Saving the United Nations: A global tax on international financial transactions?

by Steven Dale

The miracle of high speed telecommunications has enabled players in world financial markets to transfer billions of dollars between countries with a few computer keystrokes, creating bonanzas for speculators but terror for nations whose economic plans can be wrecked by sudden, dramatic outflows of capital. And while an estimated $1.3 trillion in foreign exchange transactions moves across the globe each business day, United Nations agencies that provide social services still go begging for funds.

Can global capital flows be taxed to generate revenue for these agencies? That was one of the main questions at a recent roundtable in Ottawa on global financial transformations and the United Nations system. Held at IDRC, the event was sponsored by the National Capital Region Branch of the United Nations Association in Canada.

Roundtable chair, Caroline Pestieau, Vice-President for Programs at IDRC, said the notion of such a tax raises several practical issues including the type of surveillance, disincentives and controls required to deal with financial surges. She noted that shifting capital can be especially devastating for the South, which
requires economic stability but is rarely able to refuse foreign capital.

**Coping with shifting capital**

One solution, adopted by countries such as Chile, Columbia and Malaysia, is to apply controls on incoming investment to discourage the short-term parking of capital. The European Union, meanwhile, is banking on a single continental currency to bring more stability to exchange rates.

Other schemes, like the Tobin tax — named after the Nobel Laureate in Economics, James Tobin — attempt to deal with market volatility by increasing the costs of currency speculation. Designed to "put sand in the wheels" of the global money machine, Tobin's proposed tax on international financial transactions could also raise revenues for international agencies such as the UN.

Pestieau asked panellists whether these two goals are contradictory. "What immediately comes to mind is the situation with tobacco taxes," she said. "Do you want to raise money or do you want to stop smoking? And can you do both at the same time?"

**Improved cash flow, not tighter spending**

With respect to the United Nations financial crisis, speakers agreed that the solution is improved cashflow, not tighter spending. "Contrary to what we hear from certain quarters, the UN's budgets are not spiralling out of control," stressed Sam Hanson, counsellor at the Canadian Permanent Mission to the UN in New York. The original budget appropriation of US$2.608 billion for 1996-97 was less than the appropriation for the previous year and it has since been lowered to US$2.602. And the preliminary estimate for 1998-98 further reduces the UN's budget to US$2.48 billion.

Hanson concluded that "the UN's financial crisis is due to lack of funds because collections are not equal to assessments." Member states agree on what they should pay, but then they don't pay. By January 1996, for example, only 25 of 185 countries had honoured their assessment in full. Only 2 of the 25 were members of the G-7 and none were members of the Security Council.

But the question remains whether new international levies — such as the Tobin tax or an international carbon tax — would solve the UN's funding crisis, making it easier to maintain peacekeeping, health and education programs around the world. Such an approach raises some practical issues, said Hanson. For example, "would you need a new bureaucracy to levy the tax, or would national governments be willing to levy UN taxes on their own citizens?" he asked. "And what policing powers would the global tax collectors require to deal with tax evasion?"

**Tax won't dampen speculation**

Alan Gill, Alternate Executive Director for Canada at the Inter-American Development Bank in Washington, said that a financial transfers tax is unlikely to dampen financial speculation, since in this type of activity "you do get quite a bit of momentum," which a small surcharge is unlikely to curb. Morris Miller, formerly the executive director for Canada, Ireland, and the Caribbean at the World Bank and now an adjunct professor at the University of Ottawa, added that technical problems should not deflect attention from the need for new social revenues.

Miller described the crisis in UN funding as "a second order problem" arising from the more fundamental matter of increased income polarization, which has occurred in the face of a two-and-a-half fold (in real terms) growth in incomes worldwide since World War II. Despite this, a billion people live on less than a dollar a day and the income gap between rich and poor has grown dramatically in the past decade.

**Collecting rent on the global commons**
"We have a world that is obscenely unequal, unfair and immoral," he said, adding that the world has an obligation to provide for the desperately poor by "charging rent on the global commons, which all of us own." Vast fortunes have been made by financial speculators and communications companies that transmit signals through the atmosphere, and by companies that ship products across oceans. According to Miller, taxing the global commons is the only way the world can assert its ownership of those resources and "collect the economic rent for humanity."

*Steven Dale is a writer based in Ottawa.*

---

### Sidebar

**Alternative Funding for UN Development Programs**

**Resource Persons:**

**Morris Miller**, Adjunct Professor/Economic Consultant, Faculty of Administration, University of Ottawa, 136 Jean-Jacques Lussier, P.O Box 450 Station A, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada, K1N 6N5; Tel: (613) 562-5800, ext. 4567; Fax: (613) 562-5164

**Alan Gill**, Alternate Executive Director, Inter-American Development Bank, 1300 New York Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20577, U.S.A.; Tel: (202) 623-1021; Fax: (202) 623-3609; E-mail: ALANG@IADB.ORG

**Roger Ehrhardt**, Director General, Multilateral Technical Cooperation, Multilateral Programs Branch, Canadian International Development Agency, 200 Promenade du Portage, Hull, Quebec, Canada, K1A 0G4; Tel: (819) 994-3943; Fax: (819) 997-6632; E-mail: roger_ehrhardt@acdi-cida.gc.ca

**Sam Hanson**, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Canada to the United Nations, 1 Dag Hammarskjold Plaza, 885 Second Avenue, 14th Floor, New York, New York 10017, USA; Tel: (212) 754-5600; E-mail: sam.hanson@prmny01.x400.gc.ca

**United Nations Association in Canada - National Capital Branch**, 130 Slater St. Suite 900, Ottawa, Ontario; Tel: (613) 232-5751, ext. 254; E-mail: unac-ncrb@freenet.carleton.ca

---

### Links to explore ...

**Related IDRC articles and publications**

- [Coping with capital surges: The return of finance to Latin America](#)
- [Development and global governance](#)

**Additional resources**

- [The NCRB United Nations Reform Project](#)

  *You proposed the Tobin Tax in 1978. Today, in a period of international speculation and crisis, is it still valid and applicable?* [James Tobin’s answers...](#)

**References**
IDRC Reports Archives

IDRC Reports is published by the International Development Research Centre. Its aim is to keep an international readership informed about the work IDRC supports in developing countries as well as other development issues of interest.

Visit the new Reports online

JANUARY-DECEMBER 1997

3 January  Reviewing science policy reforms in China by Patrick Kavanagh
10 January  Greening of Tumkur by Deepak Thapa
17 January  Protecting coral reefs : eco - fishing in the Philippines by Patrik Hunt
24 January  Preventing blindness : vitamin - A fortified ultra rice by Keane Shore
31 January  Globalization of Brazil : two sides of the economic miracle by Pierre Beaudet
7 February  Women living under Muslim laws : a solidarity, information, and research network by Michel Groulx
14 February  Debt management software for Francophone countries by Antoine Raffoul
21 February  Value of trees by Jennifer Pepall
28 February  Saving the United Nations : a global tax on international financial transactions? by Stephen Dale
7 March  Protecting the Mexican environment : the role of economic instruments by Steven Hunt
14 March  Laying the foundations of a democratic Palestine : the Women's Studies Program at Birzeit University by Roula el-Raifi
21 March  Seeking sustainability in rural Egypt : linking scientific and indigenous knowledge by Kirsteen MacLeod
4 April  Grass Roots epidemiology in Guerrero, Mexico by Louise Guénette
11 April  Saving the ozone layer : alternatives to methyl bromide by Jacinda Fairholm
18 April  Connecting the North : telecommunications links for Canadian aboriginal communities by Keane Shore
25 April  Housing and urban poverty in Viet Nam by André Lachance
2 May  Improving crop resistance : a new plant breeding technique borrows from the past by Kevin Conway
9 May  Surviving poverty : common property resources in West Bengal, India by Richard Littlemore
16 May  Mercury contamination in the Amazon by Jennifer Pepall
23 May  AIDS in Uganda : understanding the causes of high risk sexual behavior by Anna Borzello
30 May  Combatting desertification: rainwater harvesting in Jordan by Leila Deeb

6 June  TRAMIL Research Network: validating the healing powers of medicinal plants by Frank Campbell

13 June  Reforesting the Sahel: tree seeds research in Burkina Faso by Michel Groulx

20 June  Protecting biodiversity: toward the fair and equitable sharing of genetic resources by Keane Shore

27 June  Yucape Project: economic development in Mexico's Yucatán Peninsula by Chris Hayes

4 July  Map Maker simplifies cartography in the field by Curt Labond

11 July  Lessons from Canada’s tobacco war by Lauren Walker

18 July  Fungus fights cereal killer in Africa by Philip Fine

25 July  PAN Mongolia experience by Geoff Long

1 August  Protecting natural resources: bioaccess legislation in Laos by Richard Littlemore

8 August  Preventing blindness: vitamin - A fortified ultra rice by Keane Shore

15 August  Women living under Muslim laws: a solidarity, information, and research network by Michel Groulx

22 August  Debt management software for Francophone countries by Antoine Raffoul

29 August  Saving the United Nations: a global tax on international financial transactions? by Stephen Dale

5 September  Sex, lies, and global economics: counting the invisible workforce by John Eberlee

12 September  Canadian internationalism in the 21st century: a conversation with Maurice Strong by Michael Smith

19 September  Acacia initiative: connecting African communities by Michael Smith

23 September  In conversation with Réal Lavergne

26 September  Sierranet: linking Sierra Leone to the world by Jennifer Pepall

3 October  Knowledge broker initiative: linking the creators and users of knowledge by Michael Smith

10 October  CamBioTec: promoting biotechnology through Canada-Latin America partnerships by Deana Driver

14 October  In conversation with Robert Valantin

17 October  Monitoring poverty in Bangladesh: toward more effective poverty alleviation programs by John Eberlee

24 October  AGUILA: promoting urban agriculture in Latin America by Laurent Fontaine

31 October  Feeding the poor: improving household production of guinea pigs in Peru by Katherine Morrow

7 November  Bamboo mat board: an environmentally friendly plywood alternative by Lionel Lumb

14 November  Essential Health Interventions Project: improving health care in Tanzania by Kanina Holmes

21 November  Controlling malaria: a low cost, environmentally friendly mosquito killer by Katherine Morrow

25 November  Helping the thirsty to solve their water crisis

25 November  Essential oils provide income for Bolivians [French text] by Gilles Drouin

28 November  AIDS in Kenya: understanding the impact of HIV on mothers and children by Kanina Holmes

5 December  Improving natural resource management in Cajamarca, Peru by Katherine Morrow

8 December  Leading the battle to end hidden hunger

12 December  Detecting the presence of waterborne chemicals: alternative water tests for the South by John Eberlee and Jennifer Pepall

15 December  Recovering economic self-confidence in Africa

19 December  Investigating the health effects of low-level exposure to methyl mercury by André Lachance

22 December  Closing the knowledge gap
22 December  Development model imposed on farmers: a fundamental cause of shrinking forests in Vietnam by Rodolphe De Koninck
23 December  In conversation with Darrell Posey
23 December  Controlling malaria: a conversation with Dr. Christian Lengeler by Christian Lengeler
31 December  IDRC partnerships with Francophonie countries: 1996 - 1997 [French text]

Unless otherwise stated, all articles and photos may be freely reproduced providing suitable credit is given.

ISSN 0315-9981 This magazine is listed in the Canadian Magazine Index.

Copyright 2003 © International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada
Octobre 2003
Alternative Funding for UN Development Programs

Reforming the funding mechanisms for UN agencies involved in development work would provide more stability and democratic decision-making, says Roger Ehrhardt, Director-General of Multilateral Technical Cooperation at the Canadian International Development Agency.

There are 18 development-oriented funds and programs in the UN system, including the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) and the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR). Unlike specialized UN agencies, such as the World Health Organization (WHO) and the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), development-oriented funds and programs are paid for through voluntary financing, rather than assessed contributions. This has created several problems:

- **overdependence:** the funds and programs rely heavily on some 10 countries that provide 80-90% of their budgets through voluntary contributions. Many Southern nations perceive that these UN agencies are dominated by big donors from the North. Such dependency has also led to financial insecurity. For example, the UNDP's budget declined dramatically in 1996 when the United States reduced its contribution.

- **instability:** the voluntary nature of funding has caused some programs to suffer larger budget cuts than the UN system's specialized agencies.

- **fragmentation:** the tendency of donors to provide extra funding through "multi-bilateral arrangements," where a group of countries supports specific projects, makes it difficult to construct overall priorities for the funds and programs.

To address these concerns, several recommendations have been made. Among the ideas under consideration by the UN Secretary General include taxes on non-renewable resources, credit card use, air travel, financial market transactions, and/or access to the Internet; and an increase in private sector contributions. Some Southern countries have pitched a two-pronged approach in which the administrative and management costs of social and developmental UN funds and programs would be financed from assessed contributions; and voluntary contributions would be eliminated as new mechanisms for raising money through taxation are phased in. Meanwhile, Nordic countries have proposed a three point plan in which assessed contributions would cover administrative costs; negotiated, longer-term pledges would be introduced; and voluntary contributions would continue. The Nordic plan does not mention new taxes as a funding instrument.

*Stephen Dale*

---

Copyright © International Development Research Centre, Ottawa, Canada

Please send your comments to editor of Reports.