that it undervalues their professional expertise. By default, they become a 'women's' expert, as against a technical expert.

Both NORAD and SIDA, for example, identify as an important priority the appointment of a WID specialist on the appraisal team for both projects and country-sector mission reviews. The task of the specialist is to act as a catalyst. The resident in-country WID officer cannot be expected to take on this responsibility. Their status may not be high enough, and as part of the residential mission they are likely to experience problems integrating into a visiting team. However, specialists are considered to be a short-term strategy; in the longer term SIDA expect to mainstream the issue. A recent example of terms of reference for a SIDA appraisal mission – for continued support to the road sector in a developing country – required it to give attention to increasing the participation of both women and men in the sector support. To facilitate this it required a gender assessment of roles, responsibilities, access to resources, and the resulting needs and problems of both women and men.

Integration of gender into technical, financial and economic appraisal reports

Where gender is recognized at the appraisal stage, it usually consists of a statement about women, added to the social appraisal. This is the standard response to a checklist question about the way in which the project 'affects' women. However, it results in a twofold problem. Not only is the social
Operational procedures for implementation

appraisal rarely authentically gendered. In addition, none of the other 'technically' focused appraisals contains any social dimensions. Yet there are critical gender issues in all the different appraisals undertaken. Although many are sector-specific, analysis of the anticipated project impact in terms of women's triple role provides the basis for identifying effects on them at the local level.

Economic appraisal reports are considered the most important, with cost-benefit analysis utilized to identify alternative project designs, from which the one that contributes most to the development objectives is selected (Baum 1982). One important issue in cost-benefit analysis is the extent to which the invisible work women do in their reproductive and community managing work has an economic value. This has been a particular problem in recent structural adjustment policies where projects to shift production from non-tradable to tradable goods have failed to value women's time as peasant workers (Elson 1991). It is not simply that such interventions can harm women; gendered cost-benefit analysis shows that economic returns are not reduced in projects that specifically ensure benefits to women. In addition, the direct involvement of women can improve the probability of projects meeting their essential objectives. Despite such conclusions, the assumption still common among economists is that 'involving women as direct beneficiaries or participants and devoting special resources to achieve this is peripheral, if not detrimental, to the attainment of central project objectives, and/or requires additional inputs at the expense of overall project focus and project returns' (Molner and Schreiber 1989: 27).

Once those responsible for the technical appraisal recognize gender as a planning issue, specific components relating to project layout and design, location and scale and type of equipment can be identified. Among the most widely cited are: that project location can differentially affect the participation of men and women; that unless the project specifically itemizes women as beneficiaries, land for 'landless' and legalized plots for 'squatters' in both cases reaches men; and that unless the project consults women, prioritization in delivery of basic services is usually those that benefit men (Moser 1987a).

A particular training problem in the technical appraisal is the selection procedure for personnel. Generally this is based only on technical expertise and not on gender-awareness. When the project includes training components, women do not always get equal access to such training, nor do the location, hours and length of training help them to participate. Again it raises the problematic issue of mainstreaming or targeting. Molner and Schreiber argue that

Almost everywhere it will be necessary to educate male staff about women's roles in forestry. In some instances, this may actually be more
realistic and cost-effective in the short term than attempting a rapid increase in the deployment of female extension staff. Properly oriented and trained, male staff can effectively consider women's needs and contributions and reach women directly in field work.

(1989: 14)

Not all would agree, however, that the problem is simply one of lack of training, with gender-aware men then being able to solve generations-old problems.

Project ratification of negotiations

In his description of the project cycle, Baum (1982) identifies negotiation as the stage at which the donor and the borrower endeavour to agree on the measures necessary to ensure the success of the project. Such agreements are then converted into legal obligations, set out in the loan document.

This stage is often identified as one of formal ratification. However, the extent to which 'political space' exists for real negotiation around differences of opinion between either donor and recipient, or from different groups within the recipient country, will determine its importance in the project cycle. For some agencies it may be the stage for document ratification, such as CIDA's Project Approval Memorandum (PAM). For others, such as SIDA, there is a negotiation period between appraisal and agreement, which can be lengthy. This stage is then an important gender entry point for shifting the agenda. Since senior staff generally control this stage, the extent to which those negotiating represent women's interest depends on the gender-awareness of participants in the negotiation process.

Implementation

Implementation is the period of construction and subsequent operation of the project. Baum has argued that although supervision is the least glamorous part of the project work, it is the most important. For no matter how well a project has been identified, prepared and appraised, its development benefits can only be realized if it is properly executed (Baum 1982). Given the widespread failure of gender policy in the implementation phase, it is particularly important for gender planning. Several gender-related issues here require specific identification and close monitoring. Many are similar to those raised in earlier stages in the project cycle. At this stage it is important to ensure that gender objectives are carried out in practice. Those most affected, therefore, are the implementing agency and the target group itself.
Operational procedures for implementation

Implementation organizations and their personnel

So often when the project is one of infrastructure provision the implementing agency does not include social scientists among its personnel. Staff composition is critical not only in terms of sensitivity in understanding the project, but also because of its implications when the target group participates in the project. Too often professionals, both consultants and nationals, bring their own stereotypical assumptions about the role of local women in society.

CIDA (1986b) argues that an important issue concerns how managers or administrators are motivated, trained and/or persuaded to consider women’s contribution. This raises the issue whether it is better to use existing organizational structures or create new ones for the implementation stage. Widespread concern at the way highly over-bureaucratized male-dominated institutions fail to reach women has resulted in an increasing focus on local women’s and NGO groups at the grass-roots level. With women’s groups, the problem, however, is not so much the groups themselves, but their resources and staffing. The widespread use of women as volunteers not only means that ‘staff’ often have inadequate training. As Buvinic (1986) has argued, it leads to the perpetuation of women’s lower status among those implementing projects. Buvinic claims that the use of women volunteers is based on the ‘cultural prescription’ that work with low-income women should be done by women. She claims that the validity of this belief has gone largely untested in the Third World. Lack of expertise is often a hindrance to project success, while the cultural need to have women staff members interact with women beneficiaries will vary according to the poverty of the group and the task required. It is important, however, not to conflate the problems of untrained volunteers who are also women, with trained, paid women project staff.

Finally, it is important to recruit women professionals into management positions. However, this will help local women only if the former are gender aware. Where the project involves extension or community workers in implementation, the terms of reference must include women in this activity. However, ‘women’s components’, such as crèche facilities, or extra training may be necessary to ensure that women gain access to employment on equal terms with men.

The role of the target group in implementation

When implementation or maintenance involves the target population, women’s participation varies with project type. Projects with labour components increasingly use women to provide free or cheap labour. These projects can range from the provision of infrastructure and housing to those allocating
handouts such as food, or providing services such as health. Recognition of the triple role is obviously essential, if the participatory component is not simply to extend the working load of low-income women, who participate to get services. As discussed, community management does not mean that women participate in community-level political processes. The failure of implementation agencies to ensure that women participate in decision-making processes has resulted in the creation of separate women’s community-level organizations. These ensure that women can express their own choices and make their own decisions.

In its Plan of Operations, CIDA questions whether projects have the institutional capability to support and protect women’s interests and, if not, how this can be developed. It raises critical issues concerning an agency’s capacity to ensure that it effectively sustains those support structures, created to help women in potentially conflictive situations. Where the project is simply reinforcing gender roles this may not be problematic. However, where objectives have included strategic gender needs of women, or where women themselves have identified these during participation, the project often cannot sustain itself unless an adequate support structure exists. Finally, it is important to recognize that women in the target population are not a homogeneous group. For instance, as Buvinic (1986) has commented, women who are better off and do not need to work for a living self-select themselves for project participation. In contrast, those who head households, and who often are the poorest with the severest time constraints, exclude themselves from projects that require time for group discussion, participation and voluntary labour.

**Monitoring and evaluation**

Although monitoring is sometimes identified as a separate stage in the project cycle, increasingly it is identified as an ongoing activity accompanying the implementation process. Ideally, a project should establish an ongoing data-collection system for monitoring purposes. However, this is only realistic for large-scale or prototype projects, but is too ambitious for most projects. Here mid-project missions or on-ground monitors can provide essential feedback during project implementation at a reasonable cost (see CIDA 1986a). However, unless the project already has undertaken gender diagnosis and integrated gender, it is unlikely to include it at this stage. Yet monitoring of women’s participation can be ensured if all the data found during the project implementation is collected and analyzed on a gender-disaggregated basis. In addition, special studies and surveys may be required, for which adequate financial provision should be made. Molner and Schreiber (1989), for instance, identify the collection of data on women’s own perceptions of the
project’s impact; on conflicts between men and women’s interests in project outputs; on the extent and distribution of project ‘costs’ and project-induced ‘losses’ among various users and beneficiaries; and on the needs, demands and constraints of different users over time.

Evaluation is the final stage in the project cycle, providing an insight into factors that contribute to project success or failure. As with monitoring, it is essential to ensure that the indicators developed are adequate and relevant to the evaluation of gender. Another constraint may be the lack of adequate resources. CIDA, for example, only evaluates a few projects, because of resource constraints. It has recommended, therefore, that priority should be given to projects that address WID concerns.

The first important step is establishing the reasons for evaluation. Projects are evaluated against their original objectives, so, if these were not gender-aware, neither is the evaluation likely to be (Levy 1989). However, the evaluation of gender in the project can ensure that the second phase includes gender. SIDA tries to emphasize socio-economic aspects within evaluations.

To ensure objectivity and independence, evaluations are not generally undertaken by the operational agency but by outside consultants or separate departments set up for this purpose. This makes issues such as the terms of reference, and consultant selection procedures, discussed earlier, of particular importance. Again it is important that the evaluation team includes a gender specialist, an accepted professional, not the in-country WID officer. Another argument, made by CIDA, is the need to involve host nationals in the research process. Not only does this help the evaluation process, but it also ensures a transfer of research techniques and expertise to the recipient. Both with consultants and nationals it is preferable to have female interviewers interview females, while in certain countries it is imperative. Finally, to ensure that the findings and lessons learned about WID are highlighted, CIDA suggest that the evaluation report contains a separate chapter or section on WID.

**CHALLENGING AND CONFRONTING BLOCKAGES: THE POLITICAL AGENDA OF GENDER PLANNING**

The previous description of the range of analytical and planning tools developed by various agencies for use in the project cycle illustrates two important issues. First, there are very real differences between the tools and techniques developed to date. At one end of the spectrum are brief, generalized checklists, at the other end are complex, detailed procedures integrated into each stage of the cycle. Second, despite the gender approach adopted, there is a broad consensus concerning specific tools, such as gendered terms of reference, staff training and gendered selection procedures. Both these
issues have important implications. They illustrate exactly how complex, time-consuming and expensive it can be to gender the project cycle. Each stage requires detailed scrutiny to identify the techniques required, and continual monitoring of their effectiveness once introduced. This, if nothing else, serves to illustrate precisely how difficult it is to operationalize gender planning.

Has the extensive introduction of new procedures changed the situation? Lack of comparative data means it is not possible to assess the progress of different agencies about their planning tools. Nevertheless, it cannot be assumed, a priori, that the greater the sophistication of existing tools the more effectively gender is integrated into the planning cycle. Agencies are naturally reticent about evaluating their own experience, preferring to view whatever changes and shifts that have occurred in the most positive manner possible. However, there is a consensus that there is still a long, uphill struggle before changes in procedures have any substantial impact, both in terms of changing attitudes within their agencies, as well as in fundamentally improving the situation of women in developing countries.

A recent evaluation of UNIFEM's work mainstreaming gender documented the continuing indifference, ambivalence and active resistance that efforts to mainstream women into development policy and programming still encounter. It concluded that 'resistance, born out of prejudice or protective self-interest is a fundamental fact' (Anderson 1990: 44). Even those professionals sympathetic to WID can seriously underestimate the effort involved. The previous chapter cited the case of an NGO head who viewed the establishment of a WID Unit as a 'temporary phenomenon' for two or three years, based on the assumption that this was the necessary time to institutionalize WID. However, after more than five years this has still not been accomplished. The question can then be asked whether the 'lack of regularized systems and planning procedures' is the essential problem in operationalizing WID. Recognition of these problems in operationalizing gender has resulted in the development of several strategies to challenge the blockages in planning procedures.

Operationalizing gender planning: a case study from SIDA

This chapter has identified a number of important shifts. These have occurred not only in the focus but also in the level of intervention. This includes changes from women in development to gender and development, from project to programme and policy level, and above all from 'targeting' and 'integrating' to 'mainstreaming'. Mainstreaming as much as targeting or integrating will fail unless the planning methodology provides procedures to confront blockages. This requires the complex but necessary identification
of the fact that planning methodology is both technical and political in nature. This chapter concludes by describing briefly the planning procedures recently developed by SIDA. This donor agency is changing both its institutional and operational planning procedures, through the integration of the gender planning methodology outlined in Chapter 5.12

From their experience to date, some important conclusions can be made. First, like many donors, SIDA has recognized the importance of a combined strategy. Its gender policy approach is 'modified' efficiency combined with empowerment. The former is integrated into sector programmes through sector action plans, while the latter relates to specific actions for women through the direct support programme and other special funds for democracy, human rights, the environment and other specific areas such as population and culture.

Secondly, SIDA has recognized that their biggest constraint has been the lack of an adequate planning methodology. SIDA, therefore, has simplified and standardized the gender planning methodology to ensure its incorporation into all interventions. Highly complicated procedures, while impressive, are time-consuming and more open to misunderstanding, and on both counts are less likely to be carried out. SIDA, therefore, identify three simple procedures for all planned interventions: the integration of gender into mainstream programmes as opposed to separate projects/components; the identification of responsibilities and roles within SIDA; and the incorporation of gender planning methodology into all normal planning routines.

Thirdly, SIDA recognizes the impossibility of acting effectively on all fronts at the same time and, therefore, prioritizes within its gender strategy. Fourthly, it identifies the preparation stage as the most important stage in the planning cycle. It recognizes that the critical criteria for the selection of entry points through which gender is introduced are 'political', and related to the points in SIDA's planning cycle where there is greatest political space for negotiation. As a result, three stages of SIDA's programme cycle have been selected as entry points. These are identified as the Preparation of New Support, when the donor and recipient undertake detailed negotiation of future support; the Yearly Sector Review, undertaken in each recipient country; and the Evaluation, when it incorporates gender in the next planning cycle. These are only three of many stages in the programming cycle. However, they are identified as providing the greatest leverage for confronting contextually specific issues relating to women's strategic as much as practical needs.

To ensure that the political space is utilized to maximum advantage, three specific 'technical' planning tools – terms of reference, team composition and reporting back – are incorporated in all entry points. Finally, several tools to ensure the mainstreaming of gender are also identified. These include
personnel with catalytic roles at both headquarters and DCOs, and adequate funds and resource bases (discussed in detail in the previous chapter), as well as operational tools similar to those identified earlier in this chapter.

Along with most agencies involved in development work, SIDA identifies that an important constraint remains the lack of gender-awareness of colleagues, or the lack of capacity to translate awareness into practice. It has, therefore, placed special emphasis on the development of training. This includes gender specialists, as well as aid generalists within the agency. Chapter 8 examines the extent to which training provides the solution for both operationalizing and institutionalizing gender into planning.
Development in Practice

Development in Practice is a forum for NGOs, official aid agencies, practitioners, policy makers, and academics to exchange information and analysis concerning the social dimensions of development and emergency relief work. As a multi-disciplinary journal of policy and practice, Development in Practice reflects a wide range of institutional and cultural backgrounds and a variety of professional experience.

Editor: Deborah Eade (Oxfam UK and Ireland)
Assistant Editor: Caroline Knowles (Oxfam UK and Ireland)

Editorial Advisers
Haleh Afshar, University of York, UK; Mary B Anderson, The Collaborative for Development Action Inc., USA; Chaloka Beyani, University of Oxford, UK; Jan Burgess, Editor, Review of African Political Economy, UK; Urvashi Butalia, Kali for Women, India; Piers Campbell, MANNET, Switzerland; Stephen Conlin, Overseas Development Administration, UK; Marie Theresa Diokno, Philippine-China Resource Center, The Philippines; Carlos Dore-Cabral, The Johns Hopkins University, USA; Michael Edwards, The Save the Children Fund, UK; Dr Claudia Garcia Moreno, WHO, Switzerland; Eleanor Hill, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, UK; Patricia Howard-Borjas, FAO, Italy; Hazel Johnson, The Open University, UK; Itziar Lozano, Red Ente Mujeres, Mexico; Firoze Manji, Aga Khan Foundation, UK; Patrick Mulvany, Intermediate Technology Development Group, UK; Jabulani Manombe Ncube, Development Initiatives and Services, Zimbabwe; Jenny Pearce, University of Bradford, UK; Jethro Pettit, World Neighbors, USA; Renée Pittin, Institute of Social Studies, The Netherlands; Douglas Porter, Australian National University, Australia; Doreen Rowan-Campbell, Independent Development Consultant, Jamaica; Kishore Saint, Ubeshwar Vikas Mandal, India; José Antonio Sanahuja, Centro de Investigación para la Paz, Spain; Professor Johan Saravanamuttoo, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Malaysia; Irma Saucedo González, El Colegio de México, Mexico; Harsh Sethi, Sage Publications India, India; Professor Issa G Shilivi, University of Dar-es-Salaam, Tanzania; Julio Tan, Community Extension and Research for Development Inc., The Philippines; Melakou Tegegn, El Taller, Tunisia; David Turton, Editor, Disasters, UK; Fernand Vincent, RAfAD, Switzerland.

The views expressed in the journal are those of the individual authors, and not necessarily those of the publisher or the editorial advisers.

Guidelines for Contributors: a summary is printed on the inside back cover.

Advertising: please apply to the Publishing Executive at the address given below.

Subscriptions
Published in four issues (February, May, August, and November), with an index and translated abstracts at the end of each volume. Subscriptions are for whole volumes only. Please apply to Carfax Publishing Company, PO Box 25, Abingdon OX14 3UE, UK, or Carfax Publishing Company, 875–881 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge MA 02139, USA; fax: +1 617 354 6875; free phone 1 800 354 1420.

A subsidised rate is available for local organisations from countries listed in the current UN Human Development Report as 'developing countries'. Two levels of bulk rate are available for international agencies, networks, and membership organisations.

Subscription rates (post-free)
Institutions: £115.00 / US$173.00
Personal subscriptions: £46.00 / US$69.00
Bulk rate (5-19 copies): £57.50 / US$87.00
(20+ copies): £46.00 / US$69.00
Developing countries: £23.00 / US$34.00

Copyright: All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means without the written permission of the Publisher.

Photocopying: For users in North America, permission is granted by Oxfam (UK and Ireland) for libraries and others registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) to photocopy any article herein for a flat fee of US$8.50 per article. Payments should be sent direct to CCC, 21 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970, USA. The Item-fee Code from this publication indicates that authorisation to photocopy items is only for internal or personal use. Serial fee code: ISSN 0961–4524 US$8.50. In the UK, the Copyright Licensing Agency (CLA), 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE is mandated to grant permission to copy.


Printed and published by Oxfam (UK and Ireland), 274 Banbury Road, Oxford, OX2 7DZ, UK
Printed on environment-friendly paper 1724/PK/94
© Oxfam (UK and Ireland) 1995
ISSN 0961–4524
Targeting women or transforming institutions?
Policy lessons from NGO anti-poverty efforts
Naila Kabeer

While inequalities between men and women have long been recognised in formal development policies, poverty-alleviation schemes generally display a discrepancy between their declared commitment to equity for women and their actual achievements in incorporating the insights of gender analysis. This article explores the experience of NGOs which have successfully incorporated gender-awareness into the formulation of anti-poverty interventions. It shows that increasing poor women’s organisational experience is critical to ensuring that their needs and views inform the planning process. The article concludes that, unless women are empowered to move beyond the ‘project trap’, and to take part in formulating policy and allocating resources, they will continue to be a marginalised category in development.

The case for gender-awareness in anti-poverty programmes

The incorporation of a gender-based perspective into research on development issues has established the significance of gender as a central dimension of poverty. There is persuasive evidence to show that women are disproportionately represented among the poorer sections of the world’s population, and that households maintained by women tend on balance to be poorer than households whose primary breadwinner is male. There is also evidence which suggests that women are making up an increasing proportion of the poor, and this is leading to a ‘feminisation of poverty’. Thus a major report by IFAD on rural poverty (still accounting for the major share of the world’s poor) points out that

The total number of rural women living below the poverty line in developing countries was estimated in 1988 to be 564 million. This represented an increase of 47% above the numbers in 1965-70, as compared with 30% for rural men below the poverty line. (Jazairy et al. 1992, p. 273)

While the changing distribution of poverty is often an aspect of broader events and processes (natural disaster, wars, depletion of environmental resources, or unjust macro-economic policies), it is always mediated by the institutionalised structures of rules, norms, entitlements, and practices which shape individual access to resources within given societies. Gender-related dimensions of poverty arise from a combination of interlocking systems of disadvantage embedded in these various social institutions.
Targeting women or transforming institutions?

Disadvantage in the private and public domains

Research on intra-household relations has revealed the asymmetrical distribution of resources and responsibilities embedded in domestic norms, and pointed to its implications for men and women's access to broader market-based opportunities (Standing, 1991; Bruce and Dwyer, 1988; Palmer, 1977). Other research has explored the extent to which market-based institutions are themselves sites of gender-based discrimination, so that women tend to be less successful than men in translating their labour and education into command over income and purchasing power (Beneria and Roldan, 1987; Humphrey, 1987; Appleton et al. 1990; Amsden, 1980). Unfair advantages for men within domestic and market institutions interact with inequalities created by class relations, to ensure that women in poverty are generally among the most disenfranchised sections of society. At the same time, these institutions do not lend themselves easily to attempts to alter their internal dynamics in the interests of equalising the positions of women and men. Thus, whole households are frequently targeted as the front-line implementing agencies in a range of schemes that aim to increase productivity and reduce poverty. Most policy-makers are reluctant to be seen to be intervening directly in intra-household norms and relations: the 'private' domain. In as much as market-based institutions belong in the public domain, they may be seen as more acceptable sites for public intervention. But here again there is reluctance in many quarters to interfere with market forces, for fear of distorting price signals and the efficient allocation of resources.

It is therefore primarily through the efforts of the State, as well as formal and informal organisations within the community, that anti-poverty schemes are formulated and implemented. Within these, attention to women's needs has not always been a priority or even a consideration. Early efforts tended to be formulated for broad generic categories of people: the community, the poor, the landless. The possibility that women — and children — within these categories might not benefit equally with men from these efforts was rarely considered. However, with the advance of a Women in Development (WID) constituency within the development community, these neglected questions began to be explored. A two-fold case was made for the specific targeting of women: that women were among the poorest of the poor; and that resources in the hands of women were more likely to be shared fairly within the household than those in men's hands (Bruce and Dwyer, 1988; Palmer, 1977).

'Women's projects' and integrated projects

Initially this new awareness was translated into policy in the form of income-generating projects for women. However, a decade of experience has shown that women-specific projects will do little to challenge the marginal place assigned to women within development as long as the norms, practices, and procedures which guide the overall development effort remain fundamentally unchanged. Instead, women-only income-generating activities serve to perpetuate a form of segregation within development polices, with productivity-related efforts targeted at men, and welfare-related efforts targeted at women (Rogers 1980). The labelling of certain projects as 'women's projects' has also given women as a category an exaggerated visibility in the policy rhetoric, one that is not matched by the actual share of development budgets invested in such projects. The absence of the corresponding label of 'men's projects' disguises the fact that by far the largest proportion of development resources continues to be invested in schemes which directly benefit men. While women may (or may not) receive indirect benefits from such schemes, the fact remains that these schemes
are generally drawn up without any consideration of the existing gender-based division of tasks, activities, and rewards. The extent to which such schemes achieve their full productive potential and the extent to which their benefits are fairly distributed among household or community members are consequently a matter of assumption and speculation, not properly grounded analysis.

The success of policy efforts to address the problems of women in poverty is emphatically not about separate versus integrated interventions, since different circumstances warrant different approaches. Rather, a gender-aware approach to the design of anti-poverty programmes and projects requires that policy-makers are clear, consistent, and well-informed about the relevance of gender in specific contexts to their goals, objectives, and strategies. This will allow them to explore and select from a range of old and new options in their attempts to ensure equal opportunities in anti-poverty programmes, rather than engaging in futile debates over women-only versus integrated projects.

Some important progress in this field has been made by a number of non-governmental organisations (NGOs), sometimes working in partnership with local or national government. The innovative nature of these NGOs does not necessarily imply greater sensitivity to women's needs and potential from their inception. Rather it reflects their greater flexibility, compared with the more rule-bound culture of most bureaucracies, and consequently their greater ability to respond to the lessons of experience. It also reflects their routine face-to-face interactions with their grassroots constituencies, compared with the more remote, formalised modelling exercises undertaken in the upper echelons of bureaucratically-managed planning institutions. This closer contact with the everyday realities of poverty has allowed some NGOs to adopt a process-based approach to policy design, rather than the rigid 'blueprint' approach which characterises conventional planning. In the rest of this article, I want to draw on the experiences of a number of NGOs from the South Asian context, in order to identify some key pointers for ensuring greater gender-awareness in the formulation of anti-poverty interventions. Although these examples relate to one geographical area, I believe that the lessons they offer have a much broader application. In addition, while I am here focusing on the gender-related dimension of policy design, I believe that the discussion here can offer lessons for 'good practice' in policy efforts in addressing all forms of marginalisation.

Participation and needs-identification

Poverty-reduction programmes are generally seen in terms of meeting the basic needs of those who lack the resources to do so for themselves. They may be designed to meet such needs either directly, through the provision of basic goods and services, or indirectly by improving people's entitlements to basic resources. The first step in the design of poverty-alleviation programmes is thus establishing what constitutes 'basic needs' in a given context, and identifying priorities among them.

This is not a neutral process: which needs are recognised, whose priorities are adopted, and consequently whose participation can be relied upon further 'downstream' in the policy process are all critically dependent on how planners go about the business of needs-identification. Women's needs and priorities have suffered in many conventional poverty-alleviation efforts, because the preconceptions of those responsible for the design of programmes have often led them to impose their own definitions of what women need. Either women's needs are subsumed (and then forgotten) under the collective needs of the household, or, when they are addressed separately, they tend to be those associated with their roles as mothers, wives, and carers within the family. That women, like men, may value...
targeted interventions which increase their self-esteem, their control over their own labour, or their sense of being active rather than passive is seldom allowed to surface in poverty-reduction schemes.

What emerges from the experience of the more innovative NGOs is that, where a space is created for women’s own voices to be heard, a very different set of needs may emerge. This space can be created by encouraging women to participate in the process of identifying a community’s needs. It can also be created by operating with an open rather than closed agenda, so that organisational practice is constantly monitored and revised in the light of experience.

The case of Grameen Bank

An early example of a more participatory approach to needs identification comes from Grameen Bank (Huq and Sultan, 1991). This has its origins in an action-research project in the early 1970s which helped to counter many conventional preconceptions about the rural poor which were enshrined in the development literature in Bangladesh: that they were primarily waged labourers; that their poverty resulted from a shortage of waged employment; and that they were (implicitly) men. What the action research revealed instead was that the rural poor earned their livelihoods from a variety of self-employed activities, rather than relying primarily on waged labour; that they were women as well as men; and that their major constraint was perceived not as the lack of agricultural wage labour, but lack of access to mainstream financial organisations. Grameen was set up as a poverty-reduction programme to deliver credit to this excluded group. From a fairly early stage it focused most of its efforts on landless women, whom it found to be a better credit risk. Women, it also turned out, were more likely to use their credit to improve their family’s welfare, rather than their own. The Bank now enjoys higher repayment rates than most official credit schemes for poor people in the region.

A women’s sanitation project

In the case of the Grameen Bank, the primary need identified was an economic one, dealing with the inadequacy of financial entitlements. Encouraging women to take part in the process of needs identification may also help to identify hitherto hidden welfare needs of women. An example of this comes from SEWA (Self-Employed Women’s Association), a trade union initially started to organise self-employed women in urban Gujarat in India. Here, participatory action research carried out before SEWA’s entry into rural areas uncovered previously hidden health needs. Inadequate sanitation facilities meant that most of the poorer villagers had to use open spaces (Jumani, 1993). This posed particular problems for women who, in the interests of modesty, were forced to use the fields under cover of darkness, either early in the morning or late in the evening. Cases of rape were common in the spaces kept aside for toilet facilities, while long delays before relieving themselves caused bowel and bladder problems for women. Indeed, the low priority, the shame, and the embarrassment invested in women’s bodies in many societies have given rise to the wider problems described by Mary Kiseska (1989) as a ‘culture of silence’ concerning women’s sexual, reproductive, and general health questions.

A women’s housing project

From an urban context comes the example of SPARC (Bapat and Patel, 1992), which works with those sections of the urban poor who live in hovels on the pavements of Bombay. These are people for whom the ‘ordinary’ problems of poverty are exacerbated by the constant threat of demolition which they face from the municipal authorities. Through a series of public meetings held with the pavement dwellers in 1986-87, both women and men within the community recognised that shelter was one
of women's key concerns and responsibilities: it was women who made a pavement dwelling into a home; women who had to deal with demolitions, which normally occurred while the men were out at work; and women who expressed the need for secure shelter as a first priority, mainly for the sake of their children and grandchildren. SPARC's programmes of popular education based on housing are consequently conducted primarily with women pavement dwellers.

To sum up, participatory approaches to needs-identification should not be seen as a question of the 'right' methods and techniques alone, but also about the possibilities created for democratic participation in the process of needs-identification. No set of methods are in themselves sensitive to differences and inequalities between men and women; each method is only as good as its practitioner. It can be argued that the qualitative, dynamic, and interactive methodology advocated by Participatory Rural Appraisal makes it more likely to challenge gender-linked stereotyping about needs and opportunities (the men = production/women = welfare formula) and to uncover categories of needs which might remain submerged in more conventional approaches to policy design. At the same time, SPARC has used quantitative techniques to generate information about the needs of the 'invisibilised' poor, both to the public and to the authorities. At the start of its activities, it conducted a 'people's census' to enumerate pavement dwellers (a group routinely left out of conventional censuses), both as a strategy to mobilise the pavement dwellers, and as a way of mobilising public opinion against mass demolitions. The active creation of an information base to mobilise people was later adopted as a methodology by the National Slum Dwellers' Federation; collective enumeration also forms a key tool in SPARC's training methodology.

Participation and needs-satisfaction

Identifying needs is clearly only one aspect of the planning process. A major factor behind women's disenfranchisement from most conventional institutions of development is that, except where the resources in question correspond specifically to 'women's roles', these institutions, implicitly or explicitly, target men. Here the more innovative NGOs, by adapting their operating rules, practices, and procedures to take account, not just of women's needs, but also of the constraints which often prevent them from claiming their fair share of resources, have sought to compensate for the fact that many conventional programmes exclude women. These NGOs' own rules and procedures embody a very different set of assumptions about potential 'beneficiaries', recognising in particular that the unequal division of resources and responsibilities within the household is likely to constrain women's access to resources, services and opportunities distributed through conventional market or State channels. Thus, in addition to prioritising a more gender-aware set of 'primary' needs around which to organise development interventions, these NGOs have sought to respond to a 'secondary' set of needs which arise from the specific constraints that women face in taking advantage of development opportunities. A number of examples will make this clear.

Women's credit schemes

Returning to the question of credit, what has become abundantly clear is that formal financial institutions have failed to reach the poor, and particularly poor women. Even where such institutions have sought to implement special credit schemes for the poor — such as the Uganda Commercial Bank's Rural Farmers' Scheme and the Differential Rate of Interest Scheme in India, both implemented through
mainstream banking institutions — women’s participation has been poor. Research into these efforts has helped to identify the mismatch between the norms and procedures of banking and women’s needs and constraints. These constraints are:

- Lack of collateral to underwrite loans.
- Inflexible procedures, formidable paperwork, and literacy requirements. The study of the Uganda Bank scheme found that the number of visits required to get loans applications processed and money released was a major reason given by women farmers for not participating in the scheme.
- The small scope of most women’s enterprises, which means that they are considered less credit-worthy.
- The costs of transactions, such as the expense incurred in acquiring information about a group that is generally more isolated and less mobile, and the relatively high costs of administering small loans.
- The social distance between bank employees, mainly middle-class men, and poor women.
- Ambiguous goals for employees in commercially-run banking organisations, who are required to pursue conventional profit-oriented aims in the administration of most of the Bank’s loans, but to adopt a different attitude when dealing with the Bank’s poverty-alleviation projects. This is clearly a problem, when there are no internal incentives to reward achievements in lending to the poor.

Gender-sensitive responses to women’s credit needs have taken a number of different forms. Some, like Mahila Milan, the Federation of Women’s Collectives in Bombay (Patel and D’Cruz, 1993), operate their own crisis credit scheme, funded by the savings of low-income households. The Federation works closely with SPARC, which initially put aside an equivalent amount of capital to compensate for any losses. While the actual money raised is modest, it does satisfy urgent needs for cash among members. Others, like the Working Women’s Forum in Madras, India, have acted as financial intermediaries between women in the urban informal sector and the mainstream banking system. Still others, like Grameen and SEWA, operate as poverty-focused banks. What these initiatives have in common is that they have tried to overcome some of the gender-determined constraints that women, particularly poorer women, face in getting access to credit, by putting in place a number of innovative institutional practices. These include:

- **Compensating for the absence of material collateral through other mechanisms.** For example, the Uganda Bank adopted character-based lending. In the case of Grameen, reliance was on ‘social collateral’: the principle of groups of borrowers with joint liability for each other’s debts. Each member knows that, unless loans are repaid, the chances of other group members receiving loans in the future are jeopardised.

- **Guaranteeing physical access,** as for example by Grameen’s strategy of ‘barefoot banking’, through a dense network of branches and outreach by bank staff.

- **Simplified procedures and minimal form filling.** Grameen’s borrowers undergo a training workshop to learn to sign their names. SEWA’s members carry identity cards with their photographs. Mahila Milan overcomes the problems posed by the illiteracy of its members by oral and memory processes and the use of symbols. Women keep track of their accounts in plastic bags with different-coloured squares of paper, representing sums of different denominations.

- **Interest** is generally set at commercial rates; the emphasis is on *subsidising access rather than interest rates.*
Naila Kabeer

A women's health and vocational training scheme

A similar attempt to meet the needs of the poor, with a special emphasis on the needs of poor women, is to be found in Gono-shasthya Kendra (GSK, 1991), also in Bangladesh. In Bangladesh, as in much of the Third World, poor people cannot easily take advantage of official health services. This is due to the urban bias of such service-provision, its cost in terms of money and time, and a social distance between (generally male) professional providers and poor rural women. In the Bangladeshi context, it is compounded by cultural norms which dictate female seclusion and restrict women's physical mobility.

GSK seeks to service the community through a network of female paramedics, who have been given training in preventative and basic curative care. It relies on young women who have completed a minimum level of schooling, rather than asking for the formal qualifications necessary in conventional nursing. Through a system of monthly household visits, using bicycles to cover distances, GSK overcomes the problems of physical and social constraints on women's access to health care. While it runs a health-insurance scheme to recover some of its costs, contributions are fixed on a sliding scale to reflect household income. However, since the case of an attempted suicide by a young woman in the early years of its life, GSK has also attempted to improve the quality of women's lives, as well their health. It runs vocational training schemes for women, focusing on non-traditional skills (carpentry, metal work, fibre-glass fabrication, shoe-making, and the operation, repair, and management of irrigation-pumps). Such skills are not only likely to bring higher financial returns, but also help to challenge prevailing stereotypes about women's competencies and skills.

Providing resources is not enough

It is beyond the scope of this article to discuss in detail the full range of examples of institutional innovations undertaken by NGOs. However, this brief discussion suggests a key lesson for the design of gender-aware interventions for poverty-reduction. All institutions are made up of rules and norms, practices and procedures which determine which categories of people are likely to be included in — and excluded from — its various operations. Many of these norms and practices were developed at a time when the issue of equity for women and men was not on the agenda, and they now need to be re-thought. More recent analysis reveals that interventions are likely to by-pass women, unless they are designed to address the more complex set of constraints that differentiate women's access to resources and opportunities from men's: mere provision is not enough. Beyond basic needs, generally regarded as the main entry-point for poverty-oriented intervention, there is a further set of 'needs' (often less visible), stemming from gender-specific constraints which differentiate men's and women's terms of access to service provision. Unless institutions are organised to accommodate these secondary needs, they are unlikely to achieve equity for women and men in their outcomes. If the existing mainstream institutions cannot be transformed overnight to take account of the logic of women's lives, gender-aware poverty-reduction requires gender-aware poverty-reduction mechanisms that can help to bridge this gap.

Participation and strategic gender Interests

The emphasis so far has been on the participatory identification and design of projects that addressed perceived gender-specific needs, opportunities, and constraints. However, if poverty-reduction is to be combined with fair treatment for women,
we must address the underlying structural conditions which generate and sustain inequality and inequity. A study of the different strategies used by the more innovative NGOs provides insights into how the question of women's empowerment is conceptualised at the grassroots level. Most of the NGOs we have been discussing use women's basic needs as an entry point for their work within the community, rather than tackling structural inequalities head-on. The transformative potential of their efforts lies in how they attempt to meet these needs: the extent to which they result in building up the self-organisation and self-confidence of poor women sufficiently for them to participate further upstream in the policy-making process. The need for 'upstream' participation is essential, since this is where key decisions about the economy are taken and priorities for resource allocation are determined. Until this occurs, poor women will remain at the receiving end of development, however much they participate in the design, implementation, and evaluation of projects. Thus a more accountable development requires that women are actors in the making of decisions at the policy level. The empowerment of women clearly entails a more political agenda, in that it challenges the existing status quo within the community, and here we can identify a number of elements in NGO strategies which appear to have this transformative potential.

First of all, there is a stress on the provision of new economic resources, rather than resources which merely reinforce women's traditional roles within a given society. Such provision sends out an important signal about the productive potential of poor women, against the general tendency to regard the existing division of resources as culturally immutable. It suggests that poverty-reduction programmes could help to continue pushing back the boundaries of what is considered possible or permissible for women to do in a given society.

Secondly, there is an emphasis on building new forms of collective relationships. A considerable body of research has found that, where women are members of associations beyond the household, and where these associations are based on solidarity and mutual self-help, they are likely to exercise greater bargaining power within the household as well as to participate more actively in community life. This provides some of the rationale for the stress which many NGOs place on building new collective relationships among poor women, and between poor women and men. It is worth noting that, with this broader perspective, the issue of whether the process begins with the building of women-only groups or integrated groups becomes irrelevant. The question is to what extent these groups are seen as isolated from the rest of the community, and to what extent they are seen as part of building up the broader organisations of the poor.

However, unless such relationships are mobilised to develop organisational power, their transformative potential is unlikely to be fully realised. Consequently, a third common element is the emphasis on collective action around self-defined priorities. The evaluation literature about these NGOs points to a variety of actions, initiated by both women-only groups and by women in alliance with men. Actions range from protests against dowry customs, wife-beating, male alcoholism, and cheating by public works officials to challenging local power structures, or taking part in local elections and community action. Such collective action breaks down past isolation, and helps to link women and other hitherto marginalised groups to broader political currents of their societies. And this is critical. Unless women are empowered to move beyond the project-trap and to take part in the making of policy where the key decisions about resource allocations are taken, they will always be a residual category in development.
Notes

1 This is an expanded version of a paper prepared for the Conference on Social Development and Poverty, Oaxaca, Mexico, September 1993.

2 The focus on the politics of needs interpretation in this paper draws on ideas put forward in Fraser (1989).

References


The author

Naila Kabeer has worked in Bangladesh, India, and Vietnam, and has been a Fellow of the Institute of Development Studies at the University of Sussex since 1985. She has been involved in directing and teaching on the MA course in Gender and Development and on the ‘Women, Men and Development’ course. She is an economist, with a special interest in household economics, poverty, gender, and human-resource issues. Her book Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought was published in 1994 by Verso Press. Her address for correspondence is c/o Institute of Development Studies, at the University of Sussex, Brighton BN1 9RE, UK.
Rescuing Gender From the Poverty Trap

CECILE JACKSON*
University of East Anglia, Norwich, U.K.

Summary. — The New Poverty Agenda is seen as incorporating gender within a new broader concept of poverty (Lipton and Maxwell, 1992) capable of measuring, evaluating and redressing gender bias along with poverty-reduction policies based on labor-intensive growth, targeted social services and safety nets. Multilateral positions on gender and development (GAD) for their part also stress the poverty of women as a primary justification for development interventions designed to improve the position of women. It is argued here however, that the concept of poverty cannot serve as a proxy for the subordination of women, that antipoverty policies cannot be expected to improve necessarily the position of women and that there is no substitute for a gender analysis, which transcends class divisions and material definitions of deprivation. The instrumental interest in women as the means to achieve development objectives such as poverty reduction may ultimately undermine GAD. Gender appears to have collapsed into a poverty trap; this essay raises a call for help, or at least a discussion about the relative benefits of captivity vs. escape. Copyright © 1996 Elsevier Science Ltd

1. INTRODUCTION

A retrospective on the past 20 years, since gender became a widespread development concern, would have to acknowledge that gender has been assimilated into development thinking in what appears to be a comprehensive way. Bilateral and multilateral development agencies have gender policies, priorities and strategies, gender units, gender specialists, gender reporting criteria and monitoring. If gender and development (GAD) has moved from the fringe to the mainstream of development, this should be cause for celebration rather than the feeling of unease about what has been lost in translation. Gender has been assimilated into development thinking in a particular way (Jaquette, 1990) and the many strands of feminist thinking and varieties of gender analysis have not been equally absorbed by development agencies. Any evaluation of how far gender has become incorporated into development institutions needs to enquire not only about whether they have staff with gender responsibilities, how funds are allocated, whether policy documents exists; it also needs to examine the content of how development institutions understand gender issues. This paper is about one characteristic of this assimilation process — the perception of gender issues in development as a variant of poverty problems. Twenty years ago Huntington (1975) published a critique of Ester Boserup which expressed concern about the implications of abandoning the equality argument in favour of an efficiency justification, a concern which this paper argues was well founded. Section 2 suggests some common and problematic themes in how most development agencies understand gender questions, section 3 remarks on the main prescriptions of the New Poverty Agenda from a gender perspective as a prelude to section 4 which discusses the problems with poverty concepts and measurement based upon “outsider” definitions, and finally section 5 extends the critique to subjective definitions of poverty.

2. GENDER STANCES IN MULTILATERALS

(a) Instrumentalism

Moser (1993, pp. 66–69) describes what she calls an “anti-poverty approach to women” as a strand in WID which sees women’s poverty as the consequence of underdevelopment rather than of subordination, and she distinguishes this from the “efficiency” approach to women, although it seems they have shared assumptions about the causes of, and remedies for, gender disadvantage. The poverty/efficiency approach has remained dominant in multilaterals for some years now, hence the World Bank WID Division focus on “measures to include women in development

*1 I would like to thank Ruth Pearson for my title and shared ideas, and Anne Marie Goetz, Richard Palmer-Jones and Christine Okali for useful comments and support.
Final revision accepted: September 4, 1995.
that contribute to economic performance, poverty reduction, and other development objectives” (World Bank, 1989, p. iii) and statements such as “[i]nvesting in women can be a cost-effective route to economic efficiency” and “[e]xpanding women’s choices in economic activity . . . can increase output and efficiency by enabling women to find their true comparative advantage, much as international trade can promote efficient specialisation and economic expansion among nations” (World Bank, 1989, pp. iv-v).

“Investing in women is a major theme in the World Bank’s two pronged strategy for poverty reduction,” (World Bank, 1994, p. 8), i.e. to labor-intensive growth and improved social services, and, furthermore, the Bank justifies concern with women’s health on the grounds of the benefit to the family of healthy mothers and the cost effectiveness of women’s health interventions.

An instrumental approach is evident in major development agencies such as the World Bank where the justifications made for attention to gender are in terms of how this will facilitate other development objectives rather than being an end in itself. Gender issues have been taken on board insofar as they are consistent with other development concerns (including poverty) and insofar as women are seen to offer a means to these, other, ends. Gender concerns are, for the World Bank, justified with reference to economic growth and poverty reduction. Similarly, UNFPA justify gender in relation to population control and environmental agencies in terms of environmental management and conservation. Even women’s “empowerment” is instrumental — UNFPA expects empowered women to have smaller families. Thus women are now the means of controlling population, of achieving sustainable development, of poverty alleviation.

The concern with instrumentalism, however, could be said to be linked to a model of development policy, practice and outcomes which is linear, structuralist and oversimplified. There are at least two ways by which instrumentalist development policies and projects may be confounded. One is via unintended consequences which may not be related to any particular human agency, and the other is through the multitude of ways in which the instrument strikes back. Women as actors and agents have their own priorities and projects which they seek to further through participation in development activities or which emerge in the process of participation. Three examples illustrate this point. The British ODA funds a poverty-focused agricultural development project in the Chotanagpur Plateau region of India, the Rainfed Farming Project, which has formed vegetable gardening groups of tribal and low-caste women in Orissa who have, over a few years, spontaneously begun to collectively punish male domestic violence and which act against alcohol abuse by destroying the equipment of village distillers. Thus an agricultural project distributing improved vegetable seeds to poor women has been enrolled by them in their ‘project’ of collective action against domestic violence and alcohol-related poverty and abuse. The project model of poverty as caused by the deficiencies of agricultural technology was subverted to add social welfare issues to the portfolio of activities undertaken by the groups.

A second example shows women using the vehicle of development interventions, in this case an income-generating project, to capture state commitment and turn it to their own ends. A case study in northern Oman (Heath, 1995) demonstrates how, over a decade, rural Muslim women involved with in many respects a rather ineffective income-generating weaving project, shaped and used the project to improve their gender relations within and beyond the household. These strategies were not based on improved financial independence through weaving but included the establishment of relations of patronage with the state, then used to deflect control by household men and to legitimize new freedoms in behavior, the assertion by women of their creative identity as weavers, and their “invention of tradition” (weaving was not a women’s activity in the preproject situation) around weaving and the representation of themselves as sustaining the cultural traditions of the nation; the gendering of space in the weaving centers in ways which positively changed work legitimacy, veiling and seclusion practices.

A final example from the experiences of a non-government organization (NGO) worker in rural Mexico observing the interface between a group of women beekeepers, with an initial self-image of themselves as rustic housewives (“mujeres pata rajada” i.e. women with cracked soles) pursuing beekeeping as a hobby, and government implementors of a WID initiative constituting them as entrepreneurs within a project (Villarreal, 1992). In this encounter the government agency sought to label the beekeeping women as needy victims, in line with government discourses on incorporation of peasant women into society while local male opinion denied any threat to the gender order by asserting the marginality of the women and the subordination of the beekeeping group to the ejido. Meanwhile “many of the women beekeepers learned the language of ‘subordination’ in order to extract benefits from it, while at the same time to some degree subverting this very ideology” (Villarreal, 1992, p. 260).

Studies such as these suggest the need for caution in linking policies and outcomes directly. The problem with the poverty trap is less one of any inevitable negative outcomes for women and more a “political” one of the consequences for GAD of reliance on the poverty argument. The reasons for project “misbehavior” have been sought in the sociology of development organizations (Buvinic, 1986), institutional inertia,
the gendered character of organizations and the marginal commitment to GAD by donors and governments (Goetz, 1992; Staudt, 1987) but they also lie in the agency of women.

If women too are instrumental and the outcomes of actually existing development activities are a dynamic mixture of interlocking projects (Long and Long, 1992), then does instrumentalism as identified in feminist critiques matter? I think it does, because the “projects” of actors do not interlock or overlap without struggle, negotiation and compromise, a process in which participants and officials are seldom equal. Where the policy and project objectives differ from those of participants, outcomes are likely to be closer to those of the more powerful bargaining partner, and the opportunities for subversion are uncertain. Goetz (1994, p. 24) shows why instrumentalism matters in the context of credit programs (of the Grameen Bank and others) in Bangladesh which have been widely cited as examples of how to, synergistically, tackle gender and poverty issues simultaneously. In reporting evidence for the low level of loan control by women, she concludes that

Donor’s interest in seeing the development of financially self-sustaining rural development institutions has resulted in a preoccupation with cost recovery, to the degree that loan repayment rates have become the primary index of success, however much they obscure the important issue of the quality of loan use. . . . As poor women and convincingly demonstrate a high repayment capacity, donors previously recalcitrant on the gender issue have pushed for the inclusion of women in credit programmes, not insensible to the obvious efficiency gains to be made (Goetz, 1994, p. 30).

Thus although predominantly disbursed to women, loans arguably have limited benefits for women because they enter into gendered social relations in the household and women largely lose control of the loans. Goetz finds that “a significant proportion of women’s loans are directly invested by their male relatives and, with women borrowers bearing the liability for repayment, though not necessarily directly benefiting from loan use” (1994, p. 1). Here an instrumental poverty program offering capital to women has transformed many women into loan repayment officers, with uncertain long-term consequences for gender relations. Money proves an inadequate currency for changing gender relations.

Synergism is a related feature of development discourses, i.e. the assertion of a positive, mutually beneficial, relationship between gender equity and other development objectives, and if instrumentalism casts women as the means to other ends, synergism implies that the means/ends distinction is irrelevant. This has not however, gone unquestioned. The antipathy of gender interests with population policy has been analyzed by Hartmann (1987), for women’s reproductive goals and interests do not necessarily conform with those of family planners. Furthermore, although it has been widely argued that education of women is linked to declining fertility, and that thus the empowerment of women through education is consistent with population limitation policies, Jeffrey (1994) argues that this link may speak less of empowerment and more of the impact of the nuclear family ideology embodied in the content of much educational material. The clash between women’s interests and environmental conservation is another arena in which synergy is debated (Jackson, 1993; Green, 1994).

The entrapment of GAD by poverty reduction presents analogous problems for the view that it is the concentration of women among the poor and vulnerable (the “feminisation of poverty”) which justifies gender and development activity. Does this mean that where poverty is not feminized then there is no justification for GAD? Are there no gender issues among those who are not the deserving poor? Must all GAD activity be focused on poor women? Will poverty alleviation improve the position of women? These are some of the questions which deserve wider debate. Part of the struggle against the increasingly instrumental approach to GAD in development agencies requires a demonstration of how gender analysis, interests and issues are distinct from, and sometimes contradictory to, poverty and class.

The arguments which show how women’s subordination is not derived from poverty need to be excavated to demonstrate the (liberal) fallacy that poverty alleviation will lead to gender equity. Poverty and gender are not entirely separate social phenomena. Indeed, one of the main features of gender analysis is the insistence that gender identity patterns all social life and that therefore gender awareness is not about “adding women” but about rethinking development concepts and practices as a whole, through a gender lens. This insight is one of many which appears to have been lost in translation. Thus the unfortunate term “the feminization of poverty” has come to mean not (as gender analysis would suggest) that poverty is a gendered experience, but that the poor are mostly women.

(b) The feminization of poverty

The term “feminization of poverty” suggests that “[w]omen tend to be disproportionately represented among the poor . . . the poorer the family the more likely it is to be headed by a woman” (World Bank, 1989, p. iv). Gender and development is frequently justified in terms of the poverty of female-headed households, for example, the IFAD review of “The State of World Rural Poverty” in estimating the number of rural women below the poverty line in 114 countries make the calculation on the basis of the number of households headed by women, added to the
expected numbers of women in households classified as falling below the poverty line (Jazairy, Alamgir and Panuecio, 1992, p. 274), i.e. it is assumed that all women-headed households are poor. This is not the case. Much depends upon the reason for female headedness, those which are de facto household heads and receive remittances from migrant males may often be less poor than male-headed households (Kennedy and Peters, 1992), while widows, divorced and separated women are indeed often among the poorest of rural people with limited access to male income transfers and property rights. The study by Lloyd and Gage-Brandon (1993) of male- and female-headed households in Ghana is one example which shows that female headedness is not associated with low incomes, while even for India where female-headed households are more uniformly elderly widows, the link with poverty is not generally strong (Agarwal, 1986, p. 187).

It is said that between 1965–70 and 1988 there was an increase of 47% of women living below the poverty line compared to a 30% increase for men (Jazairy, Alamgir and Panuecio, 1992, p. 273). Methodological queries, however, cast doubt on these figures. In addition to variability of poverty in female-headed households, the definition of female headedness was debated, contested and redefined in the period in question. For the earlier dates (1965–70) women-headed households were generally defined in a de jure manner, while by 1988 gender scholarship in the 1970s and 1980s had been showing that numbers of women headed-households were underestimated because of the exclusion of de facto women-headed households. The changing definitions make comparisons over time invalid and what we now see is the belief that all female-headed households are poor combined with a now much more inclusive definition of female headship to suggest the feminization of poverty. Combining de facto and de jure female-headed households created problems, one of which was the invalidity of time-series comparisons such as those presented by IFAD, but also generated a category with little analytical use for poverty profiles as a result of high intra group variation (Ahmad and Chalk, 1994, p. 185). Spurious averages, from populations including both these types of household, will be very misleading.

Another methodological problem, (Moore, 1994, p. 9) is that the use of percentage of income spent on food as an indicator of poverty may well also lead to an overestimation of the percentage of female-headed households among the poor since women-headed households seem to spend more on food even at higher income levels. It is arguable that the poverty of de jure women-headed households has been obscured by the inclination in GAD discourses to “talk up” the numbers of women-headed households, and their poverty, to justify GAD in numerical terms.

One example of current poverty orthodoxy which displays some of the problems with assumptions about female-headed households is the World Bank country study on Uganda titled “Growing out of poverty” (1993b). This report insists that “poorer households tend to be larger, have older and less educated household heads, and are more likely to be headed by a woman” (1993, p. 5). This could be understood to mean that poorest households are more likely to be headed by a woman than a man which is quite incorrect as Table 1 shows. The table shows the very different meaning that poorest households are slightly more likely than other households to be headed by a woman.

The table also indicates other disjunctions between the classification by poverty and by gender of the household head; there are dramatic differences in per capita expenditure for categories of the poor, but virtually none for the gender of household head categories; the poor do indeed have larger households but the female-headed households are small and more similar to those of the nonpoor; the dependency ratios across groups of the poor increases but that of households headed by women and men is remarkably similar; the percentage of food in total expenditure across poverty groups but is remarkably high for female-headed households. This table seems to suggest that female-headed households cannot all be assumed to be poor and that, while distinct from male-headed households in literacy, age (possibly although no indication of significance is given) and some aspects of consumption, these are not simply poverty differentials but speak of another axis of differentiation.

The meaning of female headship is highly contingent and cannot be used as a proxy for material deprivation (see Moore, 1994, pp. 7–13, and Handa, 1994 for Jamaica). Apart from the important question of remittances and intrahousehold transfers which, as we discuss below, is a feature of women’s incomes, the meaning of female headship is strongly related to age and life cycle as well as cultural patterns such as the probability and acceptability of widow and divorcee remarriage and the levels of support from offspring and kin. Women-headed households are also seen as the victims of nucleation (Bruce, 1989) of extended families, divorce and fragmentation. The implication here is that women are better off in extended male-headed households. It is possible however, to see family fragmentation rather differently since women-initiated divorce, for example, is often an indicator of relatively strong breakdown positions. Increasing divorce rates in Zimbabwe, the rise of informal unions and the phenomena of single mothers are as much about the increasing viability of women as individuals as about their vulnerability and poverty (Jackson, 1994). Similarly the nucleation of households can be seen differently, as a process often stimulated by the increasing autonomy of younger women in extended households and their resistance to demands made on
them by parents-in-law.¹ It often seems to be the case that women face a tradeoff between material well-being, which may be greater in extended families, in conventional marriages, and under the wing of a male household head, and other aspects of well-being such as personal autonomy, independence and personhood.

The situation of female-headed households is extremely geographically variable and difficult to generalize about. There is little doubt that Indian widows for example are impoverished and vulnerable (Dreze, 1990) and insofar as they make up a major group of women-headed households in India there is possibly some validity in representing, and counting, such households as poor, but this is not a global truth. One implication of the focus on female-headed households is that it also rather implies that the feminization of poverty only exists where there are many female-headed households, which is not everywhere. A table such as that in the IFAD study (Jazairy, Alamgir and Panuccio, 1992, p. 279) which states that the percentages of households headed by women in Asia and sub-Saharan Africa are 9% and 31% respectively suggests, by the feminization of poverty logic, that Africa has the greater problem, a view which I think would be hard to defend.

Finally, a poverty focus directs attention to female-headed households. But the emphasis on poor female-headed households avoids the more important, and more difficult area of intrahousehold poverty. The unitary conception of the household goes unchallenged, just the gender of its head has changed.

The combination of an instrumental interest in women as the means to poverty reduction ends, and the feminization of poverty discourse has led to a damaging erosion of the differences between gender disadvantage and poverty. The next section briefly examines the prescriptions of New Poverty Agenda to suggest that they are unlikely to be gender neutral in their effects and may indeed exacerbate gender differentials.

3. POVERTY THROUGH A GENDER LENS

(a) The poverty consensus

The new Poverty Agenda of multilateral development agencies claims that the concept of poverty has “been broadened, beyond the notions of inadequate private income or consumption, toward a more comprehensive perspective: absence of “a secure and sustainable livelihood” . . . [which] allows us to measure and evaluate the level and vulnerability — and freedom from bias by gender and age — of individuals access to privately

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Average</th>
<th>All Uganda</th>
<th>Non-poor</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>Poorest</th>
<th>Female-headed</th>
<th>Male-headed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Real per capita household expenditure</td>
<td>7,512</td>
<td>11,810</td>
<td>3,485</td>
<td>1,845</td>
<td>7,491</td>
<td>7,517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household size</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dependency ratio (%)</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average age of household head</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female-headed households (%)</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household heads literate (%)</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage shares in total expenditure:

| Food                          | 67 | 66 | 67 | 58 | 70 | 66 |
| Drink and tobacco             | 5  | 6  | 5  | 3  | 2  | 6  |
| Clothes                      | 6  | 6  | 7  | 10 | 6  | 6  |
| Rent                         | 3  | 3  | 4  | 7  | 4  | 3  |
| Fuel                         | 2  | 2  | 2  | 3  | 2  | 2  |
| Transport                    | 0.3| 0.4 | 0.2 | 0.2 | 0.1 | 0.3|
| Health                       | 1  | 1  | 2  | 2  | 2  | 1  |
| Education                    | 1  | 1  | 1  | 2  | 1  | 1  |

Food expenditure, as share of total expenditure:

| Market purchases | 26 | 30 | 23 | 19 | 29 | 26 |
| Own production    | 40 | 36 | 44 | 39 | 41 | 40 |

*Calculated from data for Household Budget Survey 1989/90 conducted by the Statistics Department of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning consisting of a stratified sample of 4,500 household across Uganda, except for eight districts in the North and East which were not sampled due to insecurity. Expenditures were calculated adding the value of purchased goods and the estimated value (at market prices) of the goods consumed out of own production.

Source: Adapted from World Bank (1993a), p. 5.
and publicly provided goods and services and to common property (Lipton and Maxwell, 1992, p. 10, original emphasis).

This section queries whether the new poverty agenda can, or does in practice, deal with gender bias. Labor-intensive growth is the central prescription of the new consensus on poverty. Thus criticism is leveled by Lipton and Maxwell (1992) at the declining additional demand for labor in the high-yield varieties (HYVs) being developed currently (by comparison with the 1970s), for them saving labor is unemploying labor. But is it reasonable to criticize labor-saving technology in a static manner such as this? If labor-saving technologies are more profitable and are therefore more widely adopted they may increase the absolute levels of employment. For example, in the Rainfed Farming Project (eastern India) described above, the introduction of upland paddy varieties in villages of West Benegal, which tiller strongly and minimize weeding, has led to large areas of previously semi-cultivated upland being put under paddy. Here labor-saving paddy has been associated with increasing food production and rapidly rising upland land values (mostly owned by poor tribal and low-caste farmers) as well as rising agricultural wage rates in the context of expanding labor markets. Labor-conserving varieties are both popular with farming household women for reducing drudgery and with women wage workers for stimulating growth in labor markets.

It can also often be the case that increasing labor intensity in agriculture equals greater unpaid work for household women, and therefore a conflict of their interests with those of poor men and women in the labor force, which might gain from increased demand for wage labor. Much depends on the specific tasks in which labor is saved, the gender divisions of labor and the patterns of payment for tasks. Women are not a uniform group and the costs and benefits of labor-saving technologies are class-specific, but it is arguable that mechanization has frequently been beneficial to women in relieving drudgery and that labor-intensive agricultural growth is less clearly advantageous to rural women than men.

The New Poverty Agenda also emphasizes safety nets and targeted social welfare, although much of this discussion is about households rather than individuals. Targeting rather than universal benefits are seen as desirable because they allow resources to be concentrated on the needy (World Bank, 1993a, 1993b), but disadvantages include the high costs of administration for narrow targeting and most of the Bank’s Program of Targeted Interventions have been broadly targeted (1993b, p. 18). Means testing as a method of targeting is expensive and thus the profiling of poverty aims to identify the characteristics of the poor to serve as a proxy (Ahmad and Chalk, 1994, p. 182), and this is the context in which the household categorization by male/female headship has been used as a poverty marker.

Smart safety nets and self-targeted social welfare offer support at levels which are only attractive to the very poor, and the criteria for targeting is poverty, not gender. From a gender perspective one might wonder what poverty targeting will offer the high birth-order girl child in a landed rural household in northern India, which may not be very poor but in which such a child may be very much at risk? Even where the targeted individual is a poor woman her gendered identity patterns the extent to which she may benefit from safety nets and social services. Besley and Kanbur (1993, p. 79) point out that a critical assumption in self-targeting such as workfare is that the opportunity cost of time is lower for target groups, an assumption which may not hold where the targeted individual bears household commitments such as childrearing that prevent them from giving up labor time in return for very low wages. A further objection is where such work is highly energy intensive, as in construction projects, the health consequences for poorly nourished women may be serious. Kumar (1995) found that women’s BMI is negatively affected by participation in a food-for-work project in Ethiopia, unlike men’s, and she suggests that this is because women are less able to substitute food for work labor for other household labor.

It is assumed that poor men and women will be able to respond similarly to safety net provisions, while I argue below that the experience of poverty is profoundly different for men and women and that such an assumption may be misguided. Targets bear gender identities. Some may slip through the safety net where gender norms, of propriety and self-respect, for example, mediate responses to safety net provision. Thus in Bangladesh women have been unable to take up food-for-work opportunities because of disapproval by male kin and after the Bangladesh floods in 1988 women were very reluctant to leave their rooftops for the relief camps where purdah was difficult to maintain; “To be seen by strangers while washing, sleeping and especially eating (since a wife is defined as a provider, not a consumer, of food) caused them great shame” (Shaw, 1992, p. 212). Women refugees experience gendered problems of obtaining separate food rations if they are not attached to a male household and sexual harassment problems are widely documented for women in postdisaster situations. As Douglas (1992) has pointed out, needs and wants are culturally defined and express gender ideologies, thus women consistently do not reliably identify, report and seek attention for their own ill-health. Self-targeting depends upon socially legitimated and individually recognized “need” as the basis for participation. Where targeting refers to women, e.g., in education of girls, there is often an instrumental core (educated
women have smaller families), and in general targeting of social services and safety nets refers to the identification of the especially poor. A central flaw with the poverty agenda is that it conceives of poor women as just like poor men, except poorer.

The emphasis in the New Poverty Agenda is now on “secure and sustainable livelihoods” with less weight on income or consumption and more attention to the perceptions of poor people themselves. The livelihood concept, however, when stripped down for measurement, consists of familiar elements; poverty lines defining inadequate incomes, consumption, nutrition, health, life expectancy, assets and thus the following discussion is structured around some of these poverty indicators. Poverty is defined in a number of different ways, e.g., the World Bank defines poverty as “the inability to attain a minimal standard of living” (1990, p. 26), all of which, however, embody gender spin and distortion of various kinds, much of which relates to the use of the household as the unit of analysis. For example, the poverty-reduction strategy of the World Bank is based upon the preparation of Poverty Assessments derived from poverty lines, poverty profiles and poverty indicators (Askwith, 1994). Poverty lines identify the proportion of the population with incomes below a certain level considered necessary to meet minimum nutrition and survival needs and poverty indicators commonly include GDP per capita, mortality statistics, life expectancy and literacy statistics. The brief examination of poverty indicators below shows that poor women are disadvantaged by a different metric from poor men and that the populist alternative to poverty lines, the definition and assessment of poverty by the poor themselves, fails to transcend dominant gender ideologies which deny disadvantage.

4. POVERTY OBSERVED

(a) Food consumption

The poor are frequently defined as those who do not have enough to eat, and food bias against women is alleged. Are women especially poor because of food bias? The questions raised here are whether women are malnourished in relation to their specific needs and to men, and whether women are explicitly and consciously discriminated against in food consumption. Women are usually smaller than men, their physiology and metabolism differs from men’s, their work differs and their nutritional needs are different (Harriss, 1990; Kynch, 1994). Studies of intrahousehold food allocation are beset with methodological problems but the view that adult women are discriminated against in access to food is now seriously questioned (for example see Lipton and Payne, 1994; Gillespie and McNeill, 1992). A review of nutrition studies in sub-Saharan Africa found little evidence for food bias (Svedberg, 1990). In south Asia the evidence for gender bias in anthropometric status of adults is contradictory and geographically limited (Harriss, 1990) while increases in mortality during famines affect men more than women (Dreze and Sen, 1989, p. 55), despite the ways families appear to prioritize male interests during crises, because women seem better able to survive famine conditions. Kynch’s study of food and growth among the poor in Palanpur found that adult men were more wasted than adult women, and among adults the men who were thinnest in relation to their wives were concentrated in childbearing couples, they were “provisioning men whose authority depends upon the ability to supply the household with food” (Kynch, 1994, p. 49). A gender analysis of the implications of male roles in Palanpur reveals the costs of the provisioning expectations of men in particular age groups. The picture for children, however was the reverse and girls were much more likely to be wasted and stunted than boys.

The terms food access and food allocation imply a rather mechanistic process whereby rights to food become actual consumption. But consumption is not simply determined by availability; there may be under-consumption without overt and explicit food discrimination, and adequate consumption despite it. Needs are culturally constructed and partly understood in relation to beliefs about work (its intensity and its perceived value) and well-being. In addition, where food is limited, the needs of other household members influences, to a variable degree, the level of consumption of any individual. For example, women within Asian households are socialized into an ideal of self-sacrifice, which begins with food denial, and in Bengal women fast for the welfare of their husbands while men do not reciprocate. As Harriss observes “male fasts [are] for individual spiritual purposes and female fasts [are] for the auspiciousness of the household collective (i.e. for husband, son, brother)” (1990, pp. 359–60). Self-denial over food is not exclusive to women, Hampshire and Randall writing about Fulani pastoralists observe that “the concept of Pulaaku — what it is to be a Fulani — involves eating to meet minimal requirements rather than to fill oneself up” (1994, p. 8), but it is certainly commonly bound up with altruism and prioritizing the needs of others as a central element in many feminine identities. Thus food availability at the household level tells us little about the individual experience of food adequacy in either quantity or quality.

It seems paradoxical that at the same time as gender ideologies express gender bias in food access (e.g., in the commonly reported pattern of women eating last after the men and children) we find that in terms of outcomes, i.e. anthropometric measures of nutritional status and ability to survive famines, the evidence for discrimination against women is patchy and women
not infrequently fare better than men. Is this partly a consequence of too ready an acceptance (e.g., see the World Bank Uganda study 1993a, p. 10) by researchers of articulated nutritional norms as reflecting actual food access without any interrogation of how women’s agency subverts norms, e.g., by snack food consumption, by eating during food preparation and by consumption of “leftovers”? If poverty is understood as a minimum access to food, and it emerges that women do not generally suffer food bias then a logical conclusion is that women are not poor, do not suffer deprivation.

When the justification for gender in development rests on the poverty allegation, analyses such as these can seriously undermine the case, despite the fact that poverty here only refers to material deprivation. What can be lost from view is both the food deprivation of some categories of women (in India, the very young and old, and those in the north) and the myriad other forms of deprivation experienced by women. Kynch’s (1994, pp. 36–37) study of data on a northern Indian village studied in 1958, 1964, 1974 and 1984 found that for 0–5 year olds the known deaths of male individuals surveyed fell from 22% to 5% while that of females remained 17–19%, i.e. overall mortality rates declined but the gap between male and female mortality widened.

How too does a Poverty Assessment account for the nonsurviving girls and the costs of stunting? The situation of the girl child is particularly worrying for when son-preference damages the survival chances as substantially as occurs in northern India, mainly through unequal health care, what does it mean that surviving girls grow into adult women who do not suffer food bias?

(b) Life expectancy

Life expectancy is another poverty indicator used as a summary measure of lifetime welfare to compare changing levels of well-being within and between countries. Yet in many developing countries women, despite being socially and economically disadvantaged, live longer than men and, notwithstanding high levels of maternal mortality, adult mortality of men outstrips that of women in all income groups (World Bank, 1990, p. 78). What gender differences in life expectancy tell us is not that most men are discriminated against, but that men and women experience different age-specific mortality risks related to both different physiology and nutrition and different divisions of labor, broadly defined. Whether these risks reflect gender inequity depends on how they are generated. For example, not all male mortality risks are the same and the health hazards faced by the wasted male providers in Kynch’s study are very different from the health hazards of male overconsumption in the West.

Gender analysis suggests that the quantity of life is not a good measure of well-being. As a recent review has pointed out “Because women live longer than men, the common belief is that they are healthier. In reality women are more likely to experience ill-health.” Much of this ill-health is women specific; for example 35% of ill-health among women aged 15–44 years is accounted for by reproductive health problems, gender violence and rape (World Bank, 1994, p. 14). The evidence for gender violence against women spreads across all regions, classes, cultures and age groups and there are no grounds for believing that it is alleviated with increasing prosperity (Richters, 1994).

(c) Assets

Poverty is also defined commonly in terms of household assets and resource access, land and livestock, for example, but since patriline is extremely common, women have widely different property relations to men. Thus land ownership is seldom as defining of women’s socioeconomic position, as it may be of men’s. Patrilocal marriage also places a premium on mobile property for women, who may therefore have different strategies of asset accumulation to men; they may be excluded from land inheritance but accumulate gold. Possessions are often used to indicate poverty and prosperity as if they are gender neutral in their patterns of ownership but most possessions indices are not relevant to assessing poverty of women, for they are based on typically male-owned property. The problem goes beyond gender disaggregation of ownership of the same list of possessions, and requires reassessment of which indicators are used. It might be argued that men and women both benefit from “household” assets, despite male ownership, and that therefore they are valid indicators of poverty. A women married to a man with land, with a bicycle or with a radio is in some ways better off, but it is argued below that this may not be the case.

Approaches to poverty which emphasize the transfer of assets to the poor (land reforms, social forestry, livestock) generally fail to recognize the differing relationship of women to property. Household ownership of land is not necessarily an unambiguous asset for household women. Settlement schemes in which women’s labor becomes more deeply exploited abound, e.g., the Small Scale Commercial Farms and the Resettlement Areas of Zimbabwe where communal farmers and the landless have been given larger farms in which labor is scarce and women experience heavier work loads, and in which men recruit labor through extensive polygyny (Cheater, 1981; Jacobs, 1989). Furthermore, the disparity between the assets held by spouses may disadvantage women in bargaining by increasing the gap between the gains from cooperation (marriage) and the losses from break-
down. Moreover, in the event of breakdown, few conjugal contracts uphold the rights of of wives to a share of joint property (Goody, 1990). The endowing of men with land may adversely affect women’s bargaining position within households. This is another poverty indicator which potentially distorts the understanding of gendered deprivation by use of a male yardstick.

(d) Household income

Household income also tells us little about individual access to income and is therefore an unsatisfactory indicator of individual poverty (see Dwyer and Bruce, 1988); and “there appears to be sufficient intra-household inequality to throw out standard estimates of overall inequality by an order of 30%–40%” (Kanbur and Haddad, 1994, p. 445). Household income is composed of a number of different streams; men and women cooperate in joint production and they engage in separate income-earning activities, they consumer jointly and as individuals. The variations in men and women’s incomes stem from a number of sources; women have generally poorer wages and lower levels of employment than men, they have different kin and conjugal entitlements to transfers, and they have different levels and forms of income access and control and different sets of expenditure obligations and responsibilities. The distinctive features of women’s incomes affect, and limit, the degree to which household income can serve as an indicator of their well-being.

Despite the diversity and complexity of the work on incomes within households there is one point which has been made much of and that is the evidence that women spend more of their money on children and household needs than men. This is becoming a much-used argument justifying GAD on the grounds of child welfare. It may well be true that women prioritize children’s needs, but there is a sense in which one might wish women to be a little less selfless and self-sacrificing. It is the sense that women have to be the “deserving poor” to earn the attention of development agencies which disturbs. Some recent work (Hopkins, Levin and Haddad, 1994) has been investigating, and partly substantiating, the possibility that it is the particular characteristics of women’s incomes (their seasonality and their regular nature) rather than women’s altruism which explains gender differences in expenditure. One fears that if research shows that women’s income expenditure is not as child welfare oriented as currently seems to be the case, that the commitment to gender will wane. A real improvement in the position of women may indeed involve a shift to less altruism, but paradoxically this could undermine the support of development agencies for GAD.

How does rising household income affect women within it? Hadded and Kanbur’s work (on a data set from the Philippines) on the intrahousehold Kuznets curve (1990) suggests that as household income rises so too do levels of inequality (measured in this instance by calorie adequacy) among members, until relatively high incomes are reached. They conclude that it is not simply enough to increase the total resources of a household since, particularly for poor households, the accompanying increase in inequality may well undermine the beneficial effects on the poorest individuals of the total resource increase (Haddad and Kanbur, 1990, p. 25).

There seems to be a considerable body of evidence for the argument that gender relations are more equitable in poor Indian households. Poor Indian women engage in labor markets more than wealthier women, they contribute more significantly to total household income, they have greater control over incomes and are less subject to restrictions on their physical mobility than the nonpoor. Gender equity often appears to be inversely related to household income (Menscher, 1985; Agarwal, 1986), a situation with parallels in other Asian countries. Studies on women’s experience of the Green Revolution have also shown a pattern of withdrawal of women’s labor from farm work and increasing dependence of women on men as household incomes rise.

In reviewing village studies in India, Harris (1992, pp. 361–363) finds the greatest excess mortality of girls occurs among poor landless groups in some studies and among high-caste landed groups in others. Some of the most severe discrimination against the girl child in India is found in high-caste rural groups, characteristically also high income (Krishnaji, 1987; Heyer, 1992; Jeffrey, Jeffrey and Lyon, 1989). My research in Girdhat district (1993–94) of rural south Bihar also found dramatic differences in the survival of girls among different caste/income groups, higher caste farmers had very few surviving daughters whilst the juvenile sex ratios in low caste and tribal households of the same village were much more balanced. This village is in a rainfed area where there has been no Green Revolution and where there is virtually no irrigated agriculture. A useful study over some years of fertility and mortality in a village of Uttar Pradesh found that in recent years the mortality of female children of the poor has now begun to rise dramatically which has been related mainly to reduced employment for women as a result of crop changes (away from those demanding female labor) and mechanization displacing women, and to rising dowry (Wadley, 1993). What seems to have happened is that as households have become more prosperous, in a context of Green Revolution generated growth, women have been withdrawn (or displaced) from wage work in order to conform with the strong purdah norms, and
dowries have inflated to very high levels for the poor as well as the rich. Differential neglect and higher mortality of girls is thus related both directly and indirectly to the increasing dependence of women in upwardly mobile households where higher incomes bring with them deeper aversion to girl children.

This is not to suggest that women are better off poor, but that there can be something of a tradeoff between women's material well-being and their autonomy, a situation which poor men do not seem to face. This is one way of looking at the limited degree to which poverty and gender development can be approached synergistically with the same policy instruments. If rising household income has a pervasive effect on women's well-being then poverty-reduction policies, even if successful, may not increase women's well-being in the short run. There is great variation in degree and manner by which women gain from raising male incomes and poverty reduction, but it seems clear that women within households may not necessarily benefit from higher male incomes. Much depends on the transactions and transfers within the household.

The degree to which women benefit from higher personal incomes through, for example, income-generating projects, also depends on intrahousehold transactions and the degree to which women can retain control of additional incomes. Conversely, project failure to reduce poverty through income generation does not signify an absence of change in gender relations. Heath (1995) shows how money earned in an income-generating project may be largely irrelevant to changing gender relations which derive as much from the nonfinancial leverage gained by women from project participation. Money is neither necessary nor sufficient for transforming gender relations.

(e) Entitlements

Sen's idea of entitlements has been seen as an alternative approach to poverty lines, and these too vary for men and women in households. Kabeer has pointed out, for Bangladesh, that the entitlements of women are

embedded to a far greater degree than those of men within family and kinship structures. Even where women have independent entitlements, for instance through ownership of assets or sale of labor power, they may prefer to exercise them in ways which do not disrupt kinship-based entitlements, their primary source of survival and security (1989, p. 9).

Thus women (more than men) can be, and can become, poor through both the condition and deterioration of household entitlements and the character and deterioration of the intrahousehold social relations upon which they depend. Kabeer calls for the use of more qualitative poverty indicators which recognize how, for example, marriage mediates the experience of poverty for women. Sen's capabilities framework (1987) offers a more flexible approach to well-being since capabilities may be formulated which reflect specifically gendered disadvantage, and include, for example, freedom from violence. This however leaves the problem of the commensurability of men's and women's well-being and the invalidity of comparison.

The New Poverty Agenda claims to give more attention to the perceptions of poor people themselves, in line with participatory development approaches which acknowledge the rights, and value, of beneficiary involvement with development interventions. Do the perceptions and definitions of poverty elicited from the poor give more adequate representation to gender issues?

5. POVERTY EXPERIENCED

The turn to qualitative understandings of poverty has not generally been conducive to greater gender awareness and the approach which claims to be based on how the poor themselves define poverty (Chambers, 1988), is in ways even more gender-blind than the head count methods it criticises. Here "poor people" and "the poor" are treated as an homogeneous group such that it is possible to speak of the "knowledge of poor people" and the "priorities" of poor people. Chambers calls for poor people themselves to be consulted about their own criteria for well-being and the use of Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) has been promoted as the relevant mechanism. PRA is no longer the preserve of small NGOs and is now used in poverty assessments by the World Bank (as "Beneficiary Assessment") and by bilateral agencies (e.g., Overseas Development Administration, 1995). Do the tools of PRA such as wealth ranking, reveal critical gender variations in the experience of poverty?

(a) Wealth ranking

Wealth ranking has a number of problematic features; it produces a single hierarchy yet there are multiple orderings reflecting the different dimensions of well-being, and it is static unlike poverty into which people move and escape, precipitated by particular events or simply as a consequence of domestic development cycles. There are at least two gender problems here. First, ranking of the household obscures the situation of women within it. Scoones (1995) has shown how in rural Zimbabwe men and women defined well-being differently and therefore classified people differently (women gave a greater weighting, than men or the research team, to cash incomes, remittances,
women's incomes) and he acknowledges that “Wealth ranking . . . associates wealth with a household, usually through the name of the oldest male resident. Yet ‘wealth’ may be held and controlled by different individuals within the household” (Scoones, 1995, p. 85). A further objection arises around the gendered cultural internalization of well-being expectations.

(b) Gendered subjectivities

As Sen (1987) memorably reminds us, there are often large discrepancies between subjective perceptions of well-being and well-being as measured by “objective” indicators such as some of those discussed above. Chambers (1988, p. 23) illustrates this with reference to the studies of NS Jodha in Rajasthan in which he found that the group of households who had experienced a drop in income (1964–84) also expressed having experienced improvement in 37 of 38 aspects of well-being identified by themselves, over the same period. Clearly income is only one element of well-being, and it might be concluded that poverty lines underestimate well-being, but Sen insists that we do need measures of poverty as a counterpoint to perceptions which reflect the biases and prejudices inherent in all cultures. Populists such as Beck (1994) take issue with Sen’s critique of ‘mental-metricism,’ or subjective perceptions of poverty, on the grounds that it discredits the validity of what poor people say in general and he is at pains to defend the self-definitions of poverty by poor people and to assert solidarity and mutual support as features of poor communities. It is interesting that the example used by Sen to show the problem of mental-metricism is drawn from a 1944 study of the Bengal Famine of 1943 which reported that of widowers asked whether they were “ill” or in “indifferent” health: 48.5% of widowers said they were “ill” and 45.6% that they were in “indifferent” health, whilst 2.5% of widows asked the same question said they were “ill” and none said they were in “indifferent” health (Sen, 1987, p. 53). Beck’s “deconstruction” consists of the following:

one wonders why a male academic should have chosen poor female famine sufferers as an example of ‘mental-metricism.’ Does this choice reveal ‘mental-metricism on the part of Sen himself? . . . Could a comparative survey of the health of female and male academics who had just failed to get tenure, lost their house and car, and hadn't eaten for three days, be taken as an accurate reflection of their well-being or would we expect some ‘mental-metricism’ to creep in? (1994, p. 30).

Beck seems to have missed the point, the gender differences in perceptions of well-being, and rather become angry about what he thinks is a slur against the truth of the perceptions of the disadvantaged, but perhaps what needs deconstructing is not Sen’s “mental-metricism” but Beck’s populist outrage. In his study of villages in West Bengal, Beck does not confront the problem of his own representation of “poor peoples perceptions” despite the fact that his text repeatedly displays his own beliefs about the causes and nature of poverty (1994, pp. 173–177). This apart, however, if we accepted Beck’s version of poor peoples views of poverty at face value what would it tell us about gender? Women appear as respondents, but they do not speak of gender, and nor do men. Thus for example, Beck’s discussion of violence is entirely in class terms (1994, p. 168) and says nothing about domestic violence, while Kabeer (1994, pp. 149–150) cites a number of studies on the high levels of suicides, homicides, rape and prostitution among Bengali women, many of which implicated male kin, and domestic violence, which invariably did. This absence may therefore derive from the beliefs of the researchers, or may indeed be an absence in the views of “the poor” because domestic violence is embodied in *dōxa* (Bourdieu, 1977) or because it is not spoken of for other reasons. In reviewing people’s own concepts of poverty in India, Harris concludes

‘[t]hat people’s own criteria [of poverty] do not include longer life, less disease, more freedom for women makes one suspicious of what Sen (1985) calls “physical condition neglect” as well as outright gender bias in phenomenological enquiry (1992, p. 372). Anthropological work such as the Jeffrey, Jeffrey and Lyon (1989) study of child bearing in villages of Uttar Pradesh shows the (gendered) limits of subjective perceptions

[G]irls’ inferior chances of survival [are not] locally perceived. Yet they are manifest almost from birth in the maternity histories. For couples in Dhammagiri and Jhakri, however, it is primarily the unpredictability of sons’ deaths that enters their calculations about family size (Jeffrey et al., 1989, p. 195).

Researchers blinded by populist sympathy for the poor easily overlook gender relations of inequality. There seems to be a strong connection between the view of mutual solidarity among the poor and the absence of gender analysis in work which claims to report the perceptions of the poor. According to Beck “poverty involves much more than lack of food, shelter and being subject to illness; it also involves the experience of being subordinated and oppressed, and resisting this where possible” (1994, p. 180). Being subordinated is not only related to poverty, it is also a consequence of being a women, yet we are offered no discussion of resistance by poor women against poor men possibly because of the “virtuous peasant” problem (Bernstein, 1990) characteristic of populism. Self-respect is a major feature in Becks interviews and analysis yet he declines to comment on what this might mean for gender relations, specifically the ways in which poor women observe *purdah* norms as an avenue to self-respect and in which men’s respect depends in large part upon the behavior of their wives.
There are many gains from moral conformity and observation of the “patriarchal bargain” (Kandiyoti, 1988) but what are the intended and unintended consequences of such choices for women, in the short and long term, and therefore is it responsible to represent women’s articulated perceptions as necessarily complete truths?

Cultural, including gender, ideologies pattern the entire business of communication upon which PRA depends. What women can want, what is thinkable to desire, differs from what it is culturally thinkable for men to want; what women can say, what a muted “vocabulary” allows, also differs and finally, what women will say in the context of a public PRA exercise bears a gender imprint. For women who are excluded from dominant worldviews and male vocabularies (Ardener, 1975) it is not wise to assume that they can, or will, simply express their priorities as PRA assumes. This is not to suggest that women are social automats, clearly they actively subvert language and subordination, but only to point out that what all of us say is context-dependent, contingent and to varying degrees constrained by identities. Some of the gendered politics of communication affecting PRA in my experience includes the construction of local knowledge in exogamous and patrilocal communities as the preserve of “insiders” while women often appear as outsiders, and in local terminology even as “strangers” despite their length of marital residence. Women can also be especially sensitive to allegations of gossip, yet PRA invites and requires opinions and information to be expressed publicly about others.

Although a more theorized perspective is developing in PRA and related methods (e.g., Cornwall, Gujit and Welbourn, 1993) there remains a curious paradox in the recognition that communications between researchers and researched are interactive, profoundly shaped by context, intracommunity struggles, and the politics of (multiple) identities, and the simultaneous insistence that PRA tools are any more able than other methods to deal with these issues. Mosse, writing from experience of using PRA on a British ODA agricultural development project in western India states that “PRA, far from providing a neutral vehicle for local knowledge, actually creates a context in which the selective presentation of opinion is likely to be exaggerated, and where minority or deviant views are likely to be suppressed” (1993, p. 11) and in this way the public PRA exercise can offer an avenue for the generalization of personal, and gender specific, interests.

(c) Whose perceptions and representations?

How does one evaluate the claims of Participatory Rural Appraisal (Chambers, 1992; Mascarenhas et al., 1991 and many articles in RRA Notes) to give voice to the perceptions of local people by approaches which explicitly involve respondents as partners in research and which validate these perceptions and knowledges? Many of these approaches are based on group work, e.g., participatory mapping and modeling, diagramming, wealth ranking, transect walks and matrix ranking and it is suggested that women are involved in either mixed or single sex groups depending on the context. At a practical level a number of objections can be raised about many of these techniques which claim to be open to all but for which, as always, participation makes certain demands. One is time to participate in lengthy exercises such as modeling, another is the mobility needed to participate in for example, transect walks, when women are constrained by childcare.

Assuming the researcher to be aware of a diversity of opinion within any community, the question of whose voice is represented arises. For example, Cornwall, Gujit and Welbourn recognize that the “local community” consists of many different people with different power positions, different priorities and perceptions and they raise the question of which of these competing viewpoints are then privileged. For them “If truths are relative, choosing a version becomes more a matter of appropriateness or applicability” (1993, p. 28). Given that the choice of which truth to represent lies with the PRA researchers, who after all are in control of the external representation process, then how can it be claimed that PRA voices local perceptions?

PRA as practiced assumes local knowledge to be complete and impartial yet neither seem to be justified. The reliance on PRA and the popularity of the approach in which the poor define their condition can conceal some major issues of inequality. In this regard there is something to be said for the older approaches to research, both long-term research and the much-despised survey. Indeed it was analysis of the Indian census which revealed the sex ratio problem in India (Miller, 1981).

Gender interests cannot be entirely equated with the articulated views of women. Women can be implicated in female foeticide and infanticide, in food and health biases within households, in exploitative relations with other women (e.g., as mothers-in-law) and in dowry deaths (Jeffrey, Jeffrey and Lyon, 1989, pp. 30–31). Sen is justified in his concern about “metricism,” not because it devalues the perceptions of the poor but because there is a role for other forms of knowledge than the self-perceptions of the poor.

One problem with measuring men and women by the same poverty yardstick, be it food, income, entitlements, or local perceptions of deprivation, is that it both exaggerates women’s poverty in some directions and conceals it in others, for the causes and experience of poverty differs by gender. Another is that the
poverty argument is precarious, being exposed to deconstruction and dissolution in its own terms, of measured material deprivation as well as perceptions and representations of deprivation, and uncertain to deliver clear gains to women given the instrumentalism inherent in much of the commitment to GAD in development agencies.

6. CONCLUSIONS

This paper has tried to make the case that gender justice is not a poverty issue and cannot be approached with poverty reduction policies, and that the distinction between gender and poverty is important to assert in the face of the tendency in development organizations to collapse all forms of disadvantage into poverty. The influences which have resulted in gender issues being so closely identified with poverty are many. WID narratives were, in the 1970s, often constructed around women as victims of development, a trend which was sustained, despite protests from southern feminists, in much of the critique of structural adjustment. Gender discourses also had to survive within development bureaucracies, which were themselves dominated by men, where it was easier to ring-fence gender issues as a problem of poverty, and to argue for the feminization of poverty, than to admit a corrosive feminist view of gender disadvantage as crossing boundaries of class and ethnicity, denying the "otherness" of the poor and directing attention to the gendered character of development agencies themselves.

The debates about targeting vs mainstreaming also possibly reflect these struggles. Special projects for women were the object of extensive GAD critique, on mostly legitimate grounds (e.g. McCarthy, Clay and Schaffer, 1984 on Bangladesh) and the anti-targeting stance was avidly taken up by development agencies. Thus the World Bank WID Division states that "[w]omen are viewed too often as 'targets' or 'beneficiaries', and too rarely as effective 'agents' or 'contributors' (1989: 172) and advises that '[i]n general, do not design 'women only' problems" (1989, p. 172). One consequence, however, of mainstreaming gender into "every page of every project document" (as suggested by Chris Patten the Minister for Overseas Development in Britain in the 1980s) may have been to depoliticize gender analysis and to expose it to the prevailing gender ideologies of project management, of which the most one could expect was the view of women as a resource in meeting other development goals, a position not always consistent with gender interests. It is arguable that mainstreaming has become assimilation in that the possibilities of developing distinct and autonomous GAD discourses have been limited by the absence of women-only activities and institutional bases, and the reduction of gender perspectives to conform with dominant views of deprivation as cause by poverty.

Rescuing gender from the poverty trap involves poverty-independent gender analyses and policies which recognize that poverty policies are not necessarily appropriate to tackling gender issues because the subordination of women is not caused by poverty. Even if smart safety nets successfully target the materially deprived, nonpoor women are of interest to GAD for a number of reasons. Women who are not poor, of course, experience subordination of different kinds — domestic violence, personal insecurity, limited opportunities, oppressive gender ideologies, and mortality risks which make them an important category in their own right. But in addition, the position of nonpoor women is also relevant to poor women in both positive and negative ways. By changing societal perceptions of women’s roles and identities the achievements of nonpoor women can positively influence gender bargaining, ideologies and opportunities for poor women through changing societal perceptions of women’s options.

The roles, identities and behavior of nonpoor women also have negative influences on poor women. One significant example from India is the ways in which "sanskrization," i.e. the role of higher castes in setting the roles and ideal behavior which lower castes aspire to, carries with it particular gender ideologies centered on the dependency of women. Such characterizations of women as dependents, consumers and liabilities devalue and deny the real productive contributions of poor women in particular. They are fundamental to the dowry problem in India, i.e., to the spread of dowry across all castes and the associated evils of female infanticide and dowry deaths in which women are threatened, abused and killed in order to extract higher dowry payments from their parents, or in the case of a murder, to remarry for a second dowry. It could be argued that addressing dowry practices among middle income groups is one of the most important gender issues in India today. A poverty focus misses the range of interconnected gender issues across classes and socioeconomic strata and obscures both the problems of gender bias by women toward other women as well as the possibilities for solidarity across social boundaries.

NOTES

1. The conditions under which fragmentation occur are clearly significant, for example the breakup of households under conditions of persistent and acute scarcity are discussed in Harriss (1992).
2. The well-known critique of gender bias in census data needs no repetition.

3. This is the Sen (1987) in the reference list.

4. It is, incidentally, interesting that the term agent is used here to refer to women as positive channels for development rather than to the capabilities of women for action which is not necessarily conducive to development as specified by development agents. Women's agency is, for many gender analysts, about their capacity for disruption, subversion and challenge to structural constraints.

REFERENCES


Hopkins, J., C. Levin, and L. Haddad, "Women's income and
household expenditure patterns: Gender or flow?,” American Journal of Agricultural Economics, Vol. 76, (194), pp. 1219–1225.


Kumar, S., “Intrahousehold gender aspects of food and agricultural research,” Personal e-mail communication (July 7, 1995).


Sen, A., Commodities and Capabilities (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1987).

Shaw, R., “Nature, culture and disaster: Floods and gender in
GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT
A PRACTICAL GUIDE
EDITED BY LISE ØSTERGÅRD
GENDER – HEALTH – DEVELOPMENT

Development and health are intrinsically interrelated: without a certain level of economic and social development, we cannot provide the population with basic health care. And without a basic state of health, the population does not have the physical and mental energy necessary to develop the society. It is less widely recognized that in this chicken-and-egg dilemma a third issue is always present: gender. Can a nation give birth to healthy babies without healthy mothers? Will the sucklings survive without sufficient mothers’ milk? Will the family gain enough energy from its meagre resources if the food-providing female is not able to produce sufficient provisions and practise good nutrition? Will the growth in population stop exploding if females have no knowledge about and no access to family-planning measures? Gender, health and development make up a dynamic triad.

The concept of health covers a complex human condition. It cannot be approached from a medical perspective alone, nor can it be fully dealt with in society by the health sector alone. For the formal health sector tends to operate with a ‘medicalized’ concept of health, dealing with circumscribed diseases rather than with the human being in its environmental context. Thus it tends to deal in corrective measures. However, preventive health care is no less important. To succeed, preventive health measures must identify all kinds of pathogenic factors – biological, cultural, economic, social and political – and respond to them through an interdisciplinary and intersectoral approach that involves the total community. In this totality, gender plays a decisive role.
The concept of disease

The concept of disease is more easily defined than the concept of health, and yet the suffering of people does not always fit well into the medical nosology. To sharpen the understanding, we might distinguish between diseases, being the doctor's objective diagnosis of abnormal conditions, and illness, being the patient's subjective perception of suffering and being unwell. An imaginary disease may cause serious suffering and a serious disease may be unnoticed by the patient. More importantly, a serious condition like a low haemoglobin percentage, which in an affluent country is regarded as clearly abnormal, may be widespread in a population of malnourished, anaemic Third World women, who do not even regard their state of chronic fatigue as being abnormal. More often than not, the sufferings of women are not fully recognized nor correctly interpreted by medical professionals, who are mostly men.

As a consequence of the accelerated development of medical high technology, there is a strong tendency in industrialized as well as developing countries to define health needs within a narrow concept of distinct diseases to be prevented by immunization and cured by drugs or other treatment, rather than defining health needs in terms of those human activities and social structures which are actually carriers of good or bad health. Economic, social and cultural conditions, lifestyle and life stress are the major determinants of health. Yet most countries continuously pour out increasing resources for curative high technology, which usually benefits only an urban elite population. Long-term investments in public health – such as the provision of adequate food and safe water, the elimination of physically undermining workloads and the like – are regarded as being outside the health sector.

According to the 1978 WHO/UNICEF Alma Ata Declaration, health is more than the absence of disease or infirmity, it is a state of physical, mental and social well-being.1 There is a baseline below which no individuals in any country should find themselves, a level of health that will permit them to lead a socially and economically productive life. Given this, people will realize that ill health is not inevitable: that they themselves have the power to shape their lives and the lives of their families, free from the avoidable burden of disease. Unfortunately, this ideal condition is not equally obtainable for women and men, for the health risks of women are greater, not least during the reproductive years.
The concept of development

Health and development are closely interlinked in the Alma Ata philosophy of *Health for All by the Year 2000*. Health is an integral part of development because people are both the means and the ends of development. The human energy generated by improved health should be channelled into sustainable economic and social development; and economic and social development should in turn be harnessed to improve the health of people.

Measuring development in terms of access to basic services such as health care, food security, safe water and primary education is more informative than using purely economic yardsticks, such as per capita income. Social indicators like infant mortality and life expectancy reflect even more accurately the living conditions of most of the population, because of their broad distribution across households.

Kenya, for example, with a GNP of only $330 per capita, has lower infant mortality and a higher primary school enrolment rate than, say, the Ivory Coast with a GNP of $740 per capita.\(^2\)

The concept of gender

By considering gender with health and development, we recognize that health opportunities and health hazards are not the same for men and women. What is commonly accepted as the typical attributes of men and women differ among cultures, societies, classes and over time. In certain cultures, for instance, it has been part of the male image to be strong and capable of bearing pain without complaint, while in others it has been women who are expected to suffer pain in silence. We can imagine that such expectations will influence help-seeking behaviour in times of illness.

Health planners and practitioners, who are themselves often male and Western, may implicitly view the needs for health care and the effects of health projects from a male and Western perspective. They may thus fail to see that the health needs of Third World females and males, whether adults or children, can vary considerably because of gender differences. We still have too little insight into the full effects of gender issues on the status of health. Much research needs to be done. But a first step that can be taken now is the provision of health-related statistics analysed for gender differences. Armed with such data, development planners and practitioners would have far greater prospects of improving the health care of women.
RESOURCES AND HEALTH

Poverty

Poverty is the world’s most serious carrier of ill health. In parts of the world, debt crises have led to structural changes in the national economy, followed by savings on civil budgets and unjust policies of income distribution. Such policies tend to make the poor section of the population even poorer; and among these women are most adversely affected. In the Third World there seems to be a widening gap between the income-generating ability of women and that of men. Paradoxically, development has not helped to improve the status and health of poor women, but rather has had a negative effect. We are dealing with a complex of interacting dynamics, mutually reinforcing each other with an aggravating effect.

A band of vicious circles spins through peoples’ lives:

• Poverty
• Malnutrition
• Chronic diseases
• Increased reproductive strain
• Fatigue and apathy
• Lack of education
• Poor income-generating ability
• Leading to increased poverty.

The carriers of ill health may also be broken up into smaller circuits, as for instance:

• High reproductive activity
• Poor health
• High infant mortality
• Leading to increased pressure on reproduction.

Or:

• Low socio-economic status
• Low self-esteem
• Reluctance to seek health care
• Chronic diseases
• Still more apathy
• Leading to still lower self-esteem.

Reducing the effect of just one of the factors may ease the situation, but influencing several of the elements in these dynamic interplays at the
same time may break down the vicious circle. The health situation is definitely improved, for instance, by immunization against diseases, in turn improving energy and the capacity for work. But immunization programmes alone are 'vertical' by nature, because they only isolate a single factor of the complex nature of health.\textsuperscript{3}

The mutually reinforcing dynamism of comprehensive resource-development programmes is necessary in order to turn these increasingly negative, vicious circles into the positive spiral of socio-economic development, improving health and in turn liberating energies for further development. Family planning, for example, is more easily accepted when overall mortality is relatively low and levels of education relatively high. In turn, the spacing of births improves maternal and child health and further limits the degree of mortality. Similarly, clean water and sanitation produce more benefits when provided together with health education, which together with improved dietary habits reduces intestinal infections in children and thereby boosts nutritional status. Healthier children are more likely to attend school and to learn than the sick and malnourished, and in turn education enables people to understand health problems and to act towards their prevention. Basic health care is an essential key to open the door to sustainable development.

**Food security**

Food security has deteriorated in Africa south of the Sahara and severe food shortages are now widespread. Recurrent famines have illustrated the high degree of food insecurity in the region. Between 1965 and 1986 food consumption in sub-Saharan Africa averaged about 85 per cent of recommended requirements.\textsuperscript{4} With a highly uneven distribution, the consumption of hundreds of millions of people is far below that level. Within poor households, women and children are more susceptible to malnutrition and are therefore a specific high-risk group in relation to health.

Nutritional deficiencies are known to have strong interactions with diseases, as they lower the body's immune response. The infections tend to be more severe and the duration of illness longer, contributing to further deterioration of the person's nutritional status.

In many Third World countries, malnutrition is seasonal and increases before the harvest when food supplies have dwindled. The seasonal nature of agriculture brings special problems to women. In The Gambia it has been noted that pregnant women lose weight during the
peak agricultural season; in Thailand there is a marked increase in miscarriages as well as early termination of breastfeeding during rice planting and harvesting. The women do not have the time to prepare the necessary weaning foods and may only cook and eat once a day. Children are born low-weight for age and therefore are at high risk for morbidity and mortality.5

Even when sufficient supplies of food are available at the national level, there is no guarantee that they will reach those who need it at the household or individual level. Sometimes this results from inadequacies in infrastructure and transport, but more often it results from the fact that those who need it most do not have the means to buy it. Green revolutions have achieved self-sufficiency of food for countries but not for individuals and poor families. It is at the level of the individual and the household that the challenge to the achievement of sustainable food security must be met.

The most direct way to counteract malnutrition would simply be the encouragement of an expanded production of what the poor traditionally eat, such as millet, other coarse grains and root crops. These are cheap sources of calories and can be produced by small farmers, including female heads of households, directly serving the nutritional needs of the family. Today, however, concern is given more to market forces than to nutritional needs. High-technology monocultures are supported and low-technology subsistence farming or farm-household production is neglected at the cost of nutrition for numerous families.

A reorientation in international as well as in national planning towards emphasis on crops favoured by the poor and grown under conditions faced by the poor could improve the situation at very low cost. It is a drawback that nutrition policy and food policy are most often treated separately at a national level as well as in international organizations. Incorporating nutritional concerns explicitly into rural programmes would greatly increase the benefits of agricultural planning and could neutralize its possible negative effects.6

Water and sanitation

Unsafe water and poor sanitation are two other direct derivations of poverty. They are serious carriers of ill health and another area where gender issues are crucial. The provision of water for households is the duty of women in most of the world where water has to be carried. Women sometimes spend as much as six hours a day walking long distances and carrying heavy loads of water. This arduous task exploits
their energy and time; and since they are often nutritionally vulnerable, it further endangers their health. In fact, the carrying capacity of the women and girls in a family and the distance to the well are the decisive factors determining the actual supply of water. If the capacity is limited and if the quality of water is poor, the level of hygiene will be low and many waterborne diseases, infectious as well as parasitic, will occur. Their daily and direct contact with water makes women particularly susceptible to water-related diseases.7

Because of its association with women, the provision of water for household purposes is an undervalued issue and appropriate technology to alleviate this burdensome task is lacking. Although women are the providers and main users of water, they are seldom consulted when it comes to the initiation of water projects. Male engineers and administrators usually believe that women are incapable of managerial roles in relation to water and sanitation, in spite of the fact that they are traditionally the ones responsible for these resources in and around the home. Women have the incentive to make water programmes work, since they are the most affected by poor access to water. Wherever communities are involved in the design, construction, installation and maintenance of water supplies, water projects are more efficient, cost-effective and hence sustainable.8

WHO estimates that three out of four people in the developing countries do not have access to safe drinking water and only one out of four has access to sanitary facilities. WHO further estimates that 80 per cent of all diseases are related to unsatisfactory supplies of water and sanitation. Diarrhoea directly kills millions of children every year and contributes to malnutrition. Diarrhoea and poor nutrition form a vicious circle, since malnourished children are more seriously affected by diarrhoea, which in turn further deteriorates the nutritional condition.

Parasitic worms infect nearly one half of the entire population of the developing countries, often with very serious consequences. For example, 200 million people in 70 countries suffer the debilitating effects of schistosomiasis. Trachoma affects some 500 million people at any given time, often causing blindness. Each year malaria kills about three-quarters of a million children aged under one year in sub-Saharan Africa alone.9

It is imperative that development planners and practitioners repair their long neglect of household and family needs for water supplies. Far too often water schemes are macro-installations serving fields for export-cropping, while the micro-installations serving the nearby
villages are not implemented. Or when water schemes do supply villages, the necessary arrangements for maintenance are not made.

Workload and industrial injuries

Overwork adds to the health risks of poor Third World women. Time–budget studies have recorded the extremely long hours that women work, showing that 15 hours a day, seven days a week, all year round is not unusual for poor women in places as far apart as Burkina Faso and Northern India. Women produce as much as 60–80 per cent of subsistence food in Africa and more than half of the food in the least-developed countries all over the world. Yet rather than easing their task or boosting their productivity, the so-called development of agricultural methods has often increased the burden on women food producers through loss of land for export-cropping, leading to an increase in their traditional labour-intensive responsibilities. For example, the combined effects of this loss of land for export-cropping and population pressure have marginalized formerly productive small-scale farmers and made them dependent on an increasingly precarious access to cash income in order to buy food. This in turn has led to a massive rural exodus – predominantly a male migration to cities – which has left the women alone in rural areas, responsible for the survival of their families. In urban slums, without support from the family network, uneducated and unskilled women are employed as casual labourers, vendors or domestic servants on very low wages. Many are petty traders or turn to prostitution. The lack of day-care centres means that mothers are forced to leave their children in the care of older siblings or alone by themselves. The UN reports that about one-third of all households in the Third World are now headed by females. The normal work of poor Third World women exposes them to an enormous number of direct health risks. Studies in India show, for instance, that the amount of cancer-causing particles breathed in by women cooking over open, smoking stoves in ill-ventilated houses is equivalent to smoking twenty packets of cigarettes a day.

The increasing use of pesticides in agriculture is creating new health hazards for agricultural labour. While the chemicals are intended to be handled with extreme caution, precautionary measures are usually not adopted in many developing countries. The spraying of pesticides is carried out by untrained persons, most often women, with no safety devices. Accidents from the use of sub-standard agricultural machinery
mainly threshers – are also being increasingly reported. How is a poor, rural female-headed household to survive with a maimed mother?

To supplement their incomes, poor households engage in 'cottage-industry production'. Often this work is carried out in the home for extremely low piece rates. Some of this piece-work is a severe strain on the eyes, such as very fine embroidery. The rolling of indigenous cigarettes (bidis) are associated with tuberculosis and other respiratory tract infections because of poor domestic working conditions.

The electronics industry has perceived the economic advantage to be gained from combining high-technology with very labour-intensive component assembly. Female labour is preferred here because of women's 'nimble fingers' and great patience. But, as in the modern sector in general, women are perceived as marginal labour. Since the women have not yet been able to unionize, they are underpaid and exposed to health-destroying working conditions, performing repetitive low-skilled labour tasks in dusty, overheated quarters to extremely high production standards, working virtually round the clock during periods of peak production. Female labour is constantly supervised to the extent that extremely brief toilet visits are regulated and controlled; meal breaks are so short that it is virtually impossible to finish eating. Women are forced to make a choice between continuing to work and losing their health, or quitting and losing their livelihood.

**Education**

Education is intrinsic to development. In the widest sense, empowering people with basic cognitive skills is the surest way to render them healthy and self-reliant human beings. Research has also established that a mother's education enhances the probability of child survival. So, to raise health standards, we must also raise education levels.

In the less-developed countries there is a disparity between male and female literacy. Generally two out of every three illiterates are women. In some areas nine out of ten women are still illiterate. Furthermore, female illiteracy is three to four times higher in rural than in urban areas. The chance of little girls having seats in primary classes is very small; and when they get seats, they are not likely to keep them very long. Where admittance of girls to school is strictly limited, the drop-out rate of those who actually get started is proportionally high. For a vicious circle operates in regard to women; because of overwork, women seek the help of their daughters, which deprives the girls of schooling and
access to literacy, whereby they in turn are handicapped in relation to vocational training.

Under certain circumstances girls are not sent to school because their parents do not expect to benefit from it. Daughters are not expected to support themselves or their aged parents later in life and any benefit that does arise from education will be reaped by their marital households. Female illiteracy has been described by UNESCO as an endemic problem in three-quarters of the world.12

The gender gap in education comes at a high cost. Evidence shows that the mother’s education is the single most important determinant of a family’s health and nutrition. Further, even a few years of primary school have been shown to lower women’s wish to bear many children either directly by increasing awareness of contraception or indirectly because of increased access to their own economic resources.

Education is a catalyst operating behind all the carriers of ill health previously mentioned. Lack of education aggravates their effects, whereas sufficient education alleviates their most devastating consequences. Education is a means of overcoming poverty, increasing income, improving nutrition and health, reducing family size and, not least important, raising people’s self-confidence and enriching the quality of their lives. Educating girls is the best investment a country can make in future economic growth and welfare, because of women’s almost exclusive influence in the home on health, nutrition and fertility, and because of the formative influence of mothers on the next generation.

DIFFERENTIAL PRACTICES AND HEALTH

Son preference and daughter neglect

The preference of sons is based on purely economic grounds. The birth of a son signifies the continuation of the family, a source of income and marriage and financial security for the parents in their old age. But the birth of a girl is most often regarded as a financial burden, unless several sons have already been born. ‘To get a girl is like watering the neighbour’s tree, you have trouble and expenses in nurturing the plant, but the profit goes to somebody else.’13

Particularly where resources are scarce, the son preference in families necessarily leads to the neglect of daughters. In the most extreme cases it leads to the abandonment of the baby girl or even to
female infanticide. This low status produces a minimum investment in females from childhood and throughout life. The result is the low-health status of Third World women characterized by low-life expectancy, high rates of mortality and chronic low-grade morbidity.\textsuperscript{14} But, in areas where productivity is high and at times when there is high demand for female labour, discrimination against women is low. This mechanism acts even with children, to the effect that where women's expected employment is high, little girls receive a larger share of the family resources and are more likely to survive.\textsuperscript{15}

**Differential feeding**

The effect of son preference has a mental as well as a physical impact on discriminated daughters. It affects their self-esteem in an adverse way and socializes them into putting themselves last when the distribution of food and other household resources takes place.\textsuperscript{16} The discriminatory feeding of females starts right from early childhood. In many countries girls are weaned substantially earlier than boys and generally fed less well than boys, giving the girls significantly smaller chances of surviving and harming their developmental potential to a degree that may be dramatic when they themselves, perhaps as teenagers, are to give birth. In the general food-distribution system in families all over the world, males are given priority over females and elder family members over younger. Food is distributed in proportion to the prestige of the family member rather than in proportion to biological needs. If food distribution were based on an understanding of and concern for the biological needs of the family members, the priority would be different. The needs of small children, girls as well as boys, would be given precedence and young girls preparing for reproduction as well as pregnant and lactating mothers would be served well enough to let them carry out their reproductive functions with less waste of life than is now the case.

A study carried out in a group of villages in Bangladesh found that up to the age of five years, the calorie intake of girls was on average 16 per cent less than that of boys; the discrepancy was 11 per cent for the age group 5–14 years. As a result, 14 per cent of the female children in the survey were severely malnourished compared to 5 per cent of the male children and 26 per cent of the girls were severely stunted compared to 18 per cent of the boys. Women who are anxious for sons tend to stop breast-feeding the baby girl as soon as they become pregnant again. If, on the other hand, the first-born child is a son, they try to delay another
pregnancy as long as possible and breast-feed for an extended period to give the baby a sound start in life.\textsuperscript{17}

The sad results of these habits are documented by a number of objective observations. Studies from different parts of the world report gender differentials in nutritional status as indicated by anthropometric measurements. When social variables are compared, the most significant determinant of nutritional status is found to be sex.\textsuperscript{18} Significantly more girls than boys are malnourished and have been given less of the food resources available from a quantitative as well as from a qualitative measure.

In addition to these disadvantages, young women are in many places exposed to dietary taboos during pregnancy, with strong negative effects on their health and the health of the foetus. There are reductions in diet (particularly the exclusion of fish, eggs, meat and other high-protein nutrients), general reductions of food intake, or the exclusion of specific food items for fear of having an over-large foetus with an over-large head, causing difficult delivery. These practices and fears are decisive in countries where the malnourishment of mothers and the low birthweight of infants is common. Women's fear of having a large baby may most of all reflect the sad reality of poor care during childbirth.

**Differential health care**

The son-preference/daughter-neglect syndrome also shows up in poorer health care for girls during illness. In spite of the fact that there are more malnourished girls than boys, statistics show that more ill boys are brought to the health clinics while girls are kept at home. When health visits are paid to the villages, a substantially higher number of ill and malnourished girls are seen. The same picture is seen in relation to immunization if a small fee is charged. If immunizations are not given free, the proportion of girls brought to clinics is about one-quarter that of boys.\textsuperscript{19} Worst off are the late-born female children. A comparison of sex and birth order with medical expenditure shows a virtual absence of medical treatment for late-born females.

Generally speaking, girls are born with a biological advantage, which makes them more resistant to infection and malnutrition than boys. So, where treatment is even-handed, girls should be at less risk of dying in their first five years of life than boys. The odds are 1.15:1 in favour of girls. But in a number of countries and on every continent the biological advantage of girls has been cancelled out by their social disadvantage.\textsuperscript{20}

Such attitudes and habits, of course, have far-reaching health
implications and damage the health of females considerably. The ultimate consequence is an excess female mortality in childhood, which indicates that serious external influences act against the normal biological advantages of girls compared to boys. These adverse influences are partly the exposure to risk of health impairment, partly the ill effects of poor or lacking treatment. Excess female infant and child mortality should therefore be seen as a warning signal, indicating serious neglect of girls in the society concerned.

Unfortunately, it is very rare for gender differentiated health data to exist together with field studies on the prevalence of discrimination by sex. However, female child-mortality rates higher than those of males are reported in a number of studies.

It is important that planners of health care are aware of such hidden attitudes of daughter neglect and take measures for the prevention and abolition of these injurious practices. Prolonged action is necessary, for we are up against entrenched attitudes which are not easy or quick to change.

Nevertheless, various preventive measures are possible. A first step are relevant observations to identify whether the problem exists in a given country. This can be followed by information to parents and steps to have the girls included in the existing health services, whether preventive or curative. Information about alternative food provision and the special nutritional needs of pregnant women and lactating mothers is needed, along with training of parents in the treatment of malnourished children: for instance, those suffering from kwashiorkor. In some cases short-term special programmes to protect the neglected girls may be helpful, although this is not a permanent solution. The creation of an awareness among health and social workers of the risks run by female children in the societies where discrimination takes place is equally important.

REPRODUCTION AND HEALTH

High fertility and infertility

In developing countries, women's social situation is strongly determined by family structure and motherhood is given a high social value. Children are wealth: having children gives women status and respect, so women are proud of their child-bearing capacity. As women have authority within the sphere of the home, children increase the scope of their activity and power. Men take pride in fatherhood and
confirm their reputation for virility by having many children. So a wife who bears many children increases her own influence and prestige as well as the prestige of her husband.21

In addition to being valued for their own sake, children are valued for the help and care they can provide for the family. They begin to work at an early age inside as well as outside the household and when older they are the only form of old age security their parents have.

However, the culturally determined preference for many children also causes severe disadvantages for women by exposing them to social pressures to bear many children, especially those of the 'right' sex. In some countries, like India, where for cultural reasons parents may only depend on their sons, there is a strong preference for male children. Many women will continue trying to give birth to a son no matter how many daughters they have in the meantime. The need for one or two sons to survive into adulthood may force the woman to a high number of childbirths.

Yet high fertility goes hand-in-hand with high infant mortality, increasing the pressure on women to have more children. If the odds were greater that children would survive, few women would choose or need to become pregnant some fifteen times and give birth to eight or nine children when their lives are already strained by so many other burdens. The combination of higher income, better health, more education and a growing acceptance of family planning have begun to reduce birth rates in most middle-income countries.

The other side of this coin is infertility, which is a curse in the Third World; it deprives women of any social value. Women who cannot bear children are considered worthless; they have to face rejection from their husbands and family and may be exposed to divorce or desertion. In parts of the world this is also true for women who bear only daughters. The low status of women permits people to assume that it is always the woman who is infertile as well as responsible for the sex of the child.

Maternal mortality

Some 500,000 maternal deaths are estimated to occur each year; primarily in poor countries, among poor women and often in distant villages. For these reasons exact statistics are not available; the experience of experts is that maternal deaths are virtually always underreported. Data from Egypt, India, Indonesia, Malaysia and Turkey, gathered by a 1986 WHO report, showed that large proportions of maternal deaths took place either at home or on the way to the
hospital. These proportions ranged from 24 per cent of deaths in Turkey to 82 per cent in rural India. In Bangladesh, hospital staff were aware of only 4 per cent of the maternal deaths discovered by researchers.

The health risks for child-bearing women in the Third World are enormous. Local statistics show, for example, that each time women in rural Bangladesh become pregnant they face a risk of dying which is at least 55 times higher than that faced by women in Portugal and 400 times higher than the risk for women in Scandinavia. Because of the high birth rates in the developing countries, the lifetime risk of a woman dying in pregnancy or pregnancy-related illness is 1 in 25 or 1 in 40, which contrasts sharply with the 1 in 3,000 for women in the developed world. In addition to the hundreds of thousands of women who die in pregnancy and childbirth, millions more are permanently disabled and many of them are ostracized by their families and communities. Yet it is estimated that 63 per cent to 80 per cent of direct maternal deaths and 88 per cent to 98 per cent of all pregnancy-related deaths in the Third World could probably have been avoided with proper handling.

The causes of this high degree of morbidity and mortality are many and complex. One is too many childbirths – too early in life, or too late, or too close together. No less decisive are poor obstetric care, the fatal consequences of illegal abortions, the detrimental results of female circumcision and the generally poor physical condition of the undernourished and overworked mothers.

The safest period of a women’s life for childbearing is from age 20 to 30, yet between 10 per cent and 20 per cent of babies born in developing countries are to women in their teens who may be little more than children themselves. Because their bodies are not yet fully prepared for the demands of childbirth, teenagers stand an excess risk of death compared to women aged 20 to 24 years. In a study in Nigeria, for example, women aged 15 had a maternal mortality rate 7 times higher than women aged 20 to 24.

Teenage marriage is another reflection of the low status of women. Widespread in the developing world, it has the highest incidence in Bangladesh, where 72 per cent of women aged 15–19 are married. For south Asia as a whole, the percentage is 54 per cent, compared to 24 per cent for southeast Asia, 44 per cent for Africa and 16 per cent for Latin America. Teenage marriage is intimately tied up with the image of ideal womanhood and the need for men in male-dominated societies to control female sexuality. Furthermore, where daughters are considered a financial burden, who cannot earn for their own family nor look after
the parents in old age, there is every incentive to be free of that burden as quickly as possible.\textsuperscript{25}

Older women also face greater hazards from childbearing. Comparisons of six studies show that for women aged 35 to 39, the relative risk of dying from a given pregnancy varies from 1.85 to 5.61 compared to women aged 20 to 24.\textsuperscript{26} Other studies confirm the increased risk of death associated with having many children. In Jamaica, for example, it was found that women having their fifth through ninth birth were 43 per cent more likely to die than women having their second child. In Portugal, women having their fifth birth were three times as likely to die as women having their second, while women having their sixth or later birth were at even greater risk.\textsuperscript{27}

Maternal morbidity

Where socio-economic conditions are poor, women are most vulnerable to the health risks associated with bearing children in quick succession. Pregnancy and breastfeeding make big nutritional demands that women from poor homes are seldom able to meet, either by eating more or by getting more rest.\textsuperscript{28} Undernourished women are more likely to have spontaneous abortions, still births, or babies with low birth weights (below 2.5 kg) whose chances of survival are thereby reduced. For example, one study found that among Indian women in the low socio-economic groups subsisting on diets providing less than 1,850 kcal and 44 grams of protein daily, pregnancy wastage due to abortions and still births was around 30 per cent.\textsuperscript{29}

Most deliveries in developing countries continue to take place at home under unhygienic conditions, attended by relatives and/or traditional birth attendants (TBAs). Several governments have recognized the importance of raising the skills of TBAs and have launched training programmes with this in view. The role model for training TBAs is the Western midwife, and covers the entire span from antenatal to postnatal care including advice on breastfeeding, weaning and family planning.

In many cultures, however, birthing is considered an 'unclean' or polluting process; and in spite of her access to families at all social levels, the TBA has a low social status. In India, for example, she usually belongs to one of the lower castes; because of her social status she is not able to perform many of the tasks expected of her by the training programme, including that of being an agent for changing habits. It is therefore necessary that the trainers understand the setting in which the TBA is operating and then take steps to ensure that she has the
necessary status as a trained person within her setting, so that the community recognizes the value of both using her services and of broadening her role. This has been done successfully in some countries, including Botswana.30

Most important of all, however, is the provision of improved obstetric care. Networks must be established in the primary-health-care systems which can secure prenatal care and referral to health clinics and hospitals for delivery in case of perinatal complications.

Other factors

Other factors also contribute to maternal morbidity and mortality. Illegally induced abortion is a major killer of women and is responsible for up to 50 per cent of maternal deaths. However, reluctance or inability to get formal medical care results in selective underreporting of these abortion deaths.

Female circumcision, practised in parts of Africa, is another hazard to women's health. It can result in serious medical consequences such as infections of the vagina, urinary tract and pelvis, followed by infertility or problems in childbirth.31 Yet another health hazard is the increasing incidence of sexually transmitted diseases, which are not easy to detect in women and therefore not well treated. In addition to causing infertility, these diseases may cause continuous low-grade morbidity and fatigue in the woman and can infect the babies. The consequences of AIDS today cannot even be measured.

Family planning

In some parts of the world, women are deprived access to family-planning measures for religious or other ideological reasons and are at the mercy of backstreet abortionists. In other parts of the world, family planning is a euphemism for population control and people are persuaded or forced to submit to irreversible sterilization methods. Both these situations reflect a violation of essential human rights.

With the issue of birth control a very delicate balance must be found and preserved if the human rights of women are to be protected. It should be women's right to have free access to family planning so that they are in command of their own fertility. Moreover, they must be properly informed about the eventual side-effects of the contraceptives they may use. This is of paramount importance if the question is about female contraceptive surgery, where the impact on fertility is irreversible.
On the other hand, it should be an equally unquestioned right for women not to be viewed and dealt with by authorities – including donor agencies – as ‘objects whose fertility is to be controlled’. Women should be seen as individual human beings who love and enjoy their children if their living conditions are reasonably tolerable and who want to control their own fertility. I think we should be careful not to become too technical about this issue. Family planning must be a matter of female choice and women should actively participate in decisions about their own reproductive functions.

Because family-planning programmes have been highly controversial in parts of the world, the ethical questions they raise must be addressed by development planners and administrators. Family-planning programmes should never be executed in isolation, but always together with and preferably following after other health services, because we know that no female contraceptive is totally safe. Even a diaphragm is dangerous and may cause infections under poor sanitary conditions. Oral contraceptives should never be distributed without a general medical check and without proper instruction and control that the instruction has been fully understood. Intrauterine devices should never be applied without proper control afterwards for side-effects or complications.

In a number of countries contraceptives are distributed without such precautionary measures, often by poorly trained paramedical personnel. This is done with the justification that the high birth rates do not allow us to wait for an improvement in the health infrastructure. It is also claimed that the risk to health from an additional pregnancy is higher than that from the use of the contraceptives. But it is not acceptable that women should be forced to choose between two evils. High priority must be given to integrate family planning into a general health-care network and women must be properly informed about the various risks before they decide to adopt one of these methods.

Furthermore, research on contraception and family-planning campaigns are almost exclusively directed towards women and not towards men. It is as if men were non-existent and therefore non-responsible for human fertility. The responsibility of fatherhood should be upgraded to equal the responsibility of motherhood. Since no female contraceptive is totally safe and since the condom is the only safe contraceptive known until now, the practical strategy is to urge men to use condoms and to help make them available and cheap. Men should be persuaded to use condoms not only in extramarital relations to protect themselves, but also in matrimonial relations to protect their
wives against unwanted pregnancies which may eventually lead to dangerous abortions.

**Poverty and fertility**

Economists and demographers have argued that continuing or rising birth rates, combined with the higher population growth which follows falling crude death rates, will retard economic development and perpetuate poverty. Based on this, governments, sometimes urged by aid-agencies, have introduced isolated fertility-control programmes, particularly in rural areas. In some cases, fertility-control measures are imposed upon women, either directly or indirectly, in order for them to receive general health services or other privileges. Incentives and disincentives in the form of economic rewards or punishments are sometimes used to promote a particular method of contraception or a certain family size. Such schemes always work in the direction of forcing the most disadvantaged to comply with authorities without any real choice. Moreover, they do the health service serious harm by accepting the concept of conditionality.

Setting incentives for health and family-planning personnel, together with targets for the recruitment of family-planning acceptors, will inevitably influence the way personnel prioritize their tasks and can lead to the neglect of people's basic health needs. The Indian family-planning programme, for instance, is popularly known as the sterilization programme because the highest incentives — and thereby staff emphasis — are given for sterilizations.

In the vast body of literature on fertility there is strong evidence that isolated measures to control fertility have never led to a lasting reduction of birth rates. Human fertility is determined by far more complex clusters of social determinants, most of which are to be found outside the health sector. These include the assurance that our children will survive, the availability of some form of old age security and an improvement in living standards so that children's labour is no longer a necessity, and parents can afford to support them through their childhood and invest in their education with the perspective of giving them a better life.

It is not the high birth rates which create poverty but poverty itself, with the associated conditions of mortality and morbidity, which creates high fertility. In parts of India, such as Kerala, after social and economic changes had taken place the birth rate was much lower than for the rest of the country. Among those sections of the Indian population who
have some form of social security as well as aspirations for themselves and their children, for instance permanent employees of government and industry, family size is also shrinking.

In countries where government initiatives are taken to integrate family-planning programmes with maternal and child health care, for example Kenya, surveys indicate a notable increase in the use of both modern and traditional methods of family planning. In 1977–8, 7 per cent of married women in Kenya were using a contraceptive method compared to 17 per cent in 1984. That study found strong indicators of underlying demand and unmet need for both permanent and temporary methods of fertility regulation.34 With social and economic changes — such as increasing pressure on land, the tremendous burden of school fees, etc. — women realize that they have to adopt new strategies to survive and consequently want to limit their childbirths. However, those desires often meet resistance from their husbands; and the women frequently practise family planning without their partners' knowledge.

HEALTH SECTOR AND HEALTH NEEDS

Development of the health sector

Many developing countries were formerly part of colonial empires and attained political independence only in the second half of this century. The health-service systems they inherited had been set up mainly for the use of the colonial establishment (the administration, public services and the army) and consisted of a few hospitals in the Western medical tradition located in the urban areas where this section of the population was concentrated. The vast majority of the population, however, lived in the rural areas and was served mainly by traditional healers and practitioners of indigenous systems of medicine.

When the newly independent national governments were faced with the task of setting priorities and developing national plans, improved health status for the people was generally considered a desirable goal. This was to be brought about by expanding the health infrastructure, including training personnel in modern Western medicine. But because of the aspirations of the political elite and the medical profession, the lion’s share of the resources still went into the urban areas.

The initial expansion of the health sector into the rural areas in the early 1960s and 1970s was often financed by funds provided by aid agencies which were primarily interested in the promotion of family-planning programmes. They were therefore more concerned with family
limitation than with providing basic curative care or dealing with the underlying causes of illness.\textsuperscript{35} It was the limited success of these programmes which led to the incorporation of maternal and child health care, thereby addressing women's reproductive role more fully.

\textit{Primary health care}

Realizing the complexity of people's health needs and the limitations of a purely medical health sector, the concept of Primary Health Care was launched at the WHO-UNICEF International Conference in Alma Ata in 1978.\textsuperscript{36}

The Primary Health Care programme contains eight essential elements:

1. Education concerning the prevailing health problems and methods of preventing and controlling them
2. Promotion of food supply and proper nutrition
3. Adequate supply of safe water and basic sanitation
4. Maternal and child health, including family planning
5. Immunization against the major infectious diseases
6. Prevention and control of locally endemic diseases
7. Appropriate treatment of common diseases and injuries
8. Provision of essential drugs.

The Alma Ata declaration stresses the right and duty of people to participate individually and collectively in the planning and implementation of their health care. Primary Health Care necessarily implies a cooperation between traditional and modern medicine. Not enough is known, however, about people's beliefs and apprehension of health and illness. There are variations in the types of treatment sought - whether Western or traditional - for different illnesses and for different age groups and sexes. The formal health system needs to have a genuine interest in understanding peoples' beliefs if it is to earn their confidence and cooperation.

In the modern, formal health-care system, most health workers are women. However, they predominate in the low-status occupations while authority and decision-making rests with men. Because of women's crucial importance for health issues they must be included directly and with full responsibility in the planning and decision-making process as well as the process of implementation. Otherwise Primary Health Care will prove an insufficient means of achieving Health for All.
Women as users of health care

Because of the many health risks in the lives of poor women and because of women’s crucial role in relation to the health of their children, their access to primary health care should be as free and easy as possible. This is not only a question of the number of health centres available, but also a question of whether the health services are geared towards women’s needs and social norms. This is not always the case.

Many barriers exist to poor women’s access to health facilities. Long distances, poor communication facilities and the cost of transportation may all be prohibitive. In the rainy seasons, when morbidity is high, health facilities may be totally inaccessible to patients. The loss of a day’s wages or of a day’s work in the field and the absence of mother from unattended children and necessary household duties are other obstacles. Long waiting hours at the clinic aggravates these problems. During peak agricultural periods there is a fall in the use of services and ill children are more likely to be neglected. Given the fact that nutritional status is low before the harvest season, such a period of illness can prove to be a severe setback.

Shortages of drug supplies in many health facilities means that patients are given prescriptions and have to buy their medicines on the private market. Sometimes the price is totally beyond the reach of the patient; in other cases debts to moneylenders may be the longlasting consequence.

In some countries a lack of female staff at health clinics deters women from using them. Similarly, cultural traditions in some places require that women be escorted by a man when leaving their village. This means that another day’s work or wages may be lost, or that women must have the assent of a man before they can obtain health care. Sometimes women are treated with disrespect by the staff.

Younger women look to their elders for advice; if humiliating treatment by health staff is a common experience, women will not encourage each other to go for prenatal care, even if it is available. And when labour starts, a woman will turn most readily to the traditional midwife, whose face is familiar and comforting but who may use unhygienic methods that will pose a threat to her health.37

In order to include women fully as a target group in primary health care – in terms of their total scope of life and not only with regard to reproductive problems – health staff at all levels need to be sensitized to perceiving the role and status of women in any given area. Health programmes are too often conceived, implemented and evaluated by
specialists without directly involving the recipients of the system. Women are often the focal point and hinge, upon which success of the programme hangs, yet their insight is not used at all. They have been treated as passive recipients of a service system, which may not meet their most urgent needs and which may even be contrary to needs never made explicit.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

- The established system of health-care facilities should be decentralized in order to bring services to the people. In public budgets priority should be given to primary health care and essential drugs rather than to high-technology medical treatment.
- Preventive health care should be stressed through comprehensive measures affecting several factors simultaneously in order to break the vicious circle of carriers of ill health. For example, immunization programmes should be paired with health and nutritional education, among other things.
- Health-related statistics should be disaggregated by gender. Services can only be effective when they are based, first, on an accurate picture of health problems and needs of people, and second, on an appreciation of the complex social, cultural and economic factors that affect use of the health facilities.
- Nutrition policy and food policy should be dealt with together at national and international levels. Agricultural planning programmes should encourage the expansion of crops favoured by the poor and grown under the conditions they face.
- Water supply and sanitation programmes should involve women in their design and implementation, since the women have the greatest incentive to make these programmes succeed.
- Working conditions in urban and rural areas have an enormous impact on people’s health. More and better attention to worker health and safety will function in many areas as preventive health measures.
- The skills of traditional birth attendants should be raised through training programmes; at the same time efforts should be made to raise their status in the community, so their roles can be broadened and their knowledge shared more effectively.
- The syndrome of son preference/daughter neglect should be known by planners in the health sector. The high mortality rates of girls should be seen as a signal of marginal life conditions, where girls are not taken care of sufficiently.
• The notion that people are poor because they have many children should be questioned. Studies show that when the economic and social conditions improve, the birth rate decreases. Specific family-control programmes have not shown any continued effect.

• The concept of family control should be banished and the concept of family planning be substituted, with birth spacing, which is acceptable to women. In order to be effective, efforts to reduce birth rate should ally themselves with women’s wishes and not counter them.

• Family-planning services should be aimed at men as well as women. Condoms, the only safe contraceptive, should be cheap and widely available.

• Because no female contraceptive is totally safe, family-planning programmes should be executed where other health services are provided and women can be given proper information about the risks, instructions on the use of the various devices and follow-up control and treatment.

• It should be realized that the single most influential factor in birth rate is education. The more education provided for girls, the fewer children they tend to have.

• Because of women’s crucial importance for health issues, they should be included directly and with full responsibility in the planning, decision-making and implementation of health-care systems.

• Too often women are regarded as objects, not as active participants. Even though they may be illiterate, they should be recognized in their own right as potential carriers of a wisdom which the specialist needs — a vital, valid and down-to-earth knowledge of their own reality, deeply rooted in their own culture and in their own life experiences.

• In most developing countries, good baseline data are not available to health planners. Yet services can only be truly effective when they are based, first, on an accurate picture of the health problems and needs of people, and second, on an appreciation of the complex social, cultural and economic factors that affect the use of health facilities.

NOTES
1 WHO (1978).
3 Østergaard (1987).
5 McLean (1987).
6 Østergaard (1986).
7 Chauhan and Gopalakrishnan (1983).
9 UNICEF (1982).
10 Rogers (1980).
11 SNDT University (1983).
22 WHO (1986a).
23 WHO (1986a).
24 WHO (1986b).
26 WHO (1986b).
30 Andersen and Staugård (1986).
31 WHO (1986c).
32 Ratcliffe (1983); Warwick (1982).
33 Warwick (1982).
34 Warwick (1982); Silberschmidt (1986).
35 Silberschmidt (1986).
GENDER AND PRIMARY HEALTH CARE:
SOME FORWARD LOOKING STRATEGIES
WOMEN'S TIME AND THE USE OF HEALTH SERVICES

Joanne Leslie

A recent, detailed methodological review of time allocation research begins with the following key observation:

It can be argued that the fundamental scarce resource in the economy is the availability of human time, and that the allocation of time to various activities will ultimately determine the relative prices of goods and services, the growth path of real output, and the distribution of income. (Juster and Stafford 1991:471)

'Concerns that time constraints, in particular time constraints of women, may be limiting the capacity of households to respond optimally to market incentives are increasingly being raised in analyses of the problems being encountered by countries undergoing the process of structural adjustment' (Joekes 1991). There are at least two ways that the constraints on women's time may be important determinants of the ability of households to respond to economics recession and/or structural adjustment policies. First, a deteriorating household financial situation puts pressure on women to join or to increase their participation in the paid labour force, often by adding a first or second job in the informal sector, since job opportunities in the formal sector, particularly for women, tend to be limited. At the same time, however, increased prices for essential goods and services combined with cutbacks in government supported social services put increased pressure on women to provide time intensive food preparation, health care, and other informal social support services, not only within their immediate households, but also within their extended kin groups and communities (Leslie, Lycette and Buvinic 1988).

The dual pressure on women's time has a range of important economic implications, as well as implications for the quality of women's lives. The specific issue with which this article is concerned, however, is the possible effect of time constraints on women's capacity to use health services or to engage in other health related activities. In an earlier paper, in which some of these ideas were first raised, I attempted to estimate the time requirements of utilization of the four principal child survival technologies — growth monitoring, oral rehydration therapy, breastfeeding, and immunization — within the context of the overall demands on women's time for market and household work. The paper also discussed the extent to which time costs may be a deterrent to the use of child survival technologies (Leslie 1989).

This article builds on and goes beyond the earlier analysis in two ways. First, the empirical base is expanded both by including more recent studies, and by considering a broader range of health interventions than just the four survival technologies. Second, an attempt is made to disaggregate health services and practices along a number of dimensions, with the goal of identifying those health related activities that may be particularly vulnerable to non-utilization because of conflicting demands on women's time. Both aspects of the article benefit from a thoughtful paper by Jeannine Coreil (1991).

One of the premises of the earlier paper was that, to the extent that the child survival technologies are essentially preventive in nature (although oral rehydration therapy may not be viewed as preventive by users) they will be considered to be discretionary by women, and/or other members of the household and therefore women's time constraints may be more of a deterrent to their use than to the use of acute or case management services. It is clear, however, from an examination not only of the limited number of studies of patterns of use of the child survival technologies, but also studies of the use of maternal health services, and family planning services (all of which are primarily targeted to women) that other factors interact with time costs in important ways to modify this simple distinction between preventive and management health care.

One key factor seems to be degree of flexibility in when time costs are incurred. In settings as different as the United States and Ethiopia, for example, critics of government health services have drawn attention to the problem of inconvenient clinic hours. Ayalew (1985) found that a major reason for the lack of success of health services in Ethiopia was the failure to understand and accommodate to normal patterns of women’s time use in the community, and he recommended preparing a community time budget to help decide when and how services should be offered. In a similar vein, in proposing strategies to increase immunisation coverage in the US, Assistant Secretary of Health James O. Mason observed, 'Our clinics aren’t always open for the convenience of parents. We expect parents to adjust their schedules to fit ours — rather than the other way around. Immunization clinics should always be open on all workdays — during some non-working hours — and always during the hours that clinics are open' (The Nations Health, August 1991:9).
One of the simplest reforms that could be made to increase health service usage and decrease inconvenience to women is extending clinic hours and/or keeping clinics open at times that are particularly easy for women to be away from home or employment.

A series of studies of analysing factors that influence the use of child health services in Haiti has led Coreil to conclude that household composition and age of child both interact in significant ways with the effect of maternal time demands (Coreil 1991). For example, she finds that it is the combined effects of maternal time constraints and the absence of alternate caretakers that limits the use of child health services, particularly services that must be used outside the home, such as immunization. In addition, she finds that the effects of maternal time constraints on use of child health services are stronger for infants than for older children, and in households with more children, which she attributes to the greater necessity of infants being accompanied to health clinics by their mothers, and the difficulty of doing this with other children to care for at the same time.

The cultural acceptability and/or quality of care of services may also interact in important ways with how willing women are to incur time costs. A review of research on utilization of formal (e.g. non-traditional) maternal nutrition and health care services in developing countries provides a number of examples of this (Leslie and Rao Gupta 1989). Because antenatal care is essentially a preventive service, whereas childbirth care is essentially an acute or management service, one might expect higher rates of utilization of formal childbirth services. However, just the opposite has been found. In countries where data on coverage of both antenatal and childbirth care are available, the percentage of women receiving antenatal care is almost invariably higher than the percentage of women attended by trained personnel during childbirth. The reasons for this appear to be twofold. First, where trained personnel are not available nearby or cannot go to a woman's home, the barriers presented by distance and lack of transportation are greater once labour has begun than they are earlier in the pregnancy (although they are also significant barriers to use of antenatal care). In addition, however, studies from a range of countries have found that a major barrier to use of formal childbirth services is the perception by women that clinics or hospitals will be unable to meet their needs for privacy, emotional support, and fulfillment of rituals to protect their own or their infant's health (see Finermon 1984, and other studies called in Leslie and Rao Gupta 1989).

From the perspective of the user, the difficulty with services that are provided away from home appears to be associated with not only their greater time costs but also the greater public exposure entailed by their use. This point is made both by Coreil (1991) in her analysis of determinants of use of child health services in Haiti, where she cites criticism about children's shabby appearance by health personnel as a source of acute embarrassment to mothers, and also by Bruce (1987) in her excellent critique of contraceptive technologies and family planning services from a feminist perspective. Bruce observes '... to the degree that obtaining a method entails a public visit to a contraceptive service, intimate discussions, and physical contact with non-family members, modern contraceptive technologies can threaten women in a way that traditional child spacing techniques do not. Extended breastfeeding, post-partum abstinence, withdrawal, diverse natural family planning systems are very private. The lack of curtains in an examining room, the unexplained and unnecessary presence of more than the examining physician or paramedic, and the lack of a separate interviewing room for taking reproductive histories are resented by women and may lead them to avoid services altogether.' (Bruce 1987:368).

My earlier paper on women's time and child survival technologies called attention to the surprising lack of research on the possible effect of women's time constraints on decisions relating to breastfeeding. One notable recent addition to this very limited literature, although focusing on an industrialized rather than on a developing country, is a study of a group of Canadian women's experience of breastfeeding [Maclean 1988]. While the study explores many aspects of women's experience of breastfeeding (both positive and negative), it reaches the following conclusion concerning the time demands of breastfeeding:

The first few months post-partum are very demanding on a woman's time. The mother is the primary caretaker of the baby and of any older siblings. Because she is nursing, she is solely responsible for the feeding activity. For many mothers in this study, the early months were characterized by frequent feedings and unpredictable feeding schedules. Evenings were hectic for a woman when, for example, an older child wanted to be fed, her husband came home and the baby was fussing. Often the baby wanted to nurse more frequently in the evenings. Nighttime feedings meant interrupted sleep and extreme fatigue. A woman could spend up to 12 hours per day nursing during the first 6-12 weeks of her baby's life (Maclean 1988:365).

Twelve hours per day may seem extreme to many readers, and undoubtedly represents an upper bound on the time demands of breastfeeding; however, it somewhat counterbalances the unrealistically low estimates of 50 to 116 minutes a day that have come from some earlier studies in developing countries (see...
Almroth et al. 1979 and other studies cited in Leslie 1989). Direct evidence of a dramatic effect of breastfeeding on women’s time allocation in a developing country setting comes from a recent study of the effects of reproductive status on women’s time use in rural Kenya (Baksh, Neumann, Paolisso, Trostle and Jansen 1991). While time spent breastfeeding is grouped with holding, washing, feeding, etc. into child care time, rather than categorized as a separate activity, it is evident that the increase from 3.1 per cent of their time spent on child care in the last trimester of pregnancy to 23.2 per cent of their time spent on child care in the first three months postpartum is substantially attributable to breastfeeding. Overall, the authors calculate that the total decrease in women’s work time during the six month period that includes the last trimester of pregnancy (when inactivity or rest time increases substantially) and the first three months of breastfeeding (when childcare time increases substantially) is 273 work hours, the equivalent of 1.5 hours per day or 25 eleven hour work days.

The issue of women’s time constraints and breastfeeding warrants particular attention at this time, in light of recent recommendations by WHO and the US Agency for International Development that women in developing countries be strongly encouraged to practice exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months of their baby’s life (Koniz-Booher, Fishman, Parlato and Roberts 1991). The time demands of exclusive breastfeeding are undoubtedly more intense than any other health service or health care practice targeted to women. Not only must breastfeeding be done daily, for several hours per day, but the interval between feedings cannot normally exceed four or five hours (unless a woman expresses and stores breastmilk). While breastfeeding has the convenience and privacy advantage of being a home based practice, as emphasized by Bruce above in discussing it as a family planning technology, not all women are able to be home based continuously throughout the day. Many aspects of both women’s household and women’s paid employment require women to be absent from home for several uninterrupted hours per day, and the extent to which infants can accompany their mothers during such activities shows great micro-regional variation. A study of female farmers in Western Nepal, for example, found that most women were unable to take infants to the fields with them, primarily because of the steep terrain and long distances to be travelled, but also because of fears about the infants’ safety (Levine 1988).

The above analysis leads to a somewhat more complex set of hypotheses about the effects of women’s time constraints on the use of health services than those hypothesized in my earlier paper (Leslie 1989). Coreil (1991) has proposed that research on participation in health related activities in general, and on the effects of women’s time constraints in particular, be disaggregated along two dimensions, which she identifies as the setting or domain in which the care takes place, and the level of care. In addition to these two dimensions, I would propose that a third important dimension is whether the activity must be carried out by the mother or woman herself, or can be carried out by someone else. A matrix incorporating these three dimensions is shown in Figure 1, which also includes examples of one or more health related behaviours that would fall into each category.

Following the matrix in Figure 1, and based on the limited empirical evidence to date, I would hypothesize that women’s time constraints would more powerfully affect utilization of preventive than management care, would more powerfully affect utilization of clinic or hospital based services than health related practices in the home, and would more powerfully affect activities that must be carried out by women themselves than those that can be carried out either by the women/mother or by someone else. The total demands on women’s time, as well as the cultural appropriateness, quality, and convenience of services or recommended practices will modify these broad tendencies and, thus, would lead one to expect significant micro-regional variation. I would end by reiterating the conclusion of the earlier paper, that more studies are urgently needed, both to quantify the actual time costs associated with different health related activities, and, of even greater importance, to begin to establish the significance of these time costs relative to other determinants of use of health services, or implementation of home based health practices.

---

1 This updated material was written as a follow-up to the IDS Bulletin Workshop on Gender and Health: Issues for the Coming Decade. It builds on an earlier extensive analysis of women’s time as a key factor in the use of child survival technologies (Leslie 1989).

The earlier paper synthesized findings from 27 time allocation studies showing that women in developing countries face severe time constraints. It was noted that such studies show a lack of clear picture of the time women spend on health and child care in the home and utilization of health services, however, because these are primarily sporadic, not daily, activities. One clear implication is that reporting time spent by women on illness or health care utilization as a daily average masks the true cost to women of periodically losing half of a day or more of work time.

The earlier paper found that almost no direct empirical data have been gathered on the time costs to women of breastfeeding, immunizations, oral rehydration therapy, or growth monitoring, nor on whether time costs are an important determinant of utilization of these technologies. Specific research designed around the introduction of child survival projects, plus the inclusion of appropriate measures in the evaluations of ongoing projects, could fill this gap. Even without further research the earlier paper concludes, recognition of the time constraints faced by low-income mothers in conjunction with lessons learned from successful growth monitoring and immunization projects suggests that outreach efforts may be an important key to increasing utilization of child survival technologies.
### Figure 1: Illustrative matrix of health services and practices by location, user, and type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>User</th>
<th>Preventive</th>
<th>Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home</td>
<td>Mother only</td>
<td>Breastfeeding</td>
<td>TBA or family-assisted childbirth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ante-natal self-care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mother or other member of household</td>
<td>Natural family planning and barrier contraceptives</td>
<td>Oral rehydration therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Preparation of enriched weaning foods</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health post or clinic</td>
<td>Mother or other member of household</td>
<td>Growth monitoring</td>
<td>Antibiotics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Child immunization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Most non-barrier contraceptives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### REFERENCES

Almroth, S., Greiner, T., and Latham, M. C., 1979, 'Economic importance of breastfeeding', *Food and Nutrition*, Vol 5 No 2: 4-10

Ayalew, S., 1985, 'Time budget analysis as a tool for PHC planning (with examples from Ethiopia)', *Social Science and Medicine*, Vol 21 No 8: 865-872


Joekes, S., 1991, 'Women and structural adjustment: operational implications for the JCGP member agencies', IDS, Sussex, May


INTRODUCTION

The preservation of good health and care of the sick, disabled and dying accounts for a substantial share of national activities in even the poorest countries. Health is a labour intensive sector which involves work at a number of levels of organisation: within households, in communities, by workers in the informal sector as well as in the modern health services. A large percentage of the inputs are made by women. In many developing countries, health sector strategies have been formulated, in the absence of basic information on how these services are produced.

Two developments during the past decade have led to an increased interest in the production of health care services; the acceptance of primary health care (PHC) as a strategy for sectoral development and the economic crisis. The article addresses the implications and effects of these in relation to women.

1.2 Primary health care and the role of women

Since the publication of the Alma Ata Declaration in 1978 (WHO 1978) there has been an increasing acceptance of the PHC approach. Almost all of the tasks which it identifies as ‘essential’ have traditionally been in the domestic sphere (e.g. health education, improving nutrition, access to clean water, immunization of children, basic care of pregnant women and young children, family planning, and provision of basic curative care).

Women are the principal producers of health-related services at household level. They are the family health educators and they play the major role in the production, harvesting, processing, storing, preparation and distribution of food for their households. In many countries women haul water and manage basic sanitation in the family and the community. They play an important role in the promotion and use of immunization, the management of pregnancy and the care of children. They also treat injuries and common diseases and provide nursing care for the more seriously ill and disabled (Butler 1983).

The PHC approach stresses the importance of the mobilisation of local communities to undertake health-related work, where the assumption is often made that women will provide the resources, the time and the skills for these activities. Women have played a major role at this level by cooperating around tasks of water management, pit latrine construction and sanitation programmes, nutrition and literacy projects, communal child care, campaigns to prevent deforestation and to close down liquor shops, as well as in mother and child health programmes. At the community or village level, women have also played a role as providers of health services in the informal sector, particularly as traditional birth attendants, and more recently as Community Health Workers (CHWs).

Women constitute a substantial proportion of the labour force in the modern health services. There has been a rapid expansion in training of middle-level cadres such as nurses, paramedics, and midwives, professions which are often predominantly female. In many countries the unskilled and semi-skilled personnel who perform much of the cleaning and patient care in hospitals are women. However, men usually still constitute the majority of doctors.

There has been a considerable amount of research on women and health in developing countries in recent years. However this has focused largely on (poor) women as consumers of reproductive health care. Proposals have been developed to make services more accessible and sensitive to their needs. The role of women as producers of health care services has received much less study, with the notable exception of the recent WHO monograph (Pizurki et al 1987). There is a need for research into the implications for policy of the important role of women in the health sector.

1.3 The impact of economic crisis

The economic crisis and its effect on public health services has given an added urgency to the need to understand how health care services are produced. There has been a tendency to shift the burden on to communities and individual households (UN Sub-Committee on Nutrition, 1990).

Where charges for PHC have been introduced, or increased, women in poorer households have had to choose between decreasing their use of health services or finding additional cash (either through increased income generation or diminished expenditure on other goods and services).

\(^1\) The author would like to acknowledge the contribution of Gerald Bloom who strongly influenced the content of the article with a presentation to the workshop on 'Gender and health; issues for the coming decade', held at IDS in July 1991.
The more common response to the crisis has been a cut in the level of service delivery by the public sector and an increase in the role of households and the informal sector. There has been a substantial decrease in the use of government clinics due to lack of staff, drug shortages, and the deterioration of facilities in a number of countries. The quality of services is frequently low and there has been a shift toward the informal sector (traditional healers and semi-legal practitioners and self care (van de Geest et al 1990; Whyte 1989 and Banguire 1989). Where hospitals are perceived to be dangerous places, women are more likely to nurse their sick family members at home. Many programmes, targeted at specific health problems (children with diarrhoea, the disabled, people with AIDS), envisage a substantial and increased role for home-based and predominantly female care and support.

The economic crisis has had an impact on women as health workers as well. Levels of public sector pay have fallen considerably in many countries. The morale of health workers who work in inadequate facilities with virtually no supervision is low (Simmonds 1989) and there is a risk that significant numbers of health workers will become de-skilled (UNDP 1983). The (re)-establishment of a cadre of effective health workers is one of the highest priorities for many developing countries. This provides an opportunity for (or threat of) substantial restructuring of the work force. Questions such as the relative responsibilities of different cadres, pay and career structures, relationships of authority, relative roles of the private and public sectors, and the role of professionalism and professional bodies will be increasingly important in years to come. This article argues that the role of gender in the restructuring process as a basis for a future alliance for health, needs to be addressed.

2 THE ROLE OF GENDER IN THE PRODUCTION OF HEALTH CARE SERVICES

The remainder of this article will identify some key areas where gender-sensitive research can contribute to a better understanding of policy options. The aim is to open up a debate on the role of gender and gender politics in the production of health care services. The discussion will be structured around four levels of organisation of the production of health care; households, communities, the informal and formal sectors.

2.1 Women as carers in households

The importance of women as producers of health care services within households is increasingly recognised by researchers and international organisations. Their tasks include routine care of children, treatment of minor illness, long term commitments to care for old and disabled family members and the need to cope with catastrophic illness when it strikes.

The industrialised countries have developed a wide variety of institutions to organise a reduction of the burden on individual families (although they have come under financial stress in recent years in the UK). In both cases an assumption has been made that women, as home based carers, have no labour constraints that would limit their capacity to take on the production of health care services within the household. However, a number of studies have shown that women operate with labour constraints in their multiple roles in production and reproduction and are increasingly being squeezed with fewer resources and more demands on their time (Elson 1989).

Very few studies have been done on household caring patterns in developing countries. For example, studies on women's caring roles in relation to child survival found almost no direct empirical data on the time costs to women of breast feeding, immunizations, oral rehydration therapy, or growth monitoring. However there are indications that labour constraints are an important determinant of utilization of these technologies (Leslie 1989; Chatterjee 1991).

2.2 Women in the community

The literature on PHC frequently makes reference to the importance of 'the community' in the production of health care services, particularly in relation to mobilising activities for public health campaigns, financing health services and CHWs and organising itself in effective health committees.

The use of 'community' today in most cases refers to locality, where in most cases it can no longer be assumed that, within a given area or a village, people are homogeneous groups of individuals. In any area where modern health services exist, production and distribution systems are based on market exchange, where social stratification and differentiation have transformed rural areas into heterogeneous villages, with different socio-economic groups. In addition to these socio-economic groups, villages were already divided into different ethnic, clan, religious and caste groups that all involve different sets of obligations and roles. Also in all populations there are gender differences where the socially constructed roles between men and women determine the sexual division of labour in that community or population. The diverse groups have different access to resources, different survival strategies as well as different health care needs (Rifkin 1985). The complexity of local organisation has meant that strategies for the creation of effective organisation around health at this level have been poorly articulated.
However there are numerous examples of local or village based actions around health issues where the resources coming into the area in terms of a CHW, a loan, a training programme have been an important catalyst for change, triggering a demand and supporting people in the articulation of their needs. Many of the reportedly most successful community health projects have depended on charismatic leaders usually operating within NGO projects, where political commitment, flexibility, innovation, flexible resources, improved training and management have led to positive changes involving women's roles in the community (Halstead and Walsh 1987).

The descriptions of these positive examples however, often do not explicitly explore the gender dimensions of local participation. For example, in most countries Village Health Committees are made up of men representing the power in the village and choices made by these committees on the siting of new shallow wells, bore holes or Village Health Centres or the choice of candidates for training as a CHWs, or the introduction of drug financing schemes are made by them. These decisions usually represent the interests of the power groups in the village not the poorest sections and certainly not the poorest women, whose need is often the greatest.

Women in villages with new PHC activities carry out the extra health related tasks, while the village men are involved in the decision making processes, usually through Village Health Committees, in relation to any aspect of financing health care services or activities and any other organisational matters.

There is a need for serious research into the gender aspects of the roles of localities or 'communities' in organising themselves to produce or pay for health care services.

2.3 The Informal sector

Workers in the informal sector including traditional healers, CHWs and birth attendants are important producers of health care services, and a large number of these are female.

Traditional Birth Attendants (TBAs) or dais, have been integral part of rural India for centuries and in most other developing countries these are similar histories relating to traditional cultural patterns of childbirth. PHC interventions initiated a new interest and concern in incorporating the skills and contacts of the TBAs into modern health service delivery as a means of reducing maternal mortality. Training programmes were designed, kits were provided and support and supervision by the nurses and auxiliaries planned.

The numbers of trained TBAs are hard to estimate, but TBA and dai training programmes are now organised in 82 per cent of developing countries, compared to 37 per cent a decade earlier (Royston and Armstrong 1989). In India (where three quarters of all births are estimated to be attended by dais) 580,000 had received a one month training (Somjee 1991).

There has been considerable scepticism about these training programmes, where reports have shown the effects of the training programmes on maternity outcomes to have been negligible. Relevant factors include scepticism from the trained health workers, leading to failure to provide supervision and support, together with poor training and failure to maintain the supply of kits and stipends (Royston and Armstrong 1989).

Furthermore the ambiguous status of the TBA has been reported to have had a negative effect on the programmes' viability. But recent studies have shown that the status of the dai is not immutable. It can be improved among other factors by training (Stephens 1990).

During the past 20 years, a deliberate attempt has been made to establish a new cadre of informal sector worker. CHWs usually receive a minimum amount of training and are expected to work as volunteers or for low pay. CHW programmes exist in most developing countries. The majority of CHWs are female. Walt reports, for example, that in 14 countries, 192,000 were female and 40,000 were male (Walt 1990).

Most informal sector workers receive little continuing training and are virtually unsupervised. They work within a weak community structure which means that there is little community or local control of, involvement or support for their activities. The economic crisis of the public health services has meant that they have increasingly come to rely on cash payments as a means of income.

2.4 The formal sector: nurses

Nurses form the largest single category of health workers in most developing countries and in most developing countries they are overwhelmingly female. To simplify the discussion, the article will focus on this cadre. There has been a rapid growth in the number of trained nurses in developing countries (Table 1). In some cases there was a four-fold or greater increase between 1964 and 1985. There has been a significant fall in the average population per nurse in many countries. The fall in the ratio of physicians to nurses demonstrates the success of the policy of concentrating training on middle-level cadres.

In spite of the overall growth in numbers, serious shortages persist in the rural health services. Most nursing training is hospital-based and does not address the need for supervision, training and support of other front-line health workers. Some countries have begun
to change nursing curricula to accommodate the PHC approach. Others have faced constraints including traditional values in nursing education, nursing practice and legislation regarding nurses registration and licensing. Little has changed in nursing education or task description to accommodate new approaches. Nurses continue to be trained primarily for hospital work (Pizurki et al 1987). This has led to a situation where no-one is explicitly being trained to provide basic services to the population or to provide supervision and management support to that cadre.

Nursing is segmented into a number of hierarchical levels, e.g. professional nurses, (often university trained), non-professional (two to three years training) and auxiliary nurses (semi-skilled). In addition, a small proportion of the professional nurses may rise to senior management level. However, the training of the different cadres, their levels of responsibility and the mobility between levels differs a great deal. There are no commonly agreed guidelines on the appropriate organisation of nursing work in developing countries. The definition of the relative roles of these different categories of worker is often an arena of intense struggle.

The structure of the nursing profession in many countries reflects their colonial heritage. Brian Abel Smith describes how upper and middle class women used the nursing profession to create a power base for women and struggled for the upgrading of the hospital services in nineteenth century Britain (Abel-Smith 1960). The result was a nursing profession which was dominated by a small number of professional leaders and in which most of the work was carried out by nursing aids and practical nurses who were recruited from the working class and received little theoretical training. This pattern has been reproduced in the very unequal societies of Africa and Asia.

In recent years, the financial constraints in the public sector have led to a slow down in the number of new jobs and a fall in wage levels. Attention of human resource planners in the health sector is shifting from a simple concern with numbers to improving the effectiveness of the existing corps of health workers. There is likely to be a major re-definition of the structure of the health sector workforce over the next

---

### Table 1: Trends in total numbers of nurses, doctor/nurse ratios and population per nurse, in selected developing countries, 1965 and 1984

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Total nurses</th>
<th>Doctor/nurse ratio</th>
<th>Population/nurse</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFRICA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>1,490</td>
<td>0.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>2,099</td>
<td>19,403</td>
<td>0.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>5,051</td>
<td>20,641</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>621</td>
<td>9,126</td>
<td>0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMERICAS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Rep</td>
<td>2,321</td>
<td>5,183</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>1,259</td>
<td>5,985</td>
<td>0.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraguay</td>
<td>1,323</td>
<td>3,584</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td></td>
<td>10,976</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>76,178</td>
<td>443,011</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>3,478</td>
<td>12,287</td>
<td>0.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>6,104</td>
<td>71,306</td>
<td>0.69</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Data may not always be comparable between countries, as the definition of nurse may differ. However, data reflect general trends.
few years which will elicit a reaction by the organised professions. The politics of gender will play an important role in this process, and the next section of the article addresses three areas that will need further research.

3 PROFESSIONALISM, DECISION MAKING AND VIABLE ECONOMIC LIVELIHOODS IN THE HEALTH SECTOR

The changes in the roles of women as providers of health care have been affected, as discussed earlier in the paper by the adoption of the PHC approach and by the economic crisis. This section raises questions in regard to three key issues that need to be addressed in relation to women's changing roles: professionalism and the implications of changes for women's work and status; decision making patterns and thirdly the erosion of viable livelihoods for many women at the bottom end of the health sector hierarchy.

3.1 Professionalism and gender

This section looks at the impact of the role of the health professions in legitimising gender differences between different categories of workers, whereby women in the health sector predominate in jobs with low status and low pay.

Earlier theoretical work on the function of the medical profession described candidate selection, the long socialisation processes, the reward structure and postgraduate opportunities, registering and licensing procedures all of which were established and controlled by the profession itself (Freidson 1972). Parry described the conscious exclusion of women from the medical profession and their fight to gain entry, as well as the fight of the nurses to have their profession recognised as distinct from lesser trained or untrained lay healers (Parry 1976).

Going beyond a functionalist analysis of maintenance of professional and ethical standards, Navarro and Ehrenreich describe the role that medicine and the profession play in capitalist society in supporting class, race and gender divisions, including looking at the social control function of medicine (Navarro 1976 and Ehrenreich 1978).

These critiques of the medical profession were accompanied by feminist critiques which described the history of the medical profession from a woman's perspective. These tended to show how the medical profession had become institutionalised as a male upper class monopoly occupation, leaving outside its boundaries the midwives, nurses and lay healers. This exclusion has no consistent justification, but the stereotypes of 'innate feminine nature' were established to justify female subservience in the medical system (Ehrenreich and English 1973).

Fee argued that the medical profession conforms to the patriarchal pattern established in the family and that the solution is not simply to increase the number of female doctors, since paternalism and authoritarianism in medicine are structurally and culturally determined. She advocates enhanced power to patients and women and self-help groups where medical knowledge can be demystified and alienation between the health system and women lessed (Fee 1975).

The history of the medical and nursing professions in developing countries show similarities to the models of professions that developed in Europe at the turn of the century. Both professions developed with a determination to maintain standards that were internationally accepted and to maintain links with international professional organisations. Medicine in most developing countries also became a high status, predominantly male occupation with correspondingly high salaries. Nursing was more difficult to export as an attractive or high status occupation for girls, particularly in Asian countries, and nursing schools had great difficulty in attracting candidates.

In Africa, nursing at first attracted only male applicants. In East Africa the problem of attracting females into the nursing profession was a direct result of the comparative lack of education for girls, where boys alone had the necessary school leaving qualifications. To ensure the development of a female nursing profession, the entrance requirements for girls were lowered until sufficient girls had been trained (Raikes 1975).

While medicine retained its high status and led to the over production of doctors in many countries, nursing gradually achieved a higher status as families of girls in India and Bangladesh, for example, perceived the advantage of training a daughter and attracting a doctor husband. Nursing became a major channel for upward mobility for girls, after teaching, although still in many countries there is a shortfall in the numbers trained.

Amongst the nurses there have remained wide professional differences with girls from better off families and more years of schooling receiving one training, and girls with less education receiving a lesser training, remuneration and status. However in many developing countries the nursing profession has tended to be far less subservient to the medical hierarchy, rather taking it as a model for professional status and advancement. Strikes, for example, for pay increases by doctors in some countries have been followed by strikes by nurses for similar pay increases.

On the positive side, nursing legislation and nursing training controlled by the nursing profession, has been able to establish and maintain high standards of
hospital care for curative medicine in some hospital settings. In the face of the cuts and the problems that many health sectors face, the profession of nursing has often retained an impressive degree of accountability and a moral code of behaviour under extremely difficult circumstances that could otherwise have been more easily eroded (Holden 1991).

However the blanket acceptance of established attitudes and codes of behaviour also limits the nurses role. For example, Rispel and Schneider argue that professionalism in South Africa discourages nurses from confronting their social responsibility, where for many years nurses have been able to work without confronting the question of apartheid, its implications for their work and the wide disparities in the health status of the different populations (Rispel and Schneider 1991).

The issue of professionalism has resurfaced in developing countries as a central issue in the PHC debate, where on the one hand, community participation is seen as the key to demystifying and engaging people in defining their own health care needs and in producing services (Chambers 1991). On the other hand the serious breakdown of norms and regulations governing the practice of medicine and the distribution of drugs, is considered a serious threat to health for whole populations. For this reason Leonard argues that strengthening professions is the most feasible way of re-introducing quality controls and stopping the deregulation of drugs and procedures (Leonard 1991).

These two views express a range of problems that were raised in the earlier literature but perhaps appear more acute and complex given the stage of development of the health sector labour force, the crisis and the solutions being proposed, as well as the deep concern over the deregulation of drugs and procedures. Moreover a re-thinking of the role of professions in the delivery of health care is likely to have a far more profound impact on women's work in the health sector, where they tend to occupy the low paid, semi-skilled jobs.

3.2 Gender relations, planning and decision making patterns in the health sector

PHC policies have also provoked a new discussion on decision making patterns in the health sector, advocating that communities and all members of health teams should be involved in the decision making process. But not only have decision making processes hitherto been hierarchical and non-participatory; they have also been gender biased, with women in the majority of cases, having been excluded from major roles.

The marked hierarchical structure of the health sector and its gender inequalities reflect gender inequalities found in other sectors and in society at large. While the bulk of health care is provided by women, their participation in planning and management processes has been limited owing to fewer opportunities in training, gaining access to information, education and opportunities than men (Pizurki et al 1985).

Gender stereotyping in medicine, with a great preponderance of male physicians, is still apparent in most countries today. This pattern reflects the income and status differentials that are attached to medicine in contrast to nursing and auxiliary health care work, where the ratio is reversed and women predominate. Male domination in the health sector in relation to decision making processes is reinforced through professional ethics, socialisation during training, preferential access to resources including salary differentials, as well as to sexual power.

Many countries, recognising the error of the sexual imbalance in the male/female doctor ratio and the need for female doctors, have established positive discrimination policies for entrance to medical schools with the result that there is now an increasingly high proportion of female entrants into medical school, which for 1984-85 enrolments was 35 per cent on a world-wide basis. In another sample of 32 countries 39.4 per cent of physicians were female in the early 1970s.

However despite an increased female intake, gender differences within the medical profession persist, with assumptions about female specialization, with data from a number of countries showing a higher percentage of female doctors in paediatrics contrasted to the minority of females who specialize in surgery. Related to female opportunities in specialist fields are decision making opportunities in the formal health system. While no data is available for developing countries, data from Europe, the USA and Russia shows that where there are more female physicians overall so are there more females in decision-making positions. However, when managerial positions are examined and the number of women in top ministry positions and as heads of departments are counted, the number of females in negligible.

This statistical approach to the collection of data on women in medicine indicates a trend but does not describe the dynamics of gender relations, based on the sexual division of labour within medicine, where in every group practice, in each department and on every committee the likelihood of women taking leadership roles in decision making is minimal. However, even

---

3 Figures in this section are taken from Women as Providers of Health Care, WHO, Geneva, 1987.
when women are in leadership roles in medicine, it does not necessarily follow that they will make gender sensitive decisions in relation to either PHC or women's health issues. Without more data, and particularly qualitative research material, it is difficult to see what role women in medicine do play when they are in leadership positions. There are few indications of how this would work.

One example of female physicians' positive role in PHC leadership and management is the Women's Health Coalition in Bangladesh, where a gender approach to women's health has led to the provision of a holistic service for women's health care needs that now runs 19 Well Women Clinics (Women's Health Coalition, Bangladesh, 1989).

In relation to the relative strengths and weaknesses of medical and nursing professions and decision making, there are examples of the countries where the nursing profession does appear on an equal footing at ministerial and planning levels. For example it would seem that nurses are centrally involved in management and decision making processes in Botswana where the trained nurses are 98 per cent female and hugely outnumber the medical doctors. Foreign doctors have been employed to fill the vacant medical posts, but they cannot fill the void at the decision making levels of medically qualified nationals. This gap has been filled by highly competent and professional nurses, who have fought for the preservation and advancement of nurses status and position. But there is no indication that there has been any willingness on the part of the nurses to involve women in the planning and provision of any aspect of maternal and child health and family planning (Ngongo 1989).

Where there are cases of female influenced decision making processes, this usually happens when elements of power have come within the grasp of a small and elite group of better qualified nursing professionals, generally leaving the majority of female nursing workers as vulnerable (weak) as before in relation to males in (and out of) the medical profession. Female nurses are often oppressed by the domination of the medical profession both psychologically and physically, reflecting a similar vulnerability of women in other formal and informal sector occupations and in the wider society (Pizurki et al 1987). Reports of sexual harassment, payments demanded from female health workers both in cash and kind for their admission to training schools, for the postings and for promotion have been made from female health workers at all levels.

For example Mary, a Family Health Field Educator in Kenya, was offered a place on the training programme if she offered sex to a member of the District Health Team who was responsible for selecting the District candidates. Since her training and posting she has had to regularly satisfy this man in order to keep her posting.

Eunice, an experienced graduate nurse, working in the AIDS programme for an international NGO was sexually harassed by both her national counterpart and one of the donor experts and then raped. A separated mother with three children to support she found her original complaints led to potential dismissal. She has now withdrawn her case.

In Madhaya Pradesh in a survey done in 60 villages problems with recruiting, posting and keeping the female Multipurpose Workers in the Rural Sub-Centres were reported as lack of physical security where these health workers were continually subjected to verbal and physical attacks by male villagers until they were authorized to leave their health posts and find accommodation with families in the village.

Sexual harassment, violence against women, and rape are everyday phenomena in many parts of the Third World. Increasingly, research is showing how common this pattern is (Toft 1986; Levinson 1989; Raikes 1990; Hillmore 1991).

For health workers the question must be how to guarantee the safety of all female health workers and, at the same time, how to ensure that the health sector recognises violence as a health issue for women that needs to be addressed urgently both with active support and health education programmes. These issues are central to the inequalities found between male and female health workers and need to be addressed as a central part of the biases in decision making processes in the health sector.

3.3 Female health workers and erosion of viable economic survival strategies

In the past doctors have had an advantage over nursing and other female health workers in relation to income supplements, in that their control over diagnostic skills, drug prescribing combined with their comparative freedom from domestic obligations, meant they had both time and resources to organise private practice to augment their salaries. Private practice for doctors in many countries has been legal and where it has been illegal, there were often ways round the system that were acceptable to interested parties.

Nurses and other female auxiliary workers had more limited access to resources and so less means of augmenting their lower salaries. This was partly because their skills were different, but also related to professional norms and legal boundaries which
prevented them from diagnosing, treating and prescribing without the authority of a doctor.

There are now indications that this pattern is breaking down, and that there is a constant movement of health workers, particularly nurses and female auxiliary health workers, between government employment, NGOs, private sector and informal sector work. Nurses in Kenya for example have been recorded as setting up in private practice and prescribing, something previously unknown but still illegal1. Nurses in Uganda now moonlight and offer private practice, selling drugs within the public health services or privately as a matter of course, where these survival strategies are now referred to as 'magendo' and discussed openly (Holden 1991). Nurses in Bangladesh, who used to lobby for increased housing benefits, transport, school allowances for their children and better working conditions and wages within the public sector, have more recently opted to move either to private sector employment or migrate for better working conditions (Somjee 1991; Robson 1990).

While the better qualified nurses appear to have found ways of coping with their reduced incomes, what can be said of the auxiliaries and the CHWs? Have they too found other ways of supplementing their health sector stipends or have they now become members of the 'new poor' those who had their foot on the ladder and have now become dislodged? (Moser 1991.)

Given the combined high level of demand for minimal training schemes like those of the TBAs and CHWs, it is likely that training still leads to income generating possibilities where none existed before and that health workers are not part of the 'new poor'. What is more likely is that increasing fees for services are now a regular feature of rural health care work, even in situations where the services are supposed to be provided free or provided at a fixed cost.

An example of this is the distortion caused by incentive payments to both clients and motivators (minimally trained female health workers) for family planning acceptance in both Bangladesh and India. The system was designed to promote the up-take of the family planning programme, but the incentive payments and the imposition of government targets to all health workers has distorted its operation (Sundaram 1989; Hartmann and Standing 1989). Reports show that half of the money paid to the clients is often kept by the health care motivators who regard it as their right to charge the patient for their service. So this extra cash has now become an essential part of the survival strategies of the various categories of rural health workers, and an extra cost of survival to the rural population.

The movement of health workers between government, NGO and private care as well as the movement into informal sector work, has led to a deregulation of services and a resulting lack of accountability. These changes will affect both the efficacy of treatment and the role of prevention as well as representing a further impoverishment to those who are already worse off.

Minimally paid health workers, although marginally better off than the poor, need further resourcing as one of the ways of reducing the chaos that exists at present in many health sectors. In addition to regular salaries, resources for minimally paid health workers can be improved by supplying creches for the children of female health workers, food supplements for female workers and their children as well as ensuring that their stipends, travel allowances and supplies are maintained. The issue of the resourcing of all community workers and volunteers is crucial. CHW programmes have suffered from sex-role stereotyping, based on an assumption of the availability of female volunteers and free or cheap labour. This assumption, concerning women's labour time, has proved false where women's labour is not in surplus and moreover women are overburdened by their roles in production, reproduction and the cuts in services.

However, where CHW programmes are assessed to have been poorly planned and to offer no indications of improved health care activities in villages, training and resourcing, the role of this cadre will need re-thinking. Minimally trained CHWs should not be abandoned to seek out a living in the informal sector accelerating the deregulation of drugs, but instead could perhaps be redeployed in creches, feeding schemes or in hospices for AIDS victims.

4 CONCLUDING REMARKS

This article does not take the stand that health services are the only way, or indeed the main way, to improve the health status of people in developing countries. Improved health status for women and whole populations will come about with improvements in access to resources, to improvements in nutrition, sanitation and water.

However within this framework health services and PHC in particular still has a vital and viable role. The PHC approach needs health workers to be highly motivated, capable of adapting their work tasks, time and energies to handle constantly changing new demands. For this they should not just be appropriately trained and supervised but also they must be adequately resourced.

---

1 Communication from Karanja Mbogua.
The (re)-establishment of a cadre of effective health workers is one of the highest priorities for many developing countries. This provides an opportunity (or threat of) substantial restructuring of the workforce. Questions such as the relative responsibilities of different cadres, pay and career structures, relationships of authority, relative roles of the private and public sectors, and the role of professionalism and professional bodies will be increasingly important in years to come. The politics of gender is likely to play an important role in this process.

There are a number of research questions that would appear to be crucial in relation to some of the issues raised in the article:

**In relation to professional structures:**
- What role do the professions play in PHC and what will be their role in the restructuring of the health sector workforce?
- To what extent can the nursing profession specify play a progressive role in the restructuring process for PHC?
- How can communities and individuals be supported to define their own health needs and to organise themselves to produce and pay for services within the existing framework of rigid professional health sector and gender biased hierarchies?

**In relation to informal sector health workers:**
- Where programmes have been appropriately defined and appear functional, how can they be sustained and adequately resourced?
- At what level is control and regulation over access and distribution to pharmaceuticals appropriate?
- Where existing informal sector and minimally trained formal sector health workers are assessed to be inappropriate, what alternatives can be found that will maintain a health related role for these cadres?

**In relation to the restructuring of the workforce:**
- How should career structures be restructured and who should supervise whom?
- Should the sharp distinctions between categories of health workers be maintained or should mobility between levels be encouraged?
- What role do gender hierarchies and gender biased decision making have on the production of health care services in developing countries at all levels?

**In relation to women as major producers of health care:**
- What are the special needs of female health workers at all levels in relation to child care, working hours, security and allowances?
- To what degree does security and sexual harassment intimidate and limit the work of female health workers and how can this be addressed?
- Where are there possible links in relation to a gender alliance between the female health workers and their female clients over women's health issues?

This article argues that the role of gender in the restructuring process as a basis for a future alliance for health needs to be addressed. Gender roles need to be discussed more openly between the health teams, planners and health workers at all levels in the health sector, so that problems can be identified. Discussions concerning changes that can be made in gender roles that are related to patterns of authority, power and decision making in health sector planning (leaving women as the main providers of PHC, without participation in planning mechanisms) are needed as a crucial part of any restructuring process.

**REFERENCES**


Butler, I., Carpenter, E. S., Kay, B. J. and Simmons, R. S., 1987, 'Gender hierarchies in the health labor force', *International Journal of Health Services, Vol 17 No 1*

Chambers, R., 1991, 'In search of professionalism; bureaucracy and sustainable livelihoods for the 21st century', *IDS Bulletin, Vol 22 No 4*

Chatterjee, M., 1991, 'Indian women, health and productivity, working papers, policy, research and external affairs, women in development', *The World Bank, Washington DC*


Fee, E., 1975, 'Women and health care: a comparison of theories', *International Journal of Health Services, Vol 5 No 3*
Gender and Development is published in March, July and November each year. It offers a forum for development practitioners, students and all concerned with the theory and practice of gender-oriented development to exchange views, record experience, describe models of good practice and disseminate information about networks and resources. The views expressed in the journal are those of the individual authors and not necessarily those of Oxfam.

Oxfam welcomes contributions to this journal, which should be sent to Caroline Sweetman, The Editor, Gender and Development, Oxfam, 274 Banbury Road, Oxford OX2 7DZ, UK. A summary of the guidelines for contributors is printed on the inside back cover.

Editorial Advisory Group, Gender and Development

Peggy Antrobus, DAWN, University of the West Indies, Barbados
Sylvia Borren and Ellen Sprenger, NOVIB, The Hague, The Netherlands
Florence Butegwa, Associates for Change, Uganda
Daniela Colombo, AIDoS, Rome, Italy
Camillia El-Solh, Centre for Cross-cultural Studies, QEH, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
Aldo Facio, ILANUD, San Jose, Costa Rica
Jane Esuansiswa Goldsmith, National Alliance of Women's Organisations, London UK
Noelleen Heyzer, UNIFEM, New York, USA
Suad Joseph, Department of Anthropology, University of California, Davis CA 95616, USA
Naila Kabeer, Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex, Brighton, UK
Deborah Kasente, Department of Women's Studies, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda
Matthew Lockwood, Christian Aid, UK
Sara Hiupekile Longwe, Longwe Clarke and Associates, Lusaka, Zambia
Ruth Pearson, School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia, Norwich UK
Amartya Sen, Harvard University, Cambridge, USA
Gita Sen, Indian Institute of Management Bangalore, Bangalore, India
Rieky Stuart, Canadian Council for International Co-operation, Ottawa, Canada
Maria Suarez, FIRE, Radio for Peace International, Santa Ana, Costa Rica

Subscription rates

Subscriptions are for whole volumes only. Please apply to Carfax Publishing Company, PO Box 25, Abingdon, Oxfordshire, OX14 3UE, UK. Fax: +44 (01) 235 401550; Tel: +44 (01) 235 521154. Or to Carfax Publishing Company, 875-81 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA, USA. Fax: +1 617 687 5; Freephone: 1-800-354 1420. Subscription rates for 1998 (including postage): Personal: £28/US$47; Institutional: £70/US$116; Bulk Rate: £14/US$19. A special rate of £14/US$19 is available for organisations from countries listed in the current UN Human Development Report as developing countries. Back issues (where available) £7.95 per copy. Gender and Development is also published in an electronic version. For details of subscription to the electronic or combined versions please contact Oxfam Publishing, at the address below.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means without the written permission of the Publisher.
The REFLECT approach to literacy and social change: a gender perspective

Sara Cottingham, Kate Metcalf and Bimal Phnuyal

This article looks at the opportunities offered by REFLECT, a participatory approach to adult literacy and social change, to promote women’s rights and gender equality, outlining the principles on which the REFLECT process is based and analysing the learning points arising from an evaluation of three pilot projects using the approach.

REFLECT is based on concepts from the philosophy of Paulo Freire, and uses the techniques of Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) to share and systematise the knowledge of participants, analysing topics of local concern, and taking individual or collective action where appropriate. The role of the literacy teacher (called a facilitator) in a REFLECT class (called a circle) is to facilitate this discussion, probing deeper into the relationship between power structures and social stratification, and the topic of concern to the group, and introducing literacy and numeracy skills via the discussion. REFLECT has proved to be more participatory than primer-based methods, where the emphasis is on learning to read pre-prepared social messages about hygiene, girls’ education, family planning, tree planting, HIV/AIDS, and so on. In REFLECT, the acquisition of literacy is intended to reinforce a process of analysing issues of concern to the members of the circle, and the plans of action which come out of this. In its turn, literacy also enhances the discussion of the concerns of the circle, since the written word gives their ideas increased status; and acquiring literacy skills enables women and men to communicate their ideas to the wider community, and to different levels of power. This iterative approach involves a re-definition of conventional literacy training.

The REFLECT approach was developed by ACTIONAID in Uganda, Bangladesh, and El Salvador through field experience, and rigorously monitored and evaluated in comparison to control groups using conventional approaches. In Uganda, REFLECT was used as the first development intervention in an ACTIONAID operational area, and the circles had both male and female participants. In Bangladesh, it was introduced at the request of all-women Savings and Credit groups who wanted numeracy skills in order to sustain their groups when ACTIONAID withdrew direct support and handed over to a local NGO. In El Salvador, it was used as a way of promoting community development, by COMUS, a community-based organisation, with technical support from a national literacy organisation.

The REFLECT Mother Manual, drawing together the experience of the three pilots and the evaluation, was published in 1996. REFLECT is currently being used and adapted in 25 countries by 90 organisations. Gender equity has emerged as a greater priority for circles worldwide than it had seemed in the original pilots.

Gender and Development Vol 6, No. 2, July 1998
This article begins by describing the process of REFLECT sessions, and goes on to analyse the gender issues raised in an evaluation of the three pilot projects, focusing on a case study of ECARDS, an activist organisation based in Nepal. Finally, the article identifies problems and learning points before suggesting ways in which REFLECT's approach could be strengthened by a more explicitly feminist approach.

The basic principles of REFLECT

The REFLECT approach is based on a number of principles which underlie the process. These are:

- Gender equity is integral to all aspects of REFLECT, as it is essential for social transformation.
- The REFLECT process explores and analyses the causes of power inequalities and oppression.
- REFLECT recognises the social stratifications and power relationships which affect everyone involved in the process, and seeks to create a space and process in which they can become the focus for critical analysis.
- Conflict is a reality in people’s lives, and should be addressed constructively within the REFLECT process, not suppressed or avoided.
- REFLECT is an evolving process which must be continually re-created for each new context. Innovation is integral to the process.
- REFLECT recognises that individual transformation is as important as collective transformation.
- REFLECT recognises that the equitable practice of power at all levels in the process is essential for determining empowerment outcomes. Institutional and individual changes at all levels are an integral part of the process.

Running a REFLECT session

REFLECT sessions are run as follows. First, the topic for discussion is selected by the facilitator and participants; it should be a significant issue, relevant for participants at that time. Examples of topics which might be discussed are the history of the community; the number of people and land ownership in the community; patterns of agricultural work throughout the year; division of labour between women and men; causes of conflict; causes of ill health; environmental problems; history of rent increases in the area; children’s workload; the number of schools in the area; history of human rights abuse; and experiences of childbirth. Then, the objective of discussing the topic is decided; for example, the topic of general environmental degradation might be linked to a current shortage of fuel. The REFLECT circle uses a tool from Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA) or PLA to pool information and organise ideas.

There are many PRA tools, but the types used here are ‘information-gatherers’ such as a map and or a calendar, and tools for analysis, for example the preference ranking matrix, and the Venn diagram. Facilitators choose the appropriate tool, frequently using meetings with other facilitators to discuss the selection of both the topic and the tool and share experience of what has worked well.

The participants construct the diagram on the ground, making use of any local materials with which they feel comfortable, to represent issues under discussion. The facilitator asks probing questions, for example, about root causes or about the different experiences of women and men; and recapitulates and summarises contributions so that the participants reach a satisfactory conclusion to their discussion. Other members of the community are often attracted to these discussions, which take place in the open air, as the topic will be of general interest.

Pictures are drawn on cards and labelled in the mother tongue of participants as part of the process, and at the end the whole graphic is transferred onto a large piece of paper and displayed. This serves as a record of discussion, a tool for negotiating with outside agencies, such as NGOs and local government authorities, for assistance, and as a basis for literacy and numeracy. Participants copy it into their exercise books, selecting the written words and numbers on which they wish to focus their learning. They may also agree on a short text summarising their discussion and agreed actions. This graphic,
A Gender Workload Calendar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>cooking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fuelwood collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>processing/husking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>water collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agricultural work/</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>weeding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>home based</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>income generation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg. mat making</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total women's</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>workload</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>planting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fertilising</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>clearing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>harvesting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>selling/trading</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>total men's workload</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

with all the attached writing and numeracy, replaces the text-book (usually called a 'primer' in adult literacy programmes).

From the point of view of literacy, the emphasis in the REFLECT process is on independent writing. By the end of the course, the aim is that each participant should have a series of 20 to 30 maps and matrices documenting their analysis of local issues. The programme moves at the pace of the participants, and there is no pressure to cover a set number of topics.

Evaluating the results of REFLECT

What are the results of REFLECT programmes? The evaluation of the original three pilot projects (Archer and Cottingham 1996) produced findings which continue to be a useful framework for analysing the results of further REFLECT programmes started in the last two years. Participants cited a mixture of outcomes, from practical activities (for
example, sharing of herbal medicinal knowledge, which led to the growing of more herbs; acquisition and use of literacy and numeracy skills (for example, record keeping in an individual’s projects); to attitudinal changes, such as increased self-confidence, and greater participation in their own family or community (for example, standing for election or leading a protest march against eviction in a slum area). In addition, 60–70 per cent of those enrolled achieved basic levels of literacy and numeracy, enabling them to write a one-page letter, read a passage, and carry out the four operations (addition, subtraction, multiplication and division).

How does this mixture of practical skills and less tangible outcomes relate to changes in women’s participation in development, and gender power relations? Concrete improvements have come about as a result, despite the sensitive nature of gender relations, which are often deemed too problematic to tackle.

**Women’s increased mobility**

All three evaluations have suggested REFLECT activities encourage increased mobility of women as they share information and experiences of travelling, and can thus move around the locality with more confidence. In the Bangladesh REFLECT programme this acquisition of local information was reinforced by the habit of leaving the ‘private’ compound to attend the ‘public’ literacy circle — with husbands' and fathers’ permission.

**Increased participation in family and community**

Another reported change was increased self-confidence on the part of women, as they claimed their right to be visible and audible in family and community meetings. There may be many reasons for this critical change, but one important one is the valuing and systematisation of previously-unrecognised indigenous knowledge held by women, through the REFLECT process. One example of this unrecognised knowledge is the ability to identify local varieties of drought-resistant seeds. Documentation of such knowledge can validate it for both men and women.

In the Ugandan pilot, 15 per cent of women reported speaking for the first time in the all-male preserve of the family meeting. In Bangladesh, the female facilitators reported that their training and new status gave them a stronger voice in decisions made by their husbands, for example, about loans. In a one-year-old Indian programme, the political context of the REFLECT circles are the gottis, traditional decision-making fora revived for literacy, which were traditionally all-male, but this time included women. There was initial resistance to women’s inclusion, so an awareness-raising campaign was necessary to change entrenched attitudes towards women’s participation in the gottis.

**Changes in the gender division of labour**

Changes in the gender division of the family workload were also reported. In the Ugandan programme, more than 50 per cent of participants reported that their husbands were fetching fuel and water, in order to free them for more agricultural work (also a woman’s traditional responsibility). This was a result of including a gender workload calendar as one of a series of units on agricultural work, marketing, and natural resources. This change was not conflictual, but was based on re-negotiation for rational economic ends. The sustainability of such a change when fundamental issues of inequality between women and men are not confronted is the crucial question. Conflict is probably more likely if equity issues are confronted, and this could be seen positively in the long term if it is managed constructively (and in the absence of violence).

The REFLECT process offers an opportunity to discuss these issues, and the REFLECT approach encompasses the description of the household gender arena as one which includes both co-operation and conflict, as described by Amartya Sen: ‘conflicts of interest between men and women are unlike other conflicts such as class conflicts. A worker and a capitalist do not typically live together under the same roof — sharing concerns and experiences and acting jointly’ (Sen 1990, 91).

The same trend was observed in a more recent REFLECT programme in Nepal, where men have also started helping with domestic
work. ECARDS is a national NGO, an activist organisation working with marginalised groups in Nepal. ECARDS has been using and adapting REFLECT for over two years in its empowerment-oriented work with small-scale landholders and landless people. Workers for ECARD report that a discussion on gender issues was initiated in one REFLECT circle, prompted by the late arrival of a male participant, who stated that he was late because he was waiting for his wife to return from the field to prepare the family meal. A few female participants asked him whether he could not have prepared the meal himself. His reply was that it was not his job. The participants, especially women, challenged his views about the concept of men's and women's work. The facilitator decided to continue the discussion on the issue and did not ask them to read or write anything that evening. Gradually, all the participants got involved in the debate. They split into two groups according to their views. It was agreed that everybody would share their views without personally attacking others: the purpose was to explore the issue. It took a couple of hours, but participants (including the man who raised the issue) eventually concluded that men could and should do domestic work such as cooking, washing, and caring for children. The behaviour of the male members of the group changed a great deal as a result of the discussion; the majority of the male participants have started to do some domestic work. Their progress has been monitored by the whole group, with the men being encouraged to undertake domestic tasks (Education Action, Issue 8, ACTIONAID 1997).

This is but one example of how the discussions and analysis generated in the REFLECT circles lead to direct action. In this case, the facilitator had discussed the gender division of labour and how it affected the unequal relations between women and men, as part of his own training. This enabled him to pick up the issue easily and informally.

**Analyzing the findings**

It can be seen from the above that REFLECT's approach to gender issues is to sensitise men to gender issues as well as focusing on women. Men come to realise their own role in perpetuating gender inequalities and recognise that they have to change; it is not enough to have sympathy for women: men must be willing to look at and modify their own behaviour. The learning points in REFLECT operate on several levels, from individual, to group, to community. Actions planned as a result of the discussion may be undertaken at group or community level, but sometimes actions at the individual level are more appropriate. If there are separate REFLECT circles for men and women, they can come together subsequently to share their analysis. This technique often usefully highlights the different perspectives of women and men on the same issue. In mixed groups, care has to be taken to ensure that the experiences of women and other less powerful groups are not excluded and marginalised in the discussion.

The Salvadoran pilot project did not show any particularly interesting results in the area of strategic gender needs. The learning point here is that the implementing agency, COMUS, lacked gender awareness, and this lack of a gender perspective directly affected the focus of the discussions and the problems identified.

**The 'primer method': a WID approach**

The majority of adult literacy programmes in the 1990s target women, and fit admirably into the 'Women in Development' model, where women are perceived as efficient instruments for development. The 'primer method' for adult literacy is used to disseminate social messages. However, these often implicitly reinforce women's subordinate role. Typically, messages may include:

- *Children and the sick need greens*  
  (more domestic work for women)
- *Have less children for a more prosperous life*  
  (women's reproductive role)
- *Work together for better sanitation*  
  (women as community managers/servants)
Cook better-prepared meals to avoid angering your husband
.avoids a discussion on domestic conflict in favour of emphasising women's domestic role)

Even when more 'feminist' messages appear in primers, for example, about the wrongs of domestic violence, or the right to choose the number of children in your family, they are less valuable because they are presented as an imposed conclusion, rather than being arrived at by learners as the result of a collective discussion. Whatever the message in the literacy primer, it is chanted and copied with evangelical zeal. The literacy skills acquired are supposed to improve women's skills as providers of health, education, and income for their families, often in a harsh world of macro-economic reform. It is not surprising that this kind of conventional literacy programme, with its WID goals, has seldom proved successful, even in its own terms.

In terms of the empowerment goals of the Gender and Development (GAD) approach to development, the primer approach to women's literacy does not begin to question the sexual division of labour and women's subordination. Neither does it open up debates about why the health of the family is a woman's responsibility, or ask if she has control of her sexuality rather than only her fertility.

The REFLECT method: a GAD approach

Education per se cannot be assumed to be intrinsically worthwhile for women; it is the type of education which determines this. REFLECT is not a functional adult literacy programme and, although there are practical outcomes for REFLECT participants, these are not the main goals of the programme. REFLECT is a participatory learning process which facilitates people's critical analysis of their environment, placing women's empowerment at the heart of sustainable and equitable development. It goes without saying that a gender analysis is crucial to this empowerment process. Transformatory education for women and men should challenge the role of conventional education in maintaining hegemony (the power held by rulers in a society, not through force but by common consent based on ideas of what is 'common sense'), especially the role of education in perpetuating gender inequalities. The REFLECT process is a practical expression of a GAD approach to development.

Linking literacy to empowerment

The experience and skills of participants are linked to literacy skills which are seen as part of 'formal education'. Participants can gain from the power associated with these skills, usually manifest in an improved bargaining position and increased 'status'. This increase in power is particularly pertinent for women, because of their historical exclusion from all levels of education. There is a clear link between illiteracy, poverty, marginalisation of all kinds, and gender. Political and economic discrimination against people who do not have literacy skills remains common in countries throughout the world; whether it is formal (for example, in the UK non-literates are banned from taking a driving test, and it is illegal to take another person into your voting booth even if you cannot read the names of candidates) or informal (for example, in a HIV/AIDS project in Zimbabwe, it was found difficult for non-literate people either to make wills, or for their family to enforce them legally; a special arrangement with the police for will-enforcement was the end result in this particular project) (personal communication: feedback from Stepping Stones workshop). Women often lose control of banked money, land deeds, and inheritance, both because they cannot read and write, and because others consider them to be inferior, even stupid (Kanyasigye 1988).

When participatory methods are used, and women's existing knowledge is respected and drawn upon, practical and strategic gender needs can be addressed in the same intervention. Women can pool their practical knowledge on agriculture, health, and income generation in order to carry out their daily tasks more effectively, and at the same time acquire the practical skills and 'status' of a
literate person. This opens doors to community decision-making (for example, where standing for positions of power has been reserved for men on the grounds that they are literate) and to a more respected position in the family, whereby women’s opinion is sought. While the ability and opportunity to use literacy skills confers advantages, the benefits to participants in the programme in terms of status are often simply the consequence of being a member of a literacy class (Fiedrich, unpublished field report from Mubende, Uganda, 1997). The REFLECT process aims to utilise all the positive aspects of literacy as an intervention in its contribution to changing inequitable gender relations, the REFLECT circle becoming an empowering interface between formal and informal education.

**Raising community consciousness of women’s subordination**

The REFLECT process provides a conventional ‘safe space’ over a period of time for women and men to participate in an analysis of the major issues facing the majority of women throughout the world. For example, aspects of women’s subordination are their lesser access to, and control over, resources, on an intra-household basis; a lack of decision-making power within their own household, in the community, and in the wider society; and the unequal division of labour between women and men that places women in an disadvantaged position in productive work. This is allied to an ideological de-valuing of women’s reproductive and community management work.

Some of these strategic gender issues may be new ideas for everyone (women as well as men) in the community, and an extended period of analysis is needed. One of the problems with methods of consultation and raising gender awareness at community level is that they tend to be one-off techniques which do not lead to ownership of subsequent development programmes with a gender component. It is critically important that local people have the chance to analyse gender issues for themselves, within their own culture and environment, if power relations are to change.

**Making links from local to global**

In REFLECT, discussions start from a local analysis and view but link this to wider national or global issues. One example of this local-to-global analysis comes from the experience of Yakshi and Girjan Deepika in India. The REFLECT circles they facilitated analysed agricultural issues, and particularly the advantages and disadvantages of cash and food crops. Participants had been given loans to plant cash crops (by non-gender-aware authorities) and this had reduced women’s income (in addition to causing many other problems), as they were responsible for food crops. After analysis, they decided to plant half their land with food crops, reversing the trend towards planting all the land with tobacco and cotton. The in-depth analysis carried out in the REFLECT circles enabled participants to gain a wider perspective of the issues at stake, as it involved looking at the global impact of multi-nationals, and global trade patterns, that directly influenced people’s lives at the individual and community level. As a result of their actions, and the greater scarcity and marketability of tobacco, prices increased. The decision to grow more food crops had the biggest impact on women, who controlled these crops.

**Strengthening the GAD/feminist approach in REFLECT**

The main problem encountered so far is that it is possible to side-step the gender aspects of social differentiation on most topics. For example, if the topic for discussion is human rights abuses during a past conflict, the facilitator might ask about the experiences of different income groups, or the situation for indigenous people as compared to mestizos, but avoid asking about the different experiences of women and men. It may be difficult for the participants themselves to raise gender issues, as these tend to be controversial. In training workshops for trainers and facilitators, too little emphasis has been placed on gender analysis. This
emerged as a major issue in a workshop in Guatemala in April 1997.

Work has begun on how to build a more cross-cutting gender analysis into REFLECT. In future workshops for trainers and facilitators, there will be a stronger focus on gender. We also addressed this further in an international workshop to revise the REFLECT Mother Manual, in March 1998. The manual will also influence the units designed in the field. A further REFLECT workshop focusing on gender will take place in Nicaragua in June 1998. A gender analysis needs to be integrated into all PRA exercises in the REFLECT circle; at present, the only tool which explicitly addresses gender issues is the gender workload calendar.

However, a commitment to working to achieve gender equality cannot stop with the use of appropriate analytical tools. REFLECT works best when the ideology, and the ways of working of the individuals and the implementing organisation mirror the REFLECT process. Facilitators and promoters therefore need to examine their own lives from a gender perspective. We cannot expect participants to change and be open if facilitators and other staff are not willing to analyse their own behaviour in the private and public spheres. The funding or implementing agency is also part of this process. All staff and facilitators need to understand and internalise the implication of a gender analysis. This would involve an analysis of the way the agency works, and also the personal and professional relations of the staff. Unless there are women working in the organisation, and gender and development issues are a priority, it is hard to see how the facilitators could be trained or how the discussions could be linked with activities in the local context. Our current challenge is to engage pro-actively with organisations whose work is framed within a gender and development paradigm, and who wish to use, adapt, and develop the REFLECT process in their own context.

All three authors work in the International Education Unit at ACTIONAID UK. Address: Hamlyn House, Archway, London N19 5PG. Fax: 171 263 7599.

Sara Cottingham is REFLECT co-ordinator (e-mail:sarac@actionaid.org.uk).

Bimal Phnuyal is an international REFLECT trainer (e-mail:bimalp@actionaid.org.uk).

Kate Metcalf is a Programme Officer (e-mail: katem@actionaid.org.uk).

References


Notes

1 See the review in the Resources section of this issue.

2 The preference ranking matrix is a framework which compares and ranks people's preferences. For example, they could rank the crops they preferred to grow and then rank the benefits from growing each crop.
CHANGING PERCEPTIONS
Writings on Gender and Development

Edited by Tina Wallace with Candida March
STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT: ITS EFFECT ON WOMEN

DIANE ELSON

The last decade has been marked by a contrast between rising awareness of the importance of women's contribution to the economy and continued deterioration of the world economy. Women's Bureaux and women's groups across the world have campaigned for proper recognition of women's work both as producers of goods and services, and as reproducers of human resources; and for women to have better access to the resources they require to improve their productivity. There has been some success in opening up new activities to women and increasing their incomes through special training programmes, through projects with women's components, or projects specifically directed to women. Much of the energy in developing countries has been directed towards women's projects, often in partnership with aid agency officials who have special responsibility for women and development. In market economy developed countries, much of the emphasis has been on introducing new equal opportunities legislation and enabling women to fight their cases through the courts.

But more important for women than either projects or legislation is the general condition of the economy. Low rates of growth of output, exports and employment undermine all these efforts. The 1980s have seen not just low rates of growth, but absolute declines in economic well-being in many areas.

It is therefore very important that policy makers concerned with the well-being of women should develop the capacity to analyse the implications of global economic deterioration for women, and to assist in the formulation of policies to cope with that deterioration.

Conceptual tools: gender bias in economic analysis

Macro-economic trends and policies are usually presented in a language which appears to be gender neutral: no specific mention is made of gender or of the sexual division of labour. The focus of
attention is on the gross national product; on imports, exports and the balance of payments; on efficiency and productivity.

However, this apparent gender-neutrality hides a deep gender bias in the analysis and policy formulation. The economy is defined principally in terms of marketed goods and services, with some allowance made for subsistence crop production in developing countries. The work of caring for children, of gathering fuel and water, processing food, preparing meals, keeping the house clean, nursing the sick, managing the household, is excluded from the economy. It is, of course, this work which largely falls on the shoulders of women, even in the most developed countries. By not considering this work or the resources it requires, macro-economic analysis and policy have a built-in conceptual bias against women.

**The economy and human resources**

This conceptual bias has important practical consequences. Macro-economic policy assumes that the process of raising children and caring for members of the labour force carried out by women unpaid will continue regardless of the way in which resources are re-allocated. Women’s unpaid labour is implicitly regarded as elastic — able to stretch to make up any shortfall in other resources.

Now it is true that the production of human resources is different from the production of any other kind of resource. It does not respond to economic signals in the same way: if the price of a crop falls far enough, it may be uprooted or left to rot; if there is insufficient demand for a manufactured good, the factory is closed and the machinery mothballed, sold off, or scrapped. But if the demand for labour falls, mothers do not ‘scrap’ their children or leave them to rot untended.

However, women’s unpaid labour is not infinitely elastic — breaking point may be reached, and women’s capacity to reproduce and maintain human resources may collapse. Even if breaking point is not reached, the success of the macro-economic policy in achieving its goals may be won at the cost of a longer and harder working day for many women. This cost will be invisible to the policy makers because it is unpaid time. But the cost will be revealed in statistics on the health and nutritional status of such women. What economists regard as ‘increased efficiency’ may instead be a shifting of the costs from the paid economy to the unpaid economy. For instance, a reduction in the time patients
spend in hospital may seem to be an increase in the efficiency of the hospital; the money costs of the hospital per patient fall but the unpaid work of women in the household rises. This is not a genuine increase in efficiency; it is simply a transfer of costs from the hospital to the home.

In considering policy responses to global economic deterioration, we need to ask: does this policy work by increasing the amount of unpaid labour women have to do?

**Adjustment and the 'magic of the market'**

Though the International Monetary Fund (IMF) stabilisation programmes focus primarily on cutting demand, and World Bank structural adjustment programmes focus on boosting supply and increasing productivity, they do share an emphasis on reducing the role of the state, and increasing the role of the market in resource allocation. Both institutions hold the view that a major reason for poor economic performance is distortions in resource allocation. These distortions are caused, they say, by government policy e.g. by over-expansion of the public sector and by the use of direct controls and subsidies. A major element of both types of programme is the removal of direct controls and subsidies and a reduction in the role of the public sector.

IMF stabilisation programmes typically consist of deflation, devaluation and decontrol. Public expenditure is cut, including expenditure on social services and food subsidies. Controls over imports and foreign exchange are loosened. The exchange rate may even be determined by a weekly auction of foreign exchange rather than being fixed by the central bank.

World Bank structural adjustment programmes improve the incentives for private sector producers (particularly of exports) through changes in prices, tariffs and other taxes, subsidies and interest rates; and by reducing the resources allocated to the public sector to make more resources available to the private sector.

The thinking that underlies IMF and World Bank adjustment programmes is shared by governments of some important donor countries. President Reagan spoke of the 'magic of the market' and the UK government has made some aid conditional upon agreement of structural adjustment programmes with the World Bank.
Women, the market and the state

The relation between women, the market and the state is complex. The state does not always operate in the interests of women, and the market does not always operate against the interests of women.

The state frequently plays a major role in perpetuating social, economic and ideological processes that subordinate women. It frequently treats women as dependents of men in legal and administrative procedures, and upholds the patriarchal family in which women do not have the same access to resources as men. Examples of public sector projects and programmes which ignore the needs of women as producers, and direct resources towards men, abound.

The market appears to treat women as individuals in their own right. If women can sell their labour or their products and get a cash income of their own, this lessens their economic dependence upon men, increases their economic value, and may increase their bargaining power within the household. Access to an income of their own tends to be highly valued by women, not only for what it buys, but also for the greater dignity it brings.

However, while women have to carry the double burden of unpaid work in the home, as well as paid work producing goods and services, they are unable to compete with men on equal terms. Equal pay and equal opportunities legislation, and removing the ‘traditional’ barriers to women working outside the home, cannot by themselves free women from domestic burdens and expectations. Access to markets has benefits for women, but the benefits are always limited because raising children and caring for family members is structured by unequal gender relations, and cannot be directly and immediately responsive to market signals.

Women with high incomes can reduce their relative disadvantage in the market by buying substitutes for their unpaid work — employing cleaners, maids, nannies and cooks — but this still leaves them with the responsibility for household management.

If most women are to gain from access to markets, they also need access to public sector services, such as water supplies, electricity, waste disposal facilities, public transport, health care and education, to lighten the burden of their unpaid work and enable them to acquire the skills they need to enter the market.

This suggests that most women have an interest not so much in reducing the role of the state and increasing the role of the market,
as in restructuring both the public sector and the private sector to make them more responsive to women’s needs as producers and reproducers.

It is necessary to distinguish different activities within both the public sector and the private sector. In the public sector, we need to distinguish between social services; transport and energy; police, the legal system and armed forces; and state-owned factories, farms and marketing and distribution facilities — often called parastatals. Then within each category we need to examine exactly what is being supplied (primary health care or open heart surgery, for example) and to identify who is benefiting from these activities. We need to examine the relationship between the producers and the users of public sector goods and services. How responsive are producers to the needs of users? What mechanisms are there for users to influence the allocation of resources in the public sector? The structural adjustment required in the public sector may not be a reduction in expenditure, but a change in priorities. The mobilisation and organisation of women who use public sector services may be a way to achieve this.

The private sector needs separating into the formal and the informal sector; foreign and locally owned firms; large and small; those which employ wage labour and family labour; joint-stock companies and co-operatives; farming, trading and manufacturing; activities directed by women and activities directed by men. If greater reliance is to be placed on private enterprise — we need to ask whose enterprise? The enterprise of the woman farming or trading on her own account, or the enterprise of agribusiness and merchants with monopoly power? The enterprise of a women’s co-operative or the enterprise of a multinational corporation? The mobilisation of women’s enterprise to provide a decent income and a basis for sustained economic growth requires support from the state, particularly in the provision of credit and training, and in services that free women from domestic duties.

The impact of adjustment on women: a framework for analysis

The process of adjustment affects households in the following ways:

changes in incomes, through changes in wages and the level of employment for employees, and through changes in product
prices and product demand for the self-employed;
changes in prices of important purchases, especially food;
changes in the levels and composition of public expenditure, particularly those in the social sector, including possible introduction or increase of user charges for services;
changes in working conditions, through changes in hours of work, intensity of work, job security, fringe benefits and legal status; this applies to unpaid work as well as paid work.

These changes will not affect all households in the same way: some will lose and some will gain. Neither will these changes affect all members of households in the same way. Distribution of resources within households, as well as between households, must be taken into account. When households have to reduce food consumption because of rising prices and falling incomes, available evidence suggests it is very likely that the consumption of women and girls will be reduced by more than that of men and boys. If charges are introduced or increased for education and health services, there is a strong possibility that the access of girls will be reduced. When attempts are made to compensate for reductions in purchased resources by increases in unpaid labour (e.g. buying cheaper food that requires more preparation time), it is likely to be women who bear the main burden.

Available research shows that neither joint decision making nor equal sharing of resources within households is common. The standard of living of wives can be lower than that of husbands; and that of girls lower than boys. Nevertheless, it is generally women who have the responsibility for seeing that members of the household are fed, clothed and cared for, and their obligation to meet children's needs is generally regarded as stronger than men's. Men's obligation is limited to providing some of the cash or productive assets required. Women, then, must meet their families' needs by 'stretching' the husband's cash contribution with 'good housekeeping', or by earning a wage income, or producing food or clothing themselves, or engaging in barter and petty trade. It is women who must devise survival strategies when household incomes fall and prices rise.

Changes in income

Many adjustment programmes include limitations or complete
Structural adjustment

freezes on wage and salary rises in the public sector. Employment in the public sector may be frozen or reduced. Because urban formal sector employees are likely to face adverse changes in their incomes there will be a knock-on effect in the informal sector which supplies goods and services to formal sector employees.

Women public sector employees will be adversely affected. The public sector, rather than the private sector, has hitherto provided most of the professional and managerial urban jobs for women, often with a high degree of security. The best career opportunities for educated women in many countries have been in the public sector. This is often no longer the case: for example, in Jamaica, nurses and teachers are leaving the public sector because of the low levels of pay. Professional women remaining in the public service have been driven to doing extra jobs at night in the informal sector, such as running snack shops.

One category of employment that has expanded for women in some countries is work in export-oriented, labour intensive manufacturing. For example, Sri Lanka and Jamaica have set up Free Trade Zones (FTZs) as part of their adjustment strategy. These employ women in garment production. Wages for women in FTZs do tend to be higher than the average for comparable work outside the zones, so employers in the zones have no difficulty in recruiting women to work for them. But workers in FTZs tend to enjoy fewer rights than workers in the private formal sector factories outside the zones.

On the whole, the incomes and the quality of job opportunities available to women in urban areas have probably deteriorated, though more detailed information on this is required.

In the rural areas, some groups have enjoyed increases in incomes as a result of higher prices for producers of marketed crops. For instance, Ghana increased cocoa prices by more than seven times between 1982-3 and 1986-7 as part of a major World Bank supported programme to rehabilitate the cocoa industry. In most sub-Saharan countries, producer prices for food crops have risen substantially since 1980, mainly as a result of dismantling price controls. For instance, Zambia increased the official price of maize by 142 per cent between 1980-85. However, the impact of high prices for crops/livestock has been eroded by higher prices for consumer goods and production inputs that farmers buy. Many of these are imported and devaluation has raised their prices. Though
the price of maize rose in Zambia by 142 per cent, the real price rise for farmers, taking into account the rising prices of what they buy, was only about 6 per cent. So the incentive effect is much less than the change in nominal producer prices would suggest. The impact that such price increases have on women depends crucially on whether the extra cash income is controlled by the men or the women; and if it goes to the men, how do they dispose of it? Do they increase their personal consumption, or make part of it available to their wives for family consumption?

The benefit from higher crop prices also depends on the producers' capacity to increase output. While there is evidence that rural producers do switch from one crop to another in response to changing relative prices, it is far less clear that they will be able to increase output of a wide range of crops in response to a general increase in crop prices. For this depends on their ability to mobilise more of the inputs required — in particular fertiliser, credit, and labour. Women's double burden of crop production and domestic work leaves little spare time. There are many time-budget studies showing the long working day of women farmers. Moreover, other elements of structural adjustment programmes may also make increasing demands on women's time; cutbacks in the public provision of rural health services, education and water supplies, for instance. There is a limit to the extent that women can switch time from human resource production and maintenance to crop production. Thus the provision of public services which reduce the time women must spend in domestic duties is essential in affecting their ability to respond to higher crop prices with higher output.

Even if they do have some 'spare capacity', women may be reluctant to increase their workload because they are unlikely to enjoy the proceeds of extra work. Production of cash crops is frequently under the management of men who then control the resulting proceeds. In such cases, women may refuse to spend extra time weeding and harvesting in their husbands' fields.

The constraints on women's time can also be lifted by making each hour more productive, but that, too, requires public provision, particularly of extension services and credit.

Agricultural labourers will not benefit directly from increased crop prices, though they may benefit if there is an expansion of output which may create more employment. For them, as for urban workers, increased food crop prices will increase their cost of living.
It must also be remembered that many poor farmers are forced to sell their food crops just after harvest to repay debts, and they, too, have to purchase food for the rest of the year.

Changes in prices of consumer goods

Increased food prices for consumers are major features of adjustment programmes. Where food imports are high, devaluation, which increases the price of imports, will have a substantial impact on food prices. Removal of food subsidies is also a major feature of adjustment programmes. It is advocated as a major contribution to reducing public expenditure. In Sri Lanka, following the removal of food subsidies, prices rose by 158 per cent for rice, 386 per cent for wheat flour, 331 per cent for bread and 345 per cent for milk powder in the period 1977-84. In Zambia, the price of maize meal, the main consumer staple, was raised in one step by 50 per cent in 1985, as the first stage in removing the subsidy.

If wages are frozen while food prices (and prices of other essential items, such as kerosene) are rising, then real incomes will fall. Urban wage earners in Tanzania faced a 50 per cent fall in real income between 1980 and 1984, while in Ghana over the same period, the fall was 40 per cent.

UNICEF studies reveal a widespread deterioration in the nutritional status of children and pregnant and lactating mothers in both rural and urban areas in countries with IMF stabilisation and World Bank structural adjustment programmes. Mothers are unable to buy enough food of the right type to feed the whole family, and in many cases priority is given to adult males.

Changes in levels and composition of public expenditure

Public expenditure on social services has fallen in many developing countries. For instance, in Jamaica, social services expenditure fell by 44 per cent in real terms between 1981-83 and 1985-86. Some schools have been closed and services offered by some hospitals and health centres downgraded. Charges have been introduced for health services, even for the low paid and unemployed. In Nigeria, state governments have imposed fees on both primary and secondary education, and the enrolment rate among poor children has fallen drastically.

Expenditure cuts have often hit recurrent expenditure harder
than capital expenditure, leaving schools short of books, paper and pens and hospitals short of bandages and drugs, even while new hospitals and school buildings have gone ahead. Expenditure cuts have also often hit rural services harder than urban services.

In Sri Lanka, a serious deterioration in the delivery of health care has been noted. Large investments in new and more sophisticated hospitals and equipment have gone ahead while rural services and preventive medicine have remained short of resources. Private practice by doctors employed in the Health Service has been introduced, and studies have found that private patients get preferential access to health service facilities. Privatisation of social services has probably gone furthest in Chile. For example, educational coupons have replaced state-sponsored education, but at a time of recession poorer households have endeavoured to survive by cashing in their coupons, rather than spending them on schooling. Literacy levels have fallen.

One item of public expenditure has been growing, however, and has reached very high levels in many parts of Latin America, the Caribbean and sub-Saharan Africa. This is the payment of interest and servicing of foreign debt. In Jamaica, this accounted for no less than 42 per cent of total budgeted recurrent expenditure in 1985-86.

Changes in working conditions

It is very likely that for many women, adjustment programmes mean longer hours of work, both paid work and unpaid. Maintaining a household on reduced resources takes more time — hunting for bargains, setting up informal exchange networks with neighbours and kin, making and mending at home rather than buying, etc. Increasing agricultural output takes more time. Making a living in the informal sector in conditions of falling demand takes more time, yet the involvement of urban women in this sector is likely to grow.

However, there is a difference between survival strategies and activities that can form the basis for sustained growth and development both on a personal and a national level. There is a trend towards the casualisation of the work of urban women, not just in the informal sectors of cities in developing countries, but also in developed market economies, where outworking at home is growing. The distinction between the formal sector and the informal sector is being eroded. Women’s jobs in the formal sector are being made more
‘flexible’ — which frequently means loss of security, loss of fringe benefits such as sick pay, pensions and maternity leave, and increasing intensity of work. Free Trade Zones are one example of this trend. The contracting out of some public sector activities in some countries is another. Increased ‘efficiency’ in the public sector may be bought at the cost of deteriorating working conditions for women.

The overall impact on women: information priorities

Given the present availability of information, it is not possible to present a definitive picture. In many cases, adjustment seems to have led to a redistribution of real income away from urban areas and towards rural areas. It is estimated that in Tanzania, between 1980 and 1984, there was a 5 per cent increase in real farm incomes, while urban wage earners suffered a 50 per cent fall in real incomes. In Ghana, over the same period, farm incomes stagnated, while urban real incomes fell by 40 per cent. Rural incomes have increased relative to urban incomes in Brazil, Chile and Mexico. However, there are still large numbers of rural people living in abject poverty. None of these general estimates looks at the effects within households.

It should be a priority to monitor the impact of adjustment on the following groups of women:

- women in low-income urban and rural households;
- women employed in the public sector;
- women farmers.

Some work is under way on the impact of adjustment on the poor (notably that by UNICEF on the impact on children). It is necessary to supplement this with specific monitoring of intra-household resource allocation processes. The resources of local research institutes and universities could be called upon to conduct sample surveys of how exactly, within the household, women get access to the inputs they require for their work of raising children and caring for other family members.

Statistics should be compiled from information supplied by the public sector on the employment of women in the public sector; levels of pay; working conditions; turnover, etc. Co-operation with public sector trade unions may be fruitful in helping to monitor the extent to which conditions have deteriorated. This group of women is undoubtedly still likely to be much better off than women in low-
income households, but deterioration in the major source of modern careers for women is still a matter of concern.

The position of women farmers needs monitoring to see to what extent their incentives have improved, and to what extent they are in a position to respond to better incentives. These women are the group who seem to have some chance of benefiting from adjustment, and it is vital to identify any barriers to those benefits being realised.

**Modifying the adjustment process: policy objectives**

Considerable criticisms have already been voiced about the costs of adjustment strategies. It is argued that they bear most heavily on the poor and erode the human resource base of the economy. UNICEF has called for 'Adjustment with a Human Face'; the Overseas Development Institute in London has called for 'Adjustment with Equity'. The World Bank has indicated that structural adjustment must include policies for 'strengthening the human resource base'.

There is scope for Women's Bureaux to participate in this dialogue about modifying the adjustment process. One way would be to join their voices to those of organisations like UNICEF who are arguing for protecting the vulnerable during the adjustment process. There is, however, the disadvantage that this would focus attention mainly on women as victims and runs the danger of deteriorating into paternalism. It also tends to focus only on women in low-income households. It focuses mainly on the detrimental impact of adjustment on women, and not on the contribution that women can make to effective adjustment.

An emphasis on women as producers of goods and services and as reproducers and maintainers of human resources may prove more effective. A dialogue with the World Bank could be opened which emphasises that a prime need for strengthening the human resource base is more time for women, and more control over resources for women. Policy reform and structural changes need to encompass not just relations between public sector and private sector control of resources, but between women's control and men's control of resources.

An overarching objective would be to give the 'Adjustment with Equity' objective a 'gender' content. The objective would then be that poor women should not become worse off than other sections
of the population in absolute terms; and that better off women (including farmers and public sector employees) should not become worse off than men in comparable social groups. The indicators of well-being should include not just income, but also total hours of work (paid and unpaid) and health and nutritional status. This might be called an 'Adjustment with Gender Equity' objective.

Modifying the adjustment process: areas of intervention

The achievement of Adjustment with Gender Equity requires greater selectivity in public expenditure cuts, a restructuring of public sector activities, and a greater emphasis on self-reliant food production.

It also requires more finance from donors, to permit a slower pace of adjustment; and provision of appropriate technical assistance and training.

While reductions in public expenditure may be unavoidable, there is scope for much greater selectivity in the cuts. Before reducing food subsidies, other subsidies could be cut (for example, subsidies to national airlines). Food subsidies could be redesigned to increase the benefits to poorer women by removing subsidies on foods consumed mainly by middle and higher income families, and concentrating them on food consumed mainly by poorer families. Or poor families could be cushioned by a food stamp scheme in which they are issued special stamps (or vouchers) which can be exchanged in the shops for food (as has happened in Jamaica and Sri Lanka) though food stamps are not without problems. Direct feeding programmes for children and mothers in poor districts may be the most appropriate measure. Such a programme, supported by food aid, now exists in Jamaica.

Social expenditure on education, health and sanitation, can be given higher priority than prestige urban projects, or the building of new factories that will be unable to operate anywhere near full capacity because of lack of imports. Within social expenditure, there needs to be restructuring to direct services to the poor. UNICEF proposes an emphasis on primary health care, based on rural and urban community clinics, in preference to expensive urban hospitals. It recommends training of more para-medics and traditional midwives in preference to specialised doctors. Such restructuring could also preserve, or even expand, women's
employment opportunities in the public sector, since while specialised doctors are more likely to be men, para-medics may well be women. Restructuring could be linked to incentives for public sector employers to work in rural areas or poor urban districts: jobs in difficult or unattractive environments could be exempted from wage freezes or given special allowances.

If user changes are introduced for social services, these could be differentiated. Fees for university students could be introduced rather than fees for primary schools; or greater increases in charges for electricity, water and sanitation services introduced for those living in wealthier urban areas than for those in low-income areas.

The danger is that public expenditure cuts are determined by administrative ease and the power of organised interest groups. But an expenditure cutting exercise is an opportunity to re-order the priorities of the public sector. A Women's Bureau can intervene in this by requesting statements of impact of the proposed cuts on women, and by suggesting a different pattern of cuts, if appropriate, and a restructuring of the public sector to meet women's needs more effectively.

Adjustment is not just about public expenditure cuts and re-organising the public sector. It is also about increasing productivity and promoting growth. World Bank structural adjustment programmes emphasise increasing export crop production, especially through reducing the gap between the price farmers get and the world market price.

Though increasing export crop production may increase foreign exchange earnings when undertaken by one country facing given world market prices, it is questionable whether such a policy is valid when applied uniformly across a large number of developing countries. Since demand for most export crops is growing only very slowly, increased export volume by several countries is likely to depress world market prices and reduce the benefits of increased production. World market prices for primary products, relative to manufactures, are now at their lowest level in real terms since the 1930s.

Expansion of export crop production has not historically benefited women very much, and has often made their position worse. Typically, such crops have been grown under the control of men. Women have been required to work in the fields planting, weeding and harvesting them, but the income accruing from the
sale of such crops has been under the control of their husbands. Women have frequently lost access to better land when it was diverted from subsistence crop production under their control to export crop production under men's control. Export crops have always been allocated better seeds, fertilisers, credit and extension services — and that has meant discrimination against women.

Many governments have been sceptical of World Bank arguments, and have argued that local food production for the local market is a less risky growth strategy. However, many of them are attracted to strategies of large scale irrigated and mechanised food production, highly dependent on agribusiness and imported inputs. The results of many of these schemes have been disappointing and the costs substantially underestimated. One of the reasons for the disappointment has been a lack of recognition of the crucial role of women farmers in food production. What is needed is not simply an emphasis on food production, but an emphasis on self-reliant food production. This means increasing the productivity of small-scale women farmers who do not rely so much on imports, and who grow foods which are staples for poorer groups, such as cassava, as well as food grains such as maize and rice. There are a whole host of critical policy reforms required here to increase the productivity of women farmers. Increasing real crop prices is a necessary condition but it is by no means a sufficient condition. It is essential that more inputs and support services are directed to women farmers, and that strategies are devised for restructuring gender relations to end discrimination against women farmers. This is necessary not only to enable women to reap some gains from the adjustment process, but also to assure an effective adjustment process with some real prospects of sustained growth.


THE
Strategic SILENCE

GENDER
AND
ECONOMIC POLICY

"Insights in this book into the gendered nature of macroeconomic policy will be eye-openers."

- JULIE A NELSON, UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, DAVIS
Economists traditionally divide economics into a supply side and a demand side, and look at the functioning of economies at the micro-level of supply and demand interactions between individual economic agents, and at the macro-level of aggregate supply and demand. More recently, some economists have explicitly introduced into the analysis a third level, the meso, between the macro and the micro. Meso analysis concerns itself with the structures that mediate between individuals and the economy considered as a whole, by providing economic signals, costs and benefits, and typically focuses on markets, private-sector firms and public-sector services.

This chapter examines how concepts of the micro, the macro and the meso are used by orthodox and critical economists in discussions of economic policy reform; and the extent to which these concepts recognize gender. We also consider some feminist strategies for enabling economic analysis at these three levels to contribute towards the empowerment of women, rather than the perpetuation of their subordination.

**The advocacy of economic policy reform: micro, macro and meso in the neo-classical perspective**

The dominant analysis of economic policy reform is based on neo-classical economics. From this perspective there is no inherent reason why an economy based on voluntary contracts between individuals should experience any persistent problems. Such an economy should be self-regulating, in the sense that supply and demand are quickly brought into equality at micro- and macro-levels through the mediating structure of the market mechanism (that is, the economy tends towards general equilibrium). Such an economy should also be efficient, in the specific sense that it results in outcomes where no one can be made
better off without someone else being made worse off (that is, the economy tends towards Pareto optimality). Finally, the economy should also experience dynamic development, as voluntary contracts between individuals mediated by the market mechanism supposedly encourage initiative and innovation, and the best use of scarce resources.

In the neo-classical paradigm, micro-, meso- and macro-levels are fully integrated, and simply represent pictures of the economy at varying levels of detail. The macro-level looks at the economy in terms of total marketed output (domestic private-sector and public-sector production plus imports) and total expenditure (consumption plus private investment plus government expenditure plus exports). These aggregates are understood as a coherent result of the activities of millions of individuals (micro-level) integrated by the institutions of the meso-level. The private-sector institutions operating at the meso-level, the institutions of the market mechanism and the firm, are understood as the outcome of voluntary contracts by individuals who wish to create institutions to economize on the costs of conducting transactions (see Hodgson, 1988 for a critical explanation). What is economically rational at the individual level also appears to be economically rational at the level of society as a whole.

If things are not working out like this, and there are problems of budget and balance-of-payments deficits, inflation and unemployment, then the main problem is argued to lie in the wrong sort of public policies at macro- and meso-levels. Public policy is conceptualized as an intervention in the economy from the outside, an intervention made not by individuals but by the state, acting not via voluntary contracts but by legislative commands. The wrong sort of public policy leads to imbalances at the macro-level between aggregate supply and demand brought about by the wrong sort of fiscal and monetary policy; by giving individuals the wrong sort of economic signals at the meso-level it leads to imbalances at the micro-level between supply and demand for particular goods and services. This creates inefficiency and undermines dynamic development. The wrong sort of public policy also prevents an economy being able to adapt easily to change, particularly to 'external shocks' coming from the international economy, such as rises in interest rates, falls in the terms of trade, and falls in inflows of finance.

Changes therefore need to be made in state intervention at macro- and meso-levels. Typically, the reforms recommended include cutbacks in aggregate public expenditure and the money supply, to reduce aggregate demand and a whole series of changes at the meso-level, to remove so-called 'distortions' in the economic signals transmitted to individuals and the economic costs and benefits they enjoy. These will include changes in prices (for instance via devaluation, trade liberalization, and
withdrawal of subsidies) and in infrastructural services (such as transport, training, education and health services).

The state tends to be conceptualized as absent from the micro-level, which is seen as a private sphere of economic individuals. However, the very ability of a person to function as an economic individual — that is, an individual able to enter into voluntary contracts to exchange goods and services — is constituted by the state. A gender-aware perspective is much more likely to recognize this, because it will be concerned with economic woman as well as economic man. The ability of women to enter into economic contracts is constrained by the way that state legislation typically construes women as less than full citizens. A key example of this in the context of economic policy reform in many developing countries is the way in which the ability of women to enter into credit contracts is constrained by women’s lack of rights to family assets. All too often, women cannot sign contracts in their own right and require a male guarantor (father, brother, husband). There is no such thing as a purely private level of the economy.

A related key issue in economic policy reform, but one which is often neglected, is how the reforms change the rights enjoyed by individuals. Where this is considered, it tends to be in terms of an enhancement of individual property rights brought about by privatization. But privatization typically also reduces individual social rights of employees, and certainly reduces the collective rights of the citizens over economic assets. Individual social rights can also be reduced in the course of economic policy reform by shifts of employment from the ‘formal’ to the ‘informal’ sector; by erosion of customary use rights to land by commercialization of land; and by direct legislative change to withdraw or restructure state-provided services and benefits and to abolish employee rights, such as minimum-wage legislation and the right to strike (see Standing, 1989, and Elson, 1991 for a discussion of this in relation to labour markets). Removal of rights is very often undertaken in the name of removing ‘distortions’ from markets. However, unequal distribution of wealth and income is not considered a ‘distortion’, and reduction of the property rights of the rich and powerful does not tend to feature on the current agendas of economic policy reform. Rather, it is the poor and weak who are much more likely to find that their social rights are regarded as ‘distortions’.

The family, one might think, should logically be regarded as belonging to the meso-level — it is, after all, a social institution that brings people together and mediates between them. In economic analysis, however, the family is usually assigned to the micro-level. Indeed, neoclassical analysis treats the family as if it were an individual: in technical terms it is assumed that the family has a joint utility function, and that
an altruistic head of household makes decisions on behalf of the family that maximize the joint activity of its members. This means that, provided the ‘right’ economic signals reach a family via state agencies, markets and firms, the division of labour and distribution of income within a family is bound to be ‘optimal’, simply reflecting the different tastes and skills of family members. (This is known in the literature as the ‘new household economics’; for critical discussion, see Evans, 1989, and Folbre, 1986.)

At the micro-level, the neo-classical approach can accommodate gender difference, and even some degree of gender inequality. Economic agents can easily be characterized as ‘male’ or ‘female’, in a way that macro-economic aggregates cannot. But gender differentiation must be conceptualized as a matter of differences in the preferences and resource endowments (including skills) of individuals, if the fundamental neo-classical characterization of human beings as utility maximizers with well-defined choice sets and preference orderings is to be preserved. The key problem for women is then judged to be discrimination against them, in a variety of transactions, by other economic agents. But discrimination is judged to be in itself generally commercially irrational, leading to lower monetary returns for the discriminating agent. Thus commercialization is seen as generally acting in ways advantageous to women by undermining prejudice.4 From this point of view, economic policy reforms which strengthen commercialization and the profit motive are seen as likely to work to women’s advantage.

At the meso- and macro-levels, neo-classical analysis excludes gender. Mediating structures and monetary aggregates cannot be identified as ‘male’ or ‘female’, and so gender analysis is seen as out of place. Indeed, meso institutions and macro-policy instruments tend to be seen as ‘gender neutral’ (see also Elson, 1991). If these institutions and instruments operate in ways that are detrimental to women, then this is fundamentally due to the characteristics of individuals at the micro-level, and in particular to prejudice against women. The appropriate policy response is equal-opportunities legislation, education to combat prejudice, and ‘safety nets’ for women denied gainful employment – not a restructuring of meso institutions and a rethinking of macro-policy reforms. Gender has a place only at the micro-level, in the analysis of the responses of individuals to the reforms.

The critique of economic policy reform: micro, macro and meso in the perspectives of critical economics

There is a variety of economic analyses critical of current forms of economic policy reform, drawing on Keynesian, Kaleckian, structuralist
and Marxist perspectives. Critical perspectives stress that what is rational for the individual economic agent is not necessarily rational for the system as a whole. The macro-level of the economy has a life of its own and is not simply an aggregation which synthesizes the preferences and endowments of the individuals who make up the economy. The reason it has a life of its own is that money and the market mechanism do not simply integrate the actions of many individuals, in the way that general equilibrium theory supposes. Money and the market mechanism also disintegrate, fragment and segment individual actions. In particular, there is no guarantee that supply and demand for goods will be brought into line by price changes, with money acting simply as a medium of exchange. If agents think prices will change in the future, it makes sense for them to hold on to money itself, rather than use it to buy something right now (see Bhaduri, 1986 for further explanation).

Once this is taken into account, the economy can be seen as something with the potential to generate its own problems, such as unemployment, inflation, debt, and declining productivity. Economic crisis is not just the result of the wrong policies and 'external shocks'. Indeed, the 'external shocks' themselves can be seen as resulting from inherent dysfunctions of the international economy. A corollary of this is that the macro-level should not just be analysed on a country-by-country basis. It should be analysed at a global, as well as a national level. Policy reform should extend to the international system of trade and payments (see Helleiner, 1992).

Critical perspectives also challenge the idea that the institutions of the firm and the market mechanism can simply be derived from the utility-maximizing decisions of individuals (argued in depth by Hodgson, 1988). One strand of analysis emphasizes that these institutions embody co-operative conflicts, that is, situations in which individuals do stand to make gains from co-operating (for example, producing something together on the basis of a wage contract) but have different and conflicting interests in the distribution of the benefits (see also Drèze and Sen, 1989). Partly as a way of coping with this, meso-institutions embody social norms and networks which themselves shape the behaviour of individuals and the ideas they have about what it is appropriate to want and to do. Without such social norms market economies could not function, because voluntary contracts between individuals are always incomplete. This is because life is radically uncertain, and try as we might to cover all contingencies, the unexpected is always liable to crop up. The outcome will depend on the degree to which people feel bound to act in certain ways even though there is not a clause in the contract to cover it, on what labour market analysts call 'custom and practice', on shared general understandings and mutual trust (see Hodgson, 1988).
Similar sorts of analysis have also been extended to the family, which has been seen as a social institution that is an area of co-operative conflict in which behaviour is constrained by social norms. In the work of some economists the analysis also extends to calling into question the fundamental characterization of human beings as economic agents. It may be argued that the experience of subordination makes people less likely to have a well-defined preference function. The experience of subordination inclines people to shape their preferences to what is available, rather than reach out for what they want. Social norms constrain the choices that people make about the division of labour in the family. A notable example of this type of analysis of the family may be found in Sen, 1990.

This perspective easily lends itself to an analysis of gender inequality at the micro-level that is much more critical than that offered by the neo-classical paradigm. Rather than the gender division of labour and income in the family being seen as the optimal outcome of free choices, it may be seen as the profoundly unequal accommodation reached between individuals who occupy very different social positions with very different degrees of social power. Individuals may be conceptualized not just as biologically male and female but as socially gendered (as in Sen, 1990). Most critical economics, however, shares with neo-classical economics a lack of gender analysis at the meso- and macro-levels. Although individuals are conceptualized as gendered in the critical economics of the family, markets and firms are not generally conceptualized as gendered in a comparable way, though they may operate in ways that are particularly constraining and disadvantageous to women. At the macro-level, gender is absent altogether: the discourse is all about monetary aggregates. Many critical economists are puzzled about how gender analysis can be introduced at a level of economic analysis which is completely impersonal. However, feminist critical economics has begun to show us how we can demonstrate that not only is the personal political, the impersonal is political too!

Feminist critical economics and the critique of economic policy reform

Feminist critical economics argues that the operation of economic reform at micro-, meso- and macro-levels is male-biased, serving to perpetuate women's relative disadvantage, even though the forms of that disadvantage vary between different groups of women and are disrupted and change in the course of policy reform. Most economic theory, whether orthodox or critical, is also male-biased, even though it appears to be gender-neutral. The male bias arises because theory fails
to take adequate account of the inequality between women as a gender and men as a gender. Neo-classical economics is fundamentally disabled from doing this because of its ‘choice-theoretic’ framework of analysis. Critical economics opens up the possibility of theory which is not male-biased, and of economic policy reforms which are not male-biased, because it does not regard micro-, meso- and macro-levels of the economy as integrated and regulated by a choice-theoretic logic. Feminist critical economics starts from these possibilities.6

Most feminist critical work to date has concentrated on the micro-level. The feminist critique of economic policy reform has concentrated on investigating the impact of economic policy reform at the level of the family and the individual, utilizing a bargaining-based critical theory of the family, and arguing that the burdens placed on poor rural and poor urban women are incommensurate with any benefits they may possibly obtain (see, for example, Beneria and Feldman, 1992).

It is necessary to go beyond this and to analyse how male bias is constituted at the meso- and macro-levels, at the level of mediating institutions and monetary aggregates. One way of doing this is to investigate how social institutions and monetary relationships which are not themselves intrinsically gendered nevertheless become bearers of gender.7 The family is an intrinsically gendered institution, in that the conjugal relation that constitutes it is gender ascriptive. Marriage is a social relation between a person of the male and a person of the female gender. Kin relations are gender ascriptive – the discourse of kin indicates the gender of the persons referred to (sister, brother, nephew, niece, grandmother, grandfather).

Commercial relations between buyer and seller, and employer and employee, are not intrinsically gendered in this way. Neither are the relations between users and providers of public services. But although they are not gender ascriptive, these relations are bearers of gender, in the sense that they are permeated through and through by gender in their institutional structure. As one study of Brazilian factories concluded, ‘the supposedly objective economic laws of market competition work through and within “gendered structures”’ (Humphrey, 1985: 219).

At the meso-level, the operation of markets, firms, and public-sector agencies is gendered via the social norms and networks which are functional to the smooth operation of those institutions. Social cohesion between men is enhanced by the exclusion of women. Social discipline in hierarchical organizations is enhanced by the systematic subordination of women. Critical institutional economics has tended to stress the social benefits of customs which fill the gaps in incomplete contracts, in order to stress that economics cannot be understood simply in terms of contracts and cash nexuses. But although such customs may
be beneficial in allowing economies to continue to function, the benefits tend to be very unequally distributed. Shared social understandings and mutual trust tend to be expressions of the hegemony of the powerful. Thus, although women may formally be able to participate in markets, they tend to find themselves excluded from the traditional business–social networks, where vital exchanges of information occur and ‘goodwill’ is built up. Similarly, although women may formally be able to participate in paid employment in the private sector, they tend to find themselves excluded from the teams of skilled and professional workers who obtain the higher incomes.

Economic policy reform often involves the emergence of new meso-level institutions. Rolling back the state means the emergence of new markets and new firms. Reforming public-sector services means the emergence of new types of public-sector agency. Unless explicit thought is given to the design of these new institutions, they will tend to instigate new instances of male bias. Women will be excluded from or disadvantaged in their operations. The shared social understandings on which they rest will be expressive of male hegemony. Even though the policy reforms may not be male-biased by design, they will be male-biased by omission.

At the meso-level, therefore, we can introduce gender analysis via an examination of how the social norms and networks which are needed for the successful operation of both commercial and public-service institutions are bearers of gender.

At the macro-level the crucial thing to consider is the role of money. Money mobilizes human effort, via prices and wages; and the output of effort that it mobilizes gets counted in the gross national product, and in other monetary aggregates such as savings, investment, public expenditure, public revenue, imports and exports. But money’s mobilizing power is incomplete. It is not able to mobilize directly all the resources that go into reproducing and maintaining the capacity for effort (labour-power) in any economy which is based on wage labour rather than slave labour. The ability of money to mobilize labour power for ‘productive work’ depends on the operation of some non-monetary set of social relations to mobilize labour power for ‘reproductive work’. These non-monetary social relations are subordinate to money in the sense that they cannot function and sustain themselves without an input of money; and they are reshaped in response to the power of money. Nevertheless, neither can the monetary economy sustain itself without an input of unpaid labour, an input shaped by the structure of gender relations. Male bias in gender relations means that the burdens of ‘reproductive work’ fall mainly on women. There is an interdependence between the economy of monetized production and the non-monetized
'reproductive' economy. One implication of this 'incompleteness' of monetary relations is that money and all its forms (prices, wages, rates of interest, and so on) become 'bearers of gender', expressing male bias both in quantitative terms (as in the differential between male and female wages) and in qualitative terms (as in the difference between paid work which is recognized as productive and unpaid work which is not). Money is not gender-neutral. Women's access to money is structured by gender relations. Such access tends to disrupt non-monetized gender relations, but it results in new forms of gender relations, in which male bias is expressed in monetary form.

The interdependence between the economy of monetized production and the non-monetized economy of 'reproductive work' is a delicate balance, constrained by the fact that basic needs must be met to sustain human beings and human communities, and that monetized production is subject to inherent dislocations and crises. History shows that this interdependence in market economies cannot be successfully regulated by individual contract and monetary relations. It has always required the mediation of the organizations of the state and the community, the provision of public services and community mutual aid, to avoid destitution and social breakdown, and to enhance human development in ways that promote increases in productivity in the monetized economy. It has always required ways of transferring resources that do not entail buying and selling, but operate through taxes and subsidies, gifts and grants.

A feminist critique of economic policy reform at the macro-level can be developed in terms of an analysis of how economic policy reform treats the interdependence between the 'productive economy' and the 'reproductive economy', between making a profit and meeting needs, between covering costs and sustaining human beings. Overwhelmingly, the design of economic policy reform focuses on the 'productive economy'. Macro-policy is generally designed to bring the level of aggregate monetized demand in line with the level of aggregate monetized supply, and to change the structure of monetized demand and supply so as to favour the production of goods which are internationally tradeable (tradeables) as compared with those that are only domestically tradeable, or which are supplied without charge by the public sector though their production is monetized through the public-sector budget (non-tradeables).

Macro-policy generally takes the 'reproductive economy' for granted, assuming it can continue to function adequately no matter how its relation to the 'productive economy' is disrupted. Current forms of economic policy reform that emphasize rolling back the state and liberating market forces give scant consideration to how this will impact
on the 'reproductive economy'. There tends to be an implicit assumption that the 'reproductive economy' can accommodate itself to whatever changes macro-policy introduces, especially to withdrawals of public services and subsidies and declines in public-sector employment and to rises in prices and taxes. Since it is women who undertake most of the work in the 'reproductive economy', and in the organization of community mutual aid, this is equivalent to assuming that there is an unlimited supply of unpaid female labour, able to compensate for any adverse changes resulting from macro-economic policy, so as to continue to meet the basic needs of their families and communities and sustain them as social organizations.

This is the point at which macro-economics is male-biased. It is not that macro-policy reforms are deliberately designed to favour men. Nor is the key issue that male-biased social traditions prevent women from taking advantage of macro-policy reforms that could work in their favour. The key issue is that macro-economics has a one-sided view of the macro-economy: it considers only the monetary aggregates of the 'productive economy'. It ignores the human resource aggregates of the 'reproductive economy', the indicators of population, health, nutrition, education, skills. This one-sided view of the macro-economy is a male-biased view, because the sexual division of labour means that women are largely responsible for the 'reproductive economy' as well as contributing a great deal of effort to the 'productive economy'. This male bias cannot, however, simply be changed by theoretical analysis and research. It requires changes in the way that national and international economies function, so that human development can take priority—a point made in UNDP, 1990. For this to happen, it is not enough to introduce targeted poverty-alleviation programmes ('safety nets'). Rather than bind the wounds after they have been inflicted, it is better not to inflict the wounds in the first place.

Conclusions

One way forward would be to campaign in order that all programmes for macro-economic policy reform include not only targets for monetary aggregates and policy instruments for achieving them but also targets for human development aggregates and policy instruments for delivering them. The relation between the policy instruments and the targets should be analysed in gender-disaggregated terms that recognize inputs of unpaid labour as well as paid labour. We need to ask what kinds of institutions will mediate between changes in fiscal and monetary policy and exchange-rate policy and individuals. What benefits and what costs are different groups of women and men expected to expe-
experience? Has the interdependence between the 'productive economy' and the 'reproductive economy' been taken into account? For instance, has the programme of expenditure cuts been designed in a way that will sustain or undermine the ability of women to respond to new price incentives in agriculture and job opportunities in export-oriented manufacturing, without jeopardizing human development targets?

The integration of human development targets into macro-economic policy reform programmes will also facilitate a view of human beings as ends, not just means, as persons with social rights, not factors of production with prices. Programmes for economic policy reform should be required to specify whose rights (distinguishing rights of men and of women) will be changed, and how. This way of introducing gender-awareness into the design of economic policy reforms is likely to benefit some men as well as women in so far as it introduces consideration of needs and rights into the process of reform alongside dollars and deficits. It combats a male bias in policy reforms which is far from being deliberately introduced by those who design reforms, but which is the result of oversights and omissions facilitated by a one-sided concern with monetary variables. It emphasizes that the key issue we need to address in attempts to engender macro-economic policy reform is not pre-existing customs and traditions which discriminate against women, but one-sided emphasis by reformers on paid work in the 'productive economy', and a neglect of unpaid work in the 'reproductive economy'.

Notes

1. This does not necessarily mean a situation where everyone's basic needs are satisfied. Pareto optimality is consistent with a very unequal, as well as a very equal, distribution of income.

2. Land reform is rarely included, even though there are strong reasons to suppose land reform would in many cases improve the efficiency of resource use.

3. I shall use the terms 'family' and 'household' in the rather unquestioning way that economists do. For discussion on the complexities of these social groupings and the problems of where to draw bounds, see IDS Bulletin, 1991.

4. Occasionally arguments are presented to suggest that discrimination may be 'rational' and will persist. See, for instance, Birdsall and Sabot, 1991: 10-11.

5. Feminist economics is only just beginning to define itself and make its presence felt in economics as a discipline. Some of the work of those who define themselves as feminist economists draws on the mainstream neo-classical paradigm; other feminist economists draw on a variety of critical approaches, a notable example being Folbre (forthcoming).

6. These issues are explored at greater length in Elson, 1993b (forthcoming) and Elson, 1993a (mimeo).
7. The distinction between social relations which are intrinsically gendered ('gender ascriptive') and those which are not, but which are nevertheless bearers of gender, is due to Whitehead, 1979.

8. As was found by a study of women entrepreneurs in Kenya, Ghana, Jamaica and the Solomon Islands (Commonwealth Secretariat, 1990).

9. This is established in fascinating detail in a study of technical workers in Britain by Cockburn, 1985.

10. For discussion of male bias in state agencies, see Agarwal, 1988.

11. The functioning of the 'reproductive economy' does, of course, require inputs of cash and public services. Indeed, these are vital in improving productivity in the development of human capacities.

12. This requirement goes beyond the prescriptions of the *Human Development Report* (1990), which surprisingly fails to recognize the vital role of unpaid labour as a producer of human capacities and one-sidedly emphasizes public-sector services.

13. A study of economic policy reform in Zambia found that cutbacks in health expenditure were hampering women farmers, who were having to spend more time looking after sick relatives, and less time farming (Evans and Young, 1988).

References


——— (1993a) 'Feminist Approaches to Development Economics' (mimeo). Department of Economics, University of Manchester.


A Guide to Gender-Analysis Frameworks

Candida March, Ines Smyth, and Maitrayee Mukhopadhyay
1.3 | Choosing a framework

The choice of a suitable framework will depend on the task in hand, the context, and the resources available. This section discusses some of the issues involved, and aims to achieve easy comparison and choice. There are many similarities between the different gender-analysis frameworks: for example, all of them recognise and emphasise the existence of reproductive work alongside productive activities. However, despite the many similarities, the gender frameworks differ in their scope and emphasis.

You do not necessarily need a formal framework in order to work well or innovatively on gender issues, to reduce gender inequality, or to support women’s empowerment. These frameworks are practical instruments, designed to help their users integrate a gender analysis into social research and planning. If you are committed to bringing about change, using a framework may take you one step further towards understanding the issues, facts, and relationships which affect women’s and men’s lives in a given society. Gender frameworks are useful if they help you think through your own way of planning and doing things; they will not be useful if you find them confusing, too bureaucratic, or restrictive. Also, it is essential to remember that no framework will do the work for you. It may help you plan the work that can be done to confront women’s subordination. Afterwards, the work must still be done.

Because a framework selects a limited number of factors as important, out of the huge numbers of issues that actually influence on any situation, each framework can only produce a crude model of reality. The selection of factors in any particular framework reflects a set of values and assumptions on the part of the author(s) of the framework. You yourself also have a set of values and assumptions. The interplay between these two sets of values and assumptions will determine which approaches and interventions you consider, and which you select.

You can also combine gender frameworks designed by others to create your own hybrid version, adapting different components of separate gender
frameworks and adding your own ideas. In fact, many of the frameworks included here have been developed in such a way, for example, the Harvard Framework and People-Oriented Planning (POP). Some frameworks use similar concepts, such as the Harvard Framework and the Moser Framework. Finally, some concepts which are part of a more complicated framework can actually be used by themselves in a fruitful way.

Comparing gender frameworks

When selecting a framework for your particular work, it is important to consider their main conceptual differences. In the following, we have listed the most useful questions to ask.

To what extent does the framework incorporate an analysis of social relations which goes beyond issues of gender?

Gender relations are context-specific; they vary considerably depending on the setting. They are shaped by other aspects of relationships between people, including economic status, race, ethnicity, or disability. All these social categories play a part in determining an individual's power and status in their particular community. So, for instance, in any village gender relations will differ between the richest and the poorest community members.

How flexible are different gender frameworks?

Given time, gender roles and relations change naturally in any community. Sometimes, specific events such as conflict or economic crisis cause certain aspects to change rapidly or dramatically. In order to identify opportunities and constraints for working towards greater gender equity, development workers must be able to recognise both actual and potential changes in gender relations. No gender analysis can be static; it must recognise that change over time will occur, and examine how this will affect the society, and thus the project or programme. The Harvard Framework and the Longwe Framework in particular do not automatically include time as a variable; in contrast, the People-Oriented Planning (POP) Framework and the Social Relations Approach are centred on change over time.

Does the framework mainly analyse social roles or social relations?

A gender analysis which focuses primarily on roles takes as its starting point the gender division of labour, and the gendered distribution of resources. A gender-roles analysis therefore sees a community mainly in terms of who does what, who has what, and so on. Alternatively, a gender analysis which focuses on relations sees a community mainly in terms of how members relate to each other: what bargains they make, what bargaining power they have, what they get in return; when they act with self-interest, when they act altruistically, and
so on. The Harvard Analytical Framework can be considered a method of gender-roles analysis, whereas the Social Relations Approach is a method of gender-relations analysis.

Both roles and relations are important. However, the analytical gender frameworks which focus on roles, such as the Harvard Framework, may encourage users to think of men and women as separate groups, as if they could be isolated from each other. If you use a roles analysis, you may end up dissecting gender relations rather than creating a picture of the different ways in which everything, conflicts as well as co-operation between men and women, fits together. Naila Kabeer (1992) points out that, in particular, a gender-roles analysis does not directly examine how power is structured and negotiated (see also the users' commentaries of the Harvard and POP frameworks on pp 48-54). In contrast, gender frameworks which focus on relations, such as the Social Relations Approach, attempt to reverse this trend by first of all analysing the relationship between people: relationships of power related to class, race, age, and so on, and, of course, gender.

A fairly crude analogy of the difference between these two approaches is that of a machine. An analysis which focuses on roles takes the machine to pieces, and describes the components and how each component works. An analysis which focuses on relations draws a map or a diagram of how all the components work in relation to each other. (The Moser Framework falls somewhere in between these. The concept of roles is central to Moser's analysis, but she emphasises that roles need to be seen clearly in the context of the relations between men and women.)

A fish-smoking project developed by UNIFEM in Guinea illustrates the dangers of using a gender-roles analysis only. A gender-roles analysis, similar to the Harvard Framework, revealed the following division of labour: men caught fish; women smoked and sold the fish. The project formed the women into groups and introduced new improved stoves.

However, the project failed, because no thought had been given to how the women got the fish. Women usually got their fish through special relationships of mutual advantage with specific fishermen. When the project started, the women were seen to be beneficiaries of external funds and the fishermen increased their prices. The women could not afford to buy at the increased prices, either as individuals or as groups.

A working system had been disrupted and no viable alternative put in its stead. A relations analysis would have looked closely at the relationships between the men and the women and tried to start from there.5

*How much does each framework include and value intangible, as well as tangible, resources?*

Intangible resources include political or social resources: rights and claims on people; friendships; membership of networks; skills; experience of working in
the public sphere; self-confidence and credibility; status and respect; leadership qualities; and, often crucially for women, time. If people have very few tangible resources such as land or income, intangible resources are especially important in shaping their lives. The extent to which the different gender frameworks include and value intangible resources varies, but the Harvard Framework has a particularly narrow definition of resources.

**What is the ultimate goal of each framework? Is it focusing on efficiency or empowerment?**

Gender-analysis frameworks concentrate on certain factors in women’s and men’s lives. The chosen focus reflects a set of values and assumptions on the part of the framework’s designers. When you use a framework, these values and assumptions will ultimately influence the type of development interventions you select. It is important, therefore, to be aware, as far as possible, of the thinking behind the gender frameworks.

The efficiency approach to women in development (WID, see p 9) is based on the understanding that it is inefficient to ignore women in planning a distribution of resources. It aims to create projects and programmes with the most efficient allocation of resources. (This approach lies behind the Harvard and POP frameworks.) Although this approach seems very sensible, there are times when it can come into conflict with wider issues of justice or women’s empowerment. As a consequence, the efficiency approach has been heavily criticised as follows. First, it does not challenge existing gender relations, and so tends to lead to gender-neutral or gender-specific policies or interventions. Because resources, not power, are seen as central, it can also further tip the balance of power in the favour of men. For example, further resources will be allocated to men if it is judged efficient, even if this is to the detriment of women. Similarly, if it does not make a project more efficient to involve women then, following the logic of the efficiency argument you should not do so, and ignore issues of justice. This approach can be particularly problematic in countries where women are not involved in production outside the house (see Harvard and POP commentaries on pp 48-54). But gender relations are complex; there is more at stake than just economics.

Other gender frameworks explicitly have the aim of empowerment. These emphasise the transformation of gender relations, through women’s self-empowerment. ‘Because there are risks and costs incurred in any process of change, such change must be believed in, initiated, and directed by those whose interests it is meant to serve. Empowerment cannot be given, it must be self-generated. All that a gender transformatory policy can hope to do is to provide women with the enabling resources which will allow them to take greater control of their own lives, to determine what kinds of gender relations they would want to live within, and to devise the strategies and alliances to help them get there’ (Kabeer, 1994, 97).
(For more detail on different policy aims of gender-focused projects and programmes, see the Moser Framework, p. 55.)

Of course it is perfectly possible to use the gender frameworks (or parts of them) in ways which subvert their stated goals. For example, the Moser Framework could be used to design projects which address women's practical gender needs only, with no attempt to support women's self-empowerment.

**What is the role of the planner in the framework?**

Implicit in each framework is the planner's own view of his or her role, which can range from benign top-down planner to the planner as facilitator only. One gender framework – the Social Relations Approach – explicitly requires the planners to examine their own institutions and understand how the institutions bring biases into the planning process.

**Which gender frameworks can also be used in work addressing male gender identity and roles?**

In practice, gender-analysis frameworks do not tend to be used to plan interventions which target men or boys. However, a gender analysis should take place for all interventions, because they all have a potential impact on gender relations, and therefore on both sexes.

Furthermore, understanding gender relations is critical to understanding possibilities and constraints for working with men only. It is particularly critical to understand the 'gendered' nature of men in societies where gender roles are changing rapidly. There is an increasing awareness that gender identity cross-cuts other identity issues, including race and class, to affect men's and women's roles in the gender division of labour. Development organisations need to address these issues in the context of work with ex-combatants, in areas of mass male unemployment, in anti-violence projects, among migrant workers, and so on.

Most of the gender frameworks – except the Women's Empowerment (Longwe) Framework – do look at the gender roles and relations of both women and men, and so could be used for projects which target men. The Moser Framework looks at the strategic gender needs of women only, but the DPU's adaptation (see Appendix, p. 123) includes men as well, and can also be used with projects which address male gender issues. The Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) includes men as one of its four categories of analysis and can therefore be used for projects which target men.

**Making your choice**

Gender analysis frameworks have been designed for different purposes. These purposes include range from helping you carry out your initial research, planning and monitoring an intervention, to evaluating what it has achieved.
Context analysis: Frameworks give you a way of thinking about the context which shapes the relationships and dynamics of any situation or group.

Visualisation and planning: The framework’s tools provide you with a way of representing key points in a simple manner, to aid decision-making.

Communications: The tools help you share information, train people or sensitise them to gender issues.

Monitoring and evaluation: Framework tools can highlight the strengths and weaknesses of a particular development intervention.

Gender frameworks have sometimes been designed for use in a particular context. For instance, if you are working in emergency situations, there are two gender frameworks specifically designed for this (the People-Oriented Planning Framework, and the Capacities and Vulnerabilities Framework).

When deciding which framework to use for any particular situation, it is important to consider what aspects are appropriate in your work, and what purpose you are trying to achieve. There are a number of considerations.

Does the framework do what I want it to do?

What are you trying to achieve? What resources do you have? In each commentary from users of individual gender frameworks, we have tried to highlight the main purposes, strengths, and weaknesses of each framework, as experienced by gender and development workers and trainers. These commentaries are not exhaustive – all readers are invited to add to it. However, they do aim to help you choose an appropriate framework for your particular purpose – for training, planning or evaluation; for use in community projects, or at a level beyond the community; for communities to use themselves, or for policy makers to employ.

What will people’s reactions be?

What will people’s reactions be to using the framework, and to the conclusions that it enables them to reach? Increasingly, it is understood that organisations involved in development work reflect the biases of their own cultures. This ‘gendered’ nature of organisations, as well as of the communities with whom they work, has a profound impact on the success or failure of any development intervention. It is therefore very important to consider the culture of the individuals or organisations you are working with, and how this affects their capacity to work on gender. Some organisations and individuals will be resistant to thinking of relationships between women and men as relations of power, and to the idea of working for women’s empowerment. You will have to think carefully about how explicitly and openly you want to challenge such resistance, and you should consider which other strategies you can employ to introduce new ideas to people. Some gender frameworks are particularly helpful in analysing how organisations, and the people within them, interact with and react to the external situation and development interventions.
particular, the Social Relations Approach and the DPU's Web of Institutionalisation (see Appendix, p 123) will help you think about the links between power and resources, between the institutions which determine who receives resources, and the communities with whom they work.

Some of the gender frameworks have arisen from specific disciplines of work or research, and were originally designed for use by or on behalf of specific groups of people. These often expand on concepts and use language already familiar to those working in the discipline in order to make the framework more appealing to that group. Examples include the Harvard Analytical Framework and the Moser Framework, which use the language of policy makers and planners.

**What are the potential limitations of the framework? How can these be taken into account and compensated for?**

In some cases, the potential limitations of a framework will have a greater negative impact than in others. Some can be compensated for by using another tool. For example, the Longwe framework, which does not consider the gender interests and needs of men, could be accompanied by an analysis of gender power relations between women and men. However, if you have very little time to use a framework, a comprehensive framework such as the Social Relations Approach may seem too complex; despite its good points, you would have to take a pragmatic decision on its suitability.
2 | The gender-analysis frameworks and users' commentaries

2.1 Explaining the chapters  30
2.2 Harvard Analytical Framework and People-Oriented Planning  32
2.3 Moser Framework  55
2.4 Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM)  68
2.5 Capacities and Vulnerabilities Analysis Framework  78
2.6 Women’s Empowerment (Longwe) Framework  92
2.7 Social Relations Approach  102
2.1 | Explaining the chapters

This section gives an overview of how the rest of this book is structured. Each gender framework is discussed in its own chapter. Within the chapters, you will find the following headings.

**Background**

This brief introduction gives information on the framework's author(s), when the framework was devised, and in what context.

**Aims of the framework**

This section gives more detailed information on what purpose the original framework was intended to fulfil.

**Framework**

Under this heading, you will find a brief outline of the key concepts of the framework, and an account of how it is normally used.

Much of the material used in this and the next section are taken directly from published and unpublished material written by the intellectual author(s) of the framework, or from gender and development workers who have developed training materials on the framework. As far as is possible, all concerned have given permission for their ideas and words to be used, and full credits are given at the start of the chapter (also see Acknowledgements, p V).

**Case study**

For each framework, a short case study is presented. These are only examples to illustrate how the framework was applied in practice. They do not represent the best, or the only, way of using the framework. Depending on the context
you are working in, and the type of planning you are undertaking, your way of using it may well be different. Moreover, each case study has been summarised. In practice, a great deal more detail would be needed for planning purposes.

Commentary
This section is the main contribution of this book to the literature on gender-analysis frameworks. The views in this section are the personal views of gender and development workers and trainers in North and South, some, but not all of whom, have worked with Oxfam GB.

Uses
This section outlines the main uses of the framework. Of course the gender frameworks could always be used in additional ways.

Why it appeals
This section gives the main reasons why gender and development workers and trainers like the framework, and what they consider its main strengths.

Potential limitations
Before choosing or using the framework, you should consider its weaknesses which other workers and trainers have found. These potential weaknesses do not invalidate the usefulness of the gender frameworks; but you should be aware of them. It has been left to you, the reader, to decide whether the limitations will be significant in your context, whether you will still use the framework, and, if so, how you can compensate for the limitations. Whenever users have reported adaptations of the gender frameworks which help to balance or counteract potential limitations, these are included in the text.

Further reading
Under this heading, you will find a list of literature by the frameworks' intellectual author(s).
2.2 | Harvard Analytical Framework and People-Oriented Planning

These two gender frameworks appear in the same section because People-Oriented Planning is based on the Harvard Analytical Framework. After the two frameworks are presented, a joint commentary from users follows, which discusses those features which both frameworks share. Thereafter, two separate sub-sections examine the distinctive features of each framework.

Harvard Analytical Framework

Background

The Harvard Analytical Framework is often referred to as the Gender Roles Framework or Gender Analysis Framework. Published in 1985, it was one of the first frameworks designed for gender analysis. It was developed by researchers at the Harvard Institute for International Development in the USA, working in collaboration with the WID office of USAID, at a time when the 'efficiency approach' to integrating women in development work was gaining prominence in development circles.


Aims of the Framework

The Harvard Framework was designed to demonstrate that there is an economic case for allocating resources to women as well as men. The framework aims to help planners design more efficient projects and improve overall productivity. It does this by mapping the work and resources of men and women in a community and highlighting the main differences.
The framework

The Harvard Analytical Framework is a grid (also known as a matrix) for collecting data at the micro-level (i.e., at the community and household level). It is a useful way of organising information and can be adapted to many situations. The Harvard Analytical Framework has four main components.

Harvard Tool 1: The Activity Profile

This tool identifies all relevant productive and reproductive tasks and answers the question: who does what?

How much detail you need depends on the nature of your project. Those areas of activity which the project will be directly involved in require the greatest detail. For instance, an activity profile for an agricultural project would

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Women/girls</th>
<th>Men/boys</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Productive Activities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 2, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income generating:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 2, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 2, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reproductive Activities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water related:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activity 2, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fuel related:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food preparation:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childcare:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health related:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaning and repair:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market related:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

list, according to the gender division of labour, each agricultural activity (such as land clearance, preparation, and so on) for each crop, or each type of field. Depending on the context, other parameters may also be examined:

- Gender and age denominations: identifying whether adult women, adult men, their children, or the elderly carry out an activity;

- Time allocation: specifying what percentage of time is allocated to each activity, and whether it is carried out seasonally or daily;

- Activity locus: specifying where the activity is performed, in order to reveal people’s mobility. Is work done at home, in the family field, the family shop, or elsewhere (within or beyond) the community?

**Harvard Tool 2: The Access and Control Profile – resources and benefits**

This tool enables users to list what resources people use to carry out the tasks identified in the Activity Profile. It indicates whether women or men have access to resources, who controls their use, and who controls the benefits of a household’s (or a community’s) use of resources. Access simply means that you are able to use a resource; but this says nothing about whether you have control over it. For example, women may have some access to local political processes but little influence or control over which issues are discussed and the final decisions. The person who controls a resource is the one ultimately able to make decisions about its use, including whether it can be sold.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example of Harvard Tool 2: Access and control profile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Benefits</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outside income</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Harvard Tool 3: Influencing factors

This tool allows you to chart factors which influence the differences in the gender division of labour, access, and control as listed in the two Profiles (Tools 1 and 2). Identifying past and present influences can give an indication of future trends. These factors must also be considered because they present opportunities and constraints to increasing the involvement of women in development projects and programmes.

Influencing factors include all those that shape gender relations, and determine different opportunities and constraints for men and women. These factors are far-reaching, broad, and interrelated. They include:

- community norms and social hierarchies, such as family/community forms, cultural practices, and religious beliefs;
- demographic conditions;
- institutional structures, including the nature of government bureaucracies, and arrangements for the generation and dissemination of knowledge, skills, and technology;
- general economic conditions, such as poverty levels, inflation rates, income distribution, international terms of trade, and infrastructure;
- internal and external political events;
- legal parameters;
- training and education;
- attitude of community to development/assistance workers.

The purpose of identifying these influencing factors is to consider which ones affect women’s or men’s activities or resources, and how they, in turn,

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influencing Factors</th>
<th>Constraints</th>
<th>Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Community norms and social hierarchy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Demographic factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Institutional structures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Economic factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Legal parameters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Attitude of community to development/assistance workers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

can affect them. This tool is intended to help you identify external constraints and opportunities which you should consider in planning your development interventions. It should help you anticipate what inputs will be needed to make the intervention successful from a gender perspective.

**Harvard Tool 4: Checklist for Project-Cycle Analysis**

This consists of a series of questions. They are designed to assist you to examine a project proposal or an area of intervention from a gender perspective, using gender-disaggregated data and capturing the different effects of social change on men and women.

---

**Example of Harvard Tool 4: Checklist**

The following set of questions are the key ones for each of the four main stages in the project cycle: identification, design, implementation, evaluation.

**WOMEN'S DIMENSION IN PROJECT IDENTIFICATION**

**Assessing women's needs**
1. What needs and opportunities exist for increasing women's productivity and/or production?
2. What needs and opportunities exist for increasing women's access to and control of resources?
3. What needs and opportunities exist for increasing women's access to and control of benefits?
4. How do these needs and opportunities relate to the country's other general and sectoral development needs and opportunities?
5. Have women been directly consulted in identifying such needs and opportunities?

**Defining general project objectives**
1. Are project objectives explicitly related to women's needs?
2. Do these objectives adequately reflect women's needs?
3. Have women participated in setting those objectives?
4. Have there been any earlier efforts?
5. How has the present proposal built on earlier activity?

**Identifying possible negative effects**
1. Might the project reduce women's access to or control of resources and benefits?
2. Might it adversely affect women's situation in some other way?
3. What will be the effects on women in the short and longer term?

**WOMEN'S DIMENSION IN PROJECT DESIGN**

**Project impact on women's activities**
1. Which of these activities (production, reproduction and maintenance, socio-political) does the project affect?
2. Is the planned component consistent with the current gender denomination for the activity?
3. If it is planned to change the women's performance of that activity, i.e., locus of activity, remunerative mode, technology, mode of activity) is this feasible, and what positive or negative effects would there be on women? **continued...**
### Example of Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

4. If it does not change it, is this a missed opportunity for women's roles in the development process?
5. How can the project design be adjusted to increase the above-mentioned positive effects, and reduce or eliminate the negative ones?

**Project impact on women's access and control**
1. How will each of the project components affect women's access to and control of the resources and benefits engaged in and stemming from the production of goods and services?
2. How will each of the project components affect women's access to and control of the resources and benefits engaged in and stemming from the reproduction and maintenance of the human resources?
3. How will each of the project components affect women's access to and control of the resources and benefits engaged in and stemming from the socio-political functions?
4. What forces have been set into motion to induce further exploration of constraints and possible improvements?
5. How can the project design be adjusted to increase women's access to and control of resources and benefits?

**WOMEN'S DIMENSION IN PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION**

**Personnel**
1. Are project personnel aware of and sympathetic towards women's needs?
2. Are women used to deliver the goods or services to women beneficiaries?
3. Do personnel have the necessary skills to provide any special inputs required by women?
4. What training techniques will be used to develop delivery systems?
5. Are there appropriate opportunities for women to participate in project management positions?

**Organisational structures**
1. Does the organisational form enhance women's access to resources?
2. Does the organisation have adequate power to obtain resources needed by women from other organisations?
3. Does the organisation have the institutional capability to support and protect women during the change process?

**Operations and logistics**
1. Are the organisation's delivery channels accessible to women in terms of personnel, location and timing?
2. Do control procedures exist to ensure dependable delivery of the goods and services?
3. Are there mechanisms to ensure that the project resources or benefits are not usurped by males?

**Finances**
1. Do funding mechanisms exist to ensure programme continuity?
2. Are funding levels adequate for proposed tasks?
3. Is preferential access to resources by males avoided?

---

Harvard Analytical Framework and People-Oriented Planning | 37
Example of Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

4. Is it possible to trace funds for women from allocation to delivery with a fair degree of accuracy?

Flexibility
1. Does the project have a management information system which will allow it to detect the effects of the operation on women?
2. Does the organisation have enough flexibility to adapt its structures and operations to meet the changing or new-found situations of women?

WOMEN’S DIMENSION IN PROJECT EVALUATION

Data requirements
1. Does the project’s monitoring and evaluation system explicitly measure the project’s effects on women?
2. Does it also collect data to update the Activity Analysis and the Women’s Access and Control Analysis?
3. Are women involved in designating the data requirements?

Data collection and analysis
1. Are the data collected with sufficient frequency so that necessary project adjustments could be made during the project?
2. Are the data fed back to project personnel and beneficiaries in an understandable form and on a timely basis to allow project adjustments?
3. Are women involved in the collection and interpretation of data?
4. Are data analysed so as to provide guidance to the design of other projects?
5. Are key areas of WID/GAD research identified?


Case study of the Harvard Analytical Framework: Indonesia Community Forestry Project

This case study is adapted from Two Halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, published by CCIC, MATCH, AQOCI, Ottawa 1991, and reproduced in Oxfam’s Gender Training Manual. Here, it is included as an illustration of the Harvard Analytical Framework, even though it seems that this framework was not actually used in planning the project. The case study is reproduced here in minimal detail. For planning purposes, more detail would be needed before the following data could be considered sufficient.

Project background
This community forestry project was approved in 1983, in the village of Biyasan (not its real name) in Indonesia. It was part of a programme developed by the Indonesian Ministry of Forestry in order to make forestry benefit local communities as well as state and business interests. Poverty in Biyasan was a result of the complex relationship between high population density, poor quality soil, inequitable land-tenure traditions, and out-migration of men. The
poorest people tended to live in households headed by women – 20% of the total. In a further 10%, the male family heads had migrated in search of waged employment. Most families had lived in Biyasan for generations, but a number were resettled into the area and had been allocated 0.5 hectares of land. The nearby forests were becoming depleted because of widespread clear-cutting and selling of timber. The land-use profile gave the following picture.

- 38% Agricultural production
- 12% Home gardens
- 7% Private woodlots
- 15% Fallow
- 33% Unproductive (Adapted from Match 1991, pp 122-4)

**Using Harvard Tool 1: Activity Profile**

As stated above, the first tool of the Harvard Analytical Framework helps to collate data about men’s and women’s activities. For the people in the project area, the gender division of labour could be represented as in the table overleaf. In addition to such a quick overview, it is important to examine the details of who does what. Which women carry out a task? Which men? Where? When? For how long? In this case study, important information could have been gleaned by asking questions on the following issues:

- Wealthy farmers employed agricultural wage labour (men and women) at harvest time as well as using family labour.
- Poorer farmers relied on unpaid family labour and assistants.
- Poor farmers could not rely only on their farms to sustain their families; they needed to earn income in other ways as well.
- Reforestry had provided employment for a number of men and women, but these jobs had decreased. Women had been the main wage labourers in tree nurseries. Many women worked as unpaid labourers alongside their husbands who were employed by the state forestry company.
- Women were active in local rotating credit and savings schemes.
- Girls were involved in household work from an early age. At age 7, they helped feed animals, carry water, and gather fuel wood. By the time they were 10 years old, girls were helping plant and harvest rice. There was a village school but many girls, especially those whose mothers worked as labourers or market traders, had to drop out.
- Boys were active in feeding and caring for the animals and helping with their father’s work. (Adapted from Match 1991, pp 122, 124, 129).
# Using Harvard Tool 1: Activity profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Production activities</th>
<th>Male Child</th>
<th>Male Adult</th>
<th>Woman Child</th>
<th>Woman Adult</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planting, weeding, storing rice</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvesting rice</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seedling production</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cassava cultivation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maize cultivation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tobacco growing</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peanut cultivation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cashew cultivation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coffee growing</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cocoa growing</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home gardens</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seasonal agricultural work</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contract labourers</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reforestation</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Production, sale of rattan items</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crafts and sales</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursery reforestation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Animal breeding</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transplanting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoeing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weeding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harvesting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picking and drying coffee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picking and drying tobacco</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gathering leaves and fruit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ploughing fields</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrace construction</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Reproduction activities                     |            |            |             |             |
| Household work                              | x          |            | x           | x           |
| Feeding cattle                              |            | x          | x           | x           |
| Collecting firewood                         | x          |            | x           | x           |
| Collecting water                            | x          |            | x           |             |
| Collecting natural medicines                | x          |            | x           |             |
| Animal care                                 | x          |            |             |             |

| Socio-political activities                  |            |            |             |             |
| Weddings                                    | x          |            |             | x           |
| Funerals                                    | x          |            |             |             |
| Participation in arisan                     |            |            |             | x           |
| Village meetings                            | x          |            |             |             |

*Source: Match 1991, p 129*
Using Harvard Tool 2: Access and Control Profile

The Indonesian forestry project used Tool 2 (for examining men and women's access to and control over resources and benefits) to collect data which is partially represented in the table below. This tool indicates who has access to resources and control over their use. Benefits realised from household (and community) production and use of resources are also identified and listed. Columns indicate whether or not women and men have access to them, and control over their use.

However, use of Harvard Tool 2 reveals more data than can be shown in the table. It is necessary to examine which men and which women have access or control, and to ask what is actually meant by access and control for each case. Such questions for this project would reveal the following details.

- Women and men both owned and inherited land, although women only owned 32% of all productive land. Very few farmers were landless sharecroppers. The average size of holding was 0.7 hectares, with 6% of the population holding more than 3.5 hectares.
- Wealthier farmers could obtain credit, and some had access to machinery for weeding and hulling.
- Women’s earnings traditionally came from making rattan products and other non-wood forest goods and trading in the market.
- Wage labour had dropped significantly over recent years. It now accounted for 30% of male income and 17% of female income. There were few employment opportunities for women.
- Women traditionally did not benefit as much as men from credit and extension programmes for farmers. (Adapted from Match 1991, 121).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Using Harvard Tool 2: Access and control profile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resources</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Credit</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Machines</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fertilizer</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paid work</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: A = Access, C = Control

Source: Match 1991, p 130
Using Harvard Tool 3: Influencing Factors

If the Harvard Analytical Framework had been used in the project at the outset, as a planning tool, planners would have taken into account the influencing factors which shape gender relations and provide different opportunities and constraints for women and men. For instance, these factors would have included the different impact of changing migration patterns on women and men, and which women or men were most affected.

Tool 3 can also be used to examine, in retrospect, some of the key changes in gender relations that arose from the case-studies project activities.

Economic: Paid work in the project was more often given to men.

Social: Implementation of the project changed the socio-economic relations between men and women to the further advantage of men. Men gained power, women lost some.

Environment: Women were replaced by men in seedling production in the nursery. Environmental management is mostly the responsibility of upper-class men.

Education: Women did not have access to training activities, credit, and extension services. They were also excluded from training and marketing of ovens. (Match 1991, p 130)

Using Harvard Tool 4: Checklist

The checklist creates a wealth of data for any project. For reasons of space, we have chosen not to illustrate the checklist for this case study. If the Harvard Analytical Framework had been used for planning, the checklist would have highlighted in advance many of the problems which arose subsequently.
People-Oriented Planning Framework

Background

The Framework for People-Oriented Planning in Refugee Situations (popularly called POP) is an adaptation of the Harvard Analytical Framework. It was adapted for use in refugee situations, but also in order to overcome some of the Harvard Framework's initial weaknesses. POP was devised for the United Nations High Commission on Refugees (UNHCR), by Mary B Anderson and the UNHCR Senior Coordinator for Refugee Women, M (Brazeau) Howarth, following the adoption by UNHCR of a Policy on Refugee Women. It was developed with funding from the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA).


Aims of the Framework

The central purpose of POP is to ensure that there is an efficient and equitable distribution of resources and services. The framework aims to promote more appropriate targeting of development assistance, and more efficient use of donors' resources. It also aims to 'ensure [that] disparities between the sexes are reduced' (Anderson 1992, 1).

The Framework

In the introduction to the POP framework, the following key factors are emphasised:

Change: When people flee from disaster or conflict, their lives change rapidly and dramatically, and continue to change. Even in long-term refugee settlements where women's and men's roles may stabilise, these will be different from those which existed before the flight, and the new roles may be regarded as temporary by refugees themselves. In some situations, there will be a stronger adherence to traditional roles, values and perceptions. Conversely, a crisis may open up avenues for change which can lead to more balanced relations between men and women. The dynamics of change working within the society determine, to a great extent, the acceptance and success of any project.

Participation: Refugee participation is a major factor in determining whether or not a project will succeed. This requires the involvement of refugee women, men, and children.
**Importance of analysis:** Whatever type of project is being planned (water, food distribution, health promotion, and so on), socio-economic and demographic analysis are critical components of project planning.

**Components of the Framework**

The POP Framework has three components:

- The Determinants Analysis, (also called the Refugee Population Profile and Context Analysis);
- The Activities Analysis;
- The Use and Control of Resources Analysis.

**POP Tool 1: Refugee Population Profile and Context Analysis**

Two aspects shape the roles and responsibilities of men and women in refugee situations. The first is the population profile both of the displaced groups and of their host community or country. Second, the social and cultural context of both refugees and hosts will influence, possibly change, the gender division of use and control of resources. The following questions can serve as a guide in drawing up a populations profile and gaining an insight into the contexts.

**Who are the refugees?**

Answering this question involves assessing the refugee population from a demographic perspective. Who are the refugees? For example, are they families or individuals? Women? Men? Children? Are the children accompanied or not? This kind of assessment must take place at the earliest stage of a refugee emergency – details can be gathered at a later stage. It is important to find out the composition of the refugee group before they became refugees, and subsequent changes in that composition.

**What is the refugees' context?**

Factors which will have shaped gender relations before the flight and during asylum are broad and interrelated, but may include the following.

- Community norms and social hierarchy, such as family/ community power structures and religious beliefs, can be particularly important among refugee groups where men’s and women’s roles are changing;
- Demographic factors;
- Institutional structures, including the nature of government bureaucracies, and arrangements for the generation and dissemination of knowledge, technology, and skills;
• General economic conditions, such as poverty levels, inflation rates, income distribution, international terms of trade, and infrastructure;

• Internal and external political events;

• Legal parameters;

• Training and education;

• The attitudes of the host country/community;

• The attitude of refugees to development/assistance workers (Anderson 1992, pp 4-5).

As stated above, similar questions should be asked for the host and the refugee population.

The purpose of identifying these determinants is to consider which ones affect activities or resources, and how they are affected by them. This helps you identify external constraints and opportunities which you must consider in planning your programmes in order to better predict your inputs.

**POP Tool 2: The Activities Analysis**

Similar to the Harvard Tool 1 (Activities Profile), this tool enables you to find out who does what, as well as when and where they do it. Because the gender division of labour and roles is disrupted by flight, it is essential to find out what women and men were doing before, and what they are doing now, or are able to do, in the refugee situation. How strictly defined was, and is, the division of labour? Do adults or children carry out a particular task now? Was this different before? Which tasks used to be done every seasonal, which ones were carried out every day, and is this the same now? How long do the tasks take? Where are they carried out? How does this differ from before?

The activities analysis must be linked to the population profile, for a very good reason: if refugees are mainly men, then the jobs which women normally undertook cannot be done in the usual way.

Protection is a crucial concern, particularly for women and girls. The activity of protecting – including who offers protection under which circumstances – is both a legal and social concern: refugees have often lost their national status, as well as the social networks which may have offered them some protection. Communities provide protection through a protection hierarchy. This may involve communities (families and other social groupings) protecting individuals; men protecting women; adults protecting children. Such protection can be of a legal, physical or social nature. It is important to find out what protection gaps there are in the current situation. For example, what mechanisms are there for protecting orphaned children? (Anderson 1992, p 5)
**POP Tool 2: Activities Analysis**

The table below illustrates the Activities Analysis. This analysis should be completed for both the pre-refugee situation and the current situation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Production of goods...</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg carpentry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>metal work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>... and services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg teaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domestic labour</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg land clearance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>planting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>care of livestock</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household production</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg childcare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>home garden</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>water collection</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Protection activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg of unaccompanied children</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>single women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>elderly people</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social, political, religious activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eg community meeting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ceremonies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Adapted from Anderson 1992, p 8*

**POP Tool 3: Use and Control of Resources Analysis**

Similar to the Harvard Tool 2 (Access and Control Profile), this tool helps you determine how resources are distributed, and who has a say over their use, by asking the following questions.

- What resources do people have/ which did they bring with them?
- Who has which resources?
- What resources must be provided for which refugees?

You can identify what resources were used and controlled by women and men before flight, and what resources they now control and use as refugees.
This includes both material resources and intangible ones, such as community structures, social networks, time, labour, and education. Women and men may have lost some resources (such as land, full-time employment, or membership of a social network) and may be unable to regain them.

Men, women, and children will have lost different resources. They may also have gained new ones, for example, access to food items distributed by aid agencies. The new situation will affect gender relations, and may introduce opportunities for positive change for women.

**Example of POP Tool 3: Use of resources analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource lost due to flight</th>
<th>Who used this (gender/age)</th>
<th>Who controlled this (gender/age)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>land, livestock, shelter, tools, education system, health care, income</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource brought by refugees</th>
<th>Who has this (gender/age)</th>
<th>Who uses this (gender/age)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Skills political</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>manufacturing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>carpentry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sewing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cleaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agricultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>animal husbandry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge literacy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medicine/health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Resource provided to refugees</th>
<th>To whom is this provided (gender/age)</th>
<th>How/where/when is it provided (through males? females? adults?)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>food, shelter, clothing, education, legal services, health-care services etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Anderson 1992, p 11*
Commentary

Joint Commentary on Harvard Framework and POP

(These points are relevant to both the frameworks. They should be read in conjunction with the individual commentaries on each framework which follow, where points relevant specifically to each framework are addressed.)

Uses

For data collection and analysis
The gender frameworks are useful in gathering and analysing information. This analysis can then provide a database for any stage of a project cycle. The gender frameworks are more appropriate for projects than for programmes, because they rely on micro-level analysis. You need detailed knowledge of the social groups in question, so it is difficult to use them to study a region where people’s social and economic circumstances differ widely.

In training
They are often used in training programmes to illustrate to emergency workers and planners the complexity of a refugee situation.

As a gender-neutral ‘entry point’
These gender frameworks can be useful for starting a discussion about gender issues with counterparts who are resistant to thinking about power dynamics between women and men, because they are clearly based on fact, not theory.

For communication
The gender frameworks rely on the economic argument of most efficient allocation of resources. It therefore uses language similar to that of economists, which can be particularly useful when talking to people whose main influence is mainstream economic thought.

In conjunction with the Moser Framework
The gender frameworks are frequently used in conjunction with the Moser Framework, which enables planners to include Moser’s concept of strategic gender interests.

Why they appeal

Practical and hands-on

Give a clear picture of the gender division of labour
When the data have been collected, the gender frameworks give a clear and simple picture of who does what, when, and what with. They make women’s work visible and help you avoid making serious technical blunders such as handing out resources at inappropriate times, or underestimating women’s existing workload. They can clearly show differences in workloads, and in access to and control of resources.
Distinguish between access and control of resources

Easily adaptable

Non-threatening and gender-neutral; they rely on facts rather than theory

Potential limitations and adaptations

Developed from an efficiency perspective, rather than an equity perspective

Both gender frameworks were developed from the WID efficiency approach, so they suffer from similar theoretical constraints. They were designed not so much to create more balanced gender relations, but to allocate new resources in such a way as to increase the efficiency of the project or programme. The gender frameworks therefore give no guidance on how development workers might challenge existing inequalities. Neither do they draw out power dynamics, show the relationships between different people, or how people bargain, negotiate interests, make decisions, and so on. Thus, using Kabeer’s definitions of gender-aware policies (see p 21), the gender frameworks will tend to lead to gender-neutral or gender-specific interventions rather than to ones which transform gender relations.

For instance, in parts of the world where women have a very reduced role in production, the logic of the gender frameworks would probably encourage development workers to work only with the men (who already have control). While this may be effective in raising the overall income of the household as a unit, the benefits do not necessarily reach the women, and the intervention will probably have tipped the balance of power further in favour of the men.

On the other hand, the gender frameworks can give the impression that giving any additional resources to women is a good thing. This is not necessarily the case. There are numerous examples of badly designed income-generation projects. In these cases, despite the fact that resources were given to women, the projects have ended up further disadvantaging women. They have become time-consuming burdens for women or made a loss, not a profit.

Encourage an insufficiently thorough analysis

The matrices can encourage people to take a fairly superficial, tick-the-boxes approach to data collection. Planners can end up feeling over-confident, assuming that they know all they need to know. They can thereby miss the complexities of the community’s reality, and can miss crucial opportunities for change.

Fail to specify the importance of the participation of women and men themselves in the analysis

The matrices do not specifically require that planners ensure that the community members themselves – women as well as men – analyse their situation. If the Harvard or POP gender frameworks are the only planning tools used, they will lead to very top-down plans.
Some people have successfully used the matrices participatively, i.e. filling in the matrices with members of the community and discussing the results with them. They have found it effective in raising gender issues. Other users report that they have found it difficult to use with communities. One criticism in particular is that the distinction between access and control has been difficult to convey.

**Do not address the culture and context of the institutions which determine the allocation of resources to recipients**

Both the Harvard and the POP gender frameworks assume that institutions, including development organisations, have a neutral culture regarding gender power relations. Increasingly, it is understood that the way in which an organisation is 'gendered' (see pp 9-15) has a large impact on how successful their planning is in terms of supporting fairer gender relations and/or women's empowerment.

**Emphasise separation rather than connectedness and inter-relationships between individuals and groups**

The Harvard and POP Gender frameworks concentrate on the activities and resources of different categories of people, rather than on relationships between different groups. This leads to an emphasis on men and women, old and young, as separate groups with different and separate activities. However, the inter-relationships between them, and the forms of household and community co-operation and exchange are not examined. For instance, in exchange for his wife's labour on his fields, a husband may be obliged to pay her wages or to work on her fields in return. The exchange may be less direct. In return for giving a male relation control over a loan which is in her name, a woman may increase her status, or be more secure in times of the hunger gap.

Decision-making processes may be much more complicated than those represented in either matrix. Looking only at production cycles, and access and control over resources does not give a full picture of the negotiations and decision-making processes over key stages; the result is an incomplete picture of relationships. Consider a case where producers sell their wares to an intermediary, who gives them a very low price for the goods. It may seem obvious to an NGO to take over and replace the intermediary, and offer a better price. However, it may also be the case that the intermediary offers the producers informal patronage and support in times of hardship, such as credit or employment opportunities. This connection would not be visible in the Harvard framework but any attempt in these circumstances to replace the intermediary without considering this patronage is likely to fail.

In addition, control over a resource may only be partial. You may assume that a woman has control over purchase of seeds. In fact, the state marketing structures and the intermediaries also have a high level of control, because they can dictate what is available, and at what price.
Issues of power are not made explicit
Neither the Harvard nor the POP Gender frameworks ask how and why gender relations are unequal; and so issues of power distribution are not drawn out. Because the way in which men and women relate to each other is not examined, the underlying causes of women’s subordination are often not tackled. However, the profiles which emerge of women’s and men’s roles can be entry points for examining these issues, for example comparing differences in the access and control of resources.

Adaptation: Consultants for the Netherlands Development Assistance (NEDA) at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs adapted the Harvard and POP frameworks in 1994 to address this issue. Their framework is published in the manual Gender Assessment Studies. In it, a third profile, of women’s socio-political position, is added to both gender frameworks, as in the matrix below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women’s socio-political position compared to men’s</th>
<th>Lower (worse)</th>
<th>About Equal</th>
<th>Higher (better)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Women’s participation in decision-making:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• in the household</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• at community level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• society at large</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. (Self) image:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self image of women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Image of women in society</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Organisational capacity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: quoted in Monitoring and Evaluation from a Gender Perspective: A Guideline, SNV, March 1995

Ignore other underlying inequalities
As originally designed, neither the Harvard Framework nor the POP Framework deals with other underlying inequalities such as class or race; nor do they consider the different types of household in various contexts. Users are asked to compare ‘women’ and ‘men’ as two separate, homogeneous groups. Even within a particular cultural group, the differences between mothers-in-law and daughters-in-law, or first wife and second wife, or compound head and unmarried son, may be very marked. At worst, this over-simplification means that users may ignore the complex power differentials which exist in the real world, and fail to determine who the most vulnerable people are.

Adaptation: It is possible to adapt the Harvard and POP frameworks to take account of underlying inequalities. Data would be disaggregated according to
cultural, ethnic, and economic factors as well as gender and age. Alternatively, different matrices can filled in for each relatively homogeneous group.

**Designed for information collection, not for planning**
The Harvard and POP gender frameworks see the need for better information as the central issue for gender analysis. As a consequence, they provide no guidance for planners as to what action should logically follow this collection of information.

*(Below, additional users' points on the two gender frameworks are listed separately.)*

### Additional commentary on the Harvard Framework only

**Potential limitations and adaptations**

**Too materialistic**
By concentrating on activities and material resources rather than relationships between people, the Harvard Framework takes tangible considerations as its starting point for analysis. It tends to assume that people make rational choices based purely on material considerations, thus leaving out some crucial motivational factors and constraints, such as community dynamics and cultural values. To counter this tendency, you can adapt the framework by adding intangible resources to the Access and Control Profile, bringing in variables such as membership of networks or kinship groups.

**Oversimplifies the concepts of access and control**
The Harvard Framework can encourage a simplistic 'yes or no' approach by asking whether or not women have access and control. However, women experience a much more complex reality. For example, a women's group may have access to some village land, and have partial control in that they can decide what crops to grow and how. But it may be up to the elders to decide which plot the women are given. Looking simply at access and control can also hide the bargaining processes which take place in order to arrive at such complicated outcomes.

**Changes over time are not taken into account**
The matrices of the Harvard Framework tend to give a static view of the community. However, an awareness of changes over time in gender relations can be crucial for spotting opportunities as well as areas where pressures are increasing or might soon arise.

**Adaptations:** In one possible adaptation which addresses this issue, the person compiling the matrix questions at each stage whether a certain state of affairs has changed, and why. In another adaptation, the data for the matrix is gathered twice, as it is for the POP framework: once to look at the current situation, and once to compare it to an appropriate point in the past.
Does not place emphasis on who performs community work  
The framework prioritises productive and reproductive activities. It does not encourage you to think about tasks that are undertaken for community cohesion (discussed in Moser’s ‘triple roles’ concept, pp 56-57).

Adaptation: Instead of including only the categories of productive and reproductive activities, a third category is often added – either social, political, religious, or ‘community activities’.

Additional commentary on POP Framework only

Uses
In planning for refugee situations  
POP is a practical tool to assist in planning in refugee situations. With a little adaptation, it is also useful in emergencies or during periods of rapid change.

Why it appeals
Specifically designed for use in refugee situations

Simple, step-by-step approach
The framework is conceptually simple, and easy to administer. It is therefore suited to the exigencies of emergency work, even in the initial stages when workers do not have the time to employ more complex techniques. The framework pulls together a very rich map of refugee profile and socio-economic data and does so more rapidly than, for example, some forms of participative or rapid rural appraisal (PRA, RRA).

Includes concepts of change over time and protection
Two elements of the POP Framework are particularly significant for gender relations in refugee groups. The first is the element of change over time, which enables planners to consider the long term as well as the short term. The second element is the need of vulnerable groups for protection, and the fact that such protection should be considered as an activity which someone has to provide.

Uses an expanded concept of resources
The POP Framework expands the concept of resources used in the Harvard Framework, progressing beyond consideration only of material resources, to include less tangible things such as skills and social organisation, and – very important for women – time. It highlights the importance of resources in relation to responsibilities. It brings out the idea that communities lose some resources over time, but also retain some and gain others. The POP framework can help to find indicators which reveal whether the gap between women and men in terms of benefits is widening or narrowing.
Potential limitations

Works best with homogeneous groups
It is difficult to use across a region or group of communities which may not be totally homogeneous. In a refugee camp with very different communities, one needs to apply the framework first to each group independently.

Question of control cannot be fully answered
The question of who has control in the community cannot be fully answered when control over most aspects of social life is assumed by external actors.

Short-term interventions may be the result
Not enough emphasis is given to the long-term development of refugee or displaced communities.

Further reading


2.3 | Moser Framework

Background

In reaction to the Women in Development (WID) approach, which in the 1970s encouraged treating women’s issues as separate concerns, the Gender and Development (GAD) approach argued for an integrated gender-planning perspective in all development work, concentrating on the power relations between women and men. This approach challenges many of the assumptions behind traditional planning methods.

The Moser Framework was part of this challenge. Caroline Moser developed it as a method of gender analysis at the Development Planning Unit (DPU), University of London, UK in the early 1980s. Moving from analysis into action, Caroline Moser, with Caren Levy of the DPU, further developed it into a gender policy and planning method. Moser’s method was presented as a mainstream planning methodology in its own right, like urban or transport planning. The following section is adapted from Moser’s book Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training, Routledge, London, 1993. It also draws on a discussion of Moser’s framework by the Canadian Council for International Co-operation in Two Halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, MATCH, Ottawa, 1991.

Since Moser left the DPU in 1986, their Gender Policy and Planning Programme has produced a methodology which has evolved to meet the need for strategies to integrate gender in all types of intervention, and to confront power relations in organisations, communities, and social institutions. It has been used by a wide range of development organisations. Since it has not been used by Oxfam to date, and we can therefore not provide a users’ commentary, the DPU methodology is included as an appendix (p 123).

Aims of the framework

As stated above, the Moser Framework aims to set up ‘gender planning’ as a type of planning in its own right: ‘The goal of gender planning is the
emancipation of women from their subordination, and their achievement of equality, equity, and empowerment. This will vary widely in different contexts, depending on the extent to which women as a category are subordinated in status to men as a category.' (Moser 1993, 1)

The Moser Framework questions assumptions that planning is a purely technical task. Moser characterises gender planning as distinct from traditional planning methods in several critical ways: 'First, [gender planning] is both political and technical in nature. Second, it assumes conflict in the planning process. Third, it involves transformatory processes. Fourth, it characterises planning as “debate”.' (Moser 1993, 87)

**The Framework**

At the heart of the Moser Framework are three concepts:

- Women’s triple role;
- Practical and strategic gender needs;
- Categories of WID/GAD policy approaches (policy matrix).

**Moser Tool 1: Gender roles identification / triple role**

This tool involves mapping the gender division of labour by asking 'who does what?' Caroline Moser identifies a ‘triple role’ for low-income women in most societies, which she uses in this framework. The triple role for women consists of reproductive, productive, and community-managing activities. In contrast, men primarily undertake productive and community politics activities.

**Reproductive work:** As defined by Moser, this involves the care and maintenance of the household and its members, including bearing and caring for children, preparing food, collecting water and fuel, shopping, housekeeping, and family health-care. In poor communities, reproductive work is, for the most part, labour-intensive and time-consuming. It is almost always the responsibility of women and girls.

**Productive work:** This involves the production of goods and services for consumption and trade (in employment and self-employment). Both women and men can be involved in productive activities, but their functions and responsibilities often differ. Women’s productive work is often less visible and less valued than men’s.

**Community work:** These activities include the collective organisation of social events and services – ceremonies and celebrations, activities to improve the community, participation in groups and organisations, local political activities, and so on. This type of work is seldom considered in economic analyses, yet it involves considerable volunteer time and is important for the spiritual and cultural development of communities. It is also a vehicle for community organisation and self-determination. Both women and men
engage in community activities, although a gender division of labour also prevails here. (MATCH 1991, 26) Moser divides community work into two different types of work.

Community-managing activities are undertaken primarily by women as an extension of their reproductive role. Such activities ensure the provision and maintenance of scarce resources which everyone uses, such as water, health-care, and education. This is voluntary unpaid work, carried out during women’s ‘free’ time.

Community politics are undertaken primarily by men, who take part in organised, formal politics, often within the framework of national politics. They are usually paid in cash for this work, or benefit indirectly through improved status or power. (MATCH 1991, 34)

Women, men, boys, and girls are all likely to take some part in each of these areas of work, but men are much less likely to be involved in reproductive work. In many societies, women and girls do almost all of the reproductive as well as much of the productive work. As the Moser framework recognises that women perform reproductive and community-management activities alongside productive work, it makes visible work that tends to be invisible. Ultimately, it aims to ensure that tasks are equally valued. Reproductive work is crucial to human survival, and to the maintenance and reproduction of the labour force, yet it is seldom considered ‘real’ work. For instance, when people are asked what work they do, their responses are usually related to productive work, especially paid or income-generating work.

It makes sense to use the triple-role analysis in a planning framework, because any development intervention in one area of work will affect the activities performed in the other two areas. For example, women’s reproductive workload can prevent them from participating in development projects. When they do participate, the additional time spent farming, producing goods, attending training sessions or meetings, means less time spent on other tasks such as child-care or food preparation.

**Moser Tool 2: Gender needs assessment**

The Moser Framework’s second tool builds on Maxine Molyneux’s (1985) concept of women’s gender interests. Moser’s concept is based on the idea that women as a group have particular needs, which differ from those of men as a group; not only because of women’s triple work role, but also because of their subordinate position to men in most societies. Similar to Molyneux’s concepts of practical and strategic gender interests, Moser distinguishes between two types of gender needs.

**Practical gender needs:** Moser defines practical gender needs as those which, if they were met, would assist women in their current activities. Interventions which focus on meeting practical gender needs respond to an immediate perceived necessity in a specific context, often related to inadequacies in living
conditions. Meeting practical gender needs does not challenge the existing gender division of labour or women's subordinate position in society, although these are the causes of women's practical gender needs. (MATCH 1991, 40)

Development interventions which are intended to meet women's practical gender needs may include:

- Water provision;
- Health-care provision;
- Opportunities for earning an income to provide for the household;
- Provision of housing and basic services;
- Distribution of food.

These needs are shared by all household members, yet women often identify them as their specific needs, because it is women who assume responsibility for meeting their families' requirements.

**Strategic gender needs**: Moser defines these as the needs which, if they were met, would enable women to transform existing imbalances of power between women and men. Women's strategic gender needs are those which exist because of women's subordinate social status. Strategic gender needs vary in particular contexts. They relate to gender divisions of labour, power, and control, and may include such issues as legal rights, domestic violence, equal wages, and women's control over their own bodies. Meeting strategic gender needs helps women to achieve greater equality and challenges their subordinate position, including their role in society. (MATCH 1991, 39)

Interventions which address women's strategic gender needs may include:

- Challenges to the gender division of labour;
- Alleviation of the burden of domestic labour and child care;
- The removal of institutionalised forms of discrimination such as laws and legal systems biased in favour of men;
- Provision of reproductive health services, offering women choice over child-bearing;
- Measures against male violence. (Molyneux 1985)

**Moser Tool 3: Disaggregating control of resources and decision-making within the household**

This tool asks the questions: Who controls what? Who decides what? How? Here the Moser Framework links allocation of resources within the household (intra-household allocation) with the bargaining processes which determine this. Who has control over what resources within the household, and who has what power of decision-making?
**Moser Tool 4: Planning for balancing the triple role**

Users of the framework are asked to examine whether a planned programme or a project will increase a woman's workload in one of her roles, to the detriment of her other roles. Women must balance competing demands on their reproductive, productive, and community responsibilities. The need to balance these roles determines women's involvement in each of the roles, and potentially constrains their involvement in activities which will significantly increase the time they need to spend in one particular role.

Moser also highlights how sectoral planning (which concentrates only on one area, such as transport, and is commonly undertaken by governments) has very often been particularly detrimental to women, since it does not consider the interplay between women's triple roles. Carrying out intersectoral, or linked, planning would avoid this problem.

**Moser Tool 5: Distinguishing between different aims in interventions: the WID/GAD Policy Matrix**

This is mainly a tool for evaluation, to examine what approach has been used in an existing project, programme, or policy. However, it can also be used to consider what would be most suitable approach for future work. Examining the policy approaches can help you anticipate some of their inherent weaknesses, constraints, and possible pitfalls.

The Moser Framework encourages users to consider how different planning interventions transform the subordinate position of women, by asking: to what extent do different approaches meet practical and/or strategic gender needs? To support this, Moser gives an analysis of five different types of policy approach which have dominated development planning over the last few decades, which she defines as the welfare, equity, anti-poverty, efficiency, and empowerment approach. These different policy approaches have not occurred in strict chronological order. In practice, many have appeared more or less simultaneously.

**Welfare:** This approach has existed since the 1950s. It was used most from 1950-70, but remains popular today. The welfare approach acknowledges women in their reproductive role only, and sees them as passive beneficiaries of development interventions. It aims to meet women's practical gender needs in their role as mothers, for example by providing food aid, implementing measures against malnutrition, and promoting family planning. The welfare approach can be characterised as 'top-down', and does not challenge the existing sexual division of labour or women's subordinate status.

**Equity:** This original WID approach was widely used in development work during the UN Women's Decade from 1976-85. Its purpose is to promote equality for women. The equity approach recognises women as active participants in development. It recognises the triple role, and seeks to meet women's strategic gender needs through direct state intervention, by giving
women political and economic autonomy, and by reducing their inequality with men. The equity approach is criticised by some as rooted in Western notions of feminism, is often considered to be threatening to men, and is unpopular with most governments.

**Anti-poverty:** This is a less radical adaptation of the WID equity approach, adopted from the 1970s onwards. Using the argument that women are disproportionately represented among the poorest people, the purpose of the anti-poverty approach is to ensure that poor women move out of poverty by increasing their productivity. Thus, women's poverty is seen as a problem of underdevelopment, not of subordination. This approach recognises the productive role of women, and seeks to meet their practical gender need of earning an income, particularly in small-scale, income-generating projects. It is most popular with NGOs.

**Efficiency:** The third, and now predominant, adaptation of the WID approach has been adopted especially since debt crisis in the 1980s. Its purpose is to ensure that development is more efficient and effective through harnessing women's economic contribution. It seeks to meet women's practical gender needs, recognising all three roles. However, the efficiency approach often assumes that women's time is elastic, and women are expected to compensate for declining social services by simply extending their working day. It often wrongly associates women's 'participation' with increased gender equity and decision-making power for women. Despite these problems, it is still a very popular approach.

**Empowerment:** This is the most recent approach, articulated by Southern women. Its purpose is to empower women through supporting their own initiatives, thus fostering self-reliance. Women's subordination is seen not only as a result of male oppression, but also as a consequence of colonial and neo-colonial oppression.

The empowerment approach also recognises that women's experience is very varied, tempered by other factors such as class, race, age, and so on. It argues that action is necessary at different levels to combat the various aspects of women's oppression. The empowerment approach openly acknowledges the centrality of power – asserting that women have to get more of it in order to change their position. It recognises the triple role and seeks to meet strategic gender needs indirectly, through grassroots mobilisation of women, for example through organising women's groups which can make demands for their practical gender needs to be met (Moser 1993, 231).

*Moser Tool 6: Involving women, and gender-aware organisations and planners, in planning*

Finally, Moser's framework asks users to think about the importance of involving women, gender-aware organisations, and planners themselves in planning. This is essential to ensure that real practical and strategic gender
needs are identified and incorporated into the planning process. These individuals or organisations must be involved not only in the analysis, but also in defining the goals of an intervention, and in its implementation.

Case study using Moser Framework

This case study refers to the Indonesia Forestry Project (pp 38-39) which has already been used as the case study for the Harvard Analytical Framework. The same case study is used here because some of the tools of the Moser Framework are similar to those of the Harvard Analytical Framework. Where this is the case, please refer to chapter 2.2 for full details, tables, and so on. Where a tool is unique to the Moser Framework, the full way of using it is shown here.

Using Moser Tool 1: Identifying gender roles/ triple role

This involves mapping who does what in a given community; the mapping is done in a similar way to the Activities Profile in the Harvard Analytical Framework (see p 33). When you use the Moser Framework, however, the roles and activities are analysed according to Moser's three categories of productive, reproductive, and community work.

Using Moser Tool 2: Gender needs assessment

This involves identifying women's practical and strategic gender needs – those needs they have as a consequence of their roles, tasks, and responsibilities; and those needs which, if they were met, would better enable them to challenge their existing inequality vis-à-vis men in their community.

For the Indonesia Forestry Project, the women's gender needs which were identified are listed in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example of Moser Tool 2: Gender needs assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women's practical gender needs</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- access to seedlings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- firewood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- needs related to reforestation and forestry activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- improved ovens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- marketing of rattan products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- specific training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- paid work</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from MATCH 1991, 132
No attempt was made in the Indonesia project to address any of the poor women's strategic gender interests. In addition, women's practical needs related to forest management and forest products were not addressed.

**Using Moser Tool 3: Disaggregating control of resources and decision-making within the household**

For this case study, the data on who controls what, who decides what, and how, has already been presented in the Access and Control Profile in the Harvard Framework (p 34). However, not enough information was found out about which member of the household makes what decisions, and how. For good project planning, more detailed work would need to be done.

**Using Moser Tool 4: Linked planning for balancing the triple role**

This is about checking that all women's existing work and responsibilities have been fully considered and taken into account during planning. In this case, better project planning would have given more consideration to women's workload or how women balanced their triple role. This project concentrated almost exclusively on women's productive role. Consequently, planners made unrealistic assumptions about women's capacity to increase their productivity and participate in training activities.

**Using Moser Tool 5: Analysing the policy aim, using the WID/GAD policy matrix**

This tool examines the intervention's objectives, in the light of various WID/GAD approaches. In this case, the only project objective that mentions women states the aim to 'improve women's role in rural development and increase their productivity'. Therefore, the underlying policy approach was an anti-poverty one. Little consideration was given either of women's underlying subordination or of their non-productive roles.

If, on the other hand, the Indonesia Forestry Project had been designed using an empowerment approach, the planners would have sought out opportunities for women to discuss their practical needs in a way which would also begin to address some of the strategic needs. Supporting women's capacity to identify their own strategic needs and to find ways of addressing these would have become part of the project.

**Using Moser Tool 6: Involving women, and gender-aware organisations and planners in planning**

All the decision-makers in the Indonesia Forestry project were men. Women were able to exert some influence through the women's association. However, this did not include the community's poorer women, and only one woman was allowed to represent the association in the farmers' groups. The project would need to look at better ways to include poor women in the planning.
Commentary on Moser Framework

Uses
Planning at all levels
The Moser Framework can be used for planning at all levels, from regional to project planning. As shown in the case study above, elements of this framework are frequently used in conjunction with the Harvard Framework.

Training for awareness-raising, programme planning, and implementation
The Moser Framework is frequently used in training on gender issues to raise awareness of women’s subordination, including their unequal workload, and to find potential ways of challenging these.

Why it appeals
Accessible and easily applicable
Many users find the Moser Framework easy to use. For instance, Sukey Field, a British gender trainer, reports that ‘the Moser Framework is accessible, easily taught and communicated, and most groups from rural NGO to government workers find it easily applicable to their work’. Nazneen Kanji, of the London School of Economics, comments: ‘An “adapted” Moser Framework is useful when dealing with high-level government and aid agency officials – [it is] less threatening than the Social Relations Approach [and] diffuses initial hostility’.

Moves ‘planning’ beyond technical concerns
The Moser Framework (and the literature on it) moves users from a purely technical approach to planning towards an understanding of its political significance. Planning is seen as transformative, as likely to lead to conflict, and it is argued that it should be considered a ‘debate’. The framework recognises that institutional/ political resistance to addressing, and transforming, gender relations is likely.

Speaks to planners in their own ‘language’
Moser’s Framework brings women’s subordination into the planning discourse, and challenges planners in terms that they are familiar with.

Challenges inequality
Moser’s concept of planning aims to challenge unequal gender relations and to support women’s empowerment. The tools of the Moser Framework remind users that not all work carried out in the name of women in development does this.

Powerful tools of practical and strategic gender needs
The concepts of practical and strategic gender needs have proved powerful tools for judging the impact that a development intervention has on gender
relations. In addition, the concepts remind development workers that women's short-term, practical needs must be addressed in a way which facilitates a more balanced relationship between men and women in the long term.

**The concept of the triple role makes all areas of work visible**
The triple role makes visible work that tends to be invisible, and helps to promote fairer valuing of tasks. It also reminds planners that productive, reproductive, and community work are interrelated. You cannot change one area without having an impact on the other sphere(s); and not all work takes place either in the household or in a designated workplace.

**Distinguishes between policy approaches and thus encourages questioning an intervention's purpose**
By categorising various WID/GAD policy approaches to development, Moser helps you think through the main policy assumptions which are driving a particular project (and therefore alerts you to its possible shortcomings).

**Potential limitations and adaptations**
**Radical agenda is depoliticised by the language of planning**
The strength of speaking to planners of women's subordination in terms which they are familiar with has an accompanying weakness. To some extent, the nature of planning language depoliticises Moser's message. Although Moser's framework is based on an analysis of power and inequality, the chosen language does not fully capture the dynamics of gender power relations: the complex to and fro of bargaining, co-operation, and conflict. It is important to bear this loss of political forcefulness in mind, and to be ready to compensate for it as necessary.

In particular, talking of their gender 'needs' may make women and men appear passive – this is the language of top-down planning. In contrast, Molyneux's original use of 'interests' is related to concepts of rights and challenges to the structures of power. Talking about 'needs' can therefore inadvertently undermine Moser's attempts to address the issue of power disparity between planners and those targeted by planning. She attempts this in Tool 6, which requires users to consider how women should be involved directly in planning.

**Concept of triple role does not fully capture the power imbalance between women and men**
Although Moser uses the concept of gender 'roles' as a way to explore women's subordination, the word has many meanings in different contexts (for example, in sociology or in drama). In particular, the term can have a sense of a 'natural' or prescribed order of things; it can also imply that people have choice, as in 'my chosen role'. The concept of women's triple role is, therefore, weighted with other meanings of the word. These can result in side-stepping
the issue of how power relations are structured and played out. (Note that the concept of roles is not commonly used in other debates which address issues of structural inequality, such as racism or disability.)

**Triple role or double role?**
The triple role concept makes visible the time-consuming socio-political and cultural work which is essential to an understanding of social phenomena. But some people find it difficult to accept these three roles. Naila Kabeer (1995) argues that one weakness of the concept is that it does not strictly logically distinguish between ‘who does what and how’, and ‘what is produced’. The distinction between reproduction and production is clear: the former provides childcare and domestic work, the latter produces goods and services. But it is less clear whether community work refers to the production of a third type of resource, or to how the labour is organised (i.e. people working collectively rather than individually).

Kabeer argues that what is lost in this three-way distinction is the fact that most resources can be produced in a variety of settings, and through a variety of relationships. For example, if childcare is the resource, it can be produced through unpaid family labour, through collective unpaid labour in the form of crèches, through paid labour in the form of private day-care centres or domestic services. It can be provided by the family, by the community, the market, or the state. Each possibility will have very different consequences for the planning process and very different implications for women. Categorising such work as either reproductive or community-management work does not reveal all the opportunities for potential interventions, or foresee the possible impact of change on women’s workload or status.

**Women’s and men’s separate activities are emphasised, rather than relationships between the two**
Like the Harvard and POP Frameworks, the Moser Framework emphasises what women and men do and the resources available to them, rather than focusing on the relationship between them, which determines how activities come to be performed by women or men, and the complex dynamics by which decisions are made. Even where the framework does examine issues of control or power, it still tends to over-emphasise the separation of women and men, rather than examining the ways in which women and men are connected.

**Does not highlight other forms of inequality**
Although Moser puts emphasis on the different types of households, and power differentials within households, the framework does not deal with other underlying inequalities, such as class and race. Women cannot be considered as a homogeneous category, who all share the same needs. In fact, women have interests and needs associated with other aspects of their identity – for example, class, age, or disability. A female domestic worker will have needs.
which are not shared with her female employer. The term ‘gender needs’ should not, therefore, be used synonymously with ‘women’s needs’; in practice, this confusion often occurs.

**Autonomy, not overwork or the triple role may be women’s main concern**

In some cases, the key issue for women is not the problem of balancing their different roles, but the fact that their roles are extremely restricted. In some cases, women have no ‘community role’ because they live in seclusion and are unable to mix in the community; in other cases, they are excluded from productive work.

**Division between strategic and practical is artificial**

Some people argue that the clear division between practical and strategic needs or interests is unhelpful, as in most cases there is a continuum from practical to strategic. For instance, is education a practical or strategic issue? The important thing is to think about how you can meet immediate and urgent needs in such a way as to begin challenging gender inequalities. Some people prefer Kate Young’s (1987) idea of transformatory potential to that of strategic and practical needs. This concept advocates that women themselves examine their practical needs and look for ways of striving to meet them which have ‘the capacity or potential for questioning, undermining, or transforming gender relations and the structure of subordination.’ (Young, 1987).

Others argue that all practical interventions affect women’s power and status, even when this is not factored into the planning process or recognised by those involved in the project (Longwe 1994). It is therefore dangerous to assume that practical and strategic are separate areas of interest.

**Ignores men as ‘gendered’ beings**

Moser’s definition of strategic gender needs leads users to consider these for women only. Some people believe that this makes the concept powerful, because it underlines that women are the subordinated sex in a patriarchal system. Others believe that we need to broaden the concept to one which includes men’s strategic gender interests, since men have very strong vested interests in any process of change, or in maintaining the status quo. Examining these will help us understand better how to work with men, and to anticipate where, and how, they may resist women’s empowerment.

The adaptation of Moser’s work by the DPU has redefined ‘gender needs’ in its Web of Institutionalisation to include men’s practical and strategic gender needs. See Appendix (p 123) for definitions.

**Change over time is not examined as a variable**

**Policy approaches may be misunderstood as clear-cut categories**

The policy approaches characterised by Moser are sometimes criticised as false dichotomies, because there have been many variations. Although Moser
does point out that her categorisation should only be seen as showing the 'pure' version of each policy approach, her neat (but deliberately simplified) classification can lead to the trap of summing up an intervention in terms of a policy approach, without looking closely enough at the details. For instance, an intervention providing services to support women's reproductive role does not necessarily use a welfare approach - it may be part of a well thought-out strategy of transformation.

**New policy approaches need to be developed and conceptualised**

The characterisation of policy approaches in the Moser Framework is a powerful tool both for examining the history of development, and for examining the underlying goals and assumptions of existing policy and project interventions. However, although we need to be aware of past approaches and their influence on our current thinking, we must also be ready to explore new approaches as appropriate to given contexts. Some would argue that there is a danger that people will try to work too much within the given approaches, rather than recognising how dynamic policy is, and should be.

Some users said they find it more useful simply to work with the distinction between Women in Development (WID) and Gender and Development (GAD) as approaches.

**May encounter strong resistance**

The goal of gender planning in the Moser Framework is the 'emancipation of women from their subordination'. Strong resistance will exist where development workers do not accept this as a legitimate aim.

**Further reading**


An interesting commentary from users of the Moser Framework (quoted from in the above Commentary) can be found in Kabeer, N (1994) *Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*, Verso, London.
2.4 | Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM)

Background

The Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) was developed by Rani Parker,\(^8\) in collaboration with development practitioners working for a Middle Eastern NGO. They expressed a need for a framework appropriate to their grassroots work. As a result, the GAM is very much influenced by the reality and ideology of participatory planning; it can also accommodate the constraints imposed by shortage of funding and time, illiteracy, and insufficient or non-existent quantitative data on gender roles.

All the information in this section, including the case study, comes from Another Point of View: A Manual on Gender Analysis Training for Grassroots Workers, by A. Rani Parker, published by UNIFEM in 1993. A reprint is available from Women, Ink. Publishers, New York.

Aims of the framework

The GAM aims to help determine the different impact development interventions have on women and men, by providing a community-based technique for identifying and analysing gender differences. The GAM is a transformatory tool, in that its use is intended to initiate a process of analysis by community members themselves. It encourages the community to identify and constructively challenge their assumptions about gender roles.

The framework

The GAM is based on the following principles:

- All requisite knowledge for gender analysis exists among the people whose lives are the subject of the analysis.

- Gender analysis does not require the technical expertise of those outside the community, except as facilitators.
Gender analysis cannot promote transformation unless it is carried out by the people being analysed. (Parker 1993, 2)

The GAM is filled in by a group within the community which, preferably, should include women and men in equal numbers. The GAM can be used at different stages in the project cycle, to assess both the potential and the actual impact of an intervention on the community's gender relations. The objectives at each stage are as follows: 'At the planning stage to determine whether potential gender effects are desirable and consistent with programme goals; at the design stages where gender considerations may change the design of the project; or during monitoring and evaluation stages, to address broader programme impacts'. (Parker 1993, 29)

The GAM features two main concepts on a matrix which focuses on the impact of a development intervention.

**Example of GAM**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labour</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Parker 1993*

**GAM Tool 1: Analysis at four 'levels' of society**

The GAM analyses the impact of development interventions at four levels: women, men, households, and community. Other levels (depending on the project goals and the community in question) such as age group, class, ethnic group, and so on, can be added as appropriate. The four main categories which appear vertically on the GAM matrix are defined below.

**Women:** This refers to women of all ages who are in the target group (if the target group includes women), or to all women in the community.

**Men:** This refers to men of all ages who are in the target group (if the target group includes men), or to all men in the community.
Household: This refers to all women, men, and children living together, even if they are not part of one nuclear family. Although the type of household may vary even within the same community, people always know what constitutes their ‘household’ or ‘family’. Their own definition or unit of analysis should be used for this level in the GAM.

Community: This refers to everyone within the project area. The purpose of this level is to extend the analysis beyond the family. However, communities are complex and usually comprise a number of different groups of people with different interests. So if a clearly defined ‘community’ is not meaningful in the context of the project, this level of analysis may be eliminated. (Parker 1993)

GAM Tool 2: Analysis of four kinds of impact

The GAM looks at impact on four areas: labour, time, resources (considering both access and control), and socio-cultural factors. These categories appear horizontally on the GAM matrix.

- Labour: This refers to changes in tasks (for example, fetching water from the river), the level of skill required (skilled or unskilled, formal education, training), and labour capacity (How many people carry out a task, and how much can they do? Is it necessary to hire labour, or can members of the household do the work?).

- Time: This refers to changes in the amount of time (three hours, four days, and so on) it takes to carry out the task associated with the project or activity.

- Resources: This category refers to the changes in access to resources (income, land, and credit) as a consequence of the project, and the extent of control over changes in resources (more or less) for each group analysed.

- Socio-cultural factors: This refers to changes in social aspects of the participants’ lives (including changes in gender roles or status) as a result of the project. (Parker 1993)

Using the GAM

The GAM is used with groups of community members (with equal representation of women and men), facilitated by a development worker. Over time, it is hoped that community members themselves will facilitate the process, but Rani Parker points out that in the early stages, an experienced facilitator is needed. The analysis is always done by the group.

It is intended that the analysis in the GAM should be reviewed and revised once a month for the first three months, and once every three months thereafter. Every box should be verified on each review of the GAM. Unexpected results, as well as expected ones, must be added to the matrix.

When the GAM has been filled in, the group discusses the findings by asking the following questions.

- Are the effects listed on the GAM desirable? Are they consistent with the programme’s goals?
• How is the intervention affecting those who do not participate?
• Which results are unexpected? (These will appear on GAMs filled in during and after implementation.)

After the boxes have been filled in with the changes brought about by the project, group members should go back to the matrix and add the following:
• a plus sign (+) if the outcome is consistent with project goals;
• a minus sign (-) if the outcome is contrary to project goals;
• a question mark (?) if they are unsure whether it is consistent or contrary.

These signs are intended to give a picture of the different effects of the intervention; they are not intended to be added up in an effort to determine its net effect. This would over-simplify the picture of complex reality, and misrepresent the mix of positive and negative effects which all interventions have.

The GAM is intended to be used in addition to other standard tools of analysis such as monitoring tools, needs assessments, and so on.

Case study of GAM: Potable water in Ouled Hamouda

This case study focuses on development work in a community of 110 families called Ouled Hamouda, in the town of Makhtar in Western Tunisia. Here, the women had to walk two kilometres down a very steep, muddy path to get water. Twice each day, they filled their cans with water and carried the 20 litre cans on their backs up the steep hill. Even pregnant or sick woman did this, or those carrying their little children who could not be left behind alone in the house.

The Tunisian Foundation for Community Development (le Fondation Tunisienne pour le Developpement Communautaire/ FTDC) organises periodic development meetings in each of the 22 communities where it works. During these meetings, the community identifies problems, classifies, and prioritises these, identifies which projects would address problems, and discusses what contribution the community can make to the projects. Contributions can be in cash, kind, or labour.

In Ouled Hamouda, where the FTDC had worked for seven years, the women rated their difficulty in getting water as their biggest problem. Men, who never fetch water, rated this problem as their fifth priority. Traditionally, men, not women, construct wells. The use of the Gender Analysis Matrix in Ouled Hamouda enabled the men to understand the potential impact of addressing this problem at all four levels identified in the matrix. After completing the matrix, both women and men classified the water project as their first priority.

A committee for potable water was created, which included women and men selected by the community. A well was constructed only 300 metres away
from people's homes, and equipped with a motor pump that ejected water into a large, well-constructed cistern. Today the water project is completed and potable water is easily accessible to everyone in the community.

*Initial Gender Analysis Matrix from Ouled Hamouda*

This matrix represents the combined views of men and women in Ouled Hamouda. It represents their expectations of the impact of a project to bring potable water to the village. It enabled men and women to think through the importance and desirability of such a project. The pluses and minuses were added afterwards; a plus if the change was consistent with the project goal, a minus if it was not.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Labour</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
<td>+ Don't need to carry big cans of water</td>
<td>+ Save time</td>
<td>- Must pay for water</td>
<td>- Responsibility of paying for water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ No fears about personal security</td>
<td>+ Have more time with children</td>
<td>+ Can have home garden or other small projects</td>
<td>+ Opportunity to participate in community project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Men</strong></td>
<td>- A lot of work, difficult work</td>
<td>- Takes a lot more time to build, dig, etc</td>
<td>+ Portable water is available</td>
<td>+ Don't have to worry as much about the family when away</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ Learn new skills for work outside the community</td>
<td>+ Can stay home with family while working</td>
<td>+ Improved nutrition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household</strong></td>
<td>+ Women feel more secure when fetching water - can leave child at home</td>
<td>+ Women can give more time to child care</td>
<td>+ Easy access to potable water</td>
<td>+ New activity for children - they can help their mother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ New activity for entire family</td>
<td></td>
<td>+ Improved nutrition and better health</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community</strong></td>
<td>+ Establish Committee for Potable Water + Learn about services provided by government</td>
<td>- Less free time for leisure - Many more community meetings to attend</td>
<td>+ More potable water available for all</td>
<td>+ Clean environment + Prestige for the community</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Parker 1993, 52.

---

*Using the GAM: Project objectives in Ouled Hamouda*
Questions arising from the matrix, and answers given in discussion:

- Are the effects listed above desirable and consistent with programme goals? Yes.

- How will this activity affect those who do not participate? All community members will benefit from better access to potable water.

- Were there unexpected results, to be identified during implementation: There were some unexpected results, which are included in the next section. (Parker 1992, 52)

Changes in Ouled Hamouda following the project

- The new water source provided potable water.

- Men became more aware of the burden of women’s labour.

- Although the women had assumed that they would have to pay for the water, the men paid for it, because the job of collecting payments fell to a male member of the committee.

- Some aspects of existing gender relations were reinforced: for example, the receiving and handling of money remained in the men’s hands. Although a woman was assigned to check water usage and to ensure that everything worked, the men actually came in and carried out the repairs.

- Once the project was completed, men and children began to fetch water, changing the traditional gender division of labour for this task.

- Systems of organisation within the community were strengthened as systems for collecting payments for water usage were developed. The community determined the charges for water usage; they agreed that four families would be allowed to use the water free of charge, because they could not afford to pay for it.

- The new water source provided greater personal security for women. Also, since the well was close by, women were able to leave small children at home while they went to fetch water.

- Men spent more time at home during the project construction phase and later were able to market their skills in water-system construction and maintenance.

- The committee used to attend a district meeting at which men from other communities had ridiculed the men of Ouled Hamouda because there were so many women participating in the decision-making. This also has changed, and although there are still not many women on committees, the women on the Ouled Hamouda committee are increasingly becoming accepted in their new roles of leadership. (Parker 1993, 53)
Commentary on GAM

Uses
A participatory planning tool
The GAM is expressly designed for planning, designing, monitoring, and evaluating projects at a community level.

Useful for transformatory gender training
The GAM is a tool with a high potential for raising awareness of women's subordination as a result of unequal gender relations, so it is appropriate for use in transformatory gender training.

Purpose-designed training manual
The manual outlining the use of the GAM has been specifically designed for training purposes and includes a training methodology.

Why it appeals
Designed specifically for community-based development workers
The framework was specifically developed to fit in the reality of community-based development workers: it is accessible, flexible, and designed to accommodate changes over time, including those which are unexpected.

Simple and systematic; uses familiar categories and concepts
GAM is simple and systematic. GAM does not rely on unique or new concepts, but instead employs ones familiar to gender and development researchers and workers. Others who encounter these concepts and categories for the first time when using GAM can transfer them to other gender and development work.

Transformatory as well as technical
The GAM is designed to initiate a learning process. Parker claims that over time, the likelihood of changes favouring gender equity is increased. This is borne out by one user who sees the GAM as a useful tool for gender training because it raises consciousness about gender inequalities through the design of the categories of analysis. Because they move from practical issues to cultural change, participants cannot avoid making the links between practical impact and intangible changes at a cultural and ideological level. The use of the GAM means that transformatory work takes place simultaneously to the acquisition of practical skills.

Fosters 'bottom-up' analysis through community participation
The process of analysis should fully involve the people who are the subjects of the analysis, drawing on, and valueing, the group's diverse strengths and perspectives, rather than relying on individual expertise. The GAM enables members of the community to articulate a full range of expectations concerning a particular project.
Considers gender relations between women and men, as well as examining what each category experiences separately

The use of both the categories of household and community, as well as of women and men is one way of trying to draw out the connectedness of gender relations. It helps move gender and development workers away from a tendency to see men and women as separate, homogeneous groups, which can be considered in isolation from each other. One user comments that the inclusion of men gains the confidence of male participants in a gender training workshop since they no longer see facilitators 'talking about gender, but focusing on women only'.

Levels of analysis can be added to in order to suit particular interventions

The levels of analysis can incorporate various groups within the community; for example, a project targeting girl children can include them as a category.

Includes intangible resources.

In addition to labour and resources, GAM also highlights time and socio-political issues.

Can be used to capture changes over time

A single use of the GAM will provide only a 'snapshot' of one particular moment in a project's life. However, by repeating the GAM process, the tool can be used to follow changes over time. When complete, the GAMs filled in over the duration of a project can provide a dynamic overview of the negative and positive effects of a single project/programme on a community.

Helps anticipate resistance, and encourages consideration of what support should be offered for those at risk

The participatory process which the GAM insists on enables all concerned, from funding agencies to the community, to anticipate the resistance that the project or programme might meet from participants and non-participants. One user comments that this is invaluable for projects where women 'beneficiaries' need to be aware that they may be subject to violence from men, as a result of challenging gender relations. Implementing agencies must include in their plans the kinds of support which groups who would be under threat have a right to be offered.

Includes men as gendered beings, so can be used in interventions which target men

The levels of analysis include men as well as women, and therefore the framework can be used in situations where men or boys are the target of a development intervention, due to their particular experience of the gender division of labour and power (for example, work with ex-combatants, child miners, in anti-violence projects, and so on). Caroline Sweetman, of Oxfam GB, reports that gender training with male participants was made easier by the
inclusion of the category of men, because it overcame men's resistance. One participant told her 'we usually hear facilitators talking about gender but focusing on women only'.

**Can be used for participatory impact assessment**
The GAM is a very useful tool for impact assessment. It is an effective way of bringing out local impact indicators, building on the project members' own analysis.

**Quick data gathering**
Filling in a GAM can be a relatively quick way of gathering complex and rich data. According to the author, the completion of a GAM takes two to four hours, especially during the first few analyses.

**Potential limitations**
- Needs a good facilitator
  - For the analysis to be effective, a good facilitator is required. When the GAM is first introduced, or when no literate facilitator can be found within the community, facilitation will be needed from outside the community.

- Some factors can get lost because categories have many aspects
  - The facilitator must take care to remember and to remind everyone in the group that each category of analysis incorporates many aspects, not just the most obvious ones. For example, 'labour' includes skills as well as training, 'resources' must differentiate between access and control, and the category 'cultural factors' can include everything that is done to continue and/ or expand existing social networks.

- Requires careful repetition in order to consider change over time
  - The matrix requires repetition of the analysis over time. Once begun, the process must be continued to ensure that negative perceptions and stereotypes about gender roles are challenged.

- Does not seek out the most vulnerable community members
  - Although the GAM can be expanded to consider specific inequalities which cross-cut gender divisions, such as ethnicity, it does not explicitly differentiate which men, and which women, are most likely to experience negative or positive impacts. Finding this out must be seen by the facilitators as a crucial part of their role. An adaptation is to add 'Which women, which men' in large letters under the matrix.

- Excludes macro- and institutional analysis
  - The GAM framework does not consider the potentials offered and the constraints imposed by either the implementing agencies or external forces beyond the community.
Difficulties defining a community
It is sometimes difficult to define who is actually participating in the project, or who should be deemed as the community.

Subordination is often not explicit
Participatory methods, including the GAM, give scope to explore women's perspectives. However, there is a danger that the GAM can lead to a false consensus and false confidence that women have taken an equal part in defining the future. Where women's views have previously been silenced, the process of filling in the GAM may not be enough to capture their perspectives of the complex links between their problems and their subordinate status. It is likely that much time must be spent with women to find ways of articulating issues which they consider important.

While the GAM is designed for use with mixed groups, there may be times when it is better to use it with women-only or men-only groups, or with groups of young women and older women separately, depending on the context.

Risk of misleading outcomes due to power relations between funders and community members
As with all participatory methods, there is a risk of misleading outcomes, because community members may resist discussing all issues freely; for example, negative aspects of the project may not be discussed for fear of funding being refused. It is important that the community has trust in the process and in the implementing agencies.

Further reading
The Gender Analysis Matrix is presented in a very user-friendly training manual: Another point of view: A manual on gender analysis training for grassroots workers, A Rani Parker, published by UNIFEM, 1993, and reprinted by Women's Ink., New York, 1998. The manual has been specifically designed for training purposes and includes a training methodology; a section for the audience to assess for themselves the uses and limitations of the framework; and materials which can be reproduced for handouts.
2.5 | Capacities and Vulnerabilities Analysis Framework

'Development is a process by which vulnerabilities are reduced and capacities are increased.' (Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 12).

Background

The Capacities and Vulnerabilities Analysis (CVA), like the People-Oriented Analytical Framework, was designed specifically for use in humanitarian interventions, and for disaster preparedness.

However, unlike the POP Framework, the CVA is not grounded in a single agency's experience of relief work. Rather, it resulted from a research project, the International Relief and Development Project at Harvard University, which examined 30 case studies of NGOs responding to various disaster situations around the world. Some of the people who were involved in designing the framework also developed the Harvard Analytical Framework.


Aims of the Framework

The CVA was designed to help outside agencies plan aid in emergencies, in such a way that interventions meet immediate needs, and at the same time build on the strengths of people and their efforts to achieve long-term social and economic development.

The Framework

CVA is based on the central idea that people's existing strengths (or capacities) and weaknesses (or vulnerabilities) determine the impact that a crisis has on
them, as well as the way they respond to the crisis. A crisis becomes a disaster when it outstrips a society's capacity to cope. In the long term, emergency interventions should aim to increase people's capacities, and reduce their vulnerabilities. As such, CVA is a developmental approach to relief in emergencies.

In the following, the concepts of capacities and vulnerabilities are defined.

**Capacities:** This term describes the existing strengths of individuals and social groups. They are related to people's material and physical resources, their social resources, and their beliefs and attitudes. Capacities are built over time and determine people's ability to cope with crisis and recover from it.

**Vulnerabilities:** These are the long-term factors which weaken people's ability to cope with the sudden onset of disaster, or with drawn-out emergencies. They also make people more susceptible to disasters. Vulnerabilities exist before disasters, contribute to their severity, make effective disaster response harder, and continue after the disaster.

The concept of vulnerabilities in the CVA framework is very different from the concept of needs as used in a disaster context. Needs here are not used in the sense of practical and strategic gender needs; they are understood as 'immediate requirements for survival or recovery from crisis' (Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 10). Therefore immediate needs are often addressed by short-term, practical interventions (such as relief food). Addressing vulnerabilities, in contrast, requires the long-term strategic solutions which are part of development work.

For instance, those who experience regular mudslides in an urban area may have needs for temporary shelters and medical attention. On the other hand, their vulnerabilities are linked to those factors which directly contribute to the suffering caused by the mudslide (crowding, building homes on unstable land) and to others which indirectly affect the community's ability to respond to serious crisis (rural-to-urban migration, lack of government legislation on building codes, absence of strong community organisations) (Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 10).

**CVA Tool 1: Categories of capacities and vulnerabilities**

The CVA distinguishes between three categories of capacities and vulnerabilities, using an analysis matrix. The three categories used are physical, social, and motivational capacities and vulnerabilities.

**Physical or material capacities and vulnerabilities:** These include features of the climate, land, and environment where people live, or lived before the crisis; their health, skills, their work; their housing, technologies, water and food supply; their access to capital and other assets. All of these will be different for women and for men. While women and men suffer material deprivation during crisis, they always have some resources left, including skills and possibly goods. These are capacities upon which agencies can build.

The CVA encourages users to ask two main questions.
• What were/ are the ways in which men and women in the community were/ are physically or materially vulnerable?

• What productive resources, skills, and hazards existed/ exist? Who (men and/ or women) had/ have access and control over these resources?

Social or organisational capacities and vulnerabilities: This category refers to the social fabric of a community, and includes the formal political structures and the informal systems through which people make decisions, establish leadership, or organise various social and economic activities. Social systems include family and community systems, and decision-making patterns within the family and between families.

Gender analysis in this category is crucial, because women’s and men’s roles in these various forms of organisation differ widely. Decision-making in social groups may exclude women, or women may have well-developed systems for exchanging labour and goods. Divisions on the basis of gender, race, class, or ethnicity, can weaken the social fabric of a group, and increase its vulnerability.

CVA asks users to consider:

• What was the social structure of the community before the disaster, and how did it serve them in the face of this disaster?

• What has been the impact of the disaster on social organisation?

• What is the level and quality of participation in these structures?

Motivational and attitudinal capacities and vulnerabilities: These include cultural and psychological factors which may be based on religion, on the community’s history of crisis, on their expectation of emergency relief. Crisis can be a catalyst for extraordinary efforts by communities, but when people feel victimised and dependent, they may become fatalistic and passive, and suffer a decrease in their capacities to cope with and recover from the situation. Their vulnerabilities can be increased by inappropriate relief aid, which does not build on people’s own abilities, develop their confidence, or offer them opportunities for change.

CVA encourages users to ask:

• How do men and women in the community view themselves, and their ability to deal effectively with their social/ political environment?

• What were people’s beliefs and motivations before the disaster and how has the disaster affected them? This includes beliefs about gender roles and relations.

• Do people feel they have the ability to shape their lives? Do men and women feel they have the same ability?
### Example of the Capacities and Vulnerabilities Analysis Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Physical/material</th>
<th>Vulnerabilities</th>
<th>Capacities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What productive resources, skills, and hazards exist?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social/organisational</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the relationships between people? What are their organisational structures?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivational/attitudinal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does the community view its ability to create change?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

'Development is the process by which vulnerabilities are reduced and capacities increased.'

Source: Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 12

### CVA Tool 2: Additional dimensions of 'complex reality'

In order to make the CVA matrix reflect reality's complexity, five other dimensions must be added to the analysis.

**Disaggregation of communities by gender**

Capacities, vulnerabilities, and needs are differentiated by gender. Women and men experience crisis differently, according to their gender roles. They have different needs and interests. Women, by virtue of their lower economic, social, and political status, tend to be more vulnerable to crisis. They may also be more open to change – and gender roles can change rapidly as a result of emergencies. CVA enables these forms of social differentiation to be taken into account and mapped out on the matrix (see overleaf, top table).

**Disaggregation according to other dimensions of social relations**

A community can also be analysed according to other factors which stratify it: by the level of wealth (see overleaf, bottom table), by political affiliation, by ethnic or language groups, by age, and so on. The question always of who reveals how different people and groups are differently affected by crisis and interventions.
Example of CVA Matrix disaggregated by gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vulnerabilities</th>
<th>Capacities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical/material</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social/organisational</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivational/attitudinal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 16

Example of CVA Matrix disaggregated by economic class

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vulnerabilities</th>
<th>Capacities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Rich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical/material</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social/organisational</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivational/attitudinal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 16

Change over time
Societies are dynamic, and change over time. The CVA Matrix only provides a snapshot of a given moment. However, it can be used repeatedly – for example, before an intervention and after – to examine social change and to evaluate impact. In particular, the CVA Matrix can be used to assess change in gender relations as a result of an emergency, and of agency interventions.

‘Interactions’ between categories of analysis
There is constant interaction between the categories of analysis used in CVA. Different categories of vulnerabilities and capacities are related to each other, and changes in one will have an impact on the others. For example, increasing people’s social organisations may reduce their vulnerability to material loss, and also increase group confidence.

Analysis at different scales and levels of society
CVA can be applied to small villages and neighbourhoods, to larger districts, to whole nations, and even to regions. As the scale of application increases, the
factors examined become less precisely defined; but one can still assess both the disaster proneness and the development potential at each level.

There are also interactions between different levels of society. Various social groups are affected differently by policies and events at the regional, national, and international level. Applying CVA to different levels can help you assess what the links between the different levels are (Anderson and Woodrow 1989, 16).

Case study on CVA: Gender and vulnerability among refugees from Sierra Leone in Guinea

This case study is based on the work of Fiona Gell, then an advisor in Oxfam GB’s Emergencies Department.

Following a rebel attack in the north of Sierra Leone at the beginning of 1995, many refugees fled across the border to south-western Guinea. An estimated 20,000 refugees sheltered in local towns and villages, receiving food and shelter from the host population. The refugees were a mix of different ethnicities, and had fled from different parts of Sierra Leone. Some were agriculturalists, while others had lived in cities. The majority belonged to an ethnic group which spans the Sierra Leone-Guinea border.

During the summer, UNHCR staff encouraged the refugees to construct houses on seven sites, and a re-registration of refugees followed. Oxfam GB assisted with emergency water provision, and a sanitation and community-health programme. This involved supporting existing health posts in the refugee-affected area. UNHCR provided food, household items, clothes, and tools for house construction for those living on the sites. Refugees are now increasingly requesting assistance for programmes supporting self-reliance and education.

Fiona Gell, a gender and representation adviser for Oxfam’s emergency programmes, spent two months in south-western Guinea investigating issues of gender and vulnerability within the refugee population, using participatory rural appraisal exercises and holding discussions with Oxfam’s community health supervisors and representatives of the UNHCR, NGOs, local government and community organisations. We first list some highlights from her findings on the refugees’ physical and material capacities and vulnerabilities below, and then present a completed CVA matrix, which sums up these issues and also features the social/organisational and motivational/attitudinal aspects of her research.

Physical/material vulnerabilities

- Although UNHCR provided all refugees with a general monthly food ration, they assumed that families were able to supplement their diet independently, which is normally the case. Those who found this
particularly hard included female-headed households, unaccompanied elderly persons, people with disabilities, and urban people who had trading skills but who no longer had access to start-up capital.

- There was a high level of disease during the rainy season, when there is also scarce food and very little money.

- Female-headed households faced particular difficulties in registration:
  - some had registered their families in the name of absent men, and were unable to re-register precisely because these men were absent;
  - some were pushed out of line and then did not register because they lacked the time to queue again;
  - some were unable to register because they were attending a sick child in hospital.

- Certain female-headed households, unaccompanied elderly people, and heads of household with disabilities were unable to access adult male labour to construct houses on site and thus qualify for registration.

- Female heads of household had fewer opportunities to generate income than male heads, mainly because of domestic responsibilities. The pressure to construct a house meant that many women sold large quantities of their food rations to buy labour, or took out loans against the next food ration, thus depleting the family's already minimal food supply.

- A number of people with disabilities such as deafness or mental illness were unaware of the importance of registration.

- Allusions were also made to women succumbing to sexual coercion to access labour.

- Some female-headed households also complained of not getting equal access to tools for house construction. Tools were distributed to groups of five families, and distribution was typically dominated by men.

- Some people with disabilities such as leprosy had trouble getting food during distribution.

- Refugees who were originally urban traders had little experience of agriculture, house- and latrine-construction, and were unaccustomed to the rigours of rural life.

**Physical/material capacities**

- UNHCR supplied monthly food rations.

- Refugees generated income by selling maize rations, blankets, and so on.
• Both women and men had found work on local farms as day labourers; some had made crop-sharing arrangements; where there were rivers, men had found work as fishers.

• Some refugees had owned land in the area for many years as well as in their home villages. Some had found land nearby (on either side of the border), which they returned to frequently. Those with land on Sierra Leone's side of the border returned to the camps at night for security.

• Many people, particularly those women who had traditionally been traders, managed to generate a small income by trading in small items. Children were also involved in trade.

• Women with relatives among the host population had access to capital.

• Women’s skills included soap-making, baking, textile-dyeing, petty trading, agriculture (growing groundnuts, rice, and vegetables); they also worked as teachers, traditional birth attendants, and community workers.

• Five of Oxfam’s community-health supervisors were trained teachers who had been trained in counselling children.

• Palm wine was tapped by men from ethnic groups which are more permissive about alcohol consumption.

• Female-headed households were potentially able to exchange labour for male labour.

• Some women who headed households had taken on traditionally male roles, while others had not.

Social/organisational vulnerabilities

• 27% of households were headed by women whose husbands had either been killed by the rebels or were living elsewhere. While some female-headed households adapted to the new conditions by changing their traditional role, others were evidently unable to cope adequately.

• Less favoured wives in polygamous marriages often faced similar problems to female-headed households.

• Refugees who were originally traders were less likely to have kinship networks in the new settlement areas. Refugees arrived in the area after having walked long distances, physically and psychologically exhausted. In addition, many of them did not speak the local language.

• The Red Cross expressed concern about child trafficking.

• Prostitution was common.
Social/organisational capacities

- Many refugees had strong kinship ties across the border and/or owned land on both sides of the border. This often meant that local families offered food and shelter in return for agricultural and domestic work; many refugees were loaned a plot of land for cultivation. With the move to the refugee sites, some of the refugees had managed to maintain these economic ties.

- No unaccompanied children were identified, and orphans had been taken in by other families. Informal reports suggest that orphans fare less well during food shortages.

- The population was extremely mobile as families pursued several survival strategies at any one time. Many of the families who owned land close to the border in Sierra Leone left some members behind on the farm to guard the property and start farming. Other family members returned daily to help on the land. A few family members, often the wife and a few children, would stay at the refugee site to maintain a presence and guard the house.

- The women in some ethnic groups for women form groups to work small areas of donated land, according to tradition.

- There were women's organisations among the host population which ran income-generation and rice and vegetable production schemes. These had stated their willingness to share their skills with refugee women.

- Refugee committees existed.

Motivational/attitudinal vulnerabilities

- Many refugees, particularly women, had relatives who were tortured, killed, or taken by the rebels, and many had witnessed horrific atrocities. Many had fled several times, and did not know whether their relatives were dead or alive. Most of the refugees seemed to be coping quietly with the enormous subsequent psychological stress, but a few had evidently developed symptoms of mental illness.

Motivational/attitudinal capacities

- The combination of survival strategies (such as returning across the border to work on their old farms at the same time as registering on the refugee sites) seemed to allow families to maintain some level of independence, while also making sure they would remain eligible for external assistance (such as food distribution) which would be necessary in the case of further attacks and insecurity.
The types of support refugees asked for most were education and constructive play for the children; income generation for adults; and co-operative commercial ventures to rebuild social networks broken down by dispersal and flight. Assistance with the tracing of missing family members would help restore some sense of hope in the future.

There was a wealth of primary and secondary school teachers within the refugee population. Some refugees had set up schools where teachers worked without pay.

**Recommendations**

Following Fiona Gell's survey and her analysis of the refugee community's capacities and vulnerabilities, she made a number of recommendations including those below.

**To combat the vulnerabilities she advised:**

- to install a system for the registration of those refugees who were missed in the previous registration, or who had recently arrived;
- to supplement the diet of those physically vulnerable (such as children under five or lactating mothers) or vulnerable for socio-economic reasons (such as single parent families or unaccompanied elderly persons);
- to encourage the full representation of those people with particular vulnerabilities on existing refugee committees;
- to explore some form of psycho-social support for those individuals who were unable to cope with their severely distressing experiences;
- to request the services of the International Committee of the Red Cross for the tracing of relatives, as much of the stress refugees suffered related to the disappearance of family members.

**To build on capacities, Fiona Gell recommended:**

- to promote income-generation schemes for those unable to raise income or construct houses, such as those from cities who had no kinship ties with the settled region, or female-headed households. (Proposals had already been made for such small business programmes, individual skills had been identified, and work groups organised.)
- to use the refugee committees actively to find out about the views of all sectors of the refugee population.
- to explore how psycho-social support could be provided using resources within the community, perhaps starting with Oxfam’s community-health supervisors, who were already trained in counselling children.
To build on the fact that Oxfam's community-health supervisors and their team of health workers could give advice on what kind of support the most vulnerable families needed, as well as on who were the most capable refugees for co-ordinating self-reliance programmes.

### Using the CVA Matrix: refugees in Sierra Leone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vulnerabilities</th>
<th>Capacities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Physical/material</strong></td>
<td>Women's skills include:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What productive resources, skills, and hazards exist?</td>
<td>- income-generation (making soap, baking, dyeing textile, petty trading);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female heads of households unable to access male labour to construct camp houses; thus not eligible to receive food rations. As a consequence, many women:</td>
<td>- agriculture (groundnuts, rice, and vegetables);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- are coerced into giving sexual favours to access male labour;</td>
<td>- vocational work (teachers, traditional birth attendants, community workers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- are forced into taking out loans against next food ration, leading to debt cycle;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- are involved in prostitution in urban host communities.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social/organisational</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the relationships between people? What are their organisational structures?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 27% of households led by a woman (husbands killed, disappeared or away searching for work);</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Distribution of tools in camp dominated by men; female heads of households do not have full access.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motivational/attitudinal</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How does the community view its ability to create change?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Morale very low on arrival at camp among people who fled rebel fighters several times, following repeated attacks,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Many women who lost husbands and children to the rebels particularly affected.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After a time, refugees developed survival strategies to maximise opportunity to earn an income:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- women and children remained in camp;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- young men returned to Sierra Leone to guard the land and start farming.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Commentary on CVA

Uses
In emergencies and for development work
The CVA was designed for use in humanitarian interventions and so is especially useful in disaster relief. However, it is also a useful tool in development work, particularly for communities in vulnerable areas or those affected by chronic crises.

As a planning and assessment tool
CVA can be used to plan responses. In addition, by applying it over time, it can be used to assess change, particularly change brought about in gender relations as the result of an emergency, or of agency interventions.

Useful at different levels
CVA can be used at different levels - from the community to the national, regional, and even international level, thus enabling researchers to assess the links between the different levels.

Why it appeals
'Maps' complexity
CVA helps to chart a complex real situation, to highlight its crucial factors, and to illustrate the relationships between factors which matter most to project effectiveness.

Can be used at different stages
The CVA model is flexible and can be used before, during, and after a disaster, major change, or intervention.

Encourages a long-term perspective
CVA encourages a combination of long-term and short-term perspectives and strategies, to ensure that vulnerabilities are reduced and capacities improved.

Examines social interactions and the psychological realm
The CVA Framework attempts to ensure that an NGO will not only concentrate on material things. It gives prominence to the social interactions within a community, such as social cohesion and leadership, highlighting that these can be a resource or a hindrance. It also emphasises the psychological realm, and is able to examine emotions such as loss of hope in the future. Motivation and attitudes are seen as crucial resources or barriers, and interventions designed with CVA should take these into account. In some cases, responses directly address them. For example, in the Philippines, agencies have undertaken work with children suffering stress after typhoons.

Simple, but not simplistic
The CVA framework is relatively simple to understand and use; yet it is not over-simplistic.
Includes other forms of inequality
The CVA matrix model can be adapted to take into account all forms of social differentiation, such as gender, class, caste, age, race, ethnicity, and so on.

Can be adapted for macro-level analysis
The CVA is easier to adapt to macro-analysis than the Harvard Analytical Framework. It is important for researchers and planners to look beyond the community experiencing crisis (using the concept of scales or levels), to see the constraints and opportunities for promoting gender equality in the wider context (the international community, the state, the market, and so on) and within the implementing agencies.

Challenges the status quo
Analysing a community’s capacities vulnerabilities using this framework can help to counter arguments that oppressive social relationships within the community should not be challenged after a crisis, but that a return to the former state of affairs should be sought. The long-term factors which determine a community’s response to crisis (including gender relations) must be addressed, and changed, in order to ensure recovery and prevent another crisis.

Highlights people’s capacities, as well as their vulnerabilities
By examining capacities, the CVA can help agencies and those experiencing disaster to work against any tendency to see crisis primarily in terms of ‘victims’ and ‘needs’.

Potential limitations
Possible to exclude a gender analysis
It is very easy to use the CVA Framework and to still exclude gender issues, thus creating gender-blind analyses and responses. It is crucial that the analysis disaggregates vulnerabilities and capacities by gender, and includes an explicit analysis of power relations between men and women.

Tahmina Rahman, a gender specialist who has worked in emergency situations, argues that an effective way of doing this is to first carry out a participatory analysis with community members, using the Harvard Analytical Framework or POP. She argues that either of these works well with the CVA; they provide a strong base of gender-disaggregated data on which to build a CVA, and the CVA then draws out the relationships between different groups, counter-balancing the tendency of the Harvard Framework and POP to see women and men separately.

Does not include an explicit agenda for women’s empowerment
Although the concepts of capacities and vulnerabilities can be powerful when considering gender inequalities, the CVA Framework is not designed
specifically to promote women's empowerment. If you plan to use it for gender-redistributive planning, it is crucial that you are explicit about the aim to create a more balanced gender relationship.

**Tempts users to guess**
The CVA Framework offers a temptation to people with a relatively superficial knowledge of the situation to make guesses.

**Not a participatory tool**
Practitioners report that the framework does not lend itself to participatory uses; they have found its concepts difficult to use directly with communities experiencing crisis.

**Assumes planners have a neutral agenda regarding gender relations**
The model assumes that planners and implementing agencies are neutral agents. It is important to carry out an institutional analysis of implementing organisations in order to highlight opportunities and constraints within them regarding gender-aware planning and implementation.

**Adaptation**
Categories of capacities and vulnerabilities have been expanded to include those which relate to the human body and control over it, and one's sexuality.

**Further reading**
2.6 | Women’s Empowerment (Longwe) Framework

Background

The Women’s Empowerment (Longwe) Framework was developed by Sara Hlupekile Longwe, a consultant on gender and development based in Lusaka, Zambia.

Aims of the framework

The Longwe framework is intended to help planners question what women’s empowerment and equality means in practice, and, from this point, to assess critically to what extent a development intervention is supporting this empowerment. Longwe defines women’s empowerment as enabling women to take an equal place with men, and to participate equally in the development process in order to achieve control over the factors of production on an equal basis with men.

The framework

Sara Longwe argues that much of the development literature examines to what extent equality between women and men has been achieved according to the conventional sectors of economy and society: equality in education, employment, and so on. This system of analysing equality by sectors concentrates on separate areas of social life, rather than on women’s equality in the development process. In the Longwe framework, development means enabling people to take charge of their own lives, and escape from poverty; poverty is seen as arising not from lack of productivity, but from oppression and exploitation.

Longwe’s framework is based on the notion of five different ‘levels of equality’. The extent to which these are present in any area of social or economic life determines the level of women’s empowerment. The Longwe Framework also enables gender and development workers to analyse
development organisations' degree of commitment to women's equality and empowerment. They do this first by identifying which 'levels of equality' are addressed by a particular intervention, and second by assessing which 'levels of recognition' of women's issues exist in the project objectives. It is also possible to produce a profile of an entire development programme, categorising its projects in terms of the levels of equality which they address, and their level of recognition of women's issues. This might be part of an exercise undertaken by a large development organisation which wishes to assess its entire country programme from a gender perspective. Such an exercise is partially illustrated in case study 2 below.

The Longwe Framework is discussed in 'Gender awareness: the missing element in the Third World development project' by Sara Hlupekile Longwe in Changing Perceptions: writings on gender and development, edited by Tina Wallace with Candida March, Oxfam, 1991. It also appears in the form of training materials in the Oxfam Gender Training Manual edited by Suzanne Williams, Oxfam, 1994. The information on the framework in this section is adapted from both these sources.

**Women's Empowerment Tool 1: Levels of equality**

The Longwe Framework centres on the concept of five 'levels of equality', which indicate the extent to which women are equal with men, and have achieved empowerment. The levels of equality can be used to assess the likelihood of particular development interventions promoting equality and women's empowerment.

The levels of equality are:

- Control
- Participation
- Conscientisation
- Access
- Welfare

These levels of equality are hierarchical. If a development intervention focuses on the higher levels, there is a greater likelihood that women's empowerment will be increased by the intervention than if the project focuses on the lower levels. If the intervention concentrates only on welfare, it is very unlikely that women will find the project empowering. Equal participation in the decision-making process about certain resources is more important for achieving women's empowerment than equal access to resources; and neither participation nor access are as important as equal control.

When the levels of equality are used to analyse the impact of development interventions on women's equality and empowerment, it is important to understand that an ideal intervention does not necessarily show activities on
every level. In fact, an intervention which is empowering for women will have many components which fit into the higher categories, but none in the lower ones. The 'Welfare' level restricts its focus to access to material resources. Therefore, an intervention which addressed control of resources would be classified at a higher level – under 'Control'. It would be seen as concerned with a higher degree of women's equality and empowerment.

Longwe's levels of equality are defined in more detail as follows:

**Welfare:** Longwe defines this as the level of women's material welfare, relative to men. Do women have equal access to resources such as food supply, income and, medical care?

**Access:** This is defined as women's access to the factors of production on an equal basis with men; equal access to land, labour, credit, training, marketing facilities, and all public services and benefits. Longwe points out that equality of access is obtained by applying the principle of equality of opportunity, which typically entails the reform of the law and administrative practice to remove all forms of discrimination against women.

**Conscientisation:** This is understood in the Longwe Framework as a conscious understanding of the difference between sex and gender, and an awareness that gender roles are cultural and can be changed. ‘Conscientisation’ also involves a belief that the sexual division of labour should be fair and agreeable to both sides, and not involve the economic or political domination of one sex by the other. A belief in sexual equality is the basis of gender awareness, and of collective participation in the process of women's development.

**Participation:** Longwe defines this as women's equal participation in the decision-making process, in policy-making, planning, and administration. It is a particularly important aspect of development projects, where participation means involvement in needs-assessment, project formulation, implementation, and evaluation. Equality of participation means involving women in making the decisions by which their community will be affected, in a proportion which matches their proportion in the wider community.

**Control:** This term denotes women's control over the decision-making process through conscientisation and mobilisation, to achieve equality of control over the factors of production and the distribution of benefits. Equality of control means a balance of control between men and women, so that neither side dominates.

**Women's Empowerment Tool 2: Level of recognition of 'women's issues'**

Longwe asserts that it is not only important to assess the levels of women's empowerment which a development intervention seeks to address. It is also important to identify the extent to which the project objectives are concerned with women's development, to establish whether women's issues are ignored
or recognised. Longwe uses a very specific definition of 'women's issues', meaning all issues concerned with women's equality in any social or economic role, and involving any of the levels of equality (welfare, access, conscientisation, participation, control). In other words, an issue becomes a 'women's issue' when it looks at the relationship between men and women, rather than simply at women's traditional and subordinate sex-stereotyped gender roles.

The Longwe Framework does not specify whether development interventions should target women-only, men-only, or mixed groups. Women's empowerment must be the concern of both women and men, and the degree to which the project is defined as potentially empowering women is defined by the extent to which it addresses women's issues.

Longwe identifies three different levels of recognition of women's issues in project design:

**Negative level:** At this level, the project objectives make no mention of women's issues. Experience has shown that women are very likely to be left worse off by such a project.

**Neutral level:** This is also known as the conservative level. Project objectives recognise women's issues, but concerns remain that the project intervention does not leave women worse off than before.

**Positive level:** At this level, the project objectives are positively concerned with women's issues, and with improving the position of women relative to men.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example of Women's Empowerment Framework Tools 1 and 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project title:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Levels of equality</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Case study: A fishing community in Chile**

**Project background**

The project examined in this case study is based in a sea port in Chile of about 130,000 people.9 Fishing has always been the mainstay of the town's and the region's economy. Men used to catch and dive for seafood, while women's tasks included selling the fish and mending the nets. Now, fishing is mainly
controlled by multinational corporations (MNCs) with huge shipping vessels and factory ships, and fish stocks are being culled at unsustainable rates. Although trade union activity used to be relatively high in the region, the fact that MNCs only tend to employ people unaffiliated to a union has caused the numbers to drop radically.

There are few independent fishermen or fishsellers left, resulting in rising unemployment among men and an associated rise in alcoholism. Women tends to work in the local factories, under very poor conditions and at poor rates of pay, or in domestic service.

The project has a number of programmes, one of which is the Woman's Programme; it aims to mobilise women and support their self-empowerment. At first, its main activities were education on issues such as health, rights, organisation, and leadership. After some time, the women asked the project to begin supporting productive activities. The project now supports women’s groups working in low-cost greenhouses and handicrafts, among other such activities. Here, the Woman’s Programme is examined using Longwe’s Women’s Empowerment Framework.

Using Women's Empowerment Tool 1: Levels of equality
Applying Longwe’s levels of equality, it becomes clear that the emphasis of the programme is at the conscientisation and participation levels: increasing women’s self-confidence, and their capacity to participate in decision-making processes, through education. Below, examples are given of how the project might further be examined in terms of the levels.

Welfare
The project has no activities simply directed at increasing women’s access to material resources relative to men. In Longwe’s terminology, all levels of the Women’s Programme are concerned with higher levels of equality, since all the activities start from the premise of trying to increase women’s levels of confidence, awareness, and control.

Access
As described above, the project has now started to support women in their wish to be involved in productive activities. From May to August, it is not possible to grow vegetables in the area, so they are brought from the centre of Chile at great cost. The project held a workshop for one group to discuss the idea of growing vegetables in low-cost greenhouses made out of plastic sheeting. Now, a number of groups run such greenhouses. The women contribute the wood and labour for the construction and then take turns looking after the vegetables. Here, the project can be seen to be working at the ‘Access’ level of equality, since it is increasing women’s access to the factors of production (in this case communal land, greenhouses, and vegetables).
The project also saw equal wages as a key issue for women: this also comes under the level of ‘Access’, since it is access to equal income. However, the project’s attempt to organise women working in the factories into a coherent movement failed. Women working the long shifts did not have time to attend meetings and they were afraid of being sacked if their organising activities were discovered.

Conscientisation
Raising Awareness about gender issues forms a large part of the Chilean Women’s Programme. According to the development workers, their most important objective is ‘to provide women with general education, increase their self-confidence and awareness, and make them realise that they are important’. The project starts its work with local women with self-confidence workshops, using discussion groups, role-plays, and games on such issues as ‘how do I consider my role in the family and community?’ They then move on to mini-workshops on health, the rights and responsibilities of women, women’s work and labour rights, human rights and the national situation, the history of the women’s movement and the trade union movement in Chile, and forms of organisation.

The project has also tried to raise gender issues with men. For instance, they printed leaflets on violence against women and distributed them to men in the streets on a national day of action about the issue.

Participation
Central to the project’s approach is the idea that project activities must not impose ideas on people - in this case, local women must diagnose what they want and need. Through the activities and dialogue mentioned in the previous section on conscientisation, the objectives of the programmes evolved.

The project has given attention to increasing women’s participation in decision-making processes. At first women were reluctant to take up special positions within each of the groups. Consequently, two to three local women from each of the project groups now attend a leadership-training programme, which aims to help them feel confident in running the groups. On a bigger scale, the project also persuaded two local women to stand in local council elections - unfortunately they did not win.

Control
Women are in control of the production and benefits from the vegetables in the greenhouses, both for consumption and for selling at a profit. The project also teaches account-keeping and administration, because otherwise the women would need to rely on someone else to keep the accounts, lessening the women’s level of control over profits and resources.

The above findings can be represented in a table, disaggregated into the two main areas of production in the greenhouses, and political participation (see overleaf).
Using Women's Empowerment Tool 1: Levels of equality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Greenhouses</th>
<th>Political participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Welfare</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conscientisation</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Using Women's Empowerment Tool 2 – Level of recognition of women's issues

The Chile project would be classified as having a positive level, because the project's implementers have a high level of recognition of women's issues.

Using the Longwe Framework to analyse a multiple-project development programme

To demonstrate the use of the Longwe Framework in analysing an entire development programme, an imaginary programme with three sectors...
(agriculture, education and training, and commerce and industry) has been created in the table above. This imaginary programme includes the findings from the Chilean case study referred to above. Other projects would need to be similarly assessed, and added to the profile of the programme.

**Commentary**

**Uses**

For transformatory planning, monitoring, and evaluation
The Longwe Framework can be a useful framework for planning, monitoring and evaluation, allowing users to question whether their interventions have transformatory potential. It can be a useful tool to strengthen the translation of a commitment to women's empowerment into actual plans and policy.

For training on technical and transformatory issues
In training the Longwe Framework is taught as part of work on planning and evaluation. It is also useful as a way of encouraging an examination of what is meant by empowerment.

**Why it appeals**

Moves beyond the concept of practical and strategic gender needs to show them as a progression
The Longwe Framework has much in common with the Moser Framework's concept of practical and strategic gender needs. However, it moves away from this restrictive distinction, which Longwe views as unhelpful. The Longwe Framework shows that development interventions as containing both 'practical' and 'strategic' elements. The progression from practical to strategic depends on the extent to which the intervention has potential to 'empower'.

Emphasises empowerment
The method Longwe uses is particularly useful in explaining why 'empowerment' is intrinsic to the process of development. It therefore illuminates aspects of development work which had previously not been sufficiently recognised or appreciated.

Strongly ideological
The framework has a very strong political perspective. It emphasises that development means overcoming women's inequality compared to men in every respect.

Useful to identify the gap between rhetoric and reality in interventions
For groups committed to equality and empowerment, whose projects may not yet reflect this commitment, the Longwe Framework is a particularly valuable method of analysis. It permits an assessment of where women already have equality, and what still remains to be done.
Potential limitations

Not a ‘complete’ framework

The Longwe Framework is perhaps best seen as part of a ‘tool kit’, rather than as a stand-alone framework, for the following reasons.

- It is static and takes no account of how situations change over time;
- It looks at the relationship between men and women only in terms of equality – rather than at the complicated system of rights, claims, and responsibilities which exists between them;
- It does not consider other forms of inequality, and can encourage a misleading view of women as a homogeneous group;
- It does not examine the institutions and organisations involved;
- It does not examine the macro-environment;
- It deals in very broad generalities only.

Hierarchy of levels may make users think that empowerment is a linear process

Users may assume that in order to reach the level of ‘Control’, an intervention will have had to meet all the previous four levels. As explained above, this is not the case. An empowering intervention is likely to include resource considerations at the level of ‘Control’, but not at the levels of ‘Welfare’ and ‘Access’.

Hierarchy of levels does not allow for relative importance of different resources

The hierarchy can fall apart when one tries to consider the importance of different resources. A strict interpretation of the value of levels might lead to the conclusion that control (for example, of hoes) contributes more to women’s development than access (for example, to land).

Hierarchy of levels does not help to differentiate between marginally different impacts

Defining development only in terms of women’s empowerment can tempt users to focus only on women rather than on gender relations

The emphasis on women’s empowerment is one of the strengths of this framework. However, it is also one of its weaknesses, since it can encourage analysis of women without an understanding of how women and men relate (including how they are connected), and without an understanding of men’s needs and interests.

Strongly ideological

This framework can be too confrontational to be used with those who are not committed to women’s empowerment.
Further reading

2.7 | Social Relations Approach

Background

The Social Relations Approach to gender and development planning has been developed by Naila Kabeer at the Institute of Development Studies, Sussex University, UK, in collaboration with policy-makers, academics, and activists, primarily from the South. It has been used by government departments and NGOs for planning programmes in a number of countries. The thinking has a socialist feminist background.

Key elements of the approach are:

- the goal of development as human well-being;
- the concept of social relations;
- institutional analysis.


Aims of the framework

The Social Relations Approach is intended as a method of analysing existing gender inequalities in the distribution of resources, responsibilities, and power, and for designing policies and programmes which enable women to be agents of their own development. The framework uses concepts rather than tools to concentrate on the relationships between people and their relationship to resources and activities — and how these are re-worked through ‘institutions’ such as the state or the market.

Kabeer states that a narrow application of the Social Relations Approach, examining a particular institution, will highlight how gender inequality is formed and reproduced in individual institutions. A broader application,
focusing on a number of institutions in a given context, will reveal how gender and other inequalities cross-cut each other through different institutions' interaction, thus producing situations of specific disadvantage for individuals.

The framework

The main concepts of the Social Relations Approach are:

**Social Relations Approach Concept 1: Development as increasing human well-being**

In the Social Relations Approach, development is primarily about increasing human well-being. It is not simply about economic growth or improved productivity. Human well-being is seen as concerning survival, security, and autonomy, where autonomy means the ability to participate fully in those decisions that shape one's choices and one's life chances, at both the personal and the collective level. Therefore, development interventions must be assessed not only in terms of technical efficiency, but also in terms of how well they contribute to the broader goals of survival, security, and human dignity.

Importantly, it follows from this that the concept of production does not just include market production but all the activities which contribute to human well-being — including all those tasks which people perform to reproduce human labour (caring, nurturing, looking after the sick), those which poor people carry out to survive; and those which people perform in caring for their environment which ultimately assures their livelihoods.

**Social Relations Approach Concept 2: Social relations**

Kabeer uses the term ‘social relations’ to describe the structural relationships that create and reproduce systemic differences in the positioning of different groups of people. Such relationships determine who we are, what our roles and responsibilities are, and what claims we can make; they determine our rights, and the control that we have over our own lives and those of others. Social relations produce cross-cutting inequalities, which ascribe each individual a position in the structure and hierarchy of their society. Gender relations are one type of social relations (sometimes known as the social relations of gender). Others include those of class, race, ethnicity, and so on.

Social relations change; they are not fixed or immutable. Changes at the macro level can bring about change in social relations. Human action can also do so, as is evident in the overturning of apartheid in South Africa, and the consequent changes in that country's social relations of race.

Social relations also determine what tangible and intangible resources are available to groups and individuals. Poverty arises out of people's unequal social relations, which dictate unequal relations to resources, claims, and responsibilities. (Simply put, people don't start at the same point in the social
system, and as a consequence have very different capacities to take advantage of change or the status quo.) Poor people in general, and poor women in particular, are often excluded from formal allocations of resources, so they draw on other resources – determined by their social relations – which play a critical part in their survival strategies. For example, poor women often rely on networks of family and friends to manage their workload. Resources of this kind, available through social relations, can be so important that some would say that 'poverty is being alone'.

Often, poor people have access to resources mainly through social relationships based on patronage and dependency, where they have to trade in their autonomy in return for security. Development must also look at supporting relationships which build on solidarity and reciprocity, and which build autonomy, rather than reduce it.

**Social Relations Approach Concept 3: Institutional analysis**

The underlying causes of gender inequality are not confined to the household and family but are reproduced across a range of institutions, including the international community, the state, and the market place.

**Definitions of ‘institution’ and ‘organisation’**

Kabeer defines an institution as a framework of rules for achieving certain social or economic goals. Institutions ensure the production, reinforcement, and reproduction of social relations and thereby create and perpetuate social difference and social inequality. Organisations, on the other hand, are defined as the specific structural forms that institutions take (North 1990, quoted in Kabeer 1994). Gender-awareness requires us to analyse how these institutions actually create and reproduce inequalities.

**Four key institutional locations**

Kabeer suggests that, for analytical purposes, it is useful to think of four key institutional realms – the state, the market, the community, and family/

---

**Example of Social Relations Concept 3: Institutional analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key institutional locations</th>
<th>Organisational/structural form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
<td>Legal, military, administrative organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market</td>
<td>Firms, financial corporations, farming enterprises, multinationals, and so on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community</td>
<td>Village tribunals, voluntary associations, informal networks, patron-client relationships, NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family/kinship</td>
<td>Household, extended families, lineage groupings, and so on</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
kinship. One could choose to add the international community. To give an example of how an institution relates to organisations, the state provides the larger institutional framework for a range of legal, military, and administrative organisations. Other examples are listed in the table above.

**Challenging the ideological neutrality and independence of institutions**

The Social Relations Approach challenges two myths about institutions on which much prevailing planning is based: that they are ideologically neutral, and that they are separate entities and that therefore a change to one of them will not affect the others.

Challenging the myth of ideological neutrality, Kabeer argues that institutions produce, reinforce, and reproduce social difference and inequalities. Few institutions admit to ideologies of gender or any other form of inequality. Instead, each institution has an ‘official’ ideology which accompanies all its policy and planning. The ‘official’ ideologies which tend to dominate planning practice are based on the following assumptions.

- the state pursues the national interest and national welfare;
- the market pursues about profit maximisation;
- the community, including NGOs, is about service provision;
- family/kinship is about altruism; it is a co-operative, not a conflictual, institution.

Kabeer argues that, in order to understand how social difference and inequalities (in roles, responsibilities, claims, and power) are produced, reinforced, and reproduced through institutions, we must move beyond the official ideology of bureaucratic neutrality, and scrutinise the actual rules and practices of institutions to uncover their core values and assumptions.

The Social Relations Approach also challenges the myth of the independence, or separateness, of institutions. It asserts that they are inter-related, and that a change in the policy or practice in one institution will cause changes in the others. For instance, it is often assumed in development work that a change in one sphere – for example, an intervention which provides inputs to enable men in the community to grow more cash crops – will be self-contained, and will not have an impact on the other spheres, such as the household. However, we all know that this official picture hides much. Changes in policy or practice on the part of the state and market affect relationships within the family, and changes within the family also have an impact on the market and the state (see diagram on p 108).

Development planners and practitioners must therefore pay attention to the interactions between institutions. In planning an intervention which will deals with institutions such as the household or the community, an NGO will first need to know what the state’s policies are, and who is setting the agenda.
for the country where it aims to work. They must also recognise that institutions are capable of change — indeed, they adapt constantly, in order to respond to change in the external context. Institutional change is brought about through the practices of different institutional actors, and through processes of bargaining and negotiation.

**Five aspects of social relations shared by institutions**
Kabeer states that institutions differ in many ways; for example, they vary in different cultures. However, she emphasises that they do have some common aspects. The Social Relations Approach states that all institutions possess five distinct, but inter-related, dimensions of social relationships: rules, resources, people, activities, and power. These dimensions are significant to the analysis of social inequality in general, and gender inequality in particular. Examining institutions on the basis of their rules, practices, people, distribution of resources, and their authority and control structures, helps you understand who does what, who gains, who loses (which men and which women). This is called undertaking an institutional analysis.

1. **Rules: how things get done**
Institutional behaviour is governed by rules. These may be official and written down. They may be unofficial and expressed through norms, values, laws, traditions, and customs. What rules do is to allow or constrain the following:

- what is done;
- how it is done;
- by whom it will be done;
- who will benefit.

Rules allow everyday decisions to be made with the minimum of effort. Their disadvantage is that they entrench ways of doing things, often to such an extent that they seem natural or unchangeable.

2. **Activities: what is done?**
Institutions do things; they try to achieve goals by following their own rules. These activities can be productive, distributive, orregulative. It is important to ask the following questions about activities:

- who does what?
- who gets what?
- who can claim what?

Institutions' rules ensure that there is a routinised pattern of practice for carrying out tasks. As a consequence, certain tasks get attached to certain
social groups, so that it seems that these groups are only capable of doing that particular task. For example, the strong association of women with the tasks of caring for the young, the sick, and the elderly – both within the household and within state and market institutions – is often explained in terms of their ‘natural’ maternal predispositions.

Rewards are attached to tasks; these vary according to who does what. For instance, doing the housework receives less recognition than ploughing the family land. Such a hierarchy of rewards reinforces inequalities between women and men, or between age groups.

People who only carry out a particular task become very good at it. In this sense, the gender division of labour has the effect of a self-fulfilling prophesy. The attributes which give women an advantage in certain jobs and occupations – nurturing skills, patience, managing budgets – have been acquired through their cultural assignment to women of the tasks and responsibilities within which these traits are likely to be developed.

In the final analysis, institutional practice must be changed if unequal relations are to be transformed.

3. Resources: what is used, what is produced?
Institutions also mobilise and distribute resources. These may be human resources (for example, labour, education, and skills), material ones (food, assets, land, or money), or intangible ones (information, political, clout, goodwill, or contacts).

Very often, the distribution of resources corresponds to an institution's rules. Thus, in societies where women are required to contribute to family food provisions, they are more likely to enjoy independent access to land and other resources. By contrast, in societies where it is men's responsibility to feed the family, men are given privileged access to resources within the household, but also within state and market institutions.

4. People: who is in, who is out, who does what?
Institutions deal with people and are selective about:

- who they allow in and whom they exclude;
- who is assigned various resources, tasks, and responsibilities;
- who is positioned where in the hierarchy.

This selection reflects class, gender, and other social inequalities. For example, if you look at the household you will find that specific households allow specific people in – perhaps one is not meant to marry across class, race, or ethnic dividing lines. The market also excludes and includes specific categories of people. In Britain, high-powered jobs are normally held by white, English, middle- or upper-class men.
5. **Power: who decides, and whose interests are served?**

Institutions embody relations of authority and control. Few institutions are egalitarian, even if they profess to be so. The unequal distribution of resources and responsibilities, together with the official and unofficial rules which promote and legitimise this distribution, ensures that some institutional actors have authority and control over others. These individuals then promote practices which entrench their privileged position, and they are most likely to resist change.

**Social Relations Concept 3: Key institutions and their relations**

![Diagram of institutions and their relations]

**Social Relations Approach Concept 4: Institutional gender policies**

Naila Kabeer classifies policies into three types, depending on the degree to which they recognise and address gender issues (see diagram next page).

**Gender-blind policies:** These recognise no distinction between the sexes. Policies incorporate biases in favour of existing gender relations and therefore tend to exclude women.

**Gender-aware policies:** These recognise that women as well as men are development actors, and that they are constrained in different, often unequal, ways as potential participants and beneficiaries in the development process. They may consequently have differing and sometimes conflicting needs, interests, and priorities. Gender-aware policies can be further sub-divided into three policy types.

**Gender-neutral policy approaches** use the knowledge of gender differences in a given society to overcome biases in development interventions. They aim to ensure that interventions target and benefit both sexes effectively to meet their practical gender needs. Gender-neutral policies work within the existing gender division of resources and responsibilities.

**Gender-specific policies** use the knowledge of gender differences in a given context to respond to the practical gender needs of either women or men; they also work within the existing gender division of resources and responsibilities.
Gender-redistributive policies are interventions which intend to transform existing distributions to create a more balanced relationship between women and men. They may target both women and men, or only one group specifically. Gender-redistributive policies touch on strategic gender interests; they may work on women's practical gender needs, but do so in ways which have transformatory potential, i.e. which help create supportive conditions for women to empower themselves.

These different approaches are not mutually exclusive, and one may be a precursor to another. For instance, in situations were gender-blind planning has been the norm, moving towards gender-neutral policies would be a significant shift forward. In some situations, it may be counter-productive to start with gender-redistributive policies, and a better approach may be a gender-specific policy, meeting practical needs.

Social Relations Approach Concept 5: Immediate, underlying and structural causes

In analysing a situation in order to plan an intervention, this framework explores the immediate, underlying, and structural factors which cause the problems, and their effects on the various actors involved. The analysis can be presented in a table (see table overleaf for an example), or as a written report (see case study 2 for an example), as you prefer.
Case studies of the Social Relations Approach

Case study 1: Poor people’s access to credit in India – institutional analysis and design of development intervention

This case study is adapted from a 1996 paper by Naila Kabeer and Ramya Subrahmanian, of the Institute for Development Studies (IDS), University of Sussex. They analysed the problems of the poor in relation to credit in India, looking both at general and at gender-specific constraints which hamper poor men’s and women’s access to formal credit institutions. This analysis was used to spell out the consequences of this exclusion for their survival and well-being. Kabeer and Subrahmanian first carried out an institutional analysis of the causes and effects of reduced access to credit, using Concepts 3 and 5 of the Social Relations Approach. The findings are shown in the table on p 111.

In order to then plan an appropriate intervention, they chose a commonly used evaluation tool, the Logical Framework (see pp 112-114). This tool helps you decide how an intervention can effectively address the issues uncovered in the institutional analysis. It makes you consider what you want to achieve, how you will do it, and how you will know whether you have achieved it.
### Using Social Relations Concept 6: Causes and effects analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Long-term effects</th>
<th>• Indebtedness; vulnerability; impoverishment; disempowerment; • Women’s disempowerment vis-à-vis men; gender inequalities in physical well-being;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate effects</td>
<td>• Shortfalls in consumption; reduced capacity to recover from crisis; • Gender inequalities in distribution of consumption shortfalls; increased dependence on male income;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate effects</td>
<td>• Fluctuations in household income flows; resort to unreliable or exploitative forms of credit; • Access to credit depends on sexual exploitation;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The core problem</td>
<td>• Lack of access to formal-sector credit; • Gender inequalities in gaining access to formal-sector credit;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immediate causes</td>
<td>• Household level • Lack of collateral**; lack of self-confidence; uncertain repayment capacity; • Intensified gender disadvantage for women regarding collateral, self-confidence, and repayment capacity; • Constraints on women’s social and physical mobility;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Bank level • Collateral requirements; complex and inflexible procedures; perceptions of poor people as high-risk borrowers; • Discriminatory official and unofficial barriers against women; economic invisibility of women’s enterprise;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate causes</td>
<td>• Household level • Low-productivity enterprises; uncertainty of returns; illiteracy; ignorance about banking procedures; class distance from bank personnel; survival imperatives; • Intensified gender disadvantage for women in all the aspects listed above; greater emphasis on survival in women’s enterprises; • Social isolation; physical distancing of women from bank personnel; uncertain control over loans or the proceeds from loans;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Bank level • Risk-averse culture; perceived costs of lending to the poor; class distance from the poor; • Ideological norms about female dependency; greater perceived costs of lending to women; physical distancing from women borrowers;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural causes</td>
<td>• Bank level • Entrenched banking practices; unequal distribution of assets; imperfect financial markets; inadequate educational provision; • Ideology of male breadwinner; gender-segmented labour markets; gender-biased institutional practices; gender inequalities in intra-household power relations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Household level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Long-term objective</strong></td>
<td>Meetings with bank officials by groups’ representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring regularised access to institutional credit for women and men from low-income households</td>
<td>Agreement of bank procedures for lending to group-guaranteed members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Phasing out of agency support for groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expansion into wider range of enterprises by both men and women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intermediate objective</strong></td>
<td>Training members of older groups in leadership skills and more advanced forms of financial management  - in enterprise development and management  - women-only groups in non-traditional skills and enterprises</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion of women’s and men’s credit-management groups to invest their self-generated capital funds productively</td>
<td>Dissemination of knowledge about bank procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>Activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing group-based approaches to overcome mobility constraints</td>
<td>Increased participation in distant markets; increased access to and use of means of transport; direct interactions between group representatives and financial institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building access to other technical departments of government</td>
<td>Meetings between government departments and groups; successful resolution of group demands</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Immediate objective**

Formation of separate self-help groups of poor women and men to promote saving and lending for self-identified needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment of male and female staff and fieldworkers</td>
<td>Numbers of men and women at all levels of the organisation; egalitarian/transformatory gender division of labour within organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of staff and fieldworkers in group-information skills, gender-awareness, and financial management</td>
<td>Numbers of training programmes conducted, extent of follow-up; participation of male and female staff; attention to gender content in training programmes; changes in practice as a result of training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction of group’s centre close to target groups</td>
<td>Number of centres; group members’ satisfaction with location of centres; increase in women members’ participation in group activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adoption of sensitive and flexible rules of group saving and lending</td>
<td>Consultation with poorer members in developing rules; group members’ satisfaction with rules; increase in participation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*continued...*
Case study 2: Issues facing disabled women in Lebanon – external institutional analysis

The following case study (written by Lina Abu Habib, Project Officer in Oxfam’s Lebanon Programme, in June 1995) illustrates how Concept 3 of the Social Relations Approach was used for planning purposes by Oxfam, to achieve a wide-ranging analysis of gender and disability in Lebanon. Institutional Analysis was carried out on both the external context and the internal context in which Oxfam worked. However, what follows here is a shortened version of the external analysis only.

After a brief description of attitudes to disability before Lebanon’s civil war (which lasted from 1975-90), each of the four institutions in Concept 3 of the Social Relations Approach (state, market, community, and household) is analysed, outlining the situation before, during, and after the civil war.

**Background: external environment before the war**

Disability was considered an affliction which must be borne by the disabled person and his or her family. Disabled persons were almost totally...
marginalised from the public sphere. The state did not provide any significant services, education, or employment. No organisations or unions of disabled persons existed. Work with the disabled took place entirely within charitable and religious institutions. No consideration was given to the special needs of disabled women or women carers.

**State**

**The war years**
The state assumed some responsibility for the war-disabled as their number increased visibly. The state had very conservative attitudes on disabled persons’ integration and independence. The deteriorating economic situation led to a further decrease in the resources available for the disabled. No specific attention was paid to disabled women.

**The post-war period**
As part of the general post-war reconstruction, rehabilitation, and modernisation effort, some laws were reviewed, albeit very slowly. The National Council for Disabled’s Affairs was created, which officially recognises the representation of disabled persons. At the level of public discourse, there was a declared interest in disability issues. Some government bodies proved to be open to issues of disability, and sympathetic to new interventions. Some politicians came to hold progressive, avant-garde views on disability. But issues perceived to be related to the arena of social affairs still remained low on the state’s priority list.

**Market**

**Before and throughout the war**
Local labour laws and the labour market as a whole discriminated against disabled persons. Both the public and the private sector were ill equipped to employ or even accommodate people with disabilities. The economic crisis, which escalated from 1986 onward, has further undermined disabled persons’ access to the employment market.

**The post-war period**
The state took small, localised, but decisive, steps towards the integration and absorption of persons with disabilities into the public-service sector. However, many persons with disabilities (particularly women and poor persons who lack particular skills) remain excluded. Lobbying continues to change some discriminatory laws (labour law, social security, and so on). There are occasional nation-wide media campaigns which emphasise that disabled persons are able, and have the right, to assume gainful employment. Moreover, some efforts are made to promote access to employment through training, credit schemes, and so on.
Community/ NGOs

The war years
Emergency relief and service provision were considered priorities for NGOs. People with disabilities organised in groups and managed to gain access to international funding agencies. Different NGOs were created, many with a large constituency base. NGOs have succeeded in raising the profile of disability: for example, the national media have become more concerned. NGOs themselves have become aware that they need to develop lobbying and advocacy skills.

The post-war period
Some degree of grassroots mobilisation has been achieved. NGOs have an increased ability to network locally and regionally. They have developed and maintained links with key actors, decision makers, and some national fora. There have been some successes in lobbying and advocacy – disability is now on the official agenda. NGOs have expanded in size and in their scope of programmes, although foreign funding is generally decreasing. NGOs place more emphasis on collection and use of empirical data.

Big charitable institutions are still powerful and feel threatened by disabled persons’ NGOs. However, these have difficulties in working together and in developing much needed professional competencies. They are still weak in their planning and organisation, and there are obvious problems related to leadership. Leadership positions are mainly assumed by disabled men.

The gender perspective within NGOs remains weak or tokenistic; indeed, it is sometimes absent. Active disabled women are now seeking more attention and consideration for the specific needs and situation of disabled women. The reduced life chances for disabled people are worse in rural areas, where there is almost no state intervention or NGO activity.

Household
The household is the main location of care for people with disabilities. Women are usually the main carers in the household, and they are least likely to be provided with support and/or compensation. Women are also least likely to be the decision-makers in the household. Discrimination in access to resources often starts in the household: a disabled person’s access to material and non-material resources largely depends on the main decision-maker’s perception of his or her life chances.

Disability affects the reproductive role of women. It thus undermines their life chances considerably more than is the case for men with disabilities. A woman or girl with a disability is perceived to be unable to maintain a household and fulfil the roles of a ‘proper’ woman. Therefore, she is less likely to marry than disabled men; which increases her parent’s financial burden. Women carers are often blamed for their children’s disability.

Women with disabilities tend to be less mobile than men.
Commentary on Social Relations Approach

Uses
Useful for many purposes, and at many levels
The Social Relations Approach can be used for many purposes, including project planning and policy development. It can also be used at many levels, even at the international level.

Raises awareness of the importance of institutional analysis and can be used in training
The Social Relations Approach emphasises that institutional analysis is an important part of an organisational commitment to gender, and enables an organisation to translate an analysis into action.

Why it appeals
Gives a holistic analysis of poverty
The Social Relations Approach aims to give a fuller picture of poverty by recognising and highlighting the interacting and cross-cutting inequalities of class, gender, race, and so on. By doing so, the framework concentrates on structural analysis, material poverty, marginalisation, and powerlessness, and how those have evolved.

Aims to place gender at the centre of an entirely new framework for development theory and practice
The Social Relations Approach is an attempt to develop a new framework for development thinking – one where gender is central to the analysis. It is not an attempt to develop an add-on methodology for gender, or a separate method of analysis and planning which can only be used for projects focusing on women.

Concentrates on institutions
The Social Relations Approach offers a way of understanding how various institutions inter-relate. Therefore it gives an insight into the roots of powerlessness, poverty, and women’s subordination; but it also shows that institutions can bring about change. This framework concentrates on institutional analysis and highlights that there is no such thing as a neutral planner. Organisations using this framework are obliged to examine their own institutional practices and culture, as part of any planning process.

Links analysis at all levels
Each level of analysis is seen as linked to the others. The Social Relations Approach makes clear that what goes on in the household can subvert (deliberately or not) the policies of the state and market. It also shows that policies and practice at the middle level of community/organisations can influence these relationships.
Can be used in a dynamic analysis
Rather than giving a snapshot of gender roles at a particular point in time, without discussing the processes which have led to this, the Social Relations Approach can be used to highlight the processes of impoverishment and empowerment, as shown in the case study of Lebanon.

Highlights gender relations and emphasises women's and men's different interests and needs
The Social Relations Approach emphasises the connectedness of men and women through their social relationships, as well as the ways in which these affect them differently, as separate groups.

Potential limitations
Emphasises structure rather than agency
The analysis produced by using the Social Relations Approach tends to give an impression of monolithic institutions, where change will be difficult. While this is, in balance, probably true, it can lead to losing sight of the potential for people to bring about change.

Gender may become subsumed in a complex examination of cross-cutting inequalities, posing an obstacle for political action
This framework can be used to examine all the cross-cutting inequalities that create institutional marginalisation. As such, women can get subsumed in many individual categories of. say, class or sector. Where this is the case, gender issues become fragmented within other issues of class, ethnicity, religion, and so on.

Complexity may intimidate
The Social Relations Approach can seem complicated, detailed, and demanding. Of course it is, like the complex reality it is encouraging users to analyse. But concepts from the framework can be used in considerably simplified form.

Adaptation: The institutional analysis can be performed using three rather than five categories: rules, practices, and power (which is manifested through the rules and practices).

Difficult to use with communities in a participatory way
The theoretical grasp necessary to distinguish between complex concepts such as ‘institution’ and ‘organisation’ make the Social Relations Approach unsuitable to use in a participatory way at community level.

Complexity means very detailed knowledge of context is needed
The framework is difficult to use fully in situations where there is not very much information available.
In reality, institutions do not have definite boundaries
In real life, the institutions of state, market, community, and household cannot be so neatly defined – there is overlap between them. It is critical to understand that this neat distinction is merely a device to enable an analysis.

Difficulty in determining what is an institution
Some Oxfam staff have criticised the definition of the ‘community’ as an institution, arguing that it is not an institution in the same way as the state and the market. Others have raised the question of organisational forms which are not institutions; for example, some organisational forms of cultural or religious expression would more appropriately be defined as movements rather than institutions.

Adaptation: Institutional analysis has been used to good effect on institutions within the community, such as religious practices and laws.

Further reading

The Social Relations Approach is discussed in Reversed Realities: Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought by Naila Kabeer, Verso 1994.

The framework is also set out in a paper entitled 'Institutions, Relations and Outcomes: Framework and Tools for Gender-Aware Planning', Naila Kabeer and Ramya Subrahmanian, IDS Discussion Paper 357, Brighton, 1996. Another version of the paper is available from Oxfam’s Gender and Learning Team on request.
Bibliography


Full details and case studies of the Capabilities and Vulnerabilities Analysis method (CVA) used in dealing with emergencies. This method begins from a basis of gender awareness and is an extremely useful tool.


This is a practical planning tool for refugee workers, and draws on the concepts of the gender-analysis framework published in Gender Roles in Development Projects, Overholt et al (see separate entry). It introduces the three-step framework analysing the refugee profile and context, activities comparing what the refugees did before the emergency, and use and control of resources. The framework is also presented in a UNHCR handbook People-Oriented Planning at Work using POP to improve UNHCR programming, 1994. This is more of a how-to-do manual, taking the reader through sector by sector (water, sanitation, health) from emergencies to repatriation.


Provides an interesting exploration of how different agendas have informed projects for women, and how understanding these agendas explains the fact that outcomes may be very different from those anticipated by implementing organisations.


A very useful handbook of gender and development training, in five
sections including a general discussion of gender and development, gender and development training, case studies, and evolution of theories and practice. The second part contains some material for training including activities adapted from Harvard and Moser methods and sample formats for workshops, while the third and fourth parts have some useful case study presentations of the integration of gender into institutional programmes. (Also includes a resources section.)


This paper helps place the Social Relations Approach in context. It is written using complex terminology, but is rich in analysis and examples.


Based on a paper presented to FINNIDA in Helsinki, 1989.


In this paper, Maxine Molyneux develops the idea of practical and strategic gender interests which was later adapted by Caroline Moser in the Moser Framework's use of practical and strategic gender needs.


In this article, Caroline Moser outlined the Moser Framework.


This is a key text for understanding the Moser Framework. It outlines the theory and practice her gender planning methods, and includes an appendix on the methodology and content of gender-planning training.


Used in training a number of international agencies such as the World Bank, the US agency for International Development (USAID), and the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), it is the basic theoretical tool for the Harvard method. The first section provides background reading in technical areas concerning women and development and introduces an overall framework for project analysis. The second section is
case studies intended as a vehicle for group discussion.


Contains a wide variety of exercises to use in training on gender frameworks. Its sections include: key concepts, gender awareness, gender roles and needs, gender sensitive appraisal and planning, gender and global issues, working with women and men. An excellent and comprehensive collection of gender training exercises tried and tested over ten years of Oxfam’s work on gender and development.
A Manual for Socio-Economic and Gender Analysis:

Responding to the Development Challenge

Barbara Thomas-Slayter
Rachel Polestico
Andrea Lee Esser
Octavia Taylor
Elvina Mutua
Ecology, Community Organization (ECOGEN) is a joint project of Clark University and Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University established for the purpose of examining the role of gender in rural livelihood systems. This manual is produced by Clark University. It is based on work supported through SARSA II (Systems Approach to Regional Income and Sustainable Resource Assistance) Agreement No. DHR 5452-AA-00-9083 at Clark University, the Institute for Development Anthropology, and the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University. This work is funded by the US Agency for International Development Office of Women in Development (G/WID) and the Global Bureau/Economic Growth Center/Agriculture and Food Security Office/Food Policy Division (G/EG/AFS). The views and interpretations in this publication are those of the authors and should not be attributed to USAID or to any individual acting on its behalf. October, 1995.
B Gathering Information/ Raising Awareness

In many development efforts, academicians or technical experts are the ones to gather and analyze information, while the people look on. Tools that promote participation in gathering data are key to raising people's awareness of problems and enabling them to analyze causes and find solutions. The following tools enable villagers to do their own assessments by collecting and compiling data on situations in their own locale.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #6</th>
<th>Interviews</th>
<th>79</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Approaching communities and gathering data with structured and unstructured interviews</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #7</td>
<td>Focus Groups</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Listening to people's opinions and ideas in group discussion formats</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #8</td>
<td>Wealth Ranking</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Generating socio-economic distinctions among families and identifying indicators of wealth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #9</td>
<td>Institutional (Venn) Diagrams</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understanding community perceptions of local institutions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #10</td>
<td>Demographic Analysis Activity</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Facilitating village analysis of demographic data</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #11</td>
<td>Priority Group Analysis</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Working with community members to analyze the situation of marginalized groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time-related and Spatial Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tool #12 Village Sketch Map</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focusing on local problems and issues with a model of a village and its resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tool #13 Time and Trend Lines</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identifying events and significant changes in communities over time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tool #14 Gender-Disaggregated Activity Calendar</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visualizing seasonal patterns of production and subsistence by age and gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tool #15 Mobility Maps</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing group mobility in terms of cultural constructs, time allocation, and resource access</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interviews

Interviewing is a data-gathering method where the respondent addresses a set of questions posed by the interviewer. Interviews can relay information about physical data such as household composition, divisions of labor, and livelihood sources. Interviews can also be used to learn about people's perceptions, values, and attitudes. The two main types of interviews are structured and unstructured. Structured interviews are conducted with a set of formal questions to which succinct answers may be given. Unstructured interviews ask open-ended questions to which respondents are encouraged to give detailed answers. Interviewers may probe respondents' remarks for further details or directions. When a community is not easily approachable, unstructured interviews can be an entry point into light conversation that familiarizes the researcher and respondent and can lead to continued casual exchanges.

Interviews allow researchers to gather detailed information about how respondents frame their livelihoods, lifestyles, problems, and priorities. Community-wide patterns and trends can be extrapolated from this data. Controlling for gender, age, class or other social variables offers a truer representation of the community as well as a means to compare groups. Interviews offer researchers or community organizers a chance to talk with residents who might not normally be included in meetings.

1. Researchers in rural communities should make their purpose clear to the community or neighborhood as a whole. The residents of the community should be offered an opportunity to ask questions and to decide whether they would like to participate in the project.

2. Men have traditionally been disproportionately represented in interviews. Consideration should be taken to insure that women and other marginalized groups are represented so that their views and voices can be heard. To ensure that the views of all

Interviews

socio-economic groups are represented, you may wish to first do the Wealth Ranking exercise (Tool #8) and then draw names randomly from within each socio-economic group.

3. Interviews with individuals should be scheduled to suit the respondent's availability.

4. Interview style and content will depend upon the data needs of the particular project but here are some interviewing guidelines that the researcher should bear in mind:

   • make clear the purpose of the interview and how the results will be used before beginning a session

   • assure the respondent of absolute confidentiality

   • do not record names or include personal information that can be directly attributed to the respondent

   • maintain a receptive demeanor - show interest in responses and give encouragement during the interview to establish a rapport

   • speak clearly and at an even pace - be ready to restate or clarify questions if asked

   • do not ask threatening or challenging questions - should a respondent not want to answer a particular question, move on to the next question but take note about the circumstances and reaction of the respondent

   • watch for verbal and non-verbal cues that the respondent is uncomfortable answering - do not pressure respondents for answers

5. A brief casual conversation with the respondent before and after the interview is completed can help to foster feelings of a positive exchange.

   • Paper and pencil
   • Copies of the interview
   • Tape recorder (optional)
Tape recorders may make respondents uneasy and hamper responses that are controversial or thought to be contrary to the interviewer's bias. Respondents should only be recorded with their full consent and if it is not possible to write responses.

It is not uncommon in small communities for people to gather to observe the antics of a researcher or project team. The venue for interviews should offer some privacy so that answers are not influenced by the scrutiny of a crowd.

The aggregate results of the interviews can be made available for community analysis and used as a means of empowering communities to analyze their own data.

**Example**  
Administering Formal Interviews in the Dominican Republic*

As part of a multi-method field study** on a social forestry project in the Dominican Republic, an ECOGEN research team conducted a formal interview based on a random sample of adult male and female members of a peasant federation. We had decided to administer a formal questionnaire only to confirm our findings generated from the qualitative methods, and to give our conclusions and recommendations legitimacy to natural resource managers and biological scientists. The formal survey mirrored the types of questions we asked during earlier stages of research—including questions about the respondent’s birth family’s history of migration, position in his/her conjugal family, their roles in resource management and agriculture, as well as their opinions of the forestry project, and the future of the Federation. The questions were also designed to gather "factual" information about the household (i.e., size of landholdings, species of trees present in different land use units or number of timber trees planted).

Above and beyond confirming our findings, however, the process of generating the random sample and conducting the surveys revealed household situations that had previously been invisible to us and social categories that were underrepresented in the Forestry Enterprise Project. For example, it was not until we conducted the final survey that we became keenly aware of the number of younger families who lived on small residential plots and depended on off-farm work or on farm family (parent’s), rented or sharecropped land. We visited many young women (from women's club lists) who were

---


**D. Rocheleau and L. Ross combined several data collection activities: attendance at formal meetings; group interviews; focus groups; household histories, labor calendars and mapping exercises; key informant interviews; personal life histories; as well as the formal survey of a random sample drawn from the adult members of the Federation.
the main farmers in the household and whose family's contact with the project came through their women's club membership. There were also a number of people in the final sample (identified as "not really farmers" by promoters) who make a living by regular marketing trips to the capital to sell produce from their communities at retail markets and on the street and who also often had planted some trees. In addition we met three men who are members of the Federation, farm their own small plots, and make a living as caretakers of large holdings of absentee owners. All of these latter groups have some stake in the Forestry Enterprise Project, but were generally invisible to staff at ENDA (Environmental and Development Alternatives, an international NGO), Federation leaders, other national policy makers, and, initially to us.

In addition to making the invisible visible, the questionnaire was a particularly effective and informative tool because we incorporated the farm sketching exercise into it. In the context of a two-hour interview, we drew pictures of the farm based on direct observation, a narrative recounted by each respondent, as well as prompts and questions made as necessary to complete the drawing and fill in a list of species and land use information on the questionnaire. The final result provided ample background and vocabulary to discuss the gender division of labor, responsibilities, access, use and control as well as gendered knowledge and values associated with the plants, animals, places, products and processes depicted in the image. The resulting image also provided a template for further coding and quantification of information derived from the picture after the fact.
Focus Groups*

A focus group is a small group meeting to discuss a specific topic in an informal setting. A facilitator leads the discussion encouraging all present to offer their ideas and opinions. A record keeper may keep track of the exchanges.

Focus groups are helpful in gathering data. Many of the tools in this manual rely on information gathered in groups discussions. Focus groups are useful, for example, in generating history time lines, diagrams of men's and women's perceptions of community organizations and trend lines for resource issues such as rainfall, crop production, population, deforestation and health.

1. **Logistics:** Establish time, place and topic for discussion a few days ahead of time.

2. **Participants:** Group members can be from the same neighborhoods, formal or informal community organizations and government or community-sponsored projects. Meeting with men and women in separate groups may bring out issues obscured in joint meetings. It is also helpful to listen to individuals from different age groups, ethnic groups or classes.

3. **Group leaders:** It is best to have two people to conduct the focus group: one to facilitate the discussion, the other to record information. Group leaders should be introduced to participants by community members.

4. **Optimal length:** between one and two hours.

5. **Opening statements:** each participant may make an individual, uninterrupted statement about themselves.

6. **Discussion Format**
   - **Unstructured**: discussion centers around 1 or 2 broadly stated topic questions, or
   - **Structured**: facilitator uses 4 or 5 questions (written up before the meeting) as a guide, with more specific probes under each major question.

7. **Formulating Questions**
   - Decide on the information you want
   - Use simple language
   - Be sure the meaning of the question is clear
   - Keep questions short: Do not have several parts to each question
   - Do not word questions in a way that people are made to feel guilty or embarrassed
   - Avoid using too many “why” questions: they may sound like an interrogation

8. **Role of the Facilitator**
   - **Low involvement.** The facilitator:
     a. presents initial topic followed by unstructured group discussion
     b. introduces second topic, based largely on what points have already been raised
     c. allows discussion to come to an end on its own
   - **High involvement.** The facilitator:
     a. maintains clear and consistent order by application of a guide throughout the discussion. S/he may find it helpful to:
        - begin the structured discussion with a general question, not intending to get a full answer, but to set up an agenda of topics within the limits of the guide.
        - hold off comments which don’t quite fit in a particular stage of the discussion, but reintroduce them at a logical point; i.e. “I recall that some of you mentioned something a little different earlier, and I wonder how that fits into what we are discussing now.”
b. Ends session with final summary statements from participants.

**Advantages of Focus groups**

- Produce a great deal of information at low cost
- Are an excellent way to obtain information from illiterate participants
- May reveal a range of attitudes and opinions that might not come out in a survey
- Are well accepted by the residents in a community as they make use of group discussion -- a form of communication found naturally in most communities
- Can be good fun

**Limitations of Focus Groups**

- They require well-trained facilitators
- Results from discussion cannot usually be used to make statements about the wider community
- Participants often agree with responses from fellow members
- Focus groups have limited value in exploring complex beliefs and issues

**Materials**

- List of guide questions for facilitator
- Notebook and pen for record keeper
- Large paper for charts
- Colored markers for diagrams and time lines
- Circles of various sizes needed for community institution

**Notes to the Facilitator**

A focus group requires a competent facilitator to keep discussion on track. The facilitator will need to foster interactions that explore the participants' feelings in some depth. Open questions (why, what and how) will elicit much information and keep discussion going. S/he will need to be prepared to:

- clearly explain the purpose of the discussion
- include all participants in the discussion
- assure that the full range of voices is heard
- make sure that certain interest groups do not dominate the discussion
Focus Groups

• be conscious of existing divisions within a particular group
• be aware that the group will not work if participants do not trust one another

For more on leading group discussions, see Facilitation (Tool #1).

In the case that there is no record keeper, a cassette recorder or video camera may be used, if the group finds it suitable and if the topic is not sensitive.

This tool is also helpful for role definition, project identification and project formulation.

Example

Focus Groups in Pwani, Kenya*

Pwani, located on the periphery of Lake Nakuru Park in Kenya's Rift Valley Province, is a recently populated resettlement village. It was the first of several sites in the region in which Participatory Rural Appraisal exercises were conducted in 1990. Pwani was selected as a PRA site for primarily two reasons: 1) it is representative of settlement communities which have experienced stresses in natural resources management; and 2) it represents a situation encountered throughout the world by communities located adjacent to parks. Subsequent gender-focused research in Pwani addressed questions raised within the broader context of PRA.

Focus group interviews and discussions can show priorities for community action based on gender, class, caste, race, ethnicity and religion. In Pwani, the problems identified by male leaders in the community, such as bad roads and lack of access to markets, did not consider women's issues. The PRA exercises did not reveal the extent of the fuelwood problem until women had an opportunity to meet separately in a focus group to discuss issues of concern to them, such as the scarcity of fuelwood.

*Adapted from Dianne Rocheleau et al., 1991, People, Property, Poverty and Parks, pp. 3-13.
Wealth Ranking*

Wealth ranking is a card sorting exercise to generate information from key informants about socio-economic distinctions among residents of a community. Wealth is regarded as more than an economic attribute of a person or household. The exercise identifies other indicators of “wealth” including social status, power and authority, education, and access to both local and wider resources.

Wealth ranking can assist the researcher to devise a sample of households which is representative of the community’s different socio-economic groups. It also enables the facilitator or program coordinator to grasp the full range of socio-economic characteristics of households within a community, as viewed by residents of the community themselves. Important indicators about socio-economic strata within the community are thus determined by both male and female residents, and not by the researchers or facilitators.

1. Obtain the names of all households or a random sample of households. It is best to work with no more than 100. Write each name on a small card and give it a number to facilitate later calculations.

2. Clarify the meanings of words in the local language which are important to this exercise, such as “community” and “household.” Discuss local concepts of wealth and well being. Decide on the words or phrases to be used.

3. Choose informants. Each informant should be interviewed independently. About four or five should suffice, including both men and women. Choose informants, as much as possible, to represent a cross-section of the community in terms of gender,

Wealth Ranking

age, socio-economic status, and agro-ecological zones.

4. Find a quiet place to interview each informant. Explain the nature of the work and its purpose. Indicate that you are exploring what characterizes different levels of well being in this community, and how problems may differ among social groups.

5. Ask the informant to separate cards with family names into piles according to the interviewee’s notion of the household’s level of well being. Households placed in the same pile should have comparable levels of wealth or well being. Explain that the informant can make as many piles as he or she wants and can change the number in the course of the exercise.

6. One by one the interviewee puts cards in piles. If more than 40% of households are in a single pile, ask the interviewee to subdivide.

7. In the follow-up discussion with the interviewee, ask him or her about the characteristics associated with each pile the informant has made, and why the cards were placed in this way. Ask the informant to identify what characterizes those households in a given pile, generally, and how they might differ in terms of the specific goals of the project or research. The interviewer should record this information.

Analyzing the data*

1. The information obtained may be used informally for project planning, or it may be used more formally to create a random sample for interviewing.

2. After each exercise, make a list of households classified under each pile. If informant number 1 has sorted the households in five piles, assign number 1 to the richest and number 5 to the poorest. Numbers 2, 3, and 4 are assigned to the not-so-rich, middle, and not-so-poor categories, respectively. If there are four categories, number 1 will be assigned to the richest, and number 4, to the poorest.

3. Compute the average scores for every household using the formula found on the next page.

Category number \times 100 \\
\text{Number of categories}

**Example 1:** Informant number 1 made five piles/categories. The score for the richest will be computed as follows:

\[
\frac{1 \times 100}{5} = \frac{100}{5} = 20
\]

Therefore, each card in the “richest” category of five piles will be assigned a score of 20.

The score for the poorest will be computed as follows:

\[
\frac{5 \times 100}{5} = \frac{500}{5} = 100
\]

Each card in the “poorest” category of five piles will be assigned a score of 100.

**Example 2:** Another informant made four categories. The score for the richest will be computed as follows:

\[
\frac{1 \times 100}{4} = \frac{100}{4} = 25
\]

Each card in the “richest” category of four piles will be assigned a score of 25.

The score for the poorest will be computed as follows:

\[
\frac{4 \times 100}{4} = \frac{400}{4} = 100
\]

Each card in the “poorest” category of four piles will be assigned a score of 100.

4. Repeat the process with all your informants. Then, compute the average score for each household by adding all the scores given
Wealth Ranking

by the informants which will be divided by the number of informants. The bigger the average score, the lower the category or ranking of the household, e.g., households with scores ranging from 90 to 100 will emerge as the poorest. The richest will be those with lower scores, probably ranging from 20 to 40.

5. Categorize the households into "rich," "middle," and "poor" (or into whatever categories that will emerge). The closeness of the resulting average scores will determine the number of groupings which should not, however, exceed the maximum number of piles given by the key informants.

6. Identify wealth indicators or the differences and features of the households in each grouping based on the ranking interviews and other sources of information.

Materials
- Cards, such as 3x5 index cards
- Pen, pencil or magic marker

Example
Wealth Ranking in Tubod on Siquijor Island in the Philippines*

Extrapolating from the ways in which informants assigned households to socio-economic categories, researchers on Siquijor ascertained the following about Tubod, a small barangay located on the coast: The more prosperous households constitute 11% in Tubod; 18% of the households are upper middle-income. Tubod has a group of households (24%) which constitute a new working class and seem to be gaining a toe-hold in the modern economy as small-scale entrepreneurs, temporary, low paid government workers, or employees in someone else's business. Average income families in Tubod represent 22% of the total number of households. The poorest households represent 25% of Tubod. The wealth ranking helped to clarify the particular characteristics of each socio-economic group, such as size of holding, access to remittances and types of employment opportunities. It identified the categories which the research team needed for household interviews and surveys, and it assured that all voices were heard in the data-gathering process.

Institutional Diagrams
(Venn Diagrams)*

There are many important actors and institutions in every community. It is critical to know which organizations are the most important and have the respect and confidence of the community. Institutional diagramming allows community members to gather information about the relationships of different organizations, as well as individuals, with one another and with outside groups. Using circles of different sizes to represent different organizations, institutions or influential people, participants create a visualization of these relationships.

Institutional diagrams can help participants:
- understand how the community views these institutions and how they rank them according to their contribution to community development;
- examine the problems of special groups, e.g., the women, the poor, the wealthy, the young and the elderly in a community;
- determine the internal and external resources that community members can access.

1. Focus groups can be divided by gender, age, ethnic, socio-economic lines, or any other appropriate grouping such as village leaders or people who do not belong to any organization.

2. Through a group process, participants will decide which relationship is to be examined (e.g., the relationship of outside organizations with the community, the alliance of organizations within the community, the relationship of village leaders and community members, and others).

*Source: Adapted from The TriPARRD Committee, 1993, A Manual, pp. 84-88. B. Thomas-Slayter et al., 1993 Tools of Gender Analysis, p. 15
3. Cut out (ahead of time) different sizes of circles. Using differently colored circles provides nice contrast. Local resources such as cut banana leaves can also be used. Also, draw a big circle on a large sheet of paper or newsprint.

4. Start the exercise by asking participants to list local organizations, as well as outside institutions, that are most relevant to them.

5. Ask the participants to link the most important organizations in the community (in terms of their contributions to community development) to the largest circles, less important to medium-sized, and the least important to the smallest circles.

6. Indicate the name of the organization on each of the circles. Ask participants to place the circle inside the large circle on the sheet of paper.

7. Then ask which institutions work together and how closely. For those that cooperate or overlap a great deal, participants place the paper circles partly together.

8. Discuss as many institutions as possible and position them in relation to each other. There may be ample debate and repositioning of the circles as the task continues.

9. Bring the groups together and compare the diagrams of each group, discussing how and why they differ.

Sample questions to ask include:

- *Tell us what you think about this institution in the large circle? What do they do? Tell me about the institution in the small circle? What is their work?*

- *Why has one group put a certain institution in the center of the diagram and another has given it a very small circle placed at the edges of the diagram? How is that organization relating differently to different members of the community?*
Why has one group included fewer organizations in its diagram?

To the group with fewer organizations in its community sample, questions might include:

- What do you know about x and y institutions?
- How do you feel about their role in the community?
- In what ways are you satisfied/dissatisfied with institutions in the community?
- What can they do to serve you better?
- How can you better make use of their services?

Materials

- Newsprint and markers
- Tape or stapler
- Circles of different sizes - large, medium, small

Notes to the Facilitator

Indicate the participants' names on the diagram to give them credit.

Refer to Facilitation (Tool #1) and Focus Groups (Tool #7) for more information on leading groups in the construction of the Venn Diagram. See Conflict Management (Tool #4) for discussion on resolving dissention in groups.
The above illustration shows the importance of gathering information from both men and women about existing institutions. Focus groups discussions showed that men and women ranked the relevance of community groups for local welfare very differently. This example focuses on gender differences. Further differentiation is possible across socio-economic, age, and ethnic lines.

*Source: Anne Marie Urban and Mary Rojas, 1994. Shifting Boundaries: Gender, Migration and Community Resources in the Foothills of Choluteca, Honduras, p. 35.*
Baseline community data is usually collected by external researchers who take the information to be compiled and analyzed elsewhere. Community members are commonly unsure why particular questions are asked and how the information is used. The demographic analysis activity allows people to analyze demographic data about their community as a means to assessing their needs. Using differently sized and shaped local objects to represent groups by sex and age, participants create a visual representation of demographic groupings which provides a format for discussing specific needs and characteristics of individual groups.

The demographic analysis activity allows communities to analyze the particular needs of different demographic groups and to use that data as a means for planning a program which serves priority needs.

1. Before the meeting, gather a large number of pebbles, seeds, shells, or other local objects of different sizes, shapes or colors. Use objects of like sizes and shapes to represent demographic groupings.

2. Label one container with pictures or words for each demographic group. Suggested categories are: Elders, Men, Women, Girls (age 5 - 16), Boys (age 5 - 16), Children (under age 5).

3. During a community meeting or other gathering, invite volunteers to participate by selecting objects from each category to represent their family. A sufficient number of volunteers should be selected to provide a good representation of the community. Unless the community is very large, approximately one-third of the families is a good target.

4. Ask the volunteers to put the objects representing their families in the corresponding container. Leave a sample pebble or other

5. Ask the community to reflect on their demographic composition with questions such as:

- Which category has the largest number of people?
- What are the implications of this?
- Which group has the most immediate problems?
- What can be done about the problems?

If a program focus exists, ask questions regarding special problems such as:

- Which group is most affected by a lack of fuelwood?
- What do people in that group think about what should be done?

6. If suitable to the literacy of the community as a whole, write on chalkboard or newsprint key ideas elicited during this exercise.

Materials

- Pebbles or other small objects of different sizes, shapes and colors
- Containers with labels or pictures
- Newsprint and markers or chalkboard (optional)

Notes to the Facilitator

In some cultures, people may not like the idea of being counted. Field use in Asia has not encountered any resistance, but one trainer has encountered problems in Africa. Make sure to find out how people feel about a census-like activity before using this tool.

Do not use a chalkboard or newsprint to sum up key points if the information will only be accessible to privileged groups of people. For example, if men are mostly literate and women are mostly not, it would be better to simply reiterate key ideas verbally or using symbols rather than writing them.
Priority Group Analysis*

Once a disadvantaged group has been identified, special efforts must be made to understand how programs may differentially affect that group. The special needs and skills of the priority group should be identified. Rather than have development agents “guess” what the unique circumstances are of a marginalized group, the Priority Group Analysis allows community members from both advantaged and disadvantaged groups to work together to analyze the situation of a marginalized group within a larger community.

The Priority Group Analysis helps community members analyze the needs and potentials of a marginalized group in relation to a particular program area.

**Process**

1. Divide participants into groups of ten or less members.
2. Give each group newsprint and markers.
3. Have participants draw one large circle on the newsprint with a smaller circle inside of it. The large circle represents the whole community; the small circle is the priority group.
4. Ask participants to write or draw in the larger circle all of the program-related problems that affect the entire community. For example, if the program has a health focus, participants should note problems related to health and sanitation.
5. Next, ask participants to note program-related problems which affect the priority group and place these in the inner circle. Some of these problems will be the same as in the larger circle; some may be different.
6. Bring the groups together for a discussion. The facilitator may ask questions such as the following to focus the group:

---

Priority Group Analysis

- How do the problems in the two circles differ?
- How are they the same?
- What solutions can be found which give priority to the needs of the disadvantaged group?
- What can the disadvantaged group contribute to a project (e.g., knowledge, resources)?

Materials

- Newsprint
- Markers

Notes to the Facilitator

Do not ask people to write their ideas if a high rate of illiteracy exists or if particular segments of the community will not be able to participate. Symbols may be used. Or if the group is small enough, you may want to keep the group intact rather than subdivide. In this case the facilitator may write down the ideas along with the symbols and invite people to participate verbally. If this method is used the facilitator should consistently reiterate key ideas so that all participants can follow. The drawback to this method is that people are usually more apt to participate in smaller groups, but it may be the best method for a given situation.

Example

Priority Group Analysis of Adivasi Women and Their Community

SARTHI, an NGO based in Rajasthan, India, has been helping Adivasi women organize themselves around the rehabilitation and management of common lands. For a look at the experience of SARTHI and the Adivasi women's groups in Panchmahals District, see pp. 33-44 in Part I of the SEGA manual.

In Figure 2.2 the large circle represents the program-related problems that affect the Adivasi community. Since the SARTHI program is focused on the rehabilitation of grazing lands, problems related to the lack of vegetative matter are listed. The program-related problems affecting the Adivasi women, the priority group, are noted in the smaller circle. Some of the problems facing the priority group are the same as those facing the community. Others, such as no land tenure and no crop ownership, pertain specifically to the Adivasi women.
Figure 2.2. Priority Group Analysis of Problems Facing Adivasi Women and their Community

Adivasi Community

Adivasi Women
- Lack of fuelwood
- Poor topsoil
- Lack of fodder
- No crop ownership
- No land tenure
- Lower crop yields
- Poor topsoil

Lack of fodder

More floods
Upon entering a community, it is often difficult to know where and how to begin using participatory methods for data gathering and project design. Most community members are not accustomed to being asked for their opinions and expertise. Conversely, participatory methodologies are new to many development professionals. The Village Sketch Map is often a good place to begin because it is an easy exercise that initiates dialogue among participants and organizers. While participants produce the map, issues emerge and discussions can begin about some of the community’s problems. The map can also serve as a visualization of the initial conditions in the community which can be used as a point of comparison for project impact.

The sketch map is a representation of a community and its resources which begins to focus participants and planners on problems and issues for further investigation. The simplicity of the exercise makes it a suitable entry point in which many participants can contribute.

1. Ask participants who have gathered for the exercise to draw a sketch of their village on the ground using any local materials they choose. Participants may use sticks, pebbles, leaves, sawdust, flour or any other local material. Paper and markers may also be used.

2. Participants should determine the boundaries and contents of the map, focusing on their perceptions and what is important to them. Maps may include:

- infrastructure (roads, houses, buildings)
- water sites and sources
- health, education, and religious facilities
- agricultural lands (crop varieties and location)
- agro-ecological zones (soils, slopes, elevations)

*Source: Adapted from John Bronson, 1995, Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, pp. 13-17.*
• forest lands
• grazing lands
• other resource areas or special use places

3. Because this exercise is designed to understand local perceptions and relationships with resources, facilitators should be more concerned with the process than the results. It is important that the exercise not be dominated by a few individuals. Contributions from members of marginalized groups may need to be especially sought. Some possible methods for balancing group contributions follow. Also see Facilitation (Tool #1).

   • Ask uninvolved observers whether or not they think the placement of a particular feature is accurate. If they disagree with the placement, invite them to indicate its proper position.

   • Ask observers to map something specific or give them a stick or other tool and ask them to indicate something they would like to see on the map.

   • Ask a particularly dominant participant specific questions about the village. By engaging this person in conversation away from the map, his or her influence over the process can be lessened.

4. Sometimes more information will be elicited if separate groups form to make their own maps. Facilitators may want to suggest this if it appears that one group (male elders, for example) is dominating the process. Sometimes groups will choose to make their own maps without the facilitators’ intervention. Separate group maps can be contrasted to provide useful information regarding each group’s perceptions and priorities.

5. Throughout the exercise facilitators should note any information garnered during the process about both village resources and group dynamics. When the map(s) have been completed, participants should describe their representation. Facilitators will want to draw a copy of the map on paper for future reference.
6. After maps have been completed and discussed, facilitators may want to ask participants to indicate some things they would like to see in their village that are not currently on the map. This allows an incorporation of preliminary planning components into the exercise. It also encourages people to begin contributing their thoughts at early stages of a participatory process.

Materials
- paper and pens for facilitators
- video to record process and product (optional)

Notes to the Facilitator

The sketch map is constructed on the ground to help ensure that all community members can participate, including those uncomfortable with paper and writing implements. This also allows a large crowd to view the map and contribute to it.

The number of people involved in this exercise is less important than ensuring that all subgroups and interests within the community are represented. Facilitators need not be concerned if there is a small turnout, especially if this is the first activity undertaken in a village. A positive exchange for participants during this process can help lead to more participation at later stages.

In some situations it might be useful to assure participants that the sketch maps will not be used for taxing or controlling resources -- that the maps belong to the community.

Example

Village Sketch Map Lesoma, Botswana*

The sketch map exercise conducted in Lesoma helped to begin a dialogue between and among villagers and the external organizing group. Besides eliciting information on the village resources and infrastructure, issues such as limited transportation, few opportunities for employment, and concerns over rising population (particularly due to in-migration) were identified during the mapping. These issues were discussed openly as groups created and later presented their sketch maps to the larger group of participants. Opportunities to further analyze issues, state concerns, and search for solutions were provided during discussions following the mapping and with subsequent exercises.

Figure 2.3. Village Sketch Map Lesoma, Botswana
Time and Trend Lines*

A time line is a list of key events in the history of a community that helps identify past events, problems and achievements. A trend line is a diagram or graph showing the significant changes in a community over time. Making both time and trend lines entails general discussions with community members on the important events that have happened in the locality. Involving older women and men in these activities is essential because they are more knowledgeable about past events.

The time line helps the community organizer or field worker better understand what local, national, and global events the community considers to be important in its history and how it has dealt with crises and natural disasters in the past.

Trend analysis helps the field worker learn from the community how it views change over time in various sectors. Trend lines are helpful in identifying problems and organizing the range of opportunities for the community to consider. It also enables the community to focus their attention on the positive and negative changes over time of certain resource management practices. The field worker and participants can organize the range of opportunities for the community to consider.

1. Organize one or more groups of manageable size, especially including older men and women and long-time residents of the community for the time line exercise. The trend line activity can also include younger participants including leaders of church groups, women's cooperatives, self-help groups and men and women farmers.

2. Discuss with the group the purpose of making a time line or trend line.

3. For a time line start discussion by asking the group questions such as:
   - When was the first settlement established?
   - Who were the founding families?
   - What is the first important event you can remember in your community?
   - Have there been significant migrations in or out of your community?
   - Have there been occurrences such as wars, famines, epidemics, natural disasters or significant historical events?
   - What are some of the best things your community has done?

4. Once the time line is agreed upon, you can explore trends with the group. For a trend line, draw a blank matrix on the board or paper (see below). Indicate the years along the bottom axis. The facilitator decides on the interval of years s/he wishes to use, e.g., 1950, 1960, 1970, and so on. Explain how the years move from left to right along the axis and how the estimates of increase/decrease are to be indicated on the vertical axis. Various trends can be explored:
   - vital statistics, such as population, mortality and marriage age;
   - quality of life indicators, such as health, nutrition, education and employment; and
   - resource use and availability, such as water, firewood, land and fertilizer.

Ask the group about significant changes in the community. Determine whether different events (epidemics, floods, infant mortality, deforestation, for example) seem to be increasing in intensity.

5. When the diagrams are done, encourage a discussion on the reasons for the trends that have emerged. This will help identify problems and activities to resolve the situation. For example, if the group agrees that deforestation is getting worse, ask why. Discuss what solutions have been tried in the past and how effective they were. Ask what might ease the situation.

Materials

- Large pieces of paper and markers; or
- Chalkboard and chalk
Notes to the Facilitator

Group discussions are preferred to interviews of key individuals because they encourage dialogue among older participants, helping them remember events from the distant past.

Time and trend lines allow the field worker to develop rapport with community members. By doing these exercises s/he is perceived by the residents as interested in learning about their lives.

Example

Figure 2.4. Trend Lines from Hog Harbour, Espiritu, Vanuatu*

The trend lines below are taken from a PRA case study conducted in Hog Harbour, Espiritu, Vanuatu in September, 1994. The PRA team divided the community into two groups by gender. Each group charted the issues important to them. (Divisions could also have been made along class or geographic lines to highlight different perspectives.)

The men's group charted a number of trends including population in the area. The men traced changes in the village population since its establishment. The chart below demonstrates a population decline for the first 40 years, due to poor health services and tribal conflicts. The population began to rise again after the churches established good health services and resolved tribal strife.

The women highlighted the difficulties they faced as managers of households by charting the cost of living. In the charts below they noted that the increase in the price of goods outpaced the increase in wages.

Population in the Area Charted by Men's Group

Cost of Living Trend Charted by Women's Group

*Source: Bronson et al., Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, pp. 32-37.
Gender-Disaggregated Activity Calendar

Livelihood activities vary with seasonal cycles and by age and gender. The activity calendar makes patterns of production and subsistence (such as plowing, harvesting, marketing, animal care, and fetching wood and water) visible to development professionals and community members. By categorizing responsibilities by season, gender, age, and intensity of activity, the calendar highlights constraints to participation which can then be factored into project planning and timeframes.

Purpose

The Gender-Disaggregated Activity Calendar generates information on gender- and age-based seasonal divisions of labor in livelihood systems. The calendar can be a tool for working with the community to analyze livelihood responsibilities and to address imbalances between genders.

Process

1. Calendars should be developed with both men and women's input across socio-economic groups, but the facilitator can work with individual key informants, families, or focus groups as best suits the situation.

2. Community members work with the facilitator to develop calendars fashioned after the model in Figure 2.5. The facilitator may want to prepare the calendar outline before the meeting leaving space to draw in the activities and agents during the meeting.

3. Those who perform activities (agents) should be separated by age and gender with separate symbols for adult male, child male, adult female, and child female as shown in the key to Figure 2.5.

4. Activities should be tailored to reflect the particular setting. Categories to consider include:

*Source: Adapted Thomas-Slayter et al., 1993, Tools of Gender Analysis, pp. 22-23, and Feldstein and Jiggins, Tools for the Field, pp. 103-105
Gender-Disaggregated Activities Calendar

**Stress periods:** food shortages, drought, monsoon, extra expenses

**Household production:** cooking, construction/home repair, childcare, care for elderly, fetching firewood, fetching water

**Animal care:** small livestock, large livestock

**Farming activities:** crops (cash and subsistence) listed by type, plowing, weeding, watering, preparing fields, harvesting, marketing

**Fishing activities:** commercial or subsistence fishing, fishponds, marketing

**Other livelihood activities:** wage/salaried labor, small handicrafts, cottage industries

5. Activities may be divided by intensity of task by varying the type of line. As shown in the key in the calendar example, continuous activity is denoted by a solid line, sporadic activity is shown by a dotted line. A heavy black line may be used to show intense activity.

6. A group discussion to analyze the data on the Activities Calendar can enable communities to think through a number of issues. Some suggested areas of questioning follow:

- **Why are there shortages of food or money during certain months?** Who feels these shortages most? What is done to guard against shortages? What more can be done?

- **Who is responsible for which types of livelihood activities?** Does the division of labor seem fair? Are men working harder than women? What do people do during the months where activity is more sporadic?

- **Who is doing which types of household tasks?** How much time out of each day would you estimate these tasks take? Is this an equitable breakdown of tasks? Why or why not?
Tool #14


Materials

- Poster board, newsprint, or roll of brown paper
- Markers

Notes to the Facilitator

The calendar is designed to elicit age and gender-disaggregated information, but calendars will also vary along socio-economic lines. Facilitators can control for this by developing calendars with representatives from high and low status groups. Or, if a project is focusing only on poorer groups, facilitators can develop calendars with these groups only. Wealth Ranking (Tool #8) can help to delineate between more and less advantaged groups so that facilitators can work with designated groups.
different types of lines (e.g., dotted, straight, cross-hatched) as shown in Figure 2.6. Note: some destinations may have multiple lines showing travel to the same place for different purposes.

4. Alongside each travel line, note how often the route is travelled for that purpose. For example, a line to a city for health services may be marked “4X/yr” to signify that the trip is undertaken approximately four times a year. Travel may be broken by years, months or weeks as best suits the group.

5. Mark each destination with the amount of time it takes to complete one round trip from home to the destination. Alternatively, the amount of time taken both travelling and performing a task may be noted. In Figure 2.6, for example, women are shown to spend 80 hours a month traveling to and from Cagayan de Oro city and shopping.

6. Mobility Maps should be done with a representative sample of community members so that comparisons may be made between groups along class, gender, religious or other lines. Maps may be consolidated within groups for easier comparison.

7. Work with groups to analyze and compare information elicited from maps. Sample questions include:
   - Who spends the most time working? Is this what you would expect?
   - What is the furthest distance people travel? For what purpose? Do all groups travel to the same places? Why or why not?
   - What surprises you about this information? Does it seem right? Is it equitable? Should anything be changed?

Materials

- Copies of sketch maps
- Colored markers or other writing implements
The Wealth Ranking exercise (Tool #8) is a good way to divide households into socio-economic groups. Wealth ranking can be done before making mobility maps to ensure that a sample representation of all classes is obtained.

**Example**

![Mobility Map Example](image)

*Figure 2.6. Women's Mobility Map Salimbalan, Bukidnon, Philippines*

**Table:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Hours/Month</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Washing</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meetings</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visiting</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Based on field testing on Mindanao, the Philippines, June, 1995.*
Defining Roles and Priorities

Communities consist of diverse groups of people whose privileges, priorities, and perceptions vary widely. Development efforts which look at a community as a homogenous group risk increasing or reinforcing inequities. The following tools are designed to help community members and development practitioners work together to analyze divisions of labor and responsibility as well as access to and control over resources. Understanding such divisions can enhance program efforts to reach marginalized groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tool #16</td>
<td>Access and Control Profile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #17</td>
<td>Gender Resource Mapping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #18</td>
<td>Benefits Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #19</td>
<td>Gender Analysis Activity Profile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #20</td>
<td>Gender Analysis Matrix</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Delineating group access to and control over resources and benefits
Understanding divisions of control, responsibility and labor of resources
Identifying stakeholders and beneficiaries by exploring access to, and power and control over resources
Clarifying factors which determine divisions of labor and control
Assessing gendered impacts of projects by identifying and analyzing gender roles
Access and Control Profile*

Lack of information on access to and control over resources and benefits has led to false assumptions about what groups can accomplish and how they may benefit from particular projects. All types of work require the use of resources. Engaging in work and utilizing resources usually generates benefits for individuals, households and communities. The Access and Control Profile helps delineate a group's access to and control over resources needed for work. The profile also helps to show who has access to the benefits derived from work and the extent to which any group is able to exert control over the benefits.

The Access and Control Profile allows an analysis of resources and benefits that can help planners to compensate for or increase a marginalized group's limited access and control within a project process.

1. The Access and Control Profile is usually employed to delineate women's relations to resources and benefits from men's, but it could also be used for any marginalized subgroup within a community. For example, rather than creating categories of "men" and "women" as in Tables 2.3 and 2.4, categories could be "rich" and "poor" or "Catholics" and "animists".

2. The facilitator should decide, given the particular context, if it is best to work together with participants from the dominant and subordinant groups or if better information would be elicited by separating groups.

3. Participants should work with the facilitator to fill out the profile. Resources may include land, equipment, labor, tools, technology, cash/credit, skills, employment opportunities, education, political/organizational representation, information, self-esteem, time. Benefits may include cash, assets, provision of basic needs, education, political power, prestige, status, opportunities.

*Source: Adapted from CIDA, 1991, Two Halves Make a Whole, pp. 27-31
4. The following are some of the critical questions which should be addressed:

**Resources**
- What resources does each group have access to?
- What resources does each have control over?
- What are the implications of this information for the project?
- How can the project help to increase a disadvantaged group's access to and control over resources?

**Benefits**
- What benefits does each group receive from work?
- What benefits do they each have control over?
- What are the implications for project activities?
- How can the marginalized group's access to and control over benefits be increased?

**Materials**
- Newsprint or posterboard
- Markers

**Notes to the Facilitator**
While producing an Access and Control Profile, it is often useful to consider what factors over time influence and change gender relations, divisions of work, and access to and control over resources. Constraints and opportunities for promoting equity and empowerment presented by changes should be considered. Some factors to be aware of include the following:
- socio-cultural (changing values and lifestyles)
- economic (expanding markets, credit opportunities)
- political (new forms of government, new policies)
- environmental (resource pressure, degradation)
- demographic (outmigration, age structure)
- legal (changes in ownership or voting laws)
- educational (changes in availability and priority)
- religious (rising fundamentalism)
### Example

#### Table 2.3. Access and Control Profile' Salimbalan, Bukidnon, Philippines*

**Women's Chart**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Resources</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Land</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Labor</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tools</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Technology</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cash/Credit</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education Opportunities</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employment Opportunities</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political Representation</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**B. Benefits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Cash</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assets</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Basic Needs</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political Power</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Men's Chart**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Resources</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Land</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Labor</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tools</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Technology</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Cash/Credit</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education Opportunities</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Employment Opportunities</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political Representation</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**B. Benefits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Cash</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assets</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Basic Needs</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Education</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Political Power</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Adapted from Overholt et al., 1995, A Case Book: Gender Roles in Development Projects for use in SEGA field testing in Salimbalan, Bukidnon, Philippines, May-June 1995*
Youth's Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Resources</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash/Credit</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Opportunities</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Opportunities</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Representation</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| B. Benefits                     |        |         |       |       |
|                                 | Women  | Men     |       |       |
| Cash                            | 100    | 90      | 50    | 80    |
| Assets                          | 90     | 100     | 50    | 60    |
| Basic Needs                     | 100    | 100     | 50    | 40    |
| Education                       | 100    | 100     | 50    | 40    |
| Political Power                 | 40     | 100     | 50    | 40    |

Residents in Salimbalan came together after completing access and control profiles in separate groups. They discussed the differences between the perceptions of different groups. They then combined the data from the three charts by averaging the figures to form a group representation. They used this final chart to discuss differences between men's and women's access and control. For example, in the combined chart 46% of the women felt they controlled cash, whereas 76% of the men felt they did. Forty percent of the women felt that they had access to political representation whereas 83% of the men. They analyzed reasons for the differences, and established a target of 100% access and control in all categories for men and women alike.

Table 2.4. Combined Group Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Resources</th>
<th>Access</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cash/Credit</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education Opportunities</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Opportunities</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Representation</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| B. Benefits                     |        |         |       |       |
|                                 | Women  | Men     |       |       |
| Cash                            | 80     | 86      | 46    | 76    |
| Assets                          | 86     | 73      | 63    | 83    |
| Basic Needs                     | 86     | 86      | 63    | 50    |
| Education                       | 90     | 80      | 63    | 60    |
| Political Power                 | 90     | 90      | 66    | 80    |
Figure 2.7. Gender Resource Map Zambrana, Dominican Republic

Benefits Analysis offers an in-depth consideration of the benefits to a household and the individuals within it of the products and by-products of various livelihood activities. It can be an important learning process for the household, as well as for the researcher who has an opportunity to explore, in a lively yet detailed manner, the fundamental resource and economic issues of these households.

Benefits Analysis helps identify the likely stakeholders relevant to a given project, and the potential beneficiaries of development initiatives. It reveals who has access to the products of a household's labor, who decides how products should be used, and, if sold, who decides on the use of the cash income from the product.

1. Drawing from data obtained through other methods (e.g., Interviews, Tool #6, and Gender Resource Maps, Tool #17), create a set of index cards with a representative set of products and by-products of the family's various livelihood activities written on each card. For example, the products and by-products of a tree may include fruit, fodder, fuelwood, lumber, bark, and poles. Make a card for each product or by-product.

2. Deal the cards to adult members of the family who take turns reading the cards and describing who in the family or community uses the product or by-product, how it is used, who decides how it should be used, and who controls the money if sold.

3. If the member does not have knowledge of the product/by-product, the card is passed to the member who does. Additional input is sought from other household members.

Materials

- Index cards
- Magic markers or pens

This exercise can be fun for household members and the facilitator, as well, if it is treated in a lively manner almost as if a game rather than a research exercise.

Depending on the types of households in the community, it may also be important to specify the age of male and female decision-makers.

Table 2.5. Benefits Flow Chart Calansi, Luzon, Philippines*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>By-product</th>
<th>How Used</th>
<th>Who Decides Use</th>
<th>Who Does It</th>
<th>How is Cash Used if Sold</th>
<th>Who Decides Cash Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PALM LEAF</td>
<td>Woven to make walls</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Inner spine made into brooms</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Wrapped around boiled rice sticks</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRUIT</td>
<td>Eaten at home</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Given or sold to friends and family</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dried and sold as copra</td>
<td>f m</td>
<td>f m</td>
<td>Family needs</td>
<td>f m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HUSK</td>
<td>Made into charcoal for home use or sale</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>Family needs</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Used to stuff pillows</td>
<td>f</td>
<td>f</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRUNK</td>
<td>Used or sold as lumber</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>Family needs</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Used as fuelwood</td>
<td>m</td>
<td>m</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender Analysis Activity Profile*

Men and women may have very different types and levels of involvement at the community level. New projects can affect the distribution of responsibilities, either positively or negatively. The Gender Analysis Activity Profile (GAAP) offers a means to discuss community activities, the reasons they are undertaken, and the division of responsibility for them. Discussions take place with men and women, preferably in small groups.

Participants clarify the factors which determine the gender-based division of labor and gender-related control over resources of the community. Discussing these issues in a public forum raises awareness of gender-based inequities in resource access and control, as well as in labor demands. It can also lead to community action to address these inequities.

1. Ask the group to identify community activities. The list might include items such as:
   - tree planting
   - school maintenance
   - fundraising for a church
   - organizing a health clinic
   - organizing community celebrations
   - political activity
   - work on NGO projects

2. When the list is complete, ask the group to identify who is responsible for each of the activities, including:
   - male/female children
   - male/female teenagers
   - male/female adults
   - male/female elders

3. The facilitator should then lead a discussion focusing on why one group rather than another undertakes a particular activity. A set of subsidiary questions, such as the following, will clarify the issues:

- Why do men (rather than women) do a particular activity?
- What are the implications of men doing this activity and not another?
- How is this work valued by the community?
- Is it paid work?
- How do the people who do the work benefit?
- In what ways are these roles changing?
- Given the patterns of community involvement noted in this meeting, what projects are most valuable to men? To women? Elders? Children?

**Materials**
- Newsprint or other large paper
- Markers

**Notes to the Facilitator**
It may also be appropriate to raise the questions concerning community activities vis-a-vis specific ethnic groups, castes, or social classes, not simply gender. The activity can be organized around the most suitable social variables.

We recommend this exercise for a mixed group of both men and women, but there may be instances when more discussion would be generated when the group is not mixed.
Example

### Table 2.6. Gender Analysis Activity Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Implications</th>
<th>Who Does It</th>
<th>Why</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tree planting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School maintenance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fundraising for a church</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizing a clinic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizing celebrations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political activity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work on NGO projects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public works</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public meetings</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 2.7. Possible Entries for GAAP Chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implications?</th>
<th>Who?</th>
<th>Why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>G: a good system</td>
<td>FC: Female Child</td>
<td>LEG: Legal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A: acceptable system</td>
<td>MC: Male Child</td>
<td>REL: Religion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N: needs changing</td>
<td>FT: Female Teenager</td>
<td>CUL: Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MT: Male Teenager</td>
<td>ED: Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FA: Female Adult</td>
<td>ECON: Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MA: Male Adult</td>
<td>POL: Political</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FE: Female Elder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ME: Male Elder</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Gender Analysis Matrix*

Development practitioners often lack information as to how a proposed project may affect or be affected by different roles in the community. The Gender Analysis Matrix (GAM) is a technique for identifying and analyzing gender roles in a community in order to assess the different impacts of projects on different groups. It is essentially a visioning tool, allowing groups to predict changes. Additionally, use of the GAM begins a consciousness-raising process which identifies and challenges assumptions about gender roles.

## Purpose

The Gender Analysis Matrix is designed to facilitate community discussions about project impacts for women, men, households and the community in regard to labor, time, resources and culture. The GAM both tests and increases awareness of a project's functioning in relation to gender roles and responsibilities.

## Process

1. The GAM analysis is best if done in a community group with both men, women and youths actively participating. If cultural constraints discourage such an exchange, the facilitator may wish to consult men and women separately.

2. The facilitator should prepare the GAM structure (leaving the boxes blank) on large paper before the meeting.

3. Community members then discuss the matrix and work with the facilitator to fill out the boxes based on their expectations of the project's impact. Both women, men and youths must have input in all categories.

4. Beginning at the first line of the matrix on "women", the facilitator will want to ask the expected impacts of a project on women's labor, women's time, women's access to and control over resources, and women's status. The same would be done for the next line on "men" until the matrix is completed.

---

*Adapted from Rani Parker, 1990, *A Gender Analysis Matrix for Development Practitioners.*
5. After the matrix has been completed, the group should assign a (+) sign to those potential effects that are consistent with program goals and a (-) sign to those that are contrary to program goals. If the group is uncertain of the desirability of an outcome, a (?) may be assigned.

6. The GAM analysis may be repeated approximately once a month for the first three months. After that, it may be repeated quarterly or bi-annually. Repetition of the matrix exercise allows participants to reflect upon and change their assumptions as the project unfolds.

7. Changes in the matrix are assessed after each exercise. As the matrices evolve, original assumptions about gender and age roles may be proved true or false. This approach to consciousness-raising bases an understanding about gender roles on the everyday circumstances of community members rather than on externally-generated “facts” or statistics.

Materials
- Newsprint or other large sheet of paper
- Markers

Notes to the Facilitator
Effective use of the GAM requires men's and women's active participation. The process, if carried out at various stages of the project cycle, will raise questions and provide insights regarding the project's capability to incorporate the needs of both women and men.
### Example

**Table 2.8 Gender Analysis Matrix**

**Project Objective:** To provide credit for new technology in the form of knitting machines.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Labor</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Resources</th>
<th>Culture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Women</strong></td>
<td>- Need to learn to use new machines</td>
<td>- Less time to produce same output</td>
<td>- Likely increase in income**</td>
<td>- Strengthens women's confidence**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ New skill acquired</td>
<td>+ Need time to learn</td>
<td>- May not control income</td>
<td>+ Good for women to produce more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Men</strong></td>
<td>+ No impact</td>
<td>+ No changes in time use**</td>
<td>+ Receive more income from selling more</td>
<td>- Apprehension about women's independence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Youth</strong></td>
<td>+ Young women learn new skills</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Issues of adequate for undertaking project</td>
<td>- Rases questions about establishing programs for young men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Household</strong></td>
<td>+ Women are more skilled**</td>
<td>+ Better childcare and household management because women at home more**</td>
<td>+ More income for the family**</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community</strong></td>
<td>+ More skilled people in the community</td>
<td>+ Potential employment gains as businesses expand</td>
<td>+ Greater cash flow in the community</td>
<td>- Loss of traditional skill</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**In subsequent analyses using GAM tool, these items changed.**

Assessing Needs/Identifying Projects

Deciding on a project which best suits the needs of a community is a difficult task. Communities must decide which problem they want to address and how they want to address it recognizing that any approach will have benefits and drawbacks. The next set of tools work to facilitate an analysis of the strengths and weaknesses of a given approach so that the most appropriate project can be selected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #21</th>
<th>Problem Case Analysis</th>
<th>133</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Analyzing problems and assessing needs using external example situations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #22</th>
<th>Role Plays</th>
<th>135</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Understanding relationships and differing points of views via spontaneous dramatization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #23</th>
<th>Practical Needs and Strategic Interests</th>
<th>138</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Differentiating between the condition and position of community groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #24</th>
<th>Identifying Problems, Causes and Opportunities</th>
<th>141</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Finding ways to address problems with community and technical staff collaboration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #25</th>
<th>Ranking Problems and Opportunities</th>
<th>144</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prioritizing local perspectives and initiatives for solving problems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #26</th>
<th>Community Action Plan</th>
<th>147</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Identifying the actions necessary to solve problems and assigning the necessary steps</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Problem Case Analysis**

Problem case analysis is a way to involve group members in examining a problem in depth, so that they can better understand its causes and identify alternative solutions. A problem case analysis presents a brief description, with supporting data, of an external real-life situation that is used as the basis for analysis and discussion.

Analyzing problem situations promote skills in assessing needs and identifying projects. This tool allows community members to develop critical thinking and task-oriented problem solving skills by examining causes and effects in cases other than their own situation.

1. The facilitator presents a short problem situation and accompanying set of study questions to the group. If the level of literacy in the group is high, then the facilitator may hand out the case and ask participants to read along.

2. After introducing the case, the facilitator may subdivide the groups into smaller discussion groups, ensuring a representation of interests, gender, ethnicity, religion, etc.

3. The groups discuss the case using the questions as a guide.

4. After discussion, the whole group reconvenes to discuss the case. The facilitator should generate as much discussion as possible, writing down on the newsprint in words or pictures the suggestions offered by participants. (For more on promoting dialogue, see Facilitation, Tool #1.)

**Materials**

- Copies of the case studies and study questions
- Newsprint and markers

Notes to the Facilitators

Asking participants to reflect on problem situations other than their own gives them the freedom to be more critical.

It is preferable to use more than one case study. Since case analysis is new to most people, participants tend to be better prepared for discussion the second time around.

Example

Examining Problems in Leadership*

Ask the participants to study the case below. Participants may discuss in small groups and then unite to analyze the situation and propose alternatives to the case. Questions the facilitator may want to ask include:

- How do you think the group members feel in this case?
- How would you describe this type of leadership?
- What could improve upon this situation?

The chairman of a women's cooperative has called for a meeting of the membership to inform them of the impending visit of representatives from the community development office. Upon arrival, she finds the members seated in rows and three chairs, for the chairman, secretary and treasurer, facing the members. She greets those present and informs them that, in preparation for the visit, they must each donate some money for the food. She asks members to bring water and firewood to her house, where the food will be cooked. She also asks them to practice a good song to entertain the visitors. She concludes by saying, "Is that clear? Can you start paying now? Those who do not have the money can pay tomorrow." The chairman leaves with no clear decision made by the members.

The members start complaining and threaten to leave the group. They say, "Everytime they ask us for money and never account for it! Why should we cook at her house? We can cook outside our church." They continue to complain without reaching a decision.

*Adapted from Elvina Mutua, 1993, Saidika, p. 37.
Role plays are a spontaneous dramatization. Each participant in a role play takes the part of a particular character and acts, as the actor perceives it, the sorts of behavior which that character would normally exhibit. Acting is then followed by discussion guided by a facilitator.

Role plays are useful in solving problems involving relationships among two or more persons. It helps participants overcome misperceptions or unrealistic expectations that they may have of one another. Role playing permits one to step out of one's own view, momentarily, and see things from another person's perspective. It can help to ease tensions in a group by allowing people to laugh at themselves. Role plays can be helpful in clarifying role functions and in creating consensus within a group.

- **Preparation.** The facilitator introduces the problem or story to the group. She may either read the story or, in literate groups, distribute the story in writing.

- **Selecting participants for role playing.** The facilitator can either ask for volunteers or assign roles. Individuals who identify with a particular situation will be able to handle the role play easily. On the other hand, players can gain insights by stepping out of a familiar role.

- **Recorder/Audience.** Those not taking part in the role play become participating observers. In addition to alert and receptive listening, viewers will take notes to refer to during the discussion following the role play. The entire performance can be recorded on video or cassette tape as a basis for subsequent evaluation and discussion.

- **Role playing.** Players assume the roles and "live" the situation, responding to one another's speeches and actions as they feel the individuals in those roles would behave. Since there is no

*Adapted from Fannie Shaftel and George Shaftel, *Role Playing in the Curriculum*, pp. 57-64.*
set script, players must think and feel on their feet, spontaneously reacting to the developing situation.

- **Discussion and evaluation.** Follow-up discussion is one of the most vital phases of role playing. While role playing may influence attitudinal changes, it is the give-and-take of discussion that refines and informs problem-solving. At first the discussion may center on the players and action itself. Later, the exchange may focus on alternative proposals. The facilitator guides the discussion throughout with open-ended questions such as:
  
  - What is happening?
  - Could this happen in real life?
  - What will happen now?
  - In what other ways might this situation be resolved?

Because the observers are not as emotionally involved and committed as the players, they are in a position to see different viewpoints or solutions to proposals more easily. Therefore, their participation in discussion is pivotal in helping people see other vantage points.

**Materials**

- Paper and pens, for recorders
- Videotape or tape recorder (optional)

**Notes to the Facilitator**

The focus of role playing is not on right answers but on the open exploration of a particular problem or situation. To that end, the process is as important as the solutions. Facilitators have the responsibility of drawing out both players and observers. See **Facilitation** (Tool #1).
Example

Role Play: Problem Identification in the Women's Association of La Tigra*

The following example is taken from the events at the meeting of the Asociacion de Mujeres Unidas de La Tigra held in La Tigra, Costa Rica on June 1, 1995.

In a preparatory meeting with an outside facilitator trained in the SEGA approach, two members of the Asociacion de Mujeres (one of whom was a facilitator for the group) talked about the difficulties currently facing their organization: conflicts with the neighboring women's group and internal management problems. The co-facilitators decided to stage a role play to explore possible solutions to these problems. Volunteers assumed various roles such as a: disruptive member, member from the neighboring women's group, new member, chatty member, and group facilitator.

After the role play, which lasted about 1/2 hour, the co-facilitators sought feedback from the participants and observers by asking a number of questions such as:

- How did group members feel about interruptions and late arrivals on the part of other members?
- What steps can be taken by group members and facilitators to insure that every voice is heard?
- What do you think is happening between the Asociacion and the neighboring women's group?
- In what ways might the situation with the neighboring women's group be resolved?

The outcome of the meeting was very positive: women discussed establishing ground rules for meetings and decided to extend an invitation to the neighboring women's group. Thus, members of the Asociacion were able to examine the group's internal and external problems analytically and introduce innovative solutions in a lively and engaging setting.

*SEGA field testing in La Tigra, Costa Rica, June 1-2, 1995.
Practical Needs/Strategic Interests Analysis*

Development activities tend to focus on marginalized people’s practical needs. For example, many projects pay much attention to women’s access to resources without considering their lack of control over those resources. This results in reinforcing women’s traditional roles and responsibilities.

**Practical Needs** are associated with living conditions or material state. People marginalized by gender, ethnicity, class, religion and so on, may identify practical needs as those related to food, fuel, and water, the health and education of their children and opportunities for increased income. These needs can often be met through short-term development projects.

**Strategic Interests** refer to a particular group’s subordinate position relative to the social and economic standing of the advantaged. It is measured, for example, by gender disparities in wages and unemployment opportunities, by the poor’s lack of access to participation in democratic processes and decision-making, and by women’s vulnerability to poverty and violence.

This tool aims to distinguish between a priority group’s short-term practical needs and long-term strategic interests. Disadvantaged people’s awareness of their condition and position may enable them to become agents of their own development, as planners and decision-makers. This exercise will also increase the community’s awareness of the patterns and imbalances of women’s and men’s work and relations.

1. This exercise is best conducted in small focus groups after a project has been identified.

2. The facilitator should prepare a list of questions to be used as a guide in discussion.

Table 2.9. Summary of Practical Needs and Strategic Interests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practical Needs</th>
<th>Strategic Interests</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Tend to be short-term</td>
<td>• Tend to be long-term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unique to particular sub-groups</td>
<td>• Common to almost all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Related to daily needs</td>
<td>• Related to disadvantaged position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Easily identifiable</td>
<td>• Basis of disadvantage and hope for change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Can be addressed by specific inputs: food, handpumps, clinic, etc.</td>
<td>• Not always identifiable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples: food, fuel, housing, health, water, sanitation</td>
<td>• Can be addressed by: education, enhancing organizations, political mobilization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Examples: educational opportunities, freedom from violence/abuse, access/control over resources, equity in wages, prestige/self-esteem, participation in local processes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. Three major questions form the basis of this exercise:

- **What practical needs** of women and men are addressed by this project?
- **What strategic interests** of the community at large, and priority groups in particular are addressed?
- How could this project be changed to better address women’s and other priority group’s strategic interests?

More specific questions can help a priority group in assessing their needs and identifying projects.

- How does a particular problem affect women and men differently?
- **What is the level of a priority group’s participation in defining needs**?
- Will women or other disadvantaged group benefit fairly, relative to privileged groups?
- Is the project concerned merely with delivering specific inputs to the disadvantaged, or does the project expect their increased participation and ownership?
- Will women gain increased control over resources, better access to financial resources and opportunities, more control over the benefits resulting from their productive efforts, and increased participation in decision-making in the family and community?
Practical Needs/Strategic Interests

Notes to the Facilitator

- In what ways can the disadvantaged be encouraged to participate in a project, given their subordinate position within the community?

Facilitation skills are key to the success of this exercise. See Facilitation (Tool #1). Working on a group's strategic interests is a slow, incremental process. The facilitator needs to guide the group taking care not to raise unrealistic expectations or rush the process.

Strategic interests can also be addressed by conducting other socio-economic and gender analysis exercises:

- **Access and Control Profile** (Tool #16) can help a disadvantaged group analyze their condition and position.
- **Benefits Analysis** (Tool #18) can help identify the likely beneficiaries of a particular project.
- **Gender Analysis Activity Profile** (Tool #19) will help raise a group's awareness of gender inequities in resource access and control.
- **Gender Analysis Matrix** (Tool #20) will increase awareness of a project's functioning in relation to gender roles and responsibilities.
- **Problem Case Analysis** (Tool #21) will help participants analyze different situations and learn collectively.
Identifying Problems, Causes & Opportunities*

A variety of tools presented have described methods of participatory data gathering. Once data have been collected, a format is needed for analyzing the data set and addressing issues comprehensively. Identifying Problems, Causes and Opportunities is a way for village residents and technical staff or extension agents to work together to find ways to address problems.

Identifying Problems, Causes and Opportunities initiates an interactive process between the community and a technical team. This process aims to organize assorted information into comprehensive lists of problems, causes and opportunities that can be analyzed and assessed.

1. A team made up of both residents and technical or extension staff work together to develop a chart of problems and opportunities. Residents may also work on their own with community organizers. If technical staff is present, expertise should cover a range of areas such as agriculture, forestry, and water. Any interested residents can contribute but facilitators may want to divide into two or more smaller teams if many people want to participate (usually teams should be comprised of less than 10 people). In this case, two or more charts are consolidated into one. A good representation of participants across age, class, and gender lines helps ensure that one group’s views and interests are not overrepresented.

2. All data including charts, diagrams and maps that have been collected by previously conducted data-gathering exercises should be laid out for the team to review and discuss.

3. The team works together to identify and list key problems in the community. The list of problems come from the data collected in the community along with the team’s own understanding of the community.

4. The team next lists the causes of each problem. One problem may have more than one cause. This portion of the exercise helps in designing effective solutions because one must have a clear understanding of the causes of a problem in order to effect change.

5. The team now fills in the third category of the chart listing possible opportunities for solving problems. In this section and throughout the whole exercise the community members and technical staff each contribute their special expertise. Residents offer in-depth knowledge of the village while the specialists bring an outsiders’ perspective and different technical know-how.

6. Options for solving problems should be as specific as possible. The team may want to divide into smaller groups to conduct site visits of potential solutions. For example, if the team has identified the construction of public toilets as a solution to poor sanitation, a small group should walk around the community to estimate how many toilets would be needed to service the community, where they may be placed, and what the cost would be.

7. Each solution suggested by the team should meet two important criteria: the community is both capable and willing to undertake the task. This emphasizes searching for solutions that are sustainable and rely on local resources. In this way the community can initiate and control the direction of change.

8. The chart of problems, causes, and opportunities completed by the team is presented at a community meeting. Leave space for residents to edit or amend the lists. The chart should be written clearly in large print for all to see.

9. The edited chart is then used as a basis for Ranking Problems and Opportunities (Tool #25) on the following pages.

Materials
- Newsprint paper and markers
- Compiled data from previous exercises
Table 2.10. Problems, Causes, and Opportunities*
Hog Harbour, Vanuatu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problems</th>
<th>Causes</th>
<th>Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional cooperation is</td>
<td>• Different church beliefs</td>
<td>• Bring village leaders and PRA participants together to address</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>declining</td>
<td>• Politics</td>
<td>the problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Individualism</td>
<td>• Youth groups hold sports events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Quarrels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gardens are far away and spoiled</td>
<td>• Methods used for gardening</td>
<td>• Use fallow land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>by animals</td>
<td>• Coconut land has expanded too much</td>
<td>• Secure gardens with fences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Population has increased</td>
<td>• Organize workshop to improve land uses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women have too much work</td>
<td>• Cultural norms</td>
<td>• Seed advice from agricultural officers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Changes in lifestyle and farming practices</td>
<td>• Visit model farm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Too many children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Men don't help enough at home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Men make decisions without consulting women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural resources have declined</td>
<td>• Used for money</td>
<td>• Chief and land owners establish regulations and control use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Higher population</td>
<td>• Increase awareness of resource conservation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Changes in traditional ways of managing resources</td>
<td>• Replant trees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Seek forest management advice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village sanitation is not good</td>
<td>• Not enough toilets</td>
<td>• Establish a village planning committee to organize: more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• No proper rubbish dumps</td>
<td>toilets; rubbish dump; better foot paths</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Pigs are too close to homes</td>
<td>• Families to fence animals properly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Adapted from Bronson et al. 1995, Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, pp. 52-53.
Ranking Problems and Opportunities*

After problems and opportunities have been identified, the task remains to decide which problems are the most pressing and which opportunities for solution will be pursued. Ranking Problems and Opportunities brings together the community to discuss and agree upon priorities. The exercise helps increase awareness and foster community control over their own development by focusing on local priorities and initiatives.

Ranking Problems and Opportunities draws on village perspectives and initiatives for solving problems. Ranking assists community members in establishing a realistic agenda given limited labor, financial and other resources.

Ranking problems helps define which issues to address first. Ranking opportunities defines priorities for action that are most appropriate and sustainable for the community.

### Ranking Problems

1. Assemble a community meeting and review the process of data gathering and the kinds of information that the team used to develop the problems, causes, and opportunities chart.

2. Display the preliminary chart prepared by the team. Review the information on the chart carefully with the community. Invite residents to offer comments and suggestions for including new information or making changes.

3. Work with the participants to prepare a list of the most pressing problems in the village. This could be all of the problems listed on the chart but if there are a lot of problems listed, a shortened list of the most intensive problems is sufficient.

*Adapted from Bronson et al., Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, 1995, and NES et al., Participatory Rural Appraisal Handbook, 1994.*
4. Create a grid diagram large enough for everyone to see which lists the problems along the top and left side of the matrix (See Table 2.11). Each empty square of the grid represents a paired comparison of the problems which allows participants to rank problems two at a time against each other. This is known as pair-wise ranking.

5. Participants raise hands to indicate which of the two problems at issue they see as the most important. Community members may cover their eyes to minimize peer pressure during voting. Facilitators should not vote as this could sway the group. The problem receiving the most votes is listed in the appropriate square. Totaling the number of times each problem wins ranks its importance compared to other problems. See how this is done in Table 2.11.

**Ranking Opportunities**

1. Drawing again from the chart previously prepared by the team, discuss options for solving the problems that were ranked as the most pressing. Again, review the team’s suggestions with community members encouraging new ideas and critical analysis of opportunities.

2. Rank actions that can be taken to solve each priority problem by creating another pair-wise ranking matrix with opportunities listed along the top and left side.

3. Discuss criteria to be used for ranking options before voting. Such criteria as cost, social and technical feasibility, sustainability, equity, and productivity should be considered.

**Materials**

- Large size paper and markers

**Notes for the Facilitator**

Ranking exercises can be done with groups separated by class, gender, age or other delineating variables. This is often most useful if groups do not cooperate well and the interests of one group appear to be marginalized. Men and women separately ranked problems during a PRA exercise in Vanuatu. Results showed that the problems...
ranked highest by women were ranked lowest by men and vice versa. The results were combined to reflect the community's collective priorities. The exercise revealed different concerns and interests within each group and allowed a discussion of those differences which fostered better understanding.

### Table 2.11. Ranking of Problems*

Hog Harbour, Vanuatu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problems</th>
<th>Natural Resource</th>
<th>Gardens</th>
<th>Cooperation</th>
<th>Women's Work</th>
<th>Health</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural Resource</td>
<td>Natural Resource</td>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Women's Work</td>
<td>Natural Resource</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gardens</td>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Women's Work</td>
<td>Gardens</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>Women's Work</td>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women's Work</td>
<td>Women's Work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Problem</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Final Ranking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural resources</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>#1 Women’s work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gardens</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>#2 Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>#3 Natural resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women’s work</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>#4 Gardens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>#5 Health</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Consolidated from Bronson et al., Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, 1995, pp. 53-56.
Once a community has identified and ranked its key problems and opportunities, it needs to devise a plan for implementing solutions. The Community Action Plan (CAP) serves as an open community "contract" for action which spells out the steps to be taken to bring about change.

The CAP is a means of identifying the actions necessary to solve a problem, and noting who will take which action and when. It helps a community take responsibility for addressing problems in a systematic way that builds in accountability. The CAP can also help development agencies to quickly assess whether a community's development priorities are consistent with the agency's focus.

1. Drawing from the key problems and opportunities that emerged from the Ranking Problems and Opportunities (Tool #25) exercise, the facilitator works with an assembled community group to devise a CAP. The group should be dominated by community members as it is their interests the CAP is designed to reflect, but representatives of government agencies or NGOs may also participate.

2. A detailed example of a CAP prepared in advance serves well as a model to explain to participants the components of the CAP and the process of completing the plan. Specificity is important if a CAP is to be a useful guide to community change.

3. Depending upon the size and dynamics of the group gathered, the facilitator can work with the full group or break into smaller groups. Smaller groups can each work with a facilitator on separate problems or on different opportunities for the same problem. Groups should unite once they have completed their section to comment on each others work and offer suggestions for changes. The full group should agree on the final CAP.

*Adapted from Bronson et al., Conducting PRA in the South Pacific: Experiences in Natural Resources Management, 1995.
4. The CAP covers the following areas:

- **Opportunity** - states solutions identified for each problem
- **Action** - notes steps to be taken for each opportunity
- **Who Will Do It** - lists the groups or individuals committed to completing the action, thus building in accountability
- **Date to Start** - stipulates when the action will begin
- **Who Will Follow Up** - involves other community members in supporting the action and ensuring that it is accomplished

**Materials**
- Large size paper and assorted writing implements
- Charts ranking problems and opportunities for reference

**Notes to the Facilitator**
While the CAP should focus on actions that the community can undertake on its own, some solutions may entail forming partnerships with external agents. In such cases, the facilitator may want to work with the community on a comprehensive strategy for accessing aid from outside see *Building Alliances and Networks* (Tool #35), *Using the Media* (Tool #38) and *Community Writing* (Tool #39) for some suggestions on linking communities to external agencies.

Group cooperation is important to the process of completing a CAP that a community is committed to following. See *Consensus Building* (Tool #3) for ideas on fostering group cohesiveness.
Example

Table 2.12. Community Action Plan
Hog Harbor, Vanuatu, September 1994*

**Problem:** Traditional Cooperation is declining

**Objective:** Find ways to revive cooperation through respect

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opportunity</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Start Date</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Bring village leaders and PRA participants together to find ways to revive a spirit of cooperation | • Hold evening meetings | • Chief  
• Village Pastors  
• Village Elders | • Last Friday in October, 1994 | • Assistant Chief |
| Youth group representatives come together for sports events one Friday each month | • Church pastors bring two youth groups together  
• Hold meetings to improve sports facilities  
• Advise village leaders of initiatives | • Youth leaders  
• PRA participants | • October 14, 1994 | • Youth groups members and PRA participants |

**Problem:** Women have too much work

**Objective:** Reduce women’s workload

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opportunity</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Start Date</th>
<th>Follow-up</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have a workshop on gender roles and sharing responsibilities</td>
<td>• Organize a meeting to set up the workshop</td>
<td>• Two church women’s groups</td>
<td>• October 11, 1994</td>
<td>• Female PRA participant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Consolidated from Bronson et al., Conducting PRA in the South Pacific, 1995, pp. 57-60.
Planning and Formulating Projects

Once a project focus has been chosen, communities and development agents need to work together to clarify the components of the project from beginning to end. Critical components include establishing who will be responsible for which tasks, and in what time frames. The tools in this section help systematize planning processes at the local level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #27</th>
<th>Contextual Analysis</th>
<th>152</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thinking analytically with communities about obstacles and opportunities for change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #28</th>
<th>Problem Tree</th>
<th>156</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prioritizing and analyzing problems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #29</th>
<th>Objective Tree</th>
<th>159</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thinking systematically about solutions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #30</th>
<th>Story With a Gap</th>
<th>162</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Involving communities in planning processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #31</th>
<th>SWOT</th>
<th>165</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Analyzing the internal and external forces acting on a project</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #32</th>
<th>Forcefield Analysis</th>
<th>168</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Working with communities to analyze factors which may help or hinder project success</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #33</th>
<th>Project Planning Matrix/Logframe</th>
<th>170</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Providing clarity to program goals, purpose, needed inputs, and expected outputs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #34</th>
<th>Timeframe (GANTT) Chart</th>
<th>174</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Itemizing time needed to complete project stages or tasks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contextual Analysis*

The SEGA model highlights three levels of social interaction: 1) households, 2) social institutions, and 3) natural and socio-economic resources (See Figure 1.) Constraints to and opportunities for social equity are embedded in interlinking systems. A development program which seeks to improve the situation of disadvantaged groups must analyze how systems at all levels interact to affect a marginalized group. A contextual analysis is a method for systematically threshing out obstacles and opportunities for change. A contextual analysis undertaken with community members allows participants to work with project or planning teams to analyze situations and state their priorities and perceptions. Community participation offers a richer analysis than a project team could conduct in isolation. Participatory formats also function as a tool for community empowerment.

Contextual analysis is a tool for examining the various systems interacting to influence a priority group's circumstances. Use of the tool allows a systematic analysis of factors contributing to marginalization as well as a means to strategize for change.

1. A contextual analysis is best conducted in small group settings with a facilitator.

2. The facilitator should prepare an outline of the contextual analysis chart which can be filled in during the meeting.

3. For the sake of clarity, only one marginalized group and one issue should be addressed per chart. The example on the following page is based upon the SARTHI case and looks at women's relation to common lands.

4. The examination is based on the following questions:
   - *What are the conditions at each level which influence the issue?*
   - *What assumptions/causes gave rise to these conditions?*

*Adapted from Rosalie Huisinga Norem, 1993, and the GENESYS Project, *Gender and the Environment*, 1994*
• What changes are needed in order to achieve equity?
• What constraints hamper change?
• What interventions or actions can improve the situation?

5. When the contextual analysis is completed, groups may want to discuss which types of changes are the most attainable noting how actions often overlap across levels to address the same problem. Drawing from this analysis, groups may want to develop a Community Action Plan (Tool #26). The changes and actions can also be mapped out using the SEGA model as a guide.

**Materials**

- Newsprint, paper and markers

**Notes to the Facilitator**

The facilitator's familiarity with the tool and the community context along with strong facilitation skills (see Tool #1) will help to realize the most benefits from this exercise.

Some communities may have difficulty analyzing particular context levels. For example, communities may not know the status of legal doctrines affecting an issue. Facilitators should work with the project team to gain a background in the issues so that the session can also offer educational components where appropriate.

A contextual analysis may be a complex tool to introduce at early program stages for some communities. This manual offers a variety of tools from which to choose with varying levels of complexity. Facilitators and project teams should think critically about appropriateness of this and all tools.
### Example Table 2.13. Contextual Analysis: The Adivasi Community in Gujarat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context</th>
<th>Conditions</th>
<th>Assumptions Causes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Households</strong></td>
<td>Women are responsible for gathering biomass</td>
<td>Subsistence work is seen as women's work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Institutions</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political</td>
<td>National government owns common lands</td>
<td>Government controls land and should earn revenues from resource extraction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Village government controls use of wastelands</td>
<td>Local government should manage land for community use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal</td>
<td>Laws protecting Adivasi land rights as a tribal minority make no provisions for women</td>
<td>It is not deemed necessary to guard women's rights separately</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td>Women have no ownership or control over resources</td>
<td>Men will care for women and protect their interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Socio-economic Base</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital</td>
<td>Women have little access to cash income</td>
<td>Subsistence farming does not generate savings and women do not own common lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge/Information</td>
<td>Women's specialized knowledge of sustainable farming has not been included in government wasteland programs</td>
<td>Women's contribution is not valued by male-dominated institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Natural Resource Base</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land</td>
<td>Land that women have access to is degraded</td>
<td>Land management strategies don't include women's priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change Needed</td>
<td>Constraints</td>
<td>Actions/Interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men and women share more equitably in livelihood tasks</td>
<td>Traditions</td>
<td>Open dialogue with policy makers to encourage local control emphasizing sustainability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policies allowing local groups to manage lands sustainably</td>
<td>Existing policies; Economic interests; Tradition</td>
<td>Open avenues for women's participation and representation in politics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grant formal consent for women to regenerate and manage wastelands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal code should protect women's land interests</td>
<td>Existing legal code</td>
<td>Change code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men and women should engage in partnerships sharing resource control</td>
<td>Tradition; Lack of women's empowerment</td>
<td>Empower women through organization, education and consciousness-raising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women need access to capital</td>
<td>Common land does not serve as collateral</td>
<td>Develop women's savings group for credit and emergency loans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use women's knowledge to rehabilitate wastelands</td>
<td>Gender-bias; Women don't participate in government</td>
<td>Organize women to rehabilitate and manage lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women need to have control over land resources</td>
<td>Tradition; Lack of women's inclusion in decision-making</td>
<td>Women gain permission from government to lease common lands</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Problem Tree

A problem tree ranks problems, providing a visual way to understand the relationships among problems faced by a community.

The problem tree exercise enables a group to identify key problems, debate the cause-effect relationships among them, establish a hierarchy of problems, and construct a tree which will clarify the relationships visually.

1. Ask the group to list problems faced by the community. Problems may come from participatory exercises conducted previously. See Identifying Problems, Causes and Opportunities (Tool #24) for ideas on how to list problems.

2. List the problems mentioned horizontally on a large paper or on a blackboard. List the same problems vertically and make a matrix.

3. Focus attention on the horizontal list and pair it with the problem on the vertical list. For example, if education and unemployment have been listed as problems, ask the question: *Is low education the cause of low education?* This could be left blank. Now ask the question: *Is low education the cause of unemployment?* If the answer is yes, put a check mark on the box corresponding to the intersection of this tree problem. If the answer is no, do not put any mark. Complete the matrix, moving down the vertical list for each problem on the horizontal list.

4. Count the number of checks on the horizontal row for a particular problem. The item with the most checks is the major problem. Items with fewer checks are effects.

5. Count the number of checks in each vertical column and write this number at the bottom of each column. The column with the most checks is the major cause/causes. If several columns have a

---

*This tool for creating a problem tree is adapted from Rachel Polestico, n.d., Manual for Participatory Planning for the Westy Program of the Archdiocese of Nuevo Caceres.*
similarly high number of checks, these may all be considered important causes.

6. Diagram the cause-effect relationship elicited by analysis by creating a problem tree. The problem tree, at one glance, enables people to identify and prioritize problems together. The basic structure should be as follows:

Table 2.14. Problem Tree Format

![Problem Tree Diagram]

- Newsprint, markers and tape

We can demonstrate the factors leading to inequitable and unsustainable development in the form of a Problem Tree which identifies the main problem as a broad range of socio-economic and gender inequities existing throughout the world today. The underlying cause of these inequities is the disenfranchisement of the vast majority of people who have little control over the decisions and resources which affect them. The secondary causes of this situation are numerous ranging from the devaluation of their knowledge systems to the concentration of these resources in the hands of the privileged few.
Using the SEGA Approach to Develop a Problem Tree

Socio-economic Gender Inequity

Non-participation in power structures

Disregard for Human Rights
No Access & Control of Res.
Devaluation of Local Knowledge
Control by External Agencies
Dwindling Scarce Res.
Socio-cultural Impediments

Table 2.15.
Objective Tree*

The objective tree builds on the Problem Tree (Tool #28). Once the problems are identified, the Objective Tree helps groups to think systematically about solutions to these problems.

The objective tree enables a group to determine the activities which will lead them to the solutions for the problems they have identified. The tree helps participants to map out solutions logically.

1. Working with a group of community members, facilitators lead a group discussion about how to bring about an improvement in the problem situation. Ask what members think might be done to change a situation.

2. On a large paper or blackboard write ideas for the types of changes people would like to see and how to bring about those changes.

3. Encourage people to think of several different ways to bring about change so that the most feasible tactic (and not simply the first one thought of) can be pursued.

4. Formulate an Objective Tree following the format in Table 2.16. The types of changes are the "results" and the ways to bring about the change are the "activities."

5. Consider what could be done and note ideas on the objective tree.

**Purpose**

**Process**

1. Working with a group of community members, facilitators lead a group discussion about how to bring about an improvement in the problem situation. Ask what members think might be done to change a situation.

2. On a large paper or blackboard write ideas for the types of changes people would like to see and how to bring about those changes.

3. Encourage people to think of several different ways to bring about change so that the most feasible tactic (and not simply the first one thought of) can be pursued.

4. Formulate an Objective Tree following the format in Table 2.16. The types of changes are the "results" and the ways to bring about the change are the "activities."

5. Consider what could be done and note ideas on the objective tree.

**Materials**

- Newsprint, markers and tape

*The description of the objective tree is adapted from Rachel Palestico et al., Manual for Participatory Planning for the Westy Program of the Archdiocese of Nueva Caceres."
To be effective, the objectives need to be SMART: Specific, Measurable, Attainable, Realistic and Time-bounded.

We can use this type of analysis to formulate an Objective Tree which suggests ways of redressing the conditions specified in part I of the SEGA manual. The underlying objective of any development effort should foster socio-economic and gender equity through the empowerment and participation of the disadvantaged groups. This involvement can result in a variety of beneficial outcomes as noted below. The enabling interventions can include local participation, macro-level policy changes, coalitions, and organizational changes, as well as fruitful linkages between local and external capabilities.
Table 2.17. Developing an Objective Tree for SEGA

Socio-economic
Gender Equity
Goal

Empowerment/
Participation
(Purpose)

Respect
for
Human Rights
Equal Access &
Control of Res.
Valuing Local
Knowledge
External/Local
Partnerships
Environmental
Preservation

Linking External Agencies
with Local Capacities
- Policy Makers
- Academics
- Alliances
- Other People’s
Organizations

Local Initiatives
- Consciousness Raising
- Organizing
- Training
- Resource Mobilization
- Participation

Macro-level Interventions
- Policy Change
- New Paradigms
- Funding
- Coalitions

(Result)

(Activity/Interventions)
Story With a Gap*  

Involving local communities in planning processes often requires participants to utilize skills which they may not be accustomed to using in formal settings. Disadvantaged groups in particular may not have experience in planning, and may doubt whether their contributions are valid. Story With a Gap uses “before” and “after” scenes of a problem situation to simplify the planning process, and to allow all individuals an opportunity to participate in a dialogue.

Story With a Gap uses visuals to foster analytic thinking in planning. This method allows community members to discuss the planning process in an unstructured way which encourages full participation.

1. Depending on the size and character of the group, the facilitator may work with the full group or divide into subgroups. If some people do not feel comfortable within a larger group setting, it may be best to subdivide.

2. Show a prepared “before” picture or ask participants to draw their own picture depicting a problem situation. Ask participants to describe the picture and react to the problem. If the facilitator prefers, s/he may create a story about the people in the picture. The story should lead to a crisis point where something must be done to address the situation.

3. Ask participants to speculate how the situation became so dire. For example, if the picture shows a broken water pump, participants may suggest that no one knows how to fix the pump or that too many people are using the pump or that someone has purposely destroyed the pump.

4. Once the group has sufficiently discussed the “before” situation, introduce a prepared “after” picture or ask participants to draw a picture which shows an improved situation or a solution to the problem.

*Adapted from L. Srinivasan, 1993, Tools for Community Participation, pp. 118-120.
5. Ask the group to think about how the situation moved from the “before” to the “after” scenario. Ask participants who may have worked to better the situation? Villagers? The government? NGOs?

6. Ask the participants to think through the steps that led to the improved condition. The facilitator should encourage as much input as possible, writing down in words or pictures for all to see the steps that are suggested by participants.

**Materials**

- Two large posters with the “before” and “after” scenes or paper for participants to draw the scenes
- Newsprint to note steps suggested by group
- Markers

**Notes for the Facilitator**

The pictures need not be elaborate as long as they are clear. Stick figures and simple drawings will do if other pictures are not available.

This tool may work effectively in some settings as a bridge to more elaborate planning tools (Community Action Plan Tool #26 and Log-frame Tool #33). Once participants feel empowered in planning, they can build toward more formal tools and detailed plans.
Example

Before

Cogon grass (weeds following slash & burn)
No work animals
Traditional planting techniques
Few plants

After

Farm work animals
Planting in
hedgerows
More corn

*Source: SEGA field testing in Taglimao, Phillipines, May-June 1995.*
31 SWOT Analysis*

SWOT is an acronym for Strength, Weakness, Opportunity and Threat. It is a brainstorming technique for analyzing the internal forces (strengths and weaknesses) and the external forces (opportunities and threats) acting on a potential or actual project or business.

SWOT analysis provides a simple but effective means of assessing needs, identifying projects, comparing possible projects and monitoring the implementation of projects. This tool may be useful in helping a community identify the advantages and disadvantages of a certain undertaking.

1. Explain to the participants the purpose of SWOT.

2. Introduce the SWOT chart below, explaining that the strengths and weaknesses focus upon factors internal to the project, i.e., the way in which a project is run. External factors are the opportunities and threats from the outside environment that affect a project, i.e., outside funding sources.

3. If the group is large, divide the participants into smaller groups of less than 15 people, if possible. Ask each group to analyze the project using the SWOT chart. If comparing the feasibility of various projects, have each group analyze a different project.

4. For each strength, weakness, opportunity and threat listed in step 3, ask participants to think about what steps could be taken by community members running that project:
   - How can the group build on its strengths?
   - What changes could be made, as suggested by the weaknesses?
   - What can the group do to take advantage of the new opportunities?
   - How can the group protect itself from the threats?

*Adapted from Tototo Home Industries and World Education, Inc., Failika, pp. 22-23 and Rachel Polestico et al., Manual for Participatory Planning, p. 34.
5. After about one half hour, reconvene as a large group. Ask each group in turn to present its SWOT analysis to the other participants. Allow time for discussion.

Materials

- Newsprint, markers and tape
- Large SWOT chart
- Enough charts and pens for small groups

Notes for the Facilitator

If participants are illiterate, invite people to participate verbally. The facilitator may write down the ideas and assign symbols for various ideas. The facilitator should restate the main points periodically for all participants to follow.

Example

Table 2.18. SWOT Analysis: Women and the Boat

Below an abbreviated SWOT chart of the Kenyan women and the boat enterprise (Scenario #2) shows the internal strengths and weaknesses and external opportunities and threats facing the Mkwiro women’s group, as the women explored a possible expansion of their ferrying business. Tototo helped the women work through their decision-making process by using a more detailed SWOT analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Internal</th>
<th>External</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strengths</strong></td>
<td><strong>Weaknesses</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity to work</td>
<td>Illiteracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing skills</td>
<td>Innumeracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership skills</td>
<td>Dependence on men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful ferry venture</td>
<td>Reliance on Tototo</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

166
The figure below shows the sustainability strategies that capitalize on the strengths and opportunities and the turn-around strategies that minimize the weaknesses and threats facing the Mkwiro women in their boat venture.

Table 2.19. Sustainability and Turn-around Strategies Using SWOT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sustainability Strategies</th>
<th>Turn-around Strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Expand business using leadership and negotiation skills</td>
<td>• Organize consciousness raising groups about constraint issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Empower disadvantaged groups through project</td>
<td>• Implement literacy and numeracy programs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Utilize existing support to influence other organizations</td>
<td>• Teach proposal writing skills to literate women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Document story to inform policy makers and academics</td>
<td>• Build coalition to advocate for gender equity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
32 Forcefield Analysis*

In any situation there are enabling factors and hindering factors. The community wants to minimize the problems it will have in identifying, designing and implementing a development strategy or a specific project. Therefore, it needs to analyze the factors which will help build an effective strategy and those which will detract from it. This process is called forcefield analysis.

Forcefield analysis is a useful step in project formulation and design because it helps the community to reflect on the forces in the environment which may help or hinder project implementation.

Process

1. Draw a straight, vertical line representing a tension between all the forces that would help you with your strategy (arrows pushing to the right) and all the forces that would get in your way (arrows pushing to the left).

2. With the group list all the helping forces which will create an enabling environment for the project or objective. For example, in the case of Lesoma, Part III, Scenario 4, the Department of Wildlife and National Parks is willing to train village-based patrols, clearly a "helping" force.

3. Then list all the hindering forces which will make this strategy more difficult. Issues of salary and equipment are among those which need to be sorted out for Lesoma.

4. Develop a complete list of helping and hindering forces.

5. Ask the group to discuss the following questions:

   - Do we have some influence over any of these forces? Which ones?
   - Can the effects of any helping forces be increased? How?
   - Can the effects of some hindering forces be reduced? How?
   - What new forces might be generated to help carry out this project/strategy?

*Adapted from Dorothy P. Craig, 1978, Hip Pocket Guide to Planning and Evaluation.
Materials

- Newsprint and markers; or
- Chalkboard and chalk

Notes to the Facilitator

This exercise can clarify important information about a strategy which is under consideration and should facilitate the decision process. The exercise should be carried out in connection with an assessment of the resources available to implement a given strategy.

A Forcefield Analysis can be used in tandem with a SWOT Analysis (Tool #31) to help think through the strengths and weaknesses of a given project or process.

Example

Table 2.20. Forces at Work in Establishing Village-based Wildlife Patrols, Lesoma, Botswana*

In Lesoma, Botswana, members of the community are very concerned about damage to their fields from wild animals (See Part III, Scenario #4). They are contemplating establishing village-based wildlife patrols. They need to analyze what conditions/factors in their situation will facilitate the effective organization and implementation of such patrols, and what conditions and factors might make it difficult for them to operate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Helping Forces ----&gt;</th>
<th>----&gt; Hindering Forces</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Dept. of Wildlife will train village-based patrols</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Opportunity for employment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• PRA exercises opened dialogue among different groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Competition for limited natural resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ethnic conflict</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Insufficient economic resources for salaries</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Lack of equipment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Adapted from Ford et al., 1993, Managing Resources with PRA Partnerships: A Case Study of Lesoma Botswana.
The Project Planning Matrix or Logframe is a planning tool which helps project designers and stakeholders understand the causes and effects between objectives in developing an overall program or project.

The purpose of the logframe is to provide clarity in regard to overall program/project goals, its specific purpose, the anticipated outputs, and the required activities. It enables the planning group to clarify the critical components of a project, their assumptions, linkages and relationships. The tool is also useful in improving project implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

1. Review the logframe matrix shown below.

Table 2.21. Logframe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hierarchy of Objectives</th>
<th>Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI)</th>
<th>Means of Verification (MOV)</th>
<th>Important Assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Program or sector goal</td>
<td>Measures of goal achievement</td>
<td>Sources of data needed to verify goal indicators</td>
<td>External factors (outside the control of the project) necessary to sustain objectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project purpose</td>
<td>Conditions that indicate that purpose has been achieved: end of project status</td>
<td>Sources of data needed to verify purpose</td>
<td>External factors needed to attain goal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outputs</td>
<td>Measures to verify accomplishment of outputs</td>
<td>Sources of data needed to verify status of outputs</td>
<td>External factors needed to attain purpose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td>Summary of the project budget</td>
<td>Sources of data needed to verify status of activities</td>
<td>External factors needed to accomplish activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. The Logframe vertical axis assumes that there are four levels of objectives in a project. (There is, of course, no logical limit to the number of levels, just a practical one.) There are many similar terms used for the word objectives -- goals, purpose, results, outcomes, etc. In this case, we use the word objectives as a generic term for all of these. Clarify for the group building the logframe the following components:

- **Goal level**: What will this project achieve? The goal statement is a single statement of the program rationale. It does not contain multiple objectives. The goal level may include targets beyond the scope of the project planned.

- **Purpose level**: Why is the project being done? The purpose describes the desired impact of the project. For practical reasons, we recommend that the project has a single stated purpose, because multiple purposes diffuse project efforts and weaken the design.

- **Output level**: What will this project accomplish? Outputs are results. All outputs necessary for achieving the purpose are listed. The kind and magnitude of outputs are so stated that progress toward them can be verified, in terms of quantity and time.

- **Activities level**: How will the project be implemented? Activities are actions identified to produce outputs. Activities make clear what it will cost to achieve the purpose (e.g. funding, staffing, equipment, other resources.) Activities together with the appropriate assumptions create the necessary and sufficient conditions to achieve the outputs.

The horizontal axis consists of **Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI)**, **Means of Verification (MOV)**, and **Assumptions**. Definitions for these terms are:

- **Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVI)**: Indicators tell us how to recognize successful accomplishment of objectives. They are not conditions necessary to achieve those results.

- **Means of Verification (MOV)**: Where will the information be obtained to demonstrate what has been accomplished?
The MOV defines how and from what sources data or evidence will be collected.

- **Assumptions**: Assumptions are statements about external conditions which are outside the control of the project. Assumptions may describe important natural, political, or social factors necessary for the achievement of a particular objective level.

### Materials
- Newsprint, markers and tape
- Large Logframe matrix

### Notes to the Facilitator
Logframe is only one of several tools that can be used during project preparation, implementation and evaluation. It is a difficult tool to be used on its own. We recommend doing the Problem and Objective Trees (Tool #28 and 29) before the Logframe so that problems and objectives are defined first.

Logframes are often misunderstood. Confusion around the use of the tool centers on two points: 1) terms and definitions are too abstract; and 2) the structure is too rigid. In field testing the logframe in Conception de La Tigra, Costa Rica, on June 9, 1995, we found that we needed to restructure the tool in working with field level program leaders, some of whom had limited formal education. For example, since the terminology was not clear to the participants, we renamed and reordered the categories in the horizontal axis to read: **Goal, Factors that Support the Goals, Indicators of Success, Sources of Data to be Collected**.

It is important to bear in mind that the purpose of this and all other tools are to help development planners and community groups focus on dialogue, participation and discovery. If the structure or terminology of a tool prove to be an obstacle to these goals, then they should be modified to fit the context.
Example  

Table 2.22. Logframe Matrix for the SARTHI Project

Below is a logframe prepared for the Social Action for Rural and Tribal Inhabitants of India (SARTHI) in relation to the organization's work in Panchmahals District of Gujarat State with the Adivasi women. The project has helped women organize around the rehabilitation of degraded common land and some related ecological and economic livelihood projects. The work is described in Part I of this manual.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative Summary</th>
<th>OVI</th>
<th>MOV</th>
<th>Assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Goal</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improved livelihoods for women</td>
<td>• Women's training and involvement in groups</td>
<td>• Data obtained from: Surveys Focus groups SARTHI interviews</td>
<td>• Value to improving women's status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Meet biomass needs of Adivasi women</td>
<td>• New supply of fodder and fuelwood from wasteland</td>
<td>• Count # of groups</td>
<td>• Availability of trained field staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Analysis of land-use</td>
<td>• Train health workers and paraveterinarians</td>
<td>• Participant observation of land-use, meetings</td>
<td>• Can strengthen groups so leaders can't manipulate them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Improved fodder/fuelwood supply and use</td>
<td>• Vaccinate 3000 cattle</td>
<td>• Interviews</td>
<td>• Sufficient interest among women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Rehabilitate degraded land</td>
<td>• Work on wastelands</td>
<td>• Government records</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Healthy livestock</td>
<td></td>
<td>• SARTHI records</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Organize SARTHI resource projects</td>
<td>• Train health workers and paraveterinarians</td>
<td>• SARTHI reports</td>
<td>• SARTHI resources available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Train village workers</td>
<td>• Train SARTHI staff</td>
<td>• Group discussions</td>
<td>• Outside support available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Train SARTHI staff</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Random sample survey</td>
<td>• Government is supportive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Work donated wastelands</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Wasteland records</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Any group embarking on a project or related development activity needs some guidelines for completing the various phases of the activity. The GANTT chart is a bar chart enabling the group to assess how much time each stage will take in order to complete the entire process in the time allocated. It helps people focus energies on priority activities and it facilitates re-evaluation about the process so that the group can make revisions if things are not working out exactly as planned. It is useful to post a GANTT chart where all participants can see it.

The purpose of the GANTT chart is to clarify for all involved the major stages of a project and the time frame in which it is to be completed.

1. On the blackboard or on a large paper, list in the first column on the left the various activities which must be undertaken to complete the project.

2. On the horizontal axis note the appropriate unit of time, e.g. days, weeks, or months.

3. Working from left to right, plot the activities on the chart as they must occur over time in relation to other activities.

4. Establish a clear beginning and completion date for each job. Draw the lines so that their lengths are proportional to the planned duration of each activity.

5. Monitor progress on each activity by drawing solid lines parallel to and below the dotted lines to show actual duration for completed activities.

6. Make the GANTT chart available to all participants in the project.

---

An example of a GANTT chart is noted below in relation to the Nepal case on maternal health care. The maternal and child health team is undertaking basic data gathering in Palhi village. The team has devised a schedule and a plan for completing this work.

Materials
- Paper or posterboard and markers; or
- Feltboard or other means of making a chart

Notes to the Facilitator
There are other similar, but more complicated, techniques for keeping track of planning processes, namely the PERT chart* which tracks activities and the time needed to complete them. It links tasks and shows the time needed to complete each, thus emphasizing the linked responsibilities in a schedule.

Example
Table 2.23. GANTT Schedule**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ACTIVITY</th>
<th>January</th>
<th>February</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>April</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1 2 3 4</td>
<td>1 2 3 4</td>
<td>1 2 3 4</td>
<td>1 2 3 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wealth Ranking</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility Mapping</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Informant Interviews</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Groups for Trendlines</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venn Diagrams</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority Group Analysis</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Household Interviews</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring Maternal/Child Health</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


**See Part III Scenario #1 for data gathering tools used in Palhi.
Strategizing for Change

Communicating with officials and outsiders can be a new and daunting task for marginalized groups. Tools that help local groups convey information can empower them to influence policy makers and effect policy changes. Building alliances, assessing risks, documenting processes, using technological tools and the media, and writing proposals can help communities represent themselves in larger circles.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool #35</th>
<th>Building Alliances and Networks</th>
<th>179</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizing formal and informal networks to effect change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #36</td>
<td>Assessing Risks</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Thinking through levels of risk involved for community members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #37</td>
<td>Accessing GIS</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increasing local participation in environmental decision-making and information gathering</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #38</td>
<td>Using the Media</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Giving wider attention and momentum to processes empowering marginalized groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #39</td>
<td>Community Writing</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teaching document and proposal writing skills for accessing external agencies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tool #40</td>
<td>Documenting Processes</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Facilitating information flows from local to national and international realms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Building Alliances and Networks

A network or coalition is an alliance between two or more independent organizations. Each organization remains autonomous, but works collaboratively with other organizations to achieve a common goal or goals. A coalition may be formal and structured or informal and unstructured depending on its purpose and size (See "Structural Considerations" below). It may be formed for a short duration to coordinate local aid efforts, for example; or a network may be organized with the expectation that it will continue to exist over a long period, often to implement a particular program or policy issue of on-going concern.

The farm-to-market networks in the southeastern part of the United States (Part III Scenario #9) provides an example of a long-term coalition established to address the crisis of Black farmers' land loss by developing regional markets for small farmers.

Purpose

A coalition may be formed with a single purpose or a set of goals. Community-based organizations have formed networks to:

- share information and resources internally;
- provide training and technical assistance;
- publicize an issue of concern and educate specific constituencies about that issue;
- respond to a local crisis situation by harnessing social, political, financial or physical resources;
- advocate for a particular issue, such as access to more resources or stronger political voice;
- provide a more systematic, coordinated approach to program planning and implementation;
- avoid duplication of services and fill gaps in service delivery;
- support political candidates or policies;
- improve opportunities for new pilot projects; and
- accomplish what individual members cannot.
1. Identify the issue(s) for which you would like support.

2. Identify various organizations that have a stake in this issue. Decide whether you will accept individual as well as organizational members, and if so, whether any person may join or whether individuals must represent a particular segment of the community. Be sure that the network membership broadly reflects the community. Include women and representatives of various cultural, ethnic, religious generational, and socio-economic groups.

3. Determine, as a group, the network's appropriate purposes, scope, and priorities. Resolve what the coalition will do and what it will NOT do.

4. If the group is large, select a steering committee or other leadership group, which is representative of the range of interests in the full membership and is acceptable to the full membership. Use the steering group to encourage positive results, resolve problems that may arise, and conduct outreach for new members.

5. Establish committees or task forces to plan for various aspects of the network's activities, such as advocacy priorities, specific agendas, publicity and procedural matters. Involve all members in at least one committee.

6. Assess progress at the end of six months and make necessary changes. Coalitions take time to become strong; cooperation and trust among groups develops gradually on the basis of positive experience.

Structural Considerations in Building Coalitions

Setting up a working relationship with other organizations means addressing practical realities, defining group roles and individual relationships while maintaining the integrity of each member organization. Structures and processes that encourage open discussions of vested interests and group cooperation are needed. The structure must allow for the active, effective participation of all members. The smaller and more informal the group, the less structure required.
In a large, formal coalition, a board of directors may be established to determine roles and responsibilities or to monitor the coalition's program, finances and management procedures. The board's decisions may need approval by the boards of directors of member organizations. Agreements can be arrived at among participating groups.

In an informal, short-term network, the institution of a board of directors may not be practical or worthwhile; however, a board of directors may be advisable if there are plans to seek outside funding to support the coalition. Advisory boards can be useful for providing a liaison to the community and the intended beneficiaries of a program.

A coalition has the greatest chance for success if it:

- has a manageable scope of activity. If the coalition addresses one of two "winnable" tasks, it can experience some early success
- involves all of its members
- focuses on activities which would be difficult for member organizations to address successfully on their own

**Table 2.24. Forces at Work in Building Networks**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supports</th>
<th>Barriers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusive, diverse membership</td>
<td>Exclusive membership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clearly defined purpose</td>
<td>Lack of direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-range view</td>
<td>Lack of focus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action orientation</td>
<td>Fear of Advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of community</td>
<td>Factionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilitative leadership</td>
<td>Inadequate or controlling leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Celebration, humor</td>
<td>Focus on deficiencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All member input on agenda</td>
<td>Lack of interest</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example

A local social service network in the United States.*

In a number of communities in the United States there is an informal network of social service groups offering assistance to poor families. One such network emerged in response to a crisis situation in the Gardner area, comprising a small city and five surrounding towns in central Massachusetts. Two social service agencies (the Department of Social Services and Mental Health) met to provide joint services to a client. Out of their initial meeting the Gardner Area Interagency Team (GAIT), a forum for about two dozen local governmental agencies, churches, and health and social service organizations, evolved to assess community needs and plan actions to address these identified needs. GAIT served as a network for these organizations to:

- support each other in crisis situations;
- educate one another about their services and clients;
- eliminate duplication of services; and
- collaborate on a variety of projects.

GAIT achieved these goals by holding regularly scheduled monthly meetings with an agenda determined by membership and rotating leadership. Meetings typically featured an information-sharing session, reports of subcommittees and special presentations on identified problems, program plans or innovative solutions. In addition, GAIT periodically sponsored seminars and workshops for service professionals. All of these occasions proved opportunities for members of the network to communicate ideas informally and become aware of dilemmas facing other organizations. As a consequence, cooperation and collaboration became valued.

Although the network was strong and useful among health and social service providers, members perceived that representation from business groups would be critical to giving GAIT a voice beyond local boundaries, especially in a climate of shrinking aid to cities and towns. A business and social services partnership developed in the late 1980s enabling GAIT members to flex their political muscle and make decision on wider policy and legal issues affecting the provision of health and social services. More than twelve years after its inception, GAIT continues to be a vital and dynamic local network, providing members with an opportunity to serve their clients better and giving life to an old adage that there is strength in numbers.

Assessing Risks

Because SEGA is an approach that emphasizes empowerment for disadvantaged groups, it may arouse opposition from those who benefit from the status quo and who do not wish to see significant change. This opposition may vary from mild stalling tactics or indifference to outright violence and disruption.

The purpose of this exercise is to help members of the community and development facilitators think through various activities to determine the levels of risk involved for community members.

1. Clarify whether the group is involved in a) advocacy (that is, seeking to modify a policy or program to affect them in more beneficial ways) or b) resolving an existing conflict between two parties or groups within the community.

2. Identify the social, economic, cultural and political constraints to meeting objectives.

3. Analyze how these constraints may build upon one another.

4. Prioritize problems and objectives in relation to the issue at hand.

5. Identify:
   - **Supporters.** Who has interests in the same goals? How can you get their cooperation and support?
   - **Resources.** What resources are available within your group or community? What resources exist among your allies?
   - **Opposing viewpoints**
     i) Identify the specific structures, policies, or individuals involved.
     ii) Assess interests, resources, strategies and tactics of opponents
     iii) Assess the goals of your opponents
iv) Think about ways to build consensus, converting a zero-sum situation into a win-win situation for all parties

- **Observers.** What groups and individuals have no stake in the goal you are advocating? Can these neutral parties have a positive effect on your objectives? Can they have a negative effect?

**Different Kinds of Risks**

- **Capture by elites:** Is it possible or likely that the initiatives you are undertaking will be undermined or captured by those in the community who have power, position, and authority?

- **Stymied by the state:** Is there a risk that the bureaucracy will stand in your way, through obstinacy, bureaucratic subterfuge, or other means?

- **Opposing economic interests:** Will those who have "something to lose economically" find ways to undermine your objectives?

- **Beset by inertia:** Is the gravest threat one of indifference on the part of the majority of members of the community?

- **Violence or its Threat:** Do those who share your objectives and interests fear physical violence and harm from those who oppose it?

The group needs to think through very carefully what the likely risks may be, what types of actions may reduce risk, and the ways in which an organized and mobilized community can strengthen its options for effective action to improve local opportunities and well-being. The group or community may need alternative strategies for reaching its goal. Then it can choose a strategy to implement on the basis of different kinds of risk assessment.
Using Geographic Information Systems (GIS)*

In the advent of the computer technological revolution new geographic tools such as Geographic Information Systems (GIS) and remote sensing are becoming increasingly accessible for environmental decision-making. Such tools offer environmental decision-makers and managers the capability of bringing together a variety of data -- environmental, economic, and social -- into a single spatial management framework. Maps, the basis for geographic tools and analysis, can be used for local-level planning and input into national planning. GIS enables users to examine, analyze, and compare a great amount of information quickly and iteratively.

The primary purpose for using GIS is to obtain and maintain an adequate spatial information base from which effective decisions about managing resources and the environment can be made. Information is required at all levels of decision making, from policy planning at the national level to local community development projects. Although GIS is most often associated with mapped data, GIS can also manage spatial data in the form of satellite imagery, point observations such as that from rainfall stations, or tabular data often associated with census records. Furthermore, when employed appropriately, GIS can enable the participation of a variety of users including these in local communities.

As a tool, GIS facilitates:

• rapid data manipulation and comparison;
• rapid updating of environmental databases;
• selective generation of new data through manipulation of known factors and relationships;
• incorporation of remotely sensed data such as satellite imagery for continuous environmental monitoring and landuse mapping; and
• modelling of physical, economic, and social processes for simulation and prediction.

Using GIS in Community Development Efforts:

- **Generating Information.** The priorities and perspectives of local people can be represented through a process called indigenous mapping. This can be as simple as giving local names to scientific soil classifications or as complex as mapping landuse according to local land tenure systems. Through such processes, residents can assist in the development of environmental databases by sharing their specialized knowledge.

- **Environmental Decision-making.** Geographic tools can bring increased clarity to decision processes and to decision-makers. Given the variety of data that may be collected and managed, environmental management and planning can be a formidable task. Problems are identified, solutions generated, alternatives evaluated, and ultimately decisions are implemented and monitored. At all stages of the decision-making process, accurate information helps inform appropriate policies.

- **Gaining Access to a New Technology.** Geographic tools are becoming increasingly widespread at all levels of government and within NGOs. More and more, access to the technology can be found at colleges and universities, government planning offices and ministries, environmental NGOs, and in-country donor agencies.

**Appropriate Use of Geographic Tools**

Geographic Information Systems offer new opportunities for community residents to work with planners to gather and organize information. It may be particularly valuable at those junctures where conflict arises over resource use and where a careful examination of all available data and alternative solutions may help to resolve disagreements. Central to deciding if GIS is appropriate is whether or not the problem at hand is a spatial one. GIS is most useful for spatial decision-making. It is also important to evaluate whether automation offers advantages over traditional techniques. Before choosing to use GIS, the objective should be well defined. An organization should consider carefully how GIS fits into its structure and mission.
While GIS offers new opportunities for local input, it may also serve to marginalize local voices as the technology and its impressive output of official documents becomes a voice and an authority in its own right - an authority which is controlled by "official" personnel. The technology itself does not automatically enhance planning processes or increase participation. This outcome depends on the way the technology is used. It does not produce "magic" solutions to resource problems. Like any technology, GIS should be looked at critically to assess how it may help or hinder the objective of equitable and sustainable development.

Example

Landuse Planning in Brazil*

An example from Brazil demonstrates how new technologies can assist local planning and sustainable development. In Southwest Brazil, resource rich lands known as extractive reserves are owned by the federal Government but are co-managed with the local residents in order to minimize landuse conflicts. Rather than assuming a top-down management approach whereby government proposals often come in conflict with local land tenure systems, communities are involved early in the planning stages of these important lands.

GIS and remote sensing are used to map landuse in the area. Residents are involved in the development of these maps by identifying family lots on preliminary maps derived from satellite imagery. Residents also help supply vital socio-economic data. Together, digital land use maps, population, transportation networks and socio-economic information are used to model existing and future land management scenarios. Thus, through indigenous mapping and the use of geographic tools, local communities are able to voice their view of reality and their sense of ecology.

Using the Media

Journalists - and the newspapers, magazines, radio and television stations for which they work - are key actors in generating awareness and support for political and social change. Local communities, and those who would help empower the disadvantaged within them, can learn how to use the media to their advantage. The media can be powerful allies to grassroots groups and non-governmental organizations in their quest for social, political, and economic justice.

The purpose of this strategy is to enable community members and development facilitators to think about the ways in which the media can help energize and give momentum to the processes of empowering disadvantaged groups.

Process

1. Brainstorm on options for media coverage of the issues you are addressing. Letters to the editor, opinion pieces, news articles prepared for national or local newspapers and news magazines may be useful to your cause. Weekly news magazines are often "hungry" for local news of merit. Radio stations may have special programs or segments devoted to local news and community activities. If your issue or problem can be readily linked into a national concern, so much the better.

2. Be prepared when engaging the media. Good information and clear knowledge of a subject inspires confidence and can build support for your objectives. Conversely, the negative impact of a poorly staged media event seen by the public on television or heard on the radio can be difficult to overcome.

3. Build a sustained relationship with those involved in the media. Social change is a long process. Local communities seeking change want fair and accurate reporting of the issues they face and events taking place. Community leaders and representatives of non-governmental organizations need to engage reporters over a sustained period of time, offering them the best available information in order to gain credibility and acceptance.
4. Consider all forms of media: radio, television, newspapers and other options. Media serve a role in education and in changing behavior. Thus, the media can be a valuable ally. In many countries, for example, the radio is an important change agent. Many people listen to radio news, educational, and talk shows at some point during the day. If your efforts are not gaining national attention, scale down and consider local options.

5. Create your own forms of communication. A group increases its power with the creation of its own communication channels in the form of a regular newsletter or issue papers, or perhaps an occasional magazine or bulletin. They then are able to communicate with their own membership regularly and clearly on relevant topics. Such publications encourage a group to clarify objectives, create a statement of principles, and determine what their long-term goals and strategies are.

Use of media puts the issues into the public eye, and may arouse political opposition or even hostility. The facilitator should be aware of these possibilities. See also Assessing Risks (Tool #36).

Example

Ideas for Using the Media

In Bolivia, virtually all rural households have a radio and "tune in" between 7:00 and 8:00 am. Lots of ideas and information are conveyed to a broad cross-section of citizens at that time.

The Caribbean Policy Development Centre, established in Barbados in 1991 by 19 networks of non-governmental organizations in the Caribbean region, publishes a Bulletin which serves as the main channel of communication with and between member organizations. It also publishes CARICLIPS, compilations of newspaper clippings from around the region on specific topics.

In the Philippines, the Philippine Partnership for the Development of Human Resources in Rural Areas (PhilDHRA) is a broad partnership of more than 62 NGOs concerned with the social development of depressed rural communities and the empowerment of people's organizations. PhilDHRA publishes PhilDHRA Notes, a regular newsletter, as well as numerous reports and manuals related to sustainable development.
Community Writing*

Most of the tools presented in this manual involve working with communities to gather information, assess needs, and plan projects. While many of the tools are designed to be effective and non-threatening with illiterate populations, literate community members can assist the community by learning to document processes, write proposals, declarations, petitions or other such documents. In this way, the community maintains the skills needed to access and network with external agencies and thereby control its own development.

1. **Show an example.** An example of a completed document serves as a model. If community members are writing a proposal, show them another successful proposal to serve as a reference point. An example helps to familiarize communities with both the format and the standards of presentation demanded by formal documents.

2. **Build on existing mechanisms.** Do not assume that a community has absolutely no idea how to network with external agencies. Find out what is traditionally done to access resources and build on these processes. For example, if a Village Development Council normally petitions a local government office for aid during crisis times, begin with the content of written or verbal petitions to show that writing is merely formalizing a process they are already familiar with.

3. **Write one section at a time.** Break the document down into sections and work on one at a time to avoid confusion.

4. **Let community members write the document.** Usually, a teacher or other member will feel comfortable enough to do the writing. Sometimes this is not possible due to the formal nature of the writing or limited literacy in the community. In this case, an external agent may write down the community's ideas.

*Adapted from an interview with Moses Samson April 25, 1995 regarding working with communities in Botswana to write constitutions and an interview with Milan Shrestha April 25, 1995 regarding community process documentation in Nepal.*
5. **Confirm accuracy of ideas.** Regardless of who does the actual writing, it is essential that the written ideas are read back to the community for their approval as people tend to synthesize and interpret information while writing. Community members can signify their acceptance of the document by signing or marking their approval individually.

6. **Expect the process to be time-consuming.** It is important that community writing be a participatory process. As such, it will necessarily take some time to listen to everyone’s ideas and develop the document as a group. This will take much longer than if just a few individuals were to write a document.

7. **Advise and organize.** A facilitator’s role during a community writing process is to serve as a technical advisor for the document and to help organize ideas. As frustrating as it may be, facilitators must resist urges to speed up the process by initiating ideas or finishing sentences for participants. At the same time, the facilitators must fulfill an advisory role. For example, they should help guide the process so that a community proposal for a water project is technically feasible and attractive to funders. This is a delicate balance of helping to mold the process without controlling the outcome.

---

**Notes to the Facilitator**

Community writing, like most participatory processes, can be usurped by a few powerful individuals. This situation can be precipitated by the fact that the men and the wealthiest are often the most literate in a village; they may feel the most comfortable with the writing process, thereby representing an imbalance of interests. This is especially so when the writing involves securing resources or benefits. Facilitators should be aware of this possibility and work to encourage representative participation and equitable allocation of benefits. See the following tools for further insights into working with groups: **Facilitation** (Tool #1); **Consensus-Building** (Tool #3); and **Conflict Management** (Tool #4).
Documenting Processes

The SEGA Manual puts forth a different model for thinking about and practicing development. Many of the techniques and tools presented will be new to development agents and agencies. While it is always a good idea to document data and processes, it is particularly important if one is trying a participatory, bottom-up approach like SEGA for the first time.

The SEGA Model stresses the need for information to flow from local to national and international spheres rather than always in the reverse direction. In order to convey information effectively, communities and field level personnel will need to take the time to document their knowledge, their successes and challenges. Careful documentation not only helps agents learn from their experiences, but also offers evidence to the effectiveness of such approaches. Such evidence can be clearly presented to agencies and institutions which are often structurally resistant to change, thereby speeding up processes.

1. Establish a system for organizing data. Files or folders often work well. Organized documentation and record-keeping from the first stages of a project will allow facilitators to evaluate processes throughout a project rather than just at the end.

2. Development agents should take care to note their own assessment of the tool or exercise. Some questions to keep in mind follow:
   • How did the community respond to the tool?
   • Did people actively participate?
   • Did some contribute more than others? Who? Why?
   • Did the tool elicit useful information? What sort?
   • What were the drawbacks or limitations to the tool?
   • How could the tool or approach be improved?
   • Do we need materials?
Writing is not the only way to record processes. Audiovisual Aids (Tool #5) outlines ideas for means of documentation other than writing. Videos or photographs can provide compelling evidence of local responses to change which help to prove successes or recognize limitations of a SEGA approach.

Many of the tools presented in this manual include built-in methods of process documentation. For example, Mobility Maps (Tool #15), Problems, Causes and Opportunities Charts (Tool #30) and Gender Analysis Matrices (Tool #20) all result in visual representations of community data and ideas.
Bibliography for Part II


and Life Histories in Zambrana-Chacuey, Dominican Republic." In I. Guijt and M. Kaul Shah, eds.,


Prentice-Hall.


Section 5: References

5.1. Annotated Bibliography and Further Readings

This part of the toolkit provides a list of annotated/abstracted references of relevant articles not included in this toolkit. It is intended for those who are interested in reading further on the topic. The list is divided into three parts. The first part features articles of specific relevance to gender and social policy centered on the issues of poverty and socio-economic analysis; health; and education. It also provides a list of related case studies. Part Two, features references which address the evolving discourses on gender and development, considering the roles of formal and informal institutions in gendered analysis, and contemplating the use of alternative methodologies and research tools. Part Three comprises a list of non-annotated further suggested readings.

It should be noted that wherever possible, annotations were imported directly from abstracts provided by the author or publishers. The “adaptations from introductions” are notes modified from opening paragraphs and thesis statements in the original texts where no such abstracts exist. The writer has attempted to re-capture the essence of the articles by using words verbatim whenever possible. Full credit is given to the original authors and publishers of each article for the phrases and descriptives which appear in this section.

PART I

GENDER MAINSTREAMING ISSUES IN POLICY AND PLANNING:


Abstract: Projects focusing on practical needs can undermine strategic gender interests. This is because practical gender interventions often seek only to change existing activities and women’s involvement in directly productive activities. The activities and enterprises that women are currently involved in are a manifestation of an existing culture; culture reflects and determines women’s relations with men and the way that women perceive themselves. In this article, case study material from Northeast India illustrates the complexity of male/female relations across different social and economic groups. This demonstrates how practical interventions may be of only short term-benefit to some women, and may actually have a negative impact on their position in society relative to men.


Adaptation from Introduction: This case book is meant primarily for national development planners and practitioners, as well as for staff of international development agencies. It offers a set of conceptual perspectives and analytical techniques to deal with gender issues in a range of development projects through case studies as a pedagogical tool. The Overholt analytical framework is suggested as a way to build gender-differentiated data bases on activities, and increase access to and
control over resources. The framework is designed to facilitate the translation of needs into project or policy terms.


Abstract: This book reflects on the recent emergence of a less segregated approach to understanding and changing gender relations. This means understanding women and men in relation to each other, as well as identifying strategies which involve men, both separately and together with women, in addressing gender inequalities. This publication focuses on gender relations, namely the social, economic, political and legal roles of women and men in society. Four of the main themes of the Beijing Conference are considered from a gender perspective: women’s status and rights; education and training; economic participation; and sexual and reproductive health. Each of these four reviews is accompanied by an annotated bibliography, providing the reader with an introduction to key literature concerned with developing countries.


Abstract: This article examines the institutional structure and contexts with which WID policy making takes place in the Philippines, discussing the agents involved, and their practices. Drawing on the experience in the labor and employment sector, it is argued that while a government may appear to be successful in mainstreaming gender concerns in development, and may be seen as a model for gender responsive planning and policy making, the situation may be illusionary. The article points to potential inconsistencies between the particular state and its development bureaucracy. The author argues that while these inconsistencies are a barrier to the goal of promoting women’s interests in development, they also represent spaces for maneuvering and strategizing within a bureaucratic system to push for as much attention as possible on gender issues.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article describes how accountability is grounded upon the concept of consent as the principal pre-requisite of legitimate authority. It secondly notes how consent has historically played an ambivalent role for women. Its central argument is that placing consent within “a context of choice” which recognizes cultural identity threatens to negate the value of consent for women in development.

Abstract: Gender impact assessment is a way to estimate the expected impact of an intervention, such as a development project, on women, and to what extent the specific interests and needs of various categories of women will be affected. Such assessment provides information relevant to project planning, and should preferably take place before a project begins. This book presents three case studies which utilize this methodology, and offers conclusions regarding its use and the lessons which have been learned from the studies.


Abstract: Information about women’s experiences of development have been integrated into the development process in ways which reflect the dominant development paradigms, and in ways which reflect the ambient gender politics and gendered interests of development bureaucracies. Consequently, the political content of feminist knowledge - information relating to women’s interests in contexts of change- is often stripped away, leaving generalized information about women’s needs for development bureaucracies to administer. This article argues that the dominant economistic paradigm for information classification, valuation, and analysis, institutionalizes interpretations of the means of women’s experience of development. Consequently, information about women’s different experiences from men in development tends to encounter resistance from policymakers and may be ignored and inadequately included in the policy planning process.


Abstract: This book examines the response of international donor agencies to requests for aid in social transformation. It compares donor’s priorities with those of their development partners and argues that although significant achievements have been made, the fundamental goals of the women’s movement - transforming social and gender relations and creating a more equitable world - have still been eluded. It attempts to address the contradictory trends between advocacy on the one hand and growing poverty of the world’s women on the other.


Adaptation from Introduction. This article discusses the responsiveness of institutions (multi-lateral and bilateral development agencies, NGOs, and state institutions) in terms of organizational contexts (goals, procedures, incentive systems and staffing); political contexts (Political commitment of stakeholders, democratic accountability and stat-civil society relations); and the discursive contexts.
(differing gender discourses); as they affect the design and implementation of development projects and programs. The article concludes by offering some strategies for improved accountability.


Abstract: The empowerment of women by their increased participation in all aspects of political, social and economic life has become one of the major goals of democratic and participatory movements, as well as women's organizations throughout the world. This book examines the vital interaction of women's increased participation, and decision-making and empowerment, by providing vivid examples of women responding to those challenges. Beyond offering an understanding of what participation and empowerment are and can be, this book seeks to promote women’s participation whether at the grassroots and national and international levels. The book looks at the growing involvement of women in different organizations, politics and public life, development programs and international decision-making. It outlines the strategies, mechanisms and tools that women are using for their empowerment and explains new priorities and perspectives that women are bringing to today's issues.


Abstract: This is a report of a three day workshop which took place in England in May 1993. "Enhancing Our Experience: Gender Planning in EUROSTEP Agencies" brought together representatives of 13 NGDOs belonging to the European Solidarity Towards the Equal Participation of People and other European networks. The workshop focused on developing common strategies for integrating gender-fair policies and practice into the programs of EUROSTEP agencies, within their own organization and in their work with women in poor communities of the South.


Adaptation from Introduction: This paper looks at the various ways in which policies on women's advancement evaporate, even when these are fairly explicit in guidelines and regulations of a typical development agency. The argument here is that the patriarchal culture of most development agencies impedes the organization's ability to implement policies concerned with women's equality and advancement. The principles and values of feminism would not only contradict the agency's internal norms and traditions, but stand in the way of cozy and comfortable alliances with the patriarchal governments of the Third World. This paper challenges the notion that development agencies are trying hard enough, but are facing resistance from the Third World to argue that in the area of women's advancement, lack of progress on policy implementation has to be seen in terms of the common interests of both the development agency and the Third World government.
Adaptation from Introduction: This article characterizes a new approach to gender planning, and outlines its methodological tools, procedures and components. It traces the frameworks roots to recent Women in Development / Gender and Development debates. It contrasts an emancipation vs integration approach to women’s development by discussing the integration of gender-needs assessment and the WID/GAD policy matrix, and such procedures as gender diagnosis, gender objectives and entry strategies in the gender planning process.


Adaptation from Introduction: Recognition of the important role that women play in Developing countries has not necessarily been translated into planning practice. This article describes the evolution of gender planning and seeks to highlight the ways in which women and men play different roles in developing societies. Such different roles require different sets of conceptual and methodological frameworks for incorporating their needs into gender planning. This article focuses on the categorization of the triple roles that women play and how this may be translated into practical and strategic needs. Moreover, the article considers the capacity of different interventions to meet gender needs and provides for a critique of policy approaches to gender and development planning.


Abstract: This book assembles an international and interdisciplinary cast of scholars who approach the subject of the impact of gender on welfare state analysis and outcomes on two levels. First, they test the applicability of mainstream frameworks to meet new areas in analyzing gender. Secondly, they highlight possible re-conceptualizations and innovative frameworks which have been designed to provide gender-balanced analysis. These twin approaches are combined with a strong comparative component, focusing on a cross-section of countries of major interest in welfare state research.


Adaptation from Introduction: At the crossroads, we are faced with key questions about research and action. Do analysts focus on the concrete strategies of putting lessons learned into the practice of existing structures and bureaucratic institutions? Do such strategies involve complicity with an evolving structure which overwhelmingly marginalizes women and increases the gap between rich and poor, male of female? Does the strategy of attacking the structure relegate analysts to distant critics, powerless to influence and evolving process? Should analysts continue to critique the larger structure? Would more radical structures also face women and development problems? The selections in this special issue draw from a variety of perspectives and consider how capitalist and socialist economies continue to marginalize women. This article considers the impact of policy and program implementation institutions within transitions toward more women-sensitive change.
POVERTY AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC ANALYSIS:


Adaptation from Introduction: This article addresses the virtual exclusion of women from new institutions of community management. It calls for a re-conceptualization of the household outside of traditional economic analysis of the home as an undifferentiated homogenous unit. The writer challenges the assumption that all men as head of households are altruistic in their sharing of wealth. It urges policymakers to look beyond income and economic indicators to consider qualitative factors such as the social norms and perceptions which guide interactions and distributions of wealth.


Adaptation from Introduction: This book addresses the refusal by many development workers to see global restructuring as a gendered terrain. In exposing silences in the areas of economic policy; structural adjustments; liberalization; and the feminization of the labor force; the book offers insights into examining and interpreting the complex issues which frame the relationship between gender and economic policy.


Abstract: In recent years attention has concentrated on the contributions of small-scale industries to the development process, and also the part played by women’s employment in trading, service, and other small scale industries in developing countries. This book links the gender perspective on small-scale industry which explicitly concentrates on social programs, with that of economic question of higher employment and wider distribution of production. The first two parts of the book are specifically concerned with the role of small-scale industrial units in the development process, the changing gender division of labor in such industries, and the way women combine employment with their reproductive tasks and community roles. Lessons are then drawn from development programs directed towards women in small-scale industries or the “informal sector”. The third part of the book considers these recommendations in the light of case studies in the footwear industry. It concludes by criticizing the inadequacy of existing models and calling for more research in this area.


Adaptation from Introduction: Divided in two sets of chapters, this book deals with the challenges facing women in economic restructuring. The first set of chapters focuses on the relation between state and civil society, and on the broad transformations and policy reorientations which have altered this relationship. The second set deals with these issues by documenting and analyzing them from the perspective of specific sectors, namely health; social security; employment; and poverty-alleviation programs for female-headed households. Case examples are drawn from the Carribeans, Africa, Latin America, South East Asia and Eastern Europe.
Adaptation
Perspectives on Development

education, national, through analysis models; burden women practiced, must change. Development policies must surmounting the dearth of circumstances, thereby offering something to explore aspects stereotyping which surround feminist approaches have been made since the later 1970's: a) the visibility of women's work and its inclusion in labor force and national accounting statistics: and (b) macro-economic policies, with particular reference to alternative models to the orthodox structural adjustment packages.


Adaptation from Introduction: The aim of the book is to provide an idea of diversity in the dynamics of female household headship in developing countries, and to disentangle, if not dispel, some of the stereotypes which surround this phenomenon. The book is concerned with examining what women-headed households are, how they arise, how they survive, and how these issues interrelate with various forms and aspects of gender inequality, particularly among the urban poor. An integral objective of the text is to explore how female heads of households and members of their households perceive their own status and circumstances, thereby offering something of a counterbalance to the somewhat "public" discourses of family produced by the state or elite groups. The text does this by drawing on interviews among the poor and/or urbanizing areas in Mexico, Costa Rica, and the Philippines.


Adaptation from Introduction: The interdependent crisis of worldwide poverty, social disintegration, and the dearth of productive employment cannot be addressed in isolation, nor can there be any hope of surmounting them without the active involvement of women on all levels. To address these crises in a meaningful way, the end that development practitioners seek, and the manner in which development is practiced, must change. Development policies must be informed by an understanding of the unequal burden women bear in coping with the effects of poverty. The factors furthering the feminization of poverty - lack of skills; repressive family and social structures; gender-blind development policies and models; and over-reliance on market mechanisms; must be tackled. This article addresses these issues through analysis of the structures that perpetuate gender inequality and areas which warrant attention at national, local and household levels, including the invisible economic contributions of women, and education, health and technological gendered needs.

Abstract: This book explores interventions to promote the enterprises of low-income women in the Third World which go beyond providing credit for financial services. A growing number of micro-credit programs in the Third World have successfully targeted low-income women. To date, the success of these programs has served to highlight that women living in poverty not only are credit-worthy, but also, are engaged in a variety of economic activities that are critical to their livelihoods. However, only a few of these programs have systematically addressed the non-credit constraints faced by women workers. The article defines the key elements of BRAC and SEWA's success, and develops an analysis of an incremental and participatory sub-sector approach to poverty, with a view to seeing it applied more broadly in other countries and contexts. The ways in which the approach has been used differ significantly and offer interesting case studies for increasing understanding of how to support and promote the work of low-income women.


Abstract: As the economies of many Third World countries have deteriorated and their governments weakened, the World Bank and IMF have achieved overwhelming policy pre-dominance in the South. Yet their strategies of Structural Adjustment have also met with growing intellectual criticism and popular opposition. This book takes the argument further. Its authors argue that there is a fundamental, possibly premeditated negative connection between Structural Adjustment and women's social reproductive work in Africa and Latin America. This book breaks new ground in its theoretical and political critique of current development strategies.


Abstract: This volume looks at the extent to which macro-planning and major poverty alleviation programs in the Asia-Pacific region concretely benefit women. It provides a regional perspective on the interrelationships of gender, economic growth and poverty. The essays included are a selection of papers which were presented at a meeting on the subject in Vietnam - they focus on issues in the relations between poverty situations; major approaches to gender issues and poverty alleviation; and new possibilities to promote gender equity and in poverty reduction.


Abstract: This work addresses the gender dimensions of economic reforms in three African countries - Ghana, Mali, and Zambia - to determine their impact on rural women and men. Based on field research conducted under the Canadian-sponsored Structural Adjustment and Gender in Africa (SAGA)
initiative, these three country studies examine household and institutional responses to the reforms. It argues that key to enjoying the benefits of economic reform are access to technology, credit, and markets, as well as healthcare and education. Survey results reveal that the potential benefits of structural adjustment, particularly for women, have not been fully realized - women have benefitted less from macro-policies and institutional reform, and agricultural growth have benefitted by women's inequality. Among the study's recommendations for policymakers are to focus on agriculture; acknowledge and support women's roles and activities in the sector; realign social spending; provide credit and training opportunities; and allow women a voice in the economic decision-making process.


Abstract: Despite the vast difference between first and third societies world societies, subordination of women to men seems to be a universal fact. The chapters in this book look specifically at the marital bond/contract, and locate the subordination of women in terms of that contract. It examines the development and expansion of market relations and shows how it affects marital relations, husband's control over wives, and men's control over women.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article provides information on a multitude of important issues, and facts pertinent to women's issues and women's status in the growing global community. Based largely on United Nations documents and unpublished reports, it provides information in the areas of health; employment; marriage and divorce; literacy; education; family planning; voting rights; and violence against women. The first section provides a global progress report on women's political representation, education, and employment. The second section profiles 140 countries and their relative progress on women's concerns.


Abstract: Development policies and programs tend not to view women as integral to the economic development process. This is reflected in the higher investments in women's reproduction rather than their productive roles, mainly in population programs. Yet women throughout the developing world engage in economically productive work and earn incomes. They work primarily in agriculture and the informal sector, and increasingly, in formal wage employment. Their earnings, however, are generally low. Since the 1950's, development agencies have responded to the need for poor women to earn incomes by making relatively small investments in income-generating projects. Often such projects fail because they are welfare and not development concerns, offering women temporary and part-time employment in traditionally feminine skills such as knitting and sewing that have limited markets. By contrast, over the past twenty years, some non-governmental organizations, such as Self-Employed Women's Association in India, have been effective in improving women's economic status because they have started with the
premise that women are fundamental to the process of economic development. This article compares and contrasts various approaches to development.


Abstract: This book is part of an effort to promote better understanding of gender relations in society, their implications in policy making, and most of all, in social change towards a more equitable society. It takes the priority issues of the Social Summit; poverty; employment; and social integration; as a framework, and presents different gender sensitive points of view about Latin America and the Caribbean situation.


Adaptation from introduction: This book synthesizes research on the invisibility of women’s labor and on the lack of imputed value for their environments. It further explores how these invisibilities have been institutionalized. The author argues for a de-mystification of national and international economics by inserting human values and human beings back into economic indicators. Particular focus revolves around the under-numerated work of agricultural and informal market worker in the developing world.

GENDER AND HEALTH ISSUES:


Adaptation from Introduction: The collection of papers in this manuscript summarize a workshop on gender, health and sustainable development hosted by the IDRC. The articles in this reader discuss priority themes in Latin America such as AIDS; sexually transmitted diseases; environmental stress; production activities; tropical diseases; indigenous people’s health issues; and the role of health care providers. The final analysis covers forward looking strategies for gender and health initiatives.


Abstract: Participatory research has in recent years gained considerable importance both as a research strategy and as an educational process. This volume breaks new ground by presenting the experience and reflections of academics and practitioners, both from the North and South, who are using this approach in the field of health. Contributors place PR in its historical and theoretical context. They examine issues of training and practice drawing on experiences from Africa, Asia and Latin America, as well as the USA, Britain and Europe. The book further places emphasis on questions of equity in terms of gender, race and class; and the skills, qualities and attitudes required of practitioners.

Adaptation from Introduction: This selection of papers represents the fourth in a series of essay competitions jointly sponsored by the International Development Research Center and the UNDP/World Bank/WHO Special Program for Research Training in Tropical Diseases. The theme of the collection is an analysis of factors that facilitate or inhibit women's use of health services, including the discussion of the provider-client relationship. Several papers also address the issues of gender and tropical diseases in a more generalist approach, which contributes significantly to furthering women's health research in areas beyond issues of maternal, family planning, and reproductive health.


Abstract: Health research, when it does address women's concerns, tends to emphasize and cater to their needs in reproductive health. This book identifies and addresses key gaps in gender and health research, such as: women and AIDS; tropical disease; the working environment; and barriers to quality health care. It also identifies new and emerging themes in women's health and sets priorities for future action.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article begins with an overview of the epidemiology and biology of HIV and then examines the aspects of political economy and gender relations that propel the pandemic. It offers a gendered perspective on AIDS prevention and a critical assessment of current debates and research strategies in the international arena. It further argues for community-based approaches to prevention that are grounded in actual conditions and that use what have become known as "empowerment strategies." It calls for increased action-research to help reshape gender relations in support of both AIDS prevention and development. The main discussions in the article focus on the African context.


Abstract: It is 20 years since environmental issues were first put on the international agenda at the Stockholm Conference, and concern for planetary survival has shifted from desertification to acid rain to ozone depletion to bio-diversity. The official response to all the various crises however, have largely been one of offering technological and managerial "fixes", which often fail to address or solve the basic ecological issues. Genuine, viable improvements can only be implemented at ground levels, by those most strongly affected by the problem. Because of their location "on the fringes", and their traditional role in providing sustenance, it is the women who are often able to offer ecological insights that are deeper and richer than the technocratic recipes of international experts or the responses of men in their own societies. This book emphasizes the environment is not some distant concern, but one that affects the health and well-being of communities on a daily basis. For women, "the environment" is the place in which they live. The contributions in this book, edited by Vandana Shiva, shows how women worldwide are taking action at
grass-roots level, battling toxic waste, low-level radiation and biotechnology in the struggles for truly sustainable community development.


Adaptation from Introduction: The article is a personal account of a Canadian physician and novice researcher, and her experience in conducting participatory research during a years stay in Northern India. The writer discusses the challenges of time constraints, finding the appropriate research process, and working with conventional bio-medical epidemiological procedures; while striving to incorporate active participation by local people into her research. The account also highlights vulnerabilities in the researcher-subject relationship and the value of working within a team or under an accessible mentor with previous experience in the field.

SIDA. 1996. **Handbook for Integration of a Gender Perspective in the Health Sector.** Stockholm: Health Division and Gender Equality Unit. Johanna Schalkwyk, Beth Woronuik and Helen Thomas (eds).

Adaptation from Introduction. This handbook is aimed at policy for development cooperation in the Health Sector, and creating strategies to promote sexual reproduction and reproductive health and rights. The handbook is composed of three parts. The first, is an analysis of the linkages between gender equality and health sector development. It is aimed to guide sector analysis and policy development and help set concrete measurable goals for this area. The second part is composed of talking points to guide policy dialogue on gender in the health sector, based in social justice and effectiveness rationales. The third section aims to facilitate gender mainstreaming in different parts of the planning cycles such as: appraisals, sector reviews and evaluations. The handbook is composed of series of questions which should be asked at different phases of the planning cycle, complemented by comments on why these questions are relevant, and what possible actions may be taken to overcome barriers.

### GENDERED KNOWLEDGE, INFORMATION AND EDUCATION:


Adaptation from Introduction: The work of the women’s movement in South Asia, and globally, has been responsible for some significant positive changes for women: there is growing gender awareness which translates into wider recognition of women’s subordination and the need to challenge it. While the groundwork for continued action has been laid, there remain a variety of areas that are crucial to women’s empowerment and that have not received adequate attention in the past. Education is a critical ingredient to women’s empowerment when it goes beyond helping women to read words, but to read, understand, and control their worlds. This article argues that literacy classes must become more than places to learn to become “modern,” but instead, a forum for consciousness raising and
network building. It explains the need for participatory non-hierarchal teaching and curriculums that are relevant to women's realities and daily lives, rather than those of development agents.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article describes the distinctive perspectives that address the impact of technological change on the status of women. It assesses the various conceptual contributions of a decade of research on the problem of women's access to technology and evaluates the policy recommendations that flow from these approaches, paying particular attention to the question of education.


Adaptation from Introduction: Over the last decade, research has made an undeniable case for the connection between women's education and lower morbidity, mortality, and fertility rates in families. Only a few of the specific mechanisms by which this connection is made, however have been identified, and extensive research is needed to uncover all of the mechanisms that mediate between women’s education and health, and family planning behaviors. An important question for this research is whether it is the experience of schooling and the literacy skills acquired in school that leads to an impact on health maintenance and family planning. Since literacy skills can also be achieved in the adult non-formal education programs, the answer to this question could affect education and health policy. This paper argues for more opportunities for non-formal literacy training for women. It bases this reasoning on a discussion of the theoretical model and case study of a successful program that combines women’s literacy with health and family planning education in Nepal.


Abstract: Women, especially women in the developing world, occupy few positions of power within the realm of science and technology. Yet women's experiences of science and technology frequently differ from that of men - and often in less positive ways. Gender differences in the field have real consequences for the quality of women's lives and for sustainable human development. They reflect issues of justice, equal access to knowledge, and equal opportunities to shape that knowledge. In this book gender specialists from around the world probe topics ranging from indigenous knowledge, health, and information; to education, literacy and the role of small business. They provide insights into the failure of science and technology to answer women's needs and the lack of women's power in this critical domain.

Adaptation from Introduction: This article focuses on research stereotyping of gender roles in the context of the formal education system in Zimbabwe, by considering the predominant teaching methods and materials which come from a male-dominated educational establishment. It argues that curricula and methods which are supposedly gender-neutral, can continue to replicate stereotyped and restrictive views of the role of women in both child and adult education, and dis-empower women even within the educational process.


Adaptation from Introduction: In most countries in the world, a large number of women participate in non-formal education programs. While most women benefit in some way from these programs, there has been little research conducted to show whether NFE programs are actually helping women better understand themselves, their situation and the position of as women in these societies. There is also little evidence to show if, or how, these programs are empowering the participants to question and challenge discriminatory practices, to take control of their lives, or to challenge their situations. The project discussed was funded by the International Council for Adult Education to examine the extent to which non-formal education programs for women in Caribbean and South Pacific countries, contribute to empowerment of those who participate in them.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article focuses on research of twenty women who own small businesses in Lesotho. The purpose of the study was to: assess the extent to which women participate in development; to assess their present understanding of and their feelings about empowerment; and finally, to explore how non-formal education could be used for the purpose of empowerment of women. Their views and experiences are categorized in the paper along cognitive, psychological, economic and political empowerment spectrums.


Adaptation from Introduction: This publication is the result of an international seminar-workshop on "Promoting the Empowerment of Women Through Adult Learning" held in Chiangmai, Thailand in February 1997. Thirty seven women from four countries shared, reflected on, and analyzed, the different types of education opportunities for women and created a Draft Agenda for the Future of Adult Learning. The inclusions reflect the range of issues covered by the workshop and their diverse perspectives on the topic.

Adaptation from Introduction: Many stakeholders contribute to the education process in developing countries. However, systemic reform of educational efforts must include teachers as they are vital and fundamental to the success of quality education. Yet too often, teachers have been silent recipients not included in policy-making efforts, in governance and management decisions, and in day-to-day instructional strategies and decision-making. This article discusses the complex process of engendering empowerment of female teachers and underlines how systems thinking can encourage structural normative change of education systems. It pinpoints how this framework empowers teachers to be flexible and responsive to the needs of students, schools and communities.


Adaptation from Introduction: The article discusses the need for a post-literacy package beyond the initial literacy package which has been instituted by the government of Nepal. It addresses such questions as how to reach the most disadvantaged groups and tackle cultural barriers to female education; how to combine literacy skills with functional development activities; and how to facilitate the creation of learner-centered curriculums that allow pupils to construct their own materials based on needs and interests. It focuses on how the educational process can become an empowering rather than a subordinating experience.

---

**CASE STUDIES**


Abstract: This book highlights the significance of women's self-organizations and cooperatives within the context of the Indonesian non-governmental organization movement, and assesses the extent to which these self-help projects operate to increase women's bargaining power and extend their activities in general. The three criteria of control over resources, personal autonomy and social participation are used in analyzing how the socio-economic, political and cultural organization of Javanese society is manifested in the day to day lives of women and men. The authors document social change, women's ability to cope with it, and the consequent broadening of their aspirations and roles.

---


Abstract: This interdisciplinary volume provides a historical and international framework for understanding the changing roles of women in the political economy of Latin America and the Caribbean. The contributors challenge the traditional policies, goals, and effects of development; and examine such topics as: colonialism and women's subordination; the positive and negative consequences of development for women; the links to economic, social and political trends in North America; the gendered division of paid

45
and unpaid work; differing economic structures, cultural and class patterns; women’s organized resistance and survival strategies; and the relationship of gender to class, race and ethnicity/nationality.


Abstract: This volume draws together the experiences of seven South Asian NGOs in organizing rural and urban poor women for economic empowerment. Going beyond the normal descriptive accounts of the work of these NGOs, it throws new light on how changes are occurring at the grassroots level and analyzes and defines economic empowerment from the perspective of women themselves. Through case studies, the book demonstrates how women are gaining increased access to and control over economic resources and how this, in turn, has led to far-reaching socio-cultural and political changes at the individual, family, community and wider economic levels. It also shows how women are now building and taking control of their own organizations which increasingly are becoming more autonomous and financially self-reliant. This book will be of relevance to students of development and women’s studies, development planners and practitioners, women’s organizations and those with an interest in South Asia.


Adaptation from Introduction: This work traces the practical roles of women (and men) in several dimensions of rural life. In each dimension, it examines the relation between observable and recounted practical activities and relations on the one hand, and official models of these on the other, as they relate to issues such as social life, kinship, and household relations. The approach taken utilizes theory and attempts to do so as much as possible from the perspective of ordinary rural women. It considers this issue through comparisons of three geographically separate communities.


Adaptation from Introduction: This book is a contribution to the growing number of volumes on gender and development written and compiled by geographers. But more importantly, it also addresses the call for theoretical and contextual agendas in our approach to, and analysis of, gender and development and feminist geography. The book examines “unity” and “diversity” through research from British Commonwealth geographers reporting on field research. It focuses on gender issues in developing countries within the context of British colonial discourse either by citizens of Britain or citizens of former British colonies. The theme of “diversity” is explored by the heterogeneity of the people studied and the explanatory importance of differences in space and through time. The focus of the book lays in Africa and the environment in rural areas; Latin America and rural/urban interaction and migration; South Asia and the interaction of women’s productive, reproductive and decision making roles in rural areas; and South East Asia and the confrontation between religion, culture, and modernization in the urban industrial and rural contexts. Issues in health and non-governmental organizations are also addressed.

Abstract: This paper tackles the issues of women's empowerment and political participation in relation to development programs. It focuses on arguing that if women are to play a greater role in determining their own development then they have to move away from expert and re-privatization discourses and adopt a politicized view that aligns development programs with women's own need interpretations. This argument is supported through analysis of a case study in Northern India in which the organization has moved away from a welfare type approach to one in which it is clearly in line with women's politically expressed needs. These include addressing such needs as village water supply campaigns and state-wide initiatives centered around deforestation, liquor and violence.


Adaptation from Abstract: In discussing the components of responsive, clear, action-oriented evaluation, this article looks at the questions of “Who wants to know what, and for what purposes”? It considers how in the rush to gather information and assess program impacts, the needs and voices of donors and project implementers may generally overpower those of the actual participants causing important information to be lost. The article also provides the opportunity to discuss how this voice can be brought back into the process by looking at the definition, purpose, impact and potential of participatory evaluation. The article supplies an outline of a training program designed to provide field-workers with the skills and experience to facilitate participatory evaluation with women's groups.


Abstract: This book is a narrative history of the Self-Employed Women's Association (SEWA) the 40,000-strong union of India's poorest women which has increasingly become an inspiration to and living example of a new development model relevant to low-income women worldwide. SEWA'S unique organizing tactics focus on the poorest most vulnerable women in Indian society-those who are self-employed or working in the informal sector, and who have been marginalized by mainstream development strategies.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article traces the legacy of apartheid and how its impact differed for African men and women. It then discusses the structural changes in the 1970's which have created new opportunities for women. It further focuses on the 1980's and how in the context of political mobilization, women were permitted to articulate gender-specific demands. By looking at different moments in the transition process, this work explores the dynamics which have enabled women activists within the South African nationalist movement to insist that "women's voices be heard at
last" in the construction of a new social order. It also considers the competing dynamics inside the transition process which may weaken feminist voices within the new South Africa.


Abstract: Rapid urbanization has always spawned slums. But what are they like to live in? And particularly for women? This study of slum culture and gender relations compares two slums in Asia - Ratmalana in Columbo and Khlong Toey in Bangkok - and shows how the impact of urbanization, economic change and national politics has differed significantly in Sri Lanka and Thailand, despite their common cultural background in Theravada Buddhism. The book explores the impact of these differences on gender relations and the lives of the very poorest men and women. It further discusses how gender identity is defined; the contradictions between culture as publicly expressed and privately practiced in women's daily activities.

PART II

RE-CONSIDERING THE CONCEPT OF GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT


Adaptation from Introduction: This book highlights some of the fundamental questions raised by practitioners regarding goals, contents and methods of learning in development initiatives. It demonstrates how a focus on gender results in changing established concepts and methods of data collection, social analysis, and policy planning. It concludes by identifying priority areas for future research and provides a resource list and guide to selected women's research and training centers around the world.


Adaptation from Introduction: The book is a collection of technical papers and case studies aimed at giving scholars and practitioners across fields a working knowledge of the pivotal role women play in the success or failure of any development project. Case studies are drawn from diverse cultural environments such as small scale enterprises, bank loan programs, and problems in agricultural technology.

Adaptation from Introduction: This book is designed to introduce readers to significant topics in the field of anthropology of gender; it provides broad cross-cultural coverage to encourage comparative analysis of the themes under discussion, complements research with articles that deal with masculinity and male gender roles, and combines theoretical and ethnographically based articles in each section of the book. Case studies in the reader revolve around the following areas: biology; gender and human evolution; gender and prehistory; the public/private divide; the cultural construction of gender; culture and sexuality; the sexual division of labor; property and citizenship; households and kinship; ritual and religion; politics and reproduction; and colonialism and global economies.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article discusses strategies for overcoming male bias in everyday attitudes and practices, in theoretical reasoning and in public policy. It explores the possibility of weakening the underlying supports of male bias through defining extra-familial ways of integrating making a living and raising children; creating measures of collective public responsibility for children, and changing the way that paid employment is structured. It further discusses how far progress in overcoming male bias can be made within the context of existing forms of development, and examines the question of whether alternative development strategies are required for greater gender equality.


Adapted from Introduction: This article considers how development researchers may look for an alternative gender perspective. It discusses how re-thinking gender and development impinges on the production of knowledge and the current allocation of resources, and as such requires examination of how current methodologies have served the interests of privileged groups or produced skewed development practices during the last decade. The article further focuses on how knowledge generated by excluded groups can help to re-define development thought and may facilitate discovery of how diverse experiences have been concealed by compartmentalized modes of analysis. The conclusion addresses the effect of reversing the order of gender priorities and balancing responsibilities, rights and obligations.


Abstract: In recent years, participatory development has become an established orthodoxy among development agencies across the political spectrum. Drawing on the author's own research and a range of secondary sources, this article focuses on gender aspects of participatory projects. The evidence suggests that gender inequalities in resources, time availability, and power influence the activities, priorities, and framework of participatory projects just as much as "top down" development and market activities.

49
Increasing the number of women involved in participatory projects cannot, therefore, be seen as a soft alternative to specific attention to change in gender inequality. The article highlights how meeting the demands of poor women in the South will require not only local participatory projects, but linking these with wider movements for change in the national and international development agendas.


Abstract: This book is a combination of the practical and theoretical. It features articles which consider the effect of global issues on women's lives, the individual experiences of particular women, and the theoretical basis of gender aware planning and implementation of development projects. It offers numerous case studies as examples and poses questions about the future of women's participation.


Adaptation from Introduction: This work considers the construction of the notion of a singular “third world woman” in development discourse and the problem this creates in dis-enabling analysis of the diverse realities of women in developing countries. The article touches on the effect of this conceptualization in marginalizing women's knowledge and experiences, and in perpetuating stereotypes of women's development. It considers the associations made between women as dependents; victims; family beings; religious symbols; and the problems with envisioning a unified feminist movement.


Adaptation from Introduction: This work addresses the problem with the ongoing perception that development information and exchange of knowledge should flow in one direction from the North to South. The writer attempts to de-mythologize the monumental creation of the development “expert” by considering different sources for knowledge creation and possible avenues for forward-looking strategies in development theory. The article further indicates how an empowerment approach and the application of participatory action research may serve as catalysts for moving beyond what is termed as the “current development impasse.”


Adaptation from Introduction: This article discusses the origins, meaning and theories behind three approaches to development: Women in Development (WID), Women and Development (WAD), and Gender and Development (GAD). It explores how the theories may be translated into practice, and highlights the underlying assumptions that accompany each term. This is followed by a discussion of the effect each classification has on how research, policy making and international agency is assessed. An outline of various potential avenues for the development of GAD projects is also introduced focusing primarily on women's empowerment through the questioning of traditional roles and responsibilities as a primary goal.
Adaptation from Introduction: This study concerns itself with the way standard works of modernization and dependency theory have conceptualized development, modernity, dependence and revolution. It critiques the recurring themes of modernity, development, self-reliance and revolution as they are explored by many modernization and dependency theorists. It attempts to give implicit ideas about gender, tradition, and modernity a feminist critical reading so that future attempts to move beyond the two paradigmms (modernization and dependency) will be more self-conscious about and attentive to the extent to which individuals rely on gender to understand the meaning of development across international contexts.


Abstract: In recent years, global attention has focused on some remarkable transitions to democracy in different countries. Unfortunately, those transitions have failed to improve the situation of women and democratic practices have not included women in government, homes and workplaces. At the same time, non-governmental organizations have continued to expand a policy agenda with a concern for women, thanks to the Fourth World Congress on Women and a series of UN-affiliated meetings in Cairo, Nairobi and Beijing. This updated and expanded edition includes two new essays and new conclusion that reflect on the upsurge of interest in women and development since 1990. It considers the conflict over the terms “gender” at the Beijing conference; the continuing divisions between conservative women and feminists; and also between representatives of the North and South.


Adaptation from Introduction: The article explores how to conceptualize theoretically and treat methodologically the issues of power, gender, and intervention. The analysis pinpoints three conceptual inadequacies. First, that “women’s problems” cannot be reduced to a choice between women’s “autonomy” or “dependence” as implied in women and development literature. Second, that the concept of power is in need of a serious overhaul theoretically in order to account for processes such as the intricate struggle over boundaries; the creation of room for maneuvering; and various forms of everyday resistance. And third, it signals that there is a need to recognize that intervention initiatives designed to “empower the poor” may ultimately become a contradiction in terms.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article looks at the empowerment approach in relation to issues of women and development. After explaining why this is currently a significant perspective in the field of gender planning, it goes on to explore two central problems within the framework. The first problem being the way it conceptualizes women’s gender interests. It
is argued that this distinction is theoretically unfounded and empirically untenable. Secondly, it puts forth the argument that gender planners tend towards a preference for simplified tools and quantifiable targets so that women's realities are bent into planning frameworks. It concludes by calling for planners, to work from an empowerment perspective, applying flexibility and greater awareness of the political dimensions of their work.


Adaptation from Introduction: The book covers an overview of the terms and evolution of the main debates in development during the three UN Development Decades. It provides a look at the specific sectors of the economy in which women are engaged: agriculture industry and the informal sector. From this, its raises the question of the applicability of statistical data and conceptual schema that guide the collection of census data. The book concludes with a contrast of the WID and GAD perspectives, evaluating their strengths and weaknesses and looking at policy strategies and their ability to provide for empowerment and political action.

THE ROLE OF FORMAL AND INFORMAL INSTITUTIONS:


Abstract: This book challenges the assumption that state-directed development in Asia is gender neutral. The authors trace the complex and often interlinked ways in which the state, community and household have typically upheld patriarchal interests- to women's detriment. Focusing largely on contemporary developments, it examines the gender impact of: agricultural growth strategies in Sri Lanka, Malaysia, India and China; export-oriented industrialization in South East Asia; and new population policies in Malaysia and Singapore. The book also considers the ways in which the rise of religious fundamentalism in Iran and elsewhere affects women's roles and status.


Adaptation from Introduction: For poor households and especially for women who own little private land, forests and village commons have always been critical sources of basic necessities in rural India. This article focuses on the decreasing availability of resources and the shifting in property rights away from community control and managements, to State and individual control and management. The author analyzes more recent trends of the re-establishment of greater community control over forests and village commons. Her article focuses on communal systems of property that represent a new formalized system of rights based on membership; with membership replacing citizenship as the defining criterion for establishing rights in the commons. The work raises critical questions about participation and equity, and more specifically about gender equity. In exploring issues of property rights and the exercise of agency, the article is meant to
provide insights and demonstrate the relevance of the feminist environmentalist perspective, as opposed to an eco-feminist perspective, in understanding gendered responses to the environmental crisis.


Abstract: Using the recent experiences of women in Eastern Europe and Latin America as a reference point, this book examines the processes of change currently under way in new and "reformed" regimes in the Middle East and North Africa. It provides a structured and in-depth investigation of the interaction among the state, political actors, and women activists/organization during periods of liberalization in three countries - Jordan, Tunisia and Morocco. It pays special attention to issues such as access to contraception and abortion; labor; pension and criminal legislation; protection against harassment and violence; and the degree of women's participation in government.


Abstract: This book reflects current scholarship on states, socio-economic development, and feminist theory. Addressed are such issues as the role of state policies and ideologies defining gender differences; state influence over the boundaries between public and domestic spheres; state control over women's productive and reproductive lives; and the efforts of women to influence state policy. It argues that state elites promote male domination as one way of maintaining social order when nation-states are created and strengthened; and that issues defined as male by the sexual division of labor are given priority in state policies that promote security and economic development such as; foreign policy, international trade, agricultural development, and resource extraction. The article analyzes these policies in terms of their impact on gender relations and also identifies ways in which women have responded.


Abstract: This article outlines the current approaches to analyzing institutions and organizations as gendered terrains and processes. These approaches can help explain persistent difficulties in institutionalizing incentive and accountability systems responsive to women's needs and interests in development organizations. The article describes an approach to analyzing development organizations according to gendered structures and practices as they are expressed through gendered incentive and accountability systems, gendered expressions of power; and gendered patterns of organizing space and time. It further stresses the importance of situating any organizational study and strategy for organizational change within the broader institutional context of the organization in question.

Abstract: This book fills an important gap. Up to now, gender and participation have existed as two largely separate movements. Their overlap, with its synergies and contradictions, has been little explored. All too often participation has meant participation by men, with women marginalized. In participatory development, concepts of “community” have, as case studies in this book show, evaded ethical issues of local complexity and conflict, particularly those of gendered power relations.


Abstract: Women and Democracy offers a unique look at the political experiences of women in two regions of the world - Latin America and Eastern and Central Europe - which have moved from authoritarian to democratic regimes. At first glance, the roles and attitudes of these women appear to be similar. This book makes the case that the differences are notable. Examining the various political attitudes and efforts of women as they learn to participate in the political process, the contributors offer important new insights into democratic consolidation in general - and point to the need for greater attention to the role of women in political processes.


Adaptation from Introduction: The article considers the fundamental tension between the active and reactive qualities of informal associations. It argues that the extent to which an informal association uses defensive of active strategies determines the degree to which it can be receptive to development interventions. It displays this point by considering the response of diverse women’s associations to development initiatives.

ALTERNATIVE METHODOLOGIES, RESEARCH TOOLS AND TRAINING MANUALS:


Adaptation of Introduction: Two Halves Make A Whole, is a resource of practical analytical tools drawn from contracts with women in developing countries, and a wide variety of development projects and literature. It uses a Gender in Development Approach to offer resources which highlight the ability for development tools to transform unequal social/gender relations and to empower women.
Adaptation from Introduction: This draws on experience in rural development work in Irian Java (Indonesia) to clarify the centrality of popular participation in development. The article address the intersections of class, gender and participatory development to explore how development agents can support transitional development. The author puts forth the idea that integrating political economy and gender planning into a participatory methodology will allow for the placing of people first in the development initiative. The article further outlines ways to balance guidance and support, and facilitation and responses, on behalf of the development agent.


Adaptation from Introduction: This book considers the challenge for researchers who have to provide beneficiaries with "reasonable" options for change, when the tools available to the researcher may not allow him/her to fully understand the framework of reasoning of the target population. The book examines the potential flaws of research based on standard questionnaires and meticulously-designed programs of investigation. More precisely, it challenges how researchers construct questions and what is prioritized in research definition. Issues addressed in the book include obstacles to research; potential professional or logistical biases; problematic value judgements and assumptions; and ways to encourage a more genuine and holistic exchange between the researcher and village participant.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article emphasizes that PRA is not automatically gender sensitive and must be accompanied by schemes to raise gender awareness before it is applied. The paper focuses on a program which took place in Brazil and the steps it took to define gender before deciding which PRA methods would be most appropriate. The article concludes with a discussion of the benefits and dangers of linking PRA and gender. As a practical suggestion and case study it is useful for trainers, field workers and planners thinking about applying PRA.


Abstract: This article evaluates the usefulness of cost-benefit analysis (CBA) in the field of gender and development planning. While the incorporation of distributional considerations into CBA would appear to have made it more sensitive to gender differentials, the article argues that it is limited by a number of factors. These include both its own methodological biases, such as the bias toward marketed activities and quantifiable indicators, as well as the political economy of gender at different stages of the project cycle. Empirical examples from both first and third world contexts are drawn on to demonstrate how these biases work in practice. The article concludes that CBA is best suited to interventionist, rather than participatory projects; to efficiency, rather than equity goals; and, where equity is the goal, to women's practical needs rather than their strategic gender interests.

Adaptation from Introduction: This book traces the evolution of Pat Maguire, from a student researcher grappling to come to an understanding of the biases of traditional research, through the process of engaging in participatory research with a group of battered women in Gallup, New Mexico. The book develops a valuable framework for reconciling theory and practice and participatory feminist research, as well as providing unique insights for anyone who is considering doing participatory research.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article points out some of the shortcomings of the participatory rural appraisal approach (PRA) to community research, particularly as it applies to gender analysis. It offers suggestions about how these problems can be rectified. Using a case study of a natural resource development project in India, the author illustrates how local knowledge collected through PRA is problematic in that it is heavily influenced by power, authority, and gender inequality. As such, it is argued that the built in biases of PRA can inhibit the participation of women in information-gathering exercises unless steps are taken to overcome this.


Adaptation from Introduction: This article demonstrates some of the inadequacies of rapid appraisal approaches in dealing with differences within communities. It focuses on how this research style can overlook gender, ethnicity, wealth and age. The article proposes ways that RRA can be used as a method for identifying, exploring, and analyzing intra-communal difference and as a means of training development workers to appreciate the importance of their work. Case studies highlight four axes of difference in communities based on age, gender, ethnic background, and poverty. The gender examples show the different results of certain RRA exercises when attempted by men and women separately.


Beck, Tony. 1994. Literature Review of Social Gender Indicators. Prepared for Mary Powell, WID Specialist, Asia Branch, CIDA.


5.2. Institutional and Web Resources

The purpose of this part of the toolkit is to provide information on internet resources and a contact list of international organizations working in gender and social policy. The first part features a list of general gender links. The second part is a list of relevant organizations, many of which provide links to additional sites.

PART I

1. **BRIDGE**
   - This is an innovative information and analysis service specialising in gender and development issues and in assisting development professionals and organisations to integrate gender concerns into their work. BRIDGE briefings present state of the art research findings; review current policy debates; synthesise best practices; and evaluate strategies for translating gender policies into practice.

2. **DIANA - International Human Rights Database:**
   - This extended site of the University of Toronto library is dedicated to International Women's Human Rights.
   - www.law-lib.utoronto.ca/DIANA

3. **ELDIS**
   - Eldis is a gateway to online information on development or the environment. It features extensive on-line gender resources, including two subject guides on 'gender in development cooperation' and 'gender and health' (produced in conjunction with BRIDGE).
   - http://ntl.ids.ac.uk/eldis/gender/gender.htm

4. **GREAT Network - Gender Research and Training**
   - This network bridges the divides between Gender and Development researchers, development practitioners; and between individuals and dispersed institutions. It disseminates research results to development agencies and academics; informs subscribers of relevant debates and information on the Web; and manages topical debates. This site works with around 450 members from over 40 countries in all parts of the world, involved in a wide range of development and gender activities. Members include international bodies; government agencies; NGOs; campaign groups and charities; and researchers and academics.
   - http://www.uea.ac.uk/dev/greatnet

5. **ID21:**
   - This site is a selection of gender research resources from this Development Research reporting service. It provides a selection of the latest UK-based development research.

6. **International Centre for Research on Women**
   - This site provides information on leadership, management and publications on developing and transitional countries.
   - http://www.iciw.org

7. **International Gender Studies Resources**
   - This link features teaching materials for gender studies in the international area.
   - http://globetrotter.berkeley.edu/globalgender
8. Mapping the World of Women's Information Services
   - This site is aimed at increasing women's visibility in access to gender specific information. It is targeted at women's organizations, policy makers, and decision makers. It also includes database links.
   http://www.iiai.nl/mapping-the-world/mtwintro.html

9. ONEWORLD:
   - This is a searchable site of over 350 leading global justice organisations.
   http://www.oneworld.org

10. The Women in Development Network
    - This is a database of English and French resources for gender and development. It is aimed at practitioners and academics.
    http://www.focusintl.com/widnet.htm

11. WE International Magazine
    - This site features an International [magazine] based in Toronto, Canada, which examines women's relationships to their environments -- natural, physical, built, and social -- from a feminist perspective. It provides a forum for academic research and theory, professional practice, and community experience.
    http://www.web.net/~weed/

12. Women and The Web - Guides to Women's Resources
    - This site lists guides to academic lists of resources; women's organizations and discussion groups; women in specific professions; and links to women's pages; and women's use of the net.
    http://www.cohums.ohio-state.edu/english/facst/ko1/women.htm

13. WWWomen!
    - This is a search engine for women-related sites dedicated to finding all sites on the Web relevant to women-from sites about child rearing and pregnancy to sites about civil liberties, careers and religion.
    http://www.wwwomen.com/

14. Women and Education resources
    - This site provides links to many gender and education web sites, including academic programmes and departments; women's centres; colleges and universities; and library and archival resources.
    http://aztec.lib.utk.edu/~mack/wom_ed.html

PART II

1. Africa Policy Information Center (APIC) - African Women's Rights
   - This link carries policy oriented reports on African women's health, political, human rights, and references to related sites. APIC is based in Washington, D.C.
   http://www.africapolicv.org/action/women.htm

   - This site supports information on Women in Technology and Development:
   http://www.osu.edu/org/awognet/events

3. Amnesty International
   - This organization disseminates information on violations of women's rights and areas for ongoing activism.
   http://www.amnesty.org.uk

4. Association for Women in Development (AWID)
   - This page describes this non-governmental, international membership organization of practitioners, scholars and policy makers. It outlines their commitment to gender equality and capacity building, and to deepening the dialogue on specific women in development/gender in development. (WID and GAD) issues.
   http://www.awid.org/

5. Asian Centre for Women's Studies
   - This centre promotes regional networking and research in South East Asia. Ehwa Woman's University, 11-1 Daehyon-dong, Seoul 120-750 Korea
6. **Asian-Pacific Resources and Research Centre for Women (ARROW)**
   - This is a regional non-governmental, non-profit women's organization focussing on women and health.
   http://www.asiaconnect.com.mv/arrow

7. **Centre for Women's Resources**
   - This organization focusses on Asia and the Pacific and Human Rights research and political action. 43 Roces Ave, Mar Santos Bldg., 2nd Floor, Quezon City, Philippines. Tel: 78-74-71.

8. **Committee for Asian Women**
   - This organization is committed to empowerment through seminars at the local, sub-regional and regional levels. 57 Peking Rd. 5/f, Kowloon, Hong Kong. Tel: (3) 682187

9. **Commission on Gender Equality (South Africa)**
   - This organization promotes gender equality and advises Parliament, or any other legislature, on laws or proposed legislation which affect gender equality and the status of women.
   http://cge.org.za/

10. **ENDA-synfev (Environnement et Developpement du Tiers-Monde, Synergie Genre et Developpement/Synergy, Gender, and Development)**
    - This organization is based in Dakar, Senegal, and seeks to improve the lives of African women through programs such as femmes-afrique-info, an electronic network concerning the rights and health of Francophone African women.
    http://www.enda.sn/synfev/synfev.htm

11. **FEMNET - African Women's Development and Communication Network / Réseau du développement et de la communication des femmes africaines.**
    - This NGO is based in Nairobi and concerned with sharing information and ideas between African NGOs to produce a more effective NGO focus on women's development.
    http://www.africaonline.co.ke/

12. **Gender and Development at UNDP**
    - This site provides an overview of UNDP's policies and programs for gender equality and the advancement of women at global and regional levels. It considers conceptual and operational information about gender mainstreaming and UNDP's key policy documents on gender. Information about global and regional level programs are also provided, and a Resource Room /gateway to on-line information resources; including GIDPs monograph series and links to non-UNDP resources.
    http://www.undp.org/gender/

13. **Global Fund for Women**
    - This site provides a link to an international grant making organization which focuses on female human rights throughout the world. It supports issues as diverse as literacy, domestic violence, economic autonomy, and the international trafficking of women. It provides grants to women's groups in developing countries. Grants range from $500 to $10,000 dollars.
    http://www.igc.org/gfw/

14. **Global list of Women's Organizations**
    http://www.euronet.nl/~fullmoon/womlist/womlist.html

15. **IDRC - Gender and Sustainable Development Unit.**
    This site provides a forum for the dissemination and exchange of information related to gender issues in development research. It provides bibliographies, gender awards and useful links to other web pages.
    http://www.idrc.ca/gender/

16. **International Women’s Health Coalition: www.who.ca**
17. **International Women's Watch**  
- This organization focuses on women's issues from a political economy perspective. 464 19 St., Oakland, CA 94612. Tel (415) 835-9631.

18. **ISIS International**  
Via Santa Maria del l'Anima 30, 00186, Rome, Italy. Tel: (06) 6565842  
- This organization is an international network of over ten thousand contacts, and documents to provide support on women's issues.

19. **MATCH International Centre**  
- This is a site for an international organization which works in partnership with women's groups in Africa, Asia, the Caribbean, and South America. Its focus is the empowerment of women and the achievement of the practical enjoyment of human rights and fundamental freedoms through civil, political, economic and cultural justice. 
http://www.web.net/~matchint/match.html

20. **OECD Development Assistance Committee (DAC)**  
DAC supplies conceptual resources including a Source Book on Concepts and Approaches to Gender Equality, as well as Guidelines for Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in Development Cooperation.  
http://www.oecd.org/dac

- This body of the UN promotes the economic and political empowerment of women in developing countries and women's participation in all levels of development, planning and practice. UNIFEM's site provides information about its mandate, policies and programmes. It also contains a list of publications and available videos.  
http://www.unifem.undp.org/

22. **United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (INSTRAW)**  
- The objectives of this organization are to stimulate and assist, through research, training and the exchange of information, the advancement of women.  
http://www.un.org/instraw/

23. **Women in Development (a work group of the Society for International Development, Washington, DC Chapter)**  
- This site links to a volunteer organization of professionals actively committed to advancing women's roles in social, economic, and political development. The site provides information on their group as well as links to other related sites.  
http://www.geocities.com/~sidwid/

24. **Women in Development Europe (WIDE)**  
- This link features a network of women active in non governmental development organisations working to influence European and International policies and to raise awareness on gender and development issues in Europe. Its objective is to empower women worldwide. It promotes a process of joint reflection and interaction between Northern and Southern women, and aims for joint action on international and regional levels:  
http://www.eurosur.org/wide/weng/aims.htm
25. **Women in Development Network, WIDNET**
   - This is a directory of African Women's organizations, with statistics on women's education; health; labor; population/household; and power (percent of women in gov't, ministers, managers, legislators etc.). Information provided is mainly from United Nations and maintained by Sylvie Proulx & Gilbert Oloko of a Canadian consulting firm - Focus International.
   http://www.focusintl.com/widnet.htm

26. **Women In Technology International's (WITI)**
   - This is an association of professional women working in technology. WITI is dedicated to increasing the number of women executives; helping women to be more financially independent and technology-literate; and encouraging young women to choose careers in science and technology.
   http://www.witi.com/

27. **Women's Issues page - UNHCR**
   - This page outlines UNHCR's policies and programs concerning displaced women. It also provides UNHCR articles on women refugees that are recommended for teachers.
   http://www.unhcr.ch/issues/women/women.htm

28. **Womens Net**
   - This group supports women's organizations worldwide by providing and adapting telecommunications technology to enhance their work:
   http://www.igc.org/igc/womensnet/

29. **Women's Net**
   - This is a program aimed at enabling South African women to use the Internet to find the people, issues, resources and tools needed for women's social action. The site has news concerning African women and jobs. It also covers human rights; health; violence against women; and new technologies.
   http://womensnet.org.za

30. **Women - Norwegian Council for Africa**
   - This is a tool for identifying sources of information on Africa and African affairs. This site provides links to over 2,000 relevant resources.
   http://www.fellesraadet.africainfo.no/africaindex/subjects/women.htm

31. **Women Watch**
   - This site is a gateway to UN information and data on women worldwide, and an evolving electronic forum on global women's issues in the follow-up to Beijing. The Internet site provides up-to-date information on the UN's work on behalf of the women of the world and on the global agenda for improving the status of women.
   http://www.un.org/womenwatch/

32. **Women's Web**
   - This is a directory of African women's organizations:
   http://community.web.net/womensweb/index.html

33. **SANGONET**
   - This is a regional electronic information and communications network for development and human rights workers:
   http://www.sn.apc.org/
5.3. Regional Network Contacts

This section provides a list of individuals working on gender and social policy issues across Africa, Asia, Latin America, North America and Europe. It is not meant to be an exhaustive list. It is intended to assist researchers or policy planners looking for specific information in a given region, or interested in developing and expanding gender networks.

Ms. Haifa Abu-Ghazaleh,
Regional Programme Advisor,
UNIFEM, 7 Abassan St., Near Khalidi Hospital, P.O. Box 830 896 Amman, 1183 Jordan.
Tel: 962 6 4 619 727/8
Fax: 962 6 4 610 944
unifem@nets.com.jo
Expertise: Gender Analysis in the Middle East.

Dr. Simi Afonja,
Dept. of Sociology and Anthropology,
Obafemi, Awolowo University,
P.O. Box 1052, OAU Post Office,
Nigeria.
aafonja@oau.net

Ms. Regina Amadi,
Regional Programme Advisor, UNIFEM, 11 Oyinkan Abayomi Dr., Ikoyi, Lagos, Nigeria.
Tel: 234 1 269 2006
Fax: 234 1 269 0885
Expertise: Gender Analysis in West Africa (English).

Dr. Aminata Ayéva-Traoré,
87 Rue Kayingan Lawson, Nyékonakpoe, B.P. 1402
Lomé, Togo
Tel:221 409
Fax: 225 644
Expertise: PhD in Political Science (UQAM) and MA in Public Administration (Harvard; Kennedy School of Govt). Numerous positions in Togolese Government related to Women's Affairs, and Social Welfare.

Ms. Aster Zaoude,
Regional Programme Advisor,
UNIFEM,
P.O' Box 154 Immeuble Faycal,
19. Rue Parchappe
Dakar, Sénégal.
Tel: 221 823 5207
Fax: 221 823 5002
unifsen@telecom-plus.sn
Expertise: Gender Analysis in West Africa (French).

Dr. Isabella Bakker,
S636 Ross, York University,
4700 Keele St.
North York, ON
M3J 1P3,
Canada.
Tel: 416 736 2100, ext. 30166
Fax: 416 736-5686
prof.bakker<76602.1251 @compuserve.com
Expertise: Gender and Economic Reform; Structural Adjustment and Welfare State Reform; Work with the North-South Institute.

Ms. Grace Bantebya-Kyomuhendo,
Lecturer, Dept. of Women's Studies,
Makerere University, P.O. Box 7062
Kampala, Uganda.
Tel: 256 41531484
Fax: 256 41543539/ 530756/ 238833
Expertise: Health Analysis and Reform.

Dr. Ellen Bortei-Doku Aryeetey,
Senior Fellow,
Institute for Statistical, Social and Economic Research (ISSER),
University of Ghana,
Accra, Ghana.
Tel: 233 21 777098/ 665801
Dr. Janine Brodie,
Chair Dept. of Political Science,
University of Alberta,
10-19 H.M. Tory Building,
Edmonton, Alberta
Canada.
janine.brodie@ualberta.ca
Expertise: Gender and Political and Economic Reform; Public/private Reform and Welfare State Reform; Work with the North-South Institute.

Dr. Paola Cappellin,
Sociologist, Pais X Nanterre.
Professor in the Post-Graduate Program of Sociology and Anthropology,
Federal University of Rio de Janeiro,
Rua Barao da Torre 489/301 - Ipanema,
22411 003 Rio de Janeiro.
Tel: 00 55 21 247 12 62
Fax: 00 55 21 224 89 65
cappellin@uol.com.br

Dr. Chang Chueh,
Coordinator, Institute of Public Health,
Women’s Research Program,
National Taiwan University,
Taipei, Taiwan.
Tel: 886-23974812(0)
Fax: 341-7584
chueh@ha.mc.ntu.edu.tw

Dr. Patricia Constales,
Medical Doctor,
Consultant in Gender and Health.
Saludocu@oscarbet.ecuanex.net.ec

Ms. Aracelly De Leon,
University of Panama Women’s Institute,
adeleon@cwp.net.pa

Ms. Laketch Dirasse,
Regional Programme Advisor, UNIFEM,
20th Fl. Harambee Ave.,
Nairobi, Kenya.
Tel: 254 2 228776 to 9/218332
Fax: 254 2 331897 or 223 184
laketch.dirasse@undp.org
Expertise: Gender Analysis in Eastern Africa.

Ms. Shereen Essof,
Zimbabwe Women’s Resource Centre and Network,
P.O. Box 2192,
288 A Herbert Chitepo Ave.
Harare, Zimbabwe.
Tel: 263 4 737 435/792 450
Fax: 263 4 721 330
Expertise: The ZWRCN is an NGO umbrella group of a wide range of women’s organizations in Zimbabwe. It does work with the World Bank and in policy-related lobbying in Zimbabwe.

Dr. Patricia Evans
School of Social Work-- Atkinson College,
York University, 4700 Keele St.
North York, ON
M3J 1P3
Canada.
patevans@yorku.ca
Expertise: Gender and Welfare State Reform.

Ms. Yassine Fall
Executive Secretary,
AAWORD, Sicap Amitié, Villa No. 4050, B.P.
15367
Dakar-Fall, Sénégal.
aaword@telecomplus.sn
Expertise: Gender Analysis and Structural Adjustment.

Dr. Michelle Friedman,
African Gender Institute,
University of Capetown,
27 Virginia Ave., Verdehoek,
Capetown, South Africa.
Tel: 021 685 2142
mfriedmn@agi.uct.za

Dr. Kuniko Funabashi,
Women’s Studies Center,
Osaka Women’s University,
2-1 Daisencho, Sakai-city,
Osaka, Japan.
Tel: 81-722-22-5003
Fax: 81-722-23-4023
funabasi@cmk.or.jp
Dr. Eddah Gachukia,
Executive Director,
Forum for African Women Educationalists (FAWE), International House,
P.O. Box 53168
Nairobi, Kenya.
Tel: 254 2 226 590
Fax: 254 2 210709
Expertise: Gender Analysis and Education.

Dr. Gerde Wekerle,
Prof. of Environmental Studies,
Lumberg Building,
York University,
4700 Keele St.
North York, ON
M3J 1P3
Canada.
gwekerle@yorku.ca
Expertise: Welfare State Reform.

Dr. Anne-Marie Goetz,
Institute for Development Studies,
University of Sussex,
Brighton,
BN1 9RH
U.K.
A.M.Goetz@sussex.ac.uk
Expertise: Gender and Institutional Analysis and Governance (Africa, Asia).

Dr. Marjorie Griffin-Cohen,
Chair, Dept. of Women's Studies,
Simon Fraser University,
Burnaby, BC
Canada.
Expertise: Gender and Globalization/trade; Employment and Privatization.

Dr. Silvia H. Guerrero,
Director, UP Center for Women's Studies,
University of the Phillipines,
Yllana Sts., Diliman, 1101 Quezon City,
Phillipines.
Tel: 920-5301 to 99.
Fax: 920-6880
ucws@skyinet.net

Ms. Perpetua Gumbo,
School of Social Work,
Chinhoyi St./Grant St.,
P.O. Box MP 167,
Mount Pleasant,
Harare, Zimbabwe.
Tel: 263 4 751 903
Expertise: Gender and Social Security; Social Policy Analysis.

Ms. Elizabeth Gwaunza
Women and Law in Southern Africa Research (WLSA),
Suite 204 Steinar House, 132 Harare St.
Harare, Zimbabwe.
Tel: 263 4 729 152/772 935
Fax: 263 4 772 935
Expertise: Gender and Legal Issues; Human Rights.

Ms. Gioconda Herrera,
PhD Candidate, Columbia University,
New York.
Coordinator of Gender Studies, Faculty of Latin America and Social Science, FLASCO, Ecuador.
Ulpiano Paez, 118y Av. Patria, Quito, Ecuador.
Tel: (593 2) 528200; 232 029
Fax: 593 2 566 139
gherrera@hoy.net; gherrera@flasco.org.ec

Ms. Gita Honwana-Welch,
Regional Programme Advisor
UNIFEM,
Takura House, 67/69 Union Ave.
Harare, Zimbabwe.
Tel: 263 4 792 681/686
Fax: 263 4 704 729
gita.welch@undp.org
Expertise: Gender Analysis in Southern Africa.

Dr. Elizabeth Jelin,
Sociologist, Principal Researcher
University of Buenos Aires
Guatemala 4342, 1425 Buenos Aires,
Argentina.
Tel: (54-11) 4831-7423
Fax: (54-11) 4833-1220
eilijelin@mail.retina.ar
Expertise: CONICET, Coordination of Socio-cultural Research in Mercosur Ides.
Dr. Pooja Juyal,  
Dept. of Political Science,  
Isabella Thoburn College,  
Lucknow 226 007,  
Uttar Pradesh, India.  
Tel: 91-0522-321107  
Fax:91-0522-338640.

Dr. Nails Kabeer,  
Institute for Development Studies,  
University of Sussex,  
Brighton  
BN1 9RH  
UK  
nkabeer@sussex.ac.uk  
Expertise: Gender and Poverty; Planning, Evaluation, and Training (Asia).

Dr. Wanjiku Kabira,  
Coordinator,  
Collaborative Centre for Gender and Development,  
P.O. Box 34713, Adalyn Flats, Flat 3B  
Nairobi, Kenya.  
Tel: 254 2 714 595  
Expertise: Gender Analysis Training

Dr. Deborah Kasente,  
Lecturer, Dept. of Women's Studies,  
Makerere University, P.O. Box 7062  
Kampala, Uganda.  
Tel: 256 41 351484  
Fax: 256 41 543539/ 530756/ 258 833  
kasente@swiftuganda.com  
Expertise: Poverty Issues; Micro-enterprise and Finance; Social Security, Agricultural Reform; and Gender Training.

Ms. Outi Kasurinen-Badji,  
Coordinator, ENDA,  
B.P. 3376,  
5 Rue Kléber,  
Dakar, Sénégal.  
Tel: 221 222 695  
outi@enda.sn

Ms. Joanna Kerr,  
Gender and Economic Reform in Africa (GERA) Program Manager,  
North South Institute,  
c/o Westminster Ave.  
Toronto, ON  
M6R 1N4  
Canada  
416 539 9070  
416 539 8926  
jkerr@web.net  
Expertise: Structural Adjustment; and Economic Reform (Africa and Canada).

Dr. Meera Kosambi,  
Director, Research Centre for Women's Studies,  
SNDT Women’s University,  
Vithaldas Vidayavihar, Santacruz (w)  
Bombay, 400 049, India.  
Tel: 612-8461, 6648 ext. 18  
rcwssndt@bom2v.snl.net.in

Dr. Davinder Lamba,  
Mazingira Institute,  
Nairobi, Kenya.  
Tel: 254 2 443226, 443229  
Fax: 254 2 444643

Ms. Wendy Lawrence  
Integration of Women in Development Africa and Middle East Branch, CIDA, 200  
Promenade du Portage  
Hull, QUE, K1A 0G4  
Canada.  
Tel: 997 5565  
wendy_lawrence@acdi-cida.gc.ca  
Expertise: CIDA contact on Gender in Africa.

Ms. Martha McDonald,  
Dept. of Economics, Saint Mary's University,  
Halifax, Nova Scotia,  
Canada.  
mmacdona@husky1.stmarys.ca  

Dr. Patricia McFadden,  
SAPES Trust, 4 Deary Ave.,  
Belgravia, Harare,  
Zimbabwe.  
Expertise: Gender Analysis and Development.  
Founder of (former) Centre for Feminist Studies in Zimbabwe.
Ms. Carol Miller,
UNRISD
Geneva, Switzerland/US
miller@unrisd.org
Expertise: Gender Analysis; Indicators and Poverty.

Ms. Marguerite Monnet,
Sotrac Mermoz, villa No. 132, B.P. 206
Dakar, Sénégal.
Tel: 221 825 1687
Fax: 221 825 1687
afriges@sonatel.senet.net
Expertise: Gender Analysis in Training, Project Design and Evaluation; Worked with UNIFEM, UNDP, and World Bank.

Ms. Orlandian de Oliveira,
Sociologist, University of Mexico.
oodeolive@colmex.mx

Dr. Chang Pilhwa,
Director,
Asian Centre for Women’s Studies,
Ehwa Woman’s University,
11-1 Daehyon-dong, Deodaemun,
Seoul, Korea.
120-750.

Dr. Susan Poats,
Ph.D. Anthropology University of Florida.
Coordinator of MENRECUR II Project,
Fundacion para el Desarrollo, Agropercuario, Fundagro.
Calle Morena Bellido, 127y Mariana de Jesus,
Quinto Piso, Quinto, Ecuador, Casilla 17-16-219
Tel: 5932 507-422
spoats@impsat.net.ec
Expertise: Tropical Agriculture.

Ms. Marie Powell,
WID and Gender Equity Analyst,
CIDA, 200 Promenade du Portage,
Hull, QUE,
K1A 0G4
Canada.
Tel: 997 5565
marie_powell@acdi-cida.gc.ca
Expertise: CIDA; Gender Analysis in Asia.

Dr. Jane Pulkingham,
Assistant Professor,
Sociology and Anthropology,
Simon Fraser University,
Burnaby, B.C.
V5A 1S6
Canada.
Tel: 604 291 3388
Fax: 604 291 5799
pulkingh@sfu.ca
Expertise: Gender and Poverty; Social and Income Security Reform and Welfare State Reform.

Dr. Hoda Rashad,
Research Professor, Director,
Social Research Centre,
American University in Cairo,
113 Kasr El Aini St., P.O. Box 2511
Cairo, Egypt.
Tel: 20 2 355 7298
hrashad@auc-acs.eun.eg

Ms. Shahra Razavi,
UNRISD,
Geneva, Switzerland/US
razavi@unrisd.org
Expertise: UNRISD contact on Gender; Gender Analysis Indicators and Poverty.

Ms. Mary Rusimbi,
Programme Coordinator,
Tanzania Gender Networking Programme,
(TGNP), Azikiwe St.,
CRDB Building, 7th Floor,
Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.
tagnet@tagnet.udsm.ac.tz
Expertise: Gender and Education and Health Reform; Structural Adjustment.

Dr. Saparinah Sadii,
Women’s Studies Program,
Graduate School, University of Indonesia,
Salemba Raya no.4, Jakarta 10430,
Indonesia.
Tel: 62-21-3907407
Fax: 62-21-390-7404
pskwui@pacific.net.id
Dr. Suwanna Satha-Anand,  
Philosophy Department,  
Faculty of Arts,  
Chulalongkorn University,  
Bangkok 10330, Thailand.  
artfsst@chulkn.car.chula.ac.th

Dr. Gita Sen,  
Dept. of Economic and Social Science,  
Indian Institute of Management  
Bannerghatta, India.  
Tel: 91 80 664 4050  
gita@iimb.ernet.in

Ms. May Sengendo,  
Lecturer, Dept. of Women's Studies, Makerere University, P.O. Box 7062,  
Kampala, Uganda.  
Tel: 256 41 531484  
Fax: 256 41 543539/ 530756/ 258833  
mavseng.gendermu@swifzuganda.com  
Expertise: Gender and Social Policy.

Dr. Kumud Sharma,  
Director, Centre for Women's Studies  
25, Bhai Vir Singh Marg (Gole Market),  
New Delhi - 110 011, India.  
Tel: 91-11-3345530  
Fax: 91-11-33446044  
cwds@sscwds.ren.nic.in

Dr. Fatou Sow,  
Sociologue, Chercheur au CNRS  
Institut Fondamental D'Afrique Noire, Cheikh Anta Diop, B.P. 206  
Dakar, Sénégal.  
Tel: 221 825 0090  
Fax: 221 825 6533  
fatousow@telecomplus.sn  
Expertise: Gender Analysis in Social Science and Development; Gender Training.

Ms. Fatoumata Sow,  
BP 3559  
Dakar, Sénégal.  
Tel: 221 824 1415  
Fax: 221 824 1435  
fsow@svfed.refer.sn  
Expertise: Gender and Info. Technology;  
Electronic Communication.

Ms. Monica Townson,  
Independent Consultant,  
Toronto, ON  
Canada.  
mtownson@astral.magic.ca  
Expertise: Income, Social Security Reform and  
Pension Reform.

Teresa Valdes,  
Sociologist,  
Coordinator of the Gender Area,  
Flasco, Chile.  
agenero@flasco.cl

Ms. Njoki Wainaina,  
African Women's Development and  
Communications Network (FEMNET),  
P.O. Box 54562,  
Nairobi, Kenya.  
femnetcign.apc.org

Dr. Sun Xiaomei,  
Director, Women's Studies Information  
Center, Chinese Women's College,  
No.1 Yuhui Donglu, Chaoyang District,  
Beijing, 100101, China.  
Tel: 10-64925410  
Fax: 10-64932110